

argument is valid for Gascony, in Ireland and Wales there were communities who regarded themselves as English and whose leaders were full members of the governing class of England itself. As with the Anglo-Scottish landed elite, who are discussed, the interests of these lords, like those of the crown, were not confined to England. This issue clearly involves the nature of English identity. In the period 1225 to 1360 this was going through rapid and highly significant developments, as recent work has shown. Complaints about foreign personnel and payment for continental enterprises were central to attacks on Henry III and Edward I, while the wars of the latter and of Edward III used English antipathy to their neighbours as a recruiting mechanism. Similarly the Englishness of colonial populations in Wales and Ireland, relative to their non-English neighbours and their homeland, also emerged as a major concern in these decades. Prestwich does use the English of Ireland and Wales to define English identity, but only in the conclusion when he finally tackles the subject head on in a brief but valuable discussion. Considerations of Scottish politics and political society for the same period have long regarded issues of identity and regnal solidarity as central themes to be addressed and, while the reasons for this focus (or obsession) are obvious and the results not uniformly successful, this may be one area in which Scottish historiography is in advance of its English counterpart. If so, this book, in its range, detail and articulate analysis, shows that the study of England as a polity, society and economy provides a useful, though certainly not exclusive, template for ongoing work on Scotland.

University of St Andrews

MICHAEL BROWN
DOI: 10.3366/E0036924108000206

Chivalry and Knighthood in Scotland, 1424–1513.

By Katie Stevenson. Pp. xii, 228.

ISBN: 1843831929.

Woodbridge: The Boydell Press. 2006. £45.00.

Katie Stevenson's monograph delivers on the considerable promise of her doctoral thesis. It provides an excellent beginning in the examination of a universal medieval experience in a hitherto neglected Scottish context, as the introductory historiographical survey makes plain.

By taking Maurice Keen's seminal definition of chivalry as its starting point—with a focus upon the inter-twined martial, aristocratic and Christian elements of the medieval chivalric ideal—this book presents a convincing thematic exploration of chivalry and knighthood in Scotland during the reigns of successive and strongly contrasted Stewart monarchs, James I to James IV. This approach aids the illustration of the author's persuasive central thesis, that of a marked development in Scottish chivalry and knighthood during the fifteenth-century, driven almost exclusively by the Crown but also in response to Europe-wide military and humanist intellectual change. These influences placed an increasing emphasis on civic responsibility and royal service alongside the more 'traditional' ideals of individual martial prowess, noble lineage and Christian virtue.

Taken together, chapters two and three ['Knighthood in Scotland' and 'The Bestowal of Knighthood and the Dubbing Ceremony'] paint a clear picture of the growing dominance and control by the Stewart monarchy of the creation and effective employment of knights and chivalric ideals. As in other kingdoms, 'solemn court events' like coronations often saw large numbers of Scottish knights dubbed and thus bound to the person of the king or

the royal household, associations which were further strengthened throughout the fifteenth-century as monarchs drew upon such men as administrators and military captains. As Dr Stevenson shows, Scottish Crown events such as weddings, baptisms, battle-musters, tournaments, and even political assemblies like parliaments, saw nobles (and in turn their infant sons) elevated by the king or his guardians from esquire to knight – or even from knight to banneret or other honorific ranks. Yet dubbing was less frequent in Scotland on such occasions as judicial combats, the beginnings of a pilgrimage or in the pursuit of courtly love (the latter thus offering a marked contrast between Scottish and European characteristics of knighthood).

The author offers a compelling case, indeed, for viewing James I's return from English captivity in 1424 as a watershed in terms of the Crown's efforts to wrest control of chivalric ideals and European renown from such affinities as the Albany Stewarts and Black Douglases, a task then continued with renewed martial vigour by James II. However, in doing so, and in making impressive and judicious use of the often frustrating paucity of archival and printed evidence, a necessary limitation of any study with royal-reign parameters is revealed: that of the potential underplaying of alternative patrons of chivalry and knighthood in Scotland, here both before and after 1424. Prior to James I's return, it had actually been a bold, confident time to be a Scottish esquire or knight in aristocratic or French royal service: thus the established, extensive and often informal lord-man networks of service, apprenticeship and non-royal dubbing which must have existed to facilitate this activity must surely have persisted long into the period under study.

A similarly rewarding point of debate might be raised in consideration of the next – and strongest – chapter in this book, 'Scottish Tournaments', which builds on the exploratory work of Carol Edington. James I, taking his lead from Henry V of England, had no great love for the lists and held only one tournament at his favoured royal centre of Perth in 1433. But, as the author demonstrates, James II loved to joust and learnt a potent lesson from the tournament between Scots and Burgundians organised through Black Douglas connections and hosted at Stirling in 1448. Dr Stevenson makes the intriguing suggestion, too, that just as James II sought to destroy Douglas influence over Scottish chivalry, so he may have acted to reduce the power of the Sinclair earl of Orkney as a patron of knighthood and the commissioner of such chivalric text translations as the Constable Sir Gilbert Hay's volumes on *Armys* and *Knychthede* in the 1450s. James III, however, neglected the skills of chivalric patronage, shunning the tournament and household noblemen and becoming the focus of satirical verse lamenting the lost ideals of knighthood. It was James IV, of course, who revived royal control of chivalry with an invigorating Renaissance twist through a series of Arthurian-themed tournaments and associated rituals *c.* 1496 and 1503–8, spectacles matched, too, by Crown investment in the literature, learning and imagery of chivalry (an impression of over-whelming royal dominance of this ethos which segues convincingly with Andrea Thomas's recent study of the court of James V).

Nonetheless, this reviewer was encouraged by this study to reconsider the period before 1424, to explore the possibility that there was a stronger legacy of royal chivalry than previously acknowledged: according to Abbot-chronicler, Walter Bower, after all, even Robert III is said to have offered an annual 'king's gold challenge cup' to be fought for by challengers to his 'champion'. By the same token, perhaps even James III continues to be hard-done by and his reign is actually much less black-and-white in its mishandling of chivalry: as Norman Macdougall's more recent work has shown even the odious favourite, Thomas Cochrane, was renowned for skill in single combat while the king's brothers,

Albany and Mar, must have provided real alternative quasi-royal outlets of chivalric service (all of which gets a garbled rendition by Pitscottie who also records the glorious naval career of (Sir) Andrew Wood, as Dr Stevenson notes).

In chapter five, 'Scottish Knights and the Display of Piety', there is a strong examination of a theme in which Scots did display an independence from their Crown. Moreover, in some lingering commitment to the ideal of crusade, on important pilgrimage routes, and – most strikingly – through the foundation of collegiate churches as a focus of chantry masses and mausoleums for effigies, some of the peculiarities of Scottish chivalry are especially evident: the evolution of chivalric heraldry would also be a rewarding strand for further investigation as would perhaps the Crown's blending of chivalry and piety (e.g. the symbolism of James II's coronation in Easter week 1437 on the anniversary of the inauguration of Robert Bruce, p.180). Similarly, chapter six, 'Chivalry in Scottish Literature', provides a rewarding survey of romance translations, chronicles and chivalric manuals by and for Scots c.1375–c.1542. In particular, the verses critical of James III's chivalric failings and the historical, ceremonial, training and advice texts popular at the courts of James IV and V underline the degree to which knighthood had, for the Scottish kings and nobility, evolved to embrace a greater focus on public service alongside sustained martial renown, (a thesis soundly revisited in chapter seven, 'The Crown's Use of Chivalry').

Overall, then, this is a valuable study which breaks new ground, synthesises primary sources and recent research and provides much food for thought: recommended reading for scholars of late medieval Scotland and Europe generally.

University of Stirling

MICHAEL PENMAN
DOI: 10.3366/E0036924108000218

*Calendar of Papal Letters relating to Great Britain and Ireland, Volume XX,
1513–1521, Leo X, Lateran Registers, Part I.*

Edited by Anne P. Fuller. Pp. lxxix, 852.
ISBN: 1874280789.

Dublin: Irish Manuscripts Commission. 2005. €80.

This latest volume in the impressive series the *Calendar of Papal Letters* starts with the opening of Leo X's pontificate in 1513 and goes down to 1521. It brings us one step closer to being able to utilise to the full the remarkable riches that lie within the Vatican archives. Although only 11 per cent of the items within this substantial tome directly concern Scotland, those items are comparatively longer and more helpful than the majority of entries dealing with English and Welsh affairs. Being part of the routine business of papal administration, the documents produced by the Papal Chancery produce few surprises in their content. Their great value lies in the biographical and topographical information they contain, and the editor's marvellous decoding and indexing skills have made sense of the fascinating ways in which Italian scribes have rendered the names of Scottish people and places. What this meticulously produced volume reveals in remarkable detail is the highly competitive world of ecclesiastical benefice-hunting. By coincidence, the earliest and latest items in the chronological sequence relating to Scotland feature that wily careerist Patrick Paniter. Thanks to the heavy backing of James IV for his royal secretary, Paniter secured the abbey of Cambuskenneth [Items Nos 97–102, 6 April 1513]. The provision that he should take the Augustinian habit and vows within a year was subsequently ignored. Paniter held a substantial collection of other