

# Performing authenticity: James Hogg and the portable short story

Duncan Joseph Hotchkiss  
University of Stirling

Thesis submitted for the degree of *Doctor of Philosophy*  
July 2019



## ABSTRACT

James Hogg (1770-1835), the labouring-class writer from Selkirkshire in Scotland, was the subject of the marginalising forces of class prejudice and economic inequality during his lifetime. In the 184 years since his death, Hogg's place in literary histories of the Scottish – and British – Romantic-era has been characterised as peripheral and dissident. This thesis readdresses Hogg's relationship to marginality by arguing that he had agency in the construction of his identity as an outsider. It foregrounds the formal characteristics of the short story, historicised within specific contexts of publication, in shaping Hogg's performance of authenticity in relation to class, place, and language. In doing so, the thesis argues that authenticity is a performative function of text and form, rather than a natural essence of authorship and authorial biography. The performance of authenticity functions within and through the Hoggian short story's characteristic portability. I argue that portability incorporates two dialogically related elements: materiality and narrative aesthetics. Firstly, portability is defined in its literal sense of material transference. Hogg's short stories moved between contexts and media of publication, from one periodical to another, from periodical to book, and from one geographic location to another. The thesis also argues that portability is constructed within short stories, providing a unifying framework for Hogg's interrogative narrative praxis, identified elsewhere in Hogg studies as a cross-generic aesthetic of his fiction and poetry. Those narrative aesthetics are grounded in the formal characteristics and historical contexts specific to the short story form and its mutable contexts of publication.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like firstly to thank Adrian Hunter whose guidance and support has helped to shape this project, and its researcher, from the outset. I am grateful too to Suzanne Gilbert and Katie Halsey for providing enthusiastic and useful feedback. I would also like to thank Catriona Macdonald for her early encouragement during my masters studies and for giving me the confidence to pursue doctoral study, and Colin Kidd for his (even earlier) encouragement during my undergraduate studies. Thanks also to the Arts and Humanities Research Council for funding this research, and to the University of Stirling for assisting travel to conferences. I was fortunate to be free from financial worry in a political climate where access to the arts and humanities in higher education is under siege.

My sincere thanks go to all those whose thought-provoking conversation and feedback influenced the ideas presented within this thesis, especially to Aleix Tura Vecino, Félix Flores Varona, and Ewan Gibbs. Thanks should also be extended to the postgraduate research community in Stirling and Glasgow.

A massive thanks to my family and friends on the banks of the Ettrick Water, the Clyde, and the Firth of Forth for their love and support over the past four years: especially to Rachel, Heather, Emma, Ewan, Suzie, Billy, Ada, Gavin, Norman, Ruth H., Dad (who first gave me a copy of *A Justified Sinner*), Mum (whose Dux set the standard), the soon-to-be-born baby, Fiona (for the cups of tea), Conor, Leigh, Oj, Paul, Stewart, Kenny, Ruby and Paddy. Thanks must also go to David Gray, Alan Stubbs, and to my Ettrick Labrador, Laddie.

Finally, this thesis would not have been possible without the companionship of my wife, Ruth. Her moral integrity and sense of care for others is a continued source of inspiration and strength.

## DEDICATION

To the memory of Scott J. Hutchison, a Selkirk storyteller.

## CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION: Hogg the outsider: marginality, agency and form .....	7
CHAPTER ONE: Hogg, Benjamin, and The Spy as short-storyteller .....	50
CHAPTER TWO: Authentic Shepherds? Hogg's short stories and Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine .....	84
CHAPTER THREE: Reclaiming the Ettrick Shepherd: Hogg and the short story collection .....	116
CHAPTER FOUR: An Ettrick Shepherd in London: bringing the margins to the metropolis .....	156
CHAPTER FIVE: Reprinting the Ettrick Shepherd: networks, authorship and the magazine short story in America .....	185
CONCLUSION: The power of authenticity in the 'lonely voice', and futures.....	216
BIBLIOGRAPHY .....	227

## INTRODUCTION: Hogg the outsider: marginality, agency and form

James Hogg (1770-1835), the labouring-class writer from Scotland's rural border region, has long been associated with the margins. As Meiko O'Halloran has pointed out, Duncan Wu's anthology of Romantic-era readings, 'the most widely used teaching anthology in the field in the UK' and 'the essential text on Romanticism', fails to include Hogg's work in its most recent editions (2006 and 2012 respectively).<sup>1</sup> Hogg's marginality is connected to the, at times conflated, identities of class, nation and region(s) associated with the Selkirkshire writer. Douglas Mack has conceived of Hogg as belonging to 'a radical and deeply rooted tradition in Scottish writing' that 'seeks to give voice to the concerns and insights of people normally marginalised by mainstream society [...a] tradition grounded in the old oral ballads, and [...] in the writings of Alan Ramsay, Robert Fergusson, Robert Burns and James Hogg', which is 'carried on in our own day in different ways by writers such as James Kelman and Irvine Welsh'.<sup>2</sup> Hogg's place in Scotland's working-class literary canon has been rooted in his experience of writing in a literary marketplace that was fraught with class bias:

Hogg was further constrained by those who governed the Edinburgh literary marketplace, men who sought to develop and reinforce middle-class values and taste. The literati positioned Hogg in a late eighteenth-century category of 'peasant poet' that celebrated but also confined the work of working-class writers.<sup>3</sup>

The wider historical context of class anxiety and socio-economic unrest in early nineteenth-century Scotland and Britain has been recognised as having had a marginalising effect upon Hogg. 'His class' argues Suzanne Gilbert, 'meant he suffered repercussions from the social and political upheaval of the period'.<sup>4</sup> This

---

<sup>1</sup> *Romanticism: An Anthology, Fourth Edition*, ed. by Duncan Wu (Oxford: Wiley Blackwell, 2012), see cover blurb. Meiko O'Halloran, *James Hogg and British Romanticism: A Kaleidoscopic Art* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), p. 256.

<sup>2</sup> Quoted in Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson, 'Hogg and Working-class Writing', in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg* (hereafter *Companion*), ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012), pp. 55-63 (p. 55); hereafter referred to as *Companion*. See also Douglas S. Mack, *Scottish Fiction and the British Empire* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008).

<sup>3</sup> Alker and Nelson, 'Hogg and Working-class Writing', p. 56.

<sup>4</sup> Suzanne Gilbert, 'Hogg's Reception and Reputation', in *Companion*, pp. 37-45 (p. 40).

social prejudice was to continue to ‘distort’ Hogg criticism throughout the nineteenth, and into the twentieth, century.<sup>5</sup> Early nineteenth-century criticism, such as Lockhart’s ‘Memoirs of the life of Sir Walter Scott’, characterised Hogg’s work as ‘exceedingly rugged and uncouth’.<sup>6</sup> The marginalisation of Hogg from Wu’s anthology has deep roots.<sup>7</sup>

Hogg’s connection to geographic and cultural peripheries forms a large part of his outsider status. ‘The editors and reviewers who monitored the literary marketplace’, argues Ian Duncan, ‘would invoke [his rural] origins to disqualify Hogg’s attempts to write in metropolitan genres.’<sup>8</sup> Hogg’s career straddled the boundary between city and countryside, working from Ettrick for much of his life while publishing in Edinburgh and, latterly, London. ‘Mud and shite from his Borders sheep-pastures’, writes Robert Crawford in a more visceral fetishisation of Hogg’s authentic outsider qualities, ‘fucked up the carpets of [the Edinburgh literati’s] New Town drawing-rooms’.<sup>9</sup> Hogg has been characterised as existing ‘between worlds’, between the worlds of rural Ettrick and metropolitan Edinburgh, between his labouring-class identity and that of a professional literary man, between traditional oral culture and an emergent mass print culture, and between ancient superstitions, social customs and tradition, and the technological and socio-economic encroachment of modernity.<sup>10</sup> ‘His writing’, argues Gillian Hughes in a 2007 scholarly biography of Hogg, ‘was the natural expression of this double vision’.<sup>11</sup>

This thesis argues that Hogg had agency in the cultural construction of between-ness and marginality. The thesis foregrounds the short story form in Hogg’s performance

---

<sup>5</sup> Gilbert, ‘Hogg’s Reception and Reputation’, p. 43.

<sup>6</sup> Quoted in Gilbert, ‘Hogg’s Reception and Reputation’, p. 43

<sup>7</sup> Ian Duncan’s chapter ‘Hogg’s Body’ in his 2007 monograph *Scott’s Shadow* discusses how the *Blackwood’s* writers represented Hogg’s body in an idealised mode of masculinity and sexual virility at the same time as limiting Hogg according to his class background. ‘The language of cultural authority’, explains Duncan, ‘was increasingly a language that obliterated its origins not just in speech and locality but in the body.’ See Ian Duncan, *Scott’s Shadow: The Novel in Romantic Edinburgh* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2007), p. 181.

<sup>8</sup> Duncan, *Scott’s Shadow*, p. 148

<sup>9</sup> Robert Crawford, ‘Bad Shepherd’, *London Review of Books*, 23.7 (2001), 28-29 (p. 28) <<https://www.lrb.co.uk/v23/n07/robert-crawford/bad-shepherd>> [accessed 1/5/2019]

<sup>10</sup> Duncan, ‘Introduction: Hogg and His Worlds’, *Companion*, pp. 1-8 (p. 6).

<sup>11</sup> Gillian Hughes, *James Hogg: A Life* (Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 2007), pp. 303-4.

of authenticity by showing how the short form shaped Hogg's authorial and narrational strategies, and shows how the form's characteristic portability brought those functions into different types of cultural encounter across multiple magazines, mediums, and geographic locations. The short story as a form, read within its contexts of publication, performed Hogg's agency in the Scottish Romantic-era field of cultural production by situating his associated author functions in the authenticating discourses of class, region and vernacularity. In the case of Hogg, the early nineteenth-century short story's characteristic portability involved the curation of an interrogative fictional aesthetic that subverted and challenged the marginalising discourses of class, region and nation that the labouring-class writer was subject to. Staking a claim in those marginalising forces, Hogg's short stories turn the authenticity of marginality into a positive effect (in the sense of a deliberately cultivated function) of his art. Hogg's aesthetic of narrative indeterminacy, identified within Hogg studies as a cross-generic aesthetic within his fiction and poetry, is herein grounded in the formal characteristics and historical contexts specific to the short story at a formative point in its generic history. In other words, I read Hogg's widely recognised aesthetic of indeterminacy as a function of a particular form and its mutable relationship to modes of publication from magazine to book, rather than a symptom of his authorial betweenness or 'double-vision'. This is not to fully depart from the role of biography in Hogg criticism or to erase the importance of his material class position, vocational background and relationship to place. Rather, it is to restore the role of agency through an analysis of form and contexts of publication, an approach that takes into account authorial intentionality (drawing, for example, on evidence from Hogg's letters) while exploring the power relationships that shaped the author function(s) associated with Hogg and the forms he wrote in. In his work with the short story form, Hogg wielded agency in his association with identities of marginality and discourses of authenticity. This agency was attuned to power relationships within the literary marketplace and society, and was shaped, and continually reshaped, by forces in the 'field of literary production' which included author(s), texts, genres, forms, media of publication, editors, reviewers, publishers, buyers, and readers.

Previous scholarship in Hogg studies has explored ideas of authenticity and authorial agency. This thesis builds on, and departs from, that existing work to suggest that

applying generic specificity to a writer who is generically promiscuous yields fruitful results by showing how authenticity and agency are foregrounded in particular conditions and cultural processes at particular points in the history of print culture. In Hogg's treatment of the form, the short story's characteristic portability fostered conditions in which questions of authenticity and agency were accentuated by bringing Hogg into multiple different and dramatic kinds of cultural encounter across mediums of publication, including within periodicals and within the emergent short story collection in both Scotland, the UK and in America. Hogg's short stories engage those questions of authenticity and agency by placing emphasis on multivocality and restlessness within texts, and in relation to their mutable contexts of publication and reception in which authenticity was staged (and restaged) across cultural contexts centred upon the nexus of centre-periphery. In Hogg's short stories, notions of authenticity are embedded in the cultural politics of voice, class and place, and navigated through the figure of Hogg as a labouring-class Scottish writer from a rural periphery. Similar processes occur across Hogg's work. This thesis shows how that process functions specifically in the formal conditions of the early nineteenth-century short story.

Romantic short fiction has been characterised by its generic diffuseness and formal slipperiness. This thesis brings the short form's formal characteristics, and its ideological functions, into the unifying concept of portability. My deployment of portability is partly defined by its common etymological usage of physical transference. The short story's brevity – its shortness – facilitated its ability to move from publication to publication, and from medium to medium. In historicising the form's portability in the case of Hogg, the thesis builds upon short story theory and criticism to reaffirm the form's intimate relationship with periodical and magazine culture. In the case of Hogg, the relationship between the short story and the magazine is particularly acute because of his own early magazine experiment, *The Spy*, his role in founding, and contributing to, *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, his move to the London magazines, and his appearance in the north American periodical 'cultures of

reprinting'.<sup>12</sup> As well recognising as the importance of the magazine, viewing the short story through the concept of portability allows for an appreciation of the role of the bound book-format – particularly the novel, the miscellany, and the emergent short story collection – in shaping narrative and form. This thesis historicises the form's portability by tracing Hogg's short stories through their various contexts of publication, showing how contexts shape the function of short stories, and exploring how different editors, publications and media affected the aesthetic characteristic and ideological function of short stories.

As well as denoting the physical transferability of the story as material object, portability is used as a concept for understanding the literary and narratological aesthetic within Hogg's short stories, which has elsewhere been described as 'indeterminate' and 'kaleidoscopic'.<sup>13</sup> While sharing recognisable features with those ideas, this thesis builds upon such characterisations of Hogg's narrative praxis by grounding those aesthetics in form. In terms of textuality, Hogg's short stories are portable because of their lack of narrative fixed-ness, their generic instability, and their tendency toward irresolution. The characteristics associated with Hogg's textually portable short story include a self-consciousness of the form's existence in print through references to narrative constructed-ness, and the textual performance of what Walter Benjamin called the 'thin, transparent layers' of storytelling characterised by the dramatisation of the experiential moments of telling(s) which disrupt the binary of print and orality.<sup>14</sup> The textually portable interrogative aesthetic within Hogg's

---

<sup>12</sup> 'Culture of reprinting' is Meredith L. McGill's term, from Meredith L. McGill, *American Literature and the Culture of Reprinting, 1834-1853* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007). As well as by the use of its full title *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, William Blackwood's periodical is referred to throughout this thesis as both *BEM* and *Maga*.

<sup>13</sup> Hogg's narrative aesthetic across forms has been described by John Plotz as 'polydoxy' in John Plotz, 'Hogg and the Short Story', *Companion*, pp. 113-121, (p. 115). Hogg's work, argues Plotz, can be characterised by 'inescapable variability – in focalisation, in form of address, in dialect, and in epistemology' (p. 116). The stress on 'variability' and lack of closure within Hogg's texts appears in the analysis offered by Meiko O'Halloran. Hogg, explains O'Halloran, 'can be understood as a key link in literary history. As an author who looks back to the unrestrained textual experimentations of Sterne in the Augustan era and anticipates the fractured narrative of late Victorian Gothic authors, R.L. Stevenson and Bram Stoker, Hogg has a crucial part in the trajectory of bold multi-perspectival literary experimentation which leads to the emergence of the Modernist fiction of Joyce, Conrad and Ford Madox Ford, who similarly remove the locus of narrative authority and demand that readers engage in a proactive and self-conscious process of interpretation'. See O'Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, p. 257.

<sup>14</sup> Walter Benjamin, 'The Storyteller: Reflections on the Works of Nikolai Leskov' (1936). <<http://ada.evergreen.edu/~arunc/texts/frankfurt/storyteller.pdf>> [accessed 10 August 2017], p. 6.

short stories is also characterised by the undermining of singular narrative authority, and the appearance of structural aperture, open endings and interrogative impasses which bring to the fore the function of reader agency in determining meaning(s). In this way, therefore, historicist narratives of the form's 'evolution' are challenged in that short story criticism has tended to start later than the more miscellaneous-seeming Romantic period—albeit for its own good reasons, such as the absence before the mid-nineteenth century of reflexive commentary on the form, discussed in more detail below. Indeed, the problematisation of the short story's relationship to modernity, and its dialogue with tradition, is a recurrent theme in the following discussion, offering a neo-formalist perspective on Hoggian between-ness.

It is important to note that my theory of portability, while herein historicised in relation to the specific form of the short story, is not reliant on an argument based upon formal exclusivity or uniqueness. I do not argue that the short story is necessarily more or less portable than, for example, Hogg's treatment of ballads, songs, poetry, and letters. Rather, I argue for the value of formal-historical specificity in literary study, shifting from more abstract definitional debates concerned with what a form is or is not, towards a historicist approach which asks what a form does and how it was used. In that sense, then, portability is a concept that could be usefully applied to the study of other forms, genres and mediums of publication. It is not the scope of this thesis to show how portability functions in relation forms outwith the short story. I show how portability, engaging as it does concepts of agency and authenticity as well as materiality as print-object, functions in relation to a specific form and its contexts of publication (the short story in periodicals and book-format collections) at an important time in its historical development (the early nineteenth-century), in relation to a specific author (James Hogg).

*Rediscoveries: Hogg studies and Scottish Romanticism*

'Surely Hogg's time has come', argues Meiko O'Halloran in her 2016 monograph *James Hogg and British Romanticism: A Kaleidoscopic Art*.<sup>15</sup> Similarly, in the 2012

---

<sup>15</sup> O'Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, p. 257.

*Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, Ian Duncan suggests that ‘at last we are catching up with’ ‘our contemporary’, James Hogg.<sup>16</sup> Hogg studies have progressed, and expanded in depth and breadth, considerably since Douglas Mack’s 1976 monograph, which set the wheels in motion for what Duncan describes as an ‘ongoing project of reassessment’, expanding our understanding of Hogg beyond the romantic author of the ballad miscellany *The Queen’s Wake* (1813), as he was most widely known during his own lifetime.<sup>17</sup> While Mack is key to the scholarly research reappraisal of Hogg, the French author and Nobel Prize in Literature winner in 1947 André Gide’s ‘discovery’ of Hogg’s 1824 novel *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner: written by Himself* in the 1940s was to prove an important moment in our ‘catching up’ with Hogg. Gide’s introduction to the novel appeared in the same year that he was awarded the Nobel Prize, and stressed its psychological power: ‘I take it just as it is, without question, marvelling, terror stricken, in the presence of this monstrous fruit of the Tree of Knowledge.’<sup>18</sup> According to Duncan, in *Justified Sinner* ‘Hogg reclaims his pastoral persona from *Blackwood’s* and divorces it from the invisible author of *Confessions*’.<sup>19</sup> While Hogg’s novel, which is today considered both a cult and popular classic of European fiction, is not the focus of this thesis, Duncan’s recognition of authorial agency, the function of the pastoral mode, the processes of textual reclamation, and the role of the periodical press form integral strands of the argument, as outlined in the section above. Hogg makes a cameo in the novel as an, rather than *the*, ‘authentic’ Ettrick shepherd ‘who refuses – growly thorny dialect - to assist the party of literary gentlemen from Edinburgh’.<sup>20</sup> The novel has, argues Duncan, ‘at last’ become readable ‘in the aesthetic lens of late modernism’, through which *Confessions* can be viewed as belonging to a nineteenth-century tradition of a blending of folkloric and psychological doublings, ‘from Hoffman, Poe and Gogol, to Dostoevsky, Stevenson

---

<sup>16</sup> Duncan, ‘Introduction’, *Companion*, p. 8.

<sup>17</sup> For discussion of the ‘rediscovery’ of Hogg, see Douglas S. Mack’s editorial introduction to the Stirling/South Carolina editions, ‘Hogg Rediscovered: A New Edition of a Major Writer’, in James Hogg, *The Shepherd’s Calendar*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1995) pp. v-vi, and Alker and Nelson, ‘Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author: An Introduction’, in *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the working-class Author* (hereafter *Literary Marketplace*), ed. by Alker and Nelson (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2009).

<sup>18</sup> André Gide, ‘Afterword’ (1947), in James Hogg, *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (Edinburgh: Canongate, 2008), pp. 283-390 (p. 285).

<sup>19</sup> Duncan, ‘Introduction’, *Companion*, p. 3.

<sup>20</sup> Duncan, ‘Introduction’, *Companion*, p. 2.

and Wilde.<sup>21</sup> Where Hogg's most famous and most widely studied text is now considered important to the history of the novel form, Hogg's place in the history of the short story form has, until more recently, been overlooked.

Christopher North, the pseudonym of John Wilson in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, wrote shortly after the publication of Hogg's novel *The Three Perils of Women* in October 1823 that 'I wish, my dear Shepherd, that you would follow Mr. Wordsworth's example, and confine yourself to poetry.'<sup>22</sup> In spite of North's suggestion, The Stirling/South Carolina research edition of Hogg, published by Edinburgh University Press, has begun to uncover the extent of Hogg's literary output across forms, genres, and modes of publication. O'Halloran's 2016 monograph builds upon the work undertaken in recent decades by scholars of Hogg and Scottish Romanticism to address the continuation of Hogg's 'strangely marginalised' position in what is termed 'British Romanticism'.<sup>23</sup> The monograph offers a rich insight into the protean Hogg - Hogg the poet, balladeer, impressionist in epic and mock epic forms, a periodical writer, theatre critic, playwright, parodist, satirist, editor, short-storyteller, novelist. O'Halloran's monograph is also a lively sketch of a thoroughly inter-textual Romantic literary culture, in which Hogg was not marginal but central. O'Halloran argues the case for 'Hogg's centrality to British Romanticism' by situating his 'radical experiments with literary form' in a Romantic literary marketplace which is shown to be dynamic and dialogic, one in which writers and artists are conceived as both producers and consumers.<sup>24</sup> O'Halloran's analytical framework of the 'kaleidoscopic' provides the central thread of the book's argument, and points to the coincidence of the invention of the kaleidoscope in 1816 by David Brewster with the year of publication of Hogg's *The Poetic Mirror*, and aims to show how the kaleidoscopic provides the best model for understanding Hogg's 'radical literary aesthetic' – his exploration of multiple perspectives and shifting perceptions, and his interest in facilitating readers' choice in his work and increasing their agency.<sup>25</sup> As

---

<sup>21</sup> Duncan, 'Introduction', *Companion*, p.3.

<sup>22</sup> *Noctes Ambrosianae* 7, in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* 12 (October, 1823), p. 486.  
<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=PHBHAQAAMAAJ&pg=PA486>> [accessed 01/05/2019]

<sup>23</sup> O'Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, p. 2.

<sup>24</sup> O'Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, p. 1.

<sup>25</sup> O'Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, p. 6.

well as operating as a descriptive metaphor for the features of Hogg's art, the kaleidoscopic also here provides a framework for a reconfigured understanding of British Romanticism, where, much like the material kaleidoscope, the margins can be brought into the centre by shaking up, juxtaposing and re-focalising, one in which 'the marginal figure of a shepherd-poet unexpectedly moves to the centre and become the focal point'.<sup>26</sup>

While O'Halloran's work represents the most recent scholarly incarnation of 'catching up' with Hogg and has suggested the range of formal and aesthetic experimentation in his work, other Hogg studies have shown how Hogg's early nineteenth-century Edinburgh was a 'literary boomtown' 'stratified by emergent as well as traditional hierarchies of class and rank'.<sup>27</sup>

Scotch novels and Scotch reviewers were the most brilliant constellations in a northern literary galaxy which included – besides the historical romance and critical quarterly – a professional intellectual class, the entrepreneurial publisher, the nationalist ballad epic, and the monthly magazine. If not all absolutely original, here these genres and institutions acquired their definitive forms and associations, and a prestige they would bear throughout the nineteenth century.<sup>28</sup>

Peter Garside has likewise pointed to the importance of historical moment – and the socio-economic relations involved in the labour of writing - in shaping Hogg's cultural production:

He benefitted from two established kinds of support, already available to later eighteenth-century working-class writers: in the form of patronage, and through publication by the subscription method, whereby sponsors from the general public vouched to purchase copies of a book on publication.<sup>29</sup>

---

<sup>26</sup> O'Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, p. 1.

<sup>27</sup> Duncan, 'Introduction', *Companion*, p. 1.

<sup>28</sup> Duncan, *Scott's Shadow*, p. 20.

<sup>29</sup> Peter Garside, 'Hogg and the Book Trade', *Companion*, pp. 21-23 (p. 21).

For Hogg, these modes of support were available from two sources, from his Selkirkshire landlord the Duke of Buccleuch, and from his friendship and working relationship with Walter Scott. Studies by Peter Garside and Ian Duncan have reaffirmed the central position of Scott in the early nineteenth-century field of cultural production, particularly in relation to the novel form.<sup>30</sup> Hogg's connection to Scott was vital to his own writing career, and differences between the respective Borderers in terms of class position and in terms of literary aesthetic and narrative style have drawn much attention within the field of Hogg studies.<sup>31</sup>

The growth of Scottish Romanticism as a discrete field of study has played a role in establishing the importance of Hogg's Edinburgh in Romantic-era cultural production.<sup>32</sup> Murray Pittock has argued for the distinctiveness of a Scottish national Romanticism through his construction of five determining categories: the existence of a separate public sphere in Scotland, an 'altermentality' of distinctive selfhood, the

---

<sup>30</sup> See Duncan, *Scott's Shadow*, p. 22. See also Peter Garside, 'Walter Scott and the 'Common' Novel, 1808–1819', *Cardiff Corvey: Reading the Romantic Text*, 3 (1999) <[http://sites.cardiff.ac.uk/romtextv2/files/2013/02/cc03\\_n02.pdf](http://sites.cardiff.ac.uk/romtextv2/files/2013/02/cc03_n02.pdf)> [accessed 11/12/2018]; Garside, 'The English Novel in the Romantic Era: Consolidation and Dispersal', in *The English Novel 1770-1829: A Bibliographical Survey of Prose Fiction Published in the British Isles, Volume II: 1800-1829*, ed. by Peter Garside and Rainer Schowering (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), pp. 24-49.

<sup>31</sup> For an overview of the relationship between Scott and Hogg see Holly Faith Nelson, 'Hogg and Scott's 'First Meeting' and the Politics of Literary Friendship', in *Literary Marketplace*, pp. 21-41. Teresa Catarella's 'The Study of the Orally Transmitted Ballad: Past Paradigms and a New Poetics', in *Oral Tradition*, 9:2 (1994), 468-78, argued that the difference between Scott and Hogg in their respective ballad aesthetic is between the ballad as 'relic' and 'inferior' in Scott's work, and the 'essential collectivity' and 'variability' of Hogg's treatment of the ballad. Douglas Mack in *Scottish Fiction and the British Empire* (Edinburgh: EUP, 2006) argues that the 'elite' Scott and the 'subaltern' Hogg write differently about imperial Scotland, the former operating 'within the structures' of Empire and the latter 'subverting' imperial assumptions (pp. 2-3). In terms of Hogg's short stories, Murray Pittock in *Scottish and Irish Romanticism* argues that Hogg's story 'The Brownie of the Black Hags' (discussed in more detail in chapter five) presents an alternative vision of history to the Scott-style historical romance novel (p. 255). Ian Duncan, in his introduction to the 2002 S/SC edition of James Hogg, *Winter Evening Tales*, ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: EUP, 2002), similarly suggests that Hogg's writing could be regarded as an 'alternative model of Scottish fiction' to the Waverley model of historical writing (p.xxi).

<sup>32</sup> As well as the texts discussed here, other notable works in Scottish Romantic studies include Janet Sorensen, *The Grammar of Empire in Eighteenth-Century British Writing* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), *English Romanticism and the Celtic World*, ed. by Gerard Curruthers and Alan Rawes (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*, ed. by Leith Davis, Ian Duncan and Janet Sorensen (Cambridge : Cambridge University Press, 2004), *Scotland, Ireland and the Romantic Aesthetic*, ed. by David Duff and Catherine Jones (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007), Andrew Lincoln, *Walter Scott and Modernity* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), and Robert Crawford, *The Bard: Robert Burns, a Biography* (London: Jonathan Cape, 2009).

hybridity of register and language which challenges ‘heteroglossic’ hierarchies, the construction of a heroic past through a ‘taxonomy of glory’, and the performance of self in diaspora through what is termed ‘fratriotism’.<sup>33</sup> In support of the national distinctiveness argument, Pittock suggests that ‘Hogg uses the same tension between Scottish and Anglicised speech and cultural formation as a challenge to attempts to control a narrative indented to produce that very closure [of a Unionist conformity in Scott’s work]’.<sup>34</sup> Pittock’s refocalisation of Romanticism away from an English centre has drawn criticism from Katie Trumpener, particularly for the decision to draw together Scotland and Ireland as a category in Pittock’s 2008 monograph *Scottish and Irish Romanticism*:

In Pittock’s account, however, Irish literature remains in the shadow of Scottish literature—and Scottish literature somehow emerges as the preeminent proto-post-colonial literature. In repeated references to Frantz Fanon, Pittock even implicitly aligns Anglo-Scottish writing with the liberation struggles of the Algerian War—a comparison which would quickly collapse under closer scrutiny.<sup>35</sup>

The issue of postcolonial criticality and Scottish literary studies, particularly in the wake of recent scholarship which has stressed the central and active Scottish role in empire and the slave trade, is addressed in sections of this thesis.<sup>36</sup> Mack’s 2006 *Scottish Fiction and the British Empire* discusses Hogg in depth, arguing that Hogg, along with Burns and Lewis Grassie Gibbon ‘found creative and ground breaking ways in which to allow subaltern voices to be heard - and thus to question some of the assumptions that sustained the master-narrative of the British Empire’, laying a path for post-imperial Scottish literature such as the work of Jackie Kay and James Kelman.<sup>37</sup> While Hogg’s relationship with Scotland’s empire is not the focus of this

---

<sup>33</sup> Pittock, ‘What is Scottish Romanticism?’, in *The Edinburgh Companion to Scottish Romanticism*, ed. by Pittock (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2011), pp. 1-10 (pp. 2-5).

<sup>34</sup> Pittock, ‘What is Scottish Romanticism?’, p. 3.

<sup>35</sup> Katie Trumpener, ‘Books Review: David Duff and Catherine Jones, eds, *Scotland, Ireland and the Romantic Aesthetic* (Lewisburg, PA: Bucknell University Press, 2007) and Murray Pittock, *Scottish and Irish Romanticism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008)’, in *International Journal of Scottish Literature* 6 (2010).

<http://www.ijsl.stir.ac.uk/issue6/duffjonespittockreview.htm> [accessed 1/7/2019]

<sup>36</sup> See chapter two for discussion of Hogg’s ‘The Pongos: A Letter from Southern Africa’ and Alker and Nelson’s essay on the story, and chapter five for discussion of Hogg’s story ‘Emigration’ and its appearance in the Boston anti-slavery periodical, *The Liberator*.

<sup>37</sup> Mack, *Scottish Fiction and the British Empire*, p. 12.

thesis, the work of Mack, and of Nelson and Alker, which has suggested that Hogg displays sympathy for the colonised,<sup>38</sup> is an example of the power of the idea that the ‘subaltern’ Hogg is an outsider.

Hogg’s national status and identity as a Scottish writer, emphasised through the growth in study of a discrete Scottish Romanticism, is an important element of his perceived dissidence. Katie Trumpener’s work has been significant in revealing what Pittock described as a ‘powerful and dynamic Scottish Romanticism’,<sup>39</sup> particularly through the notion of ‘bardic nationalism’.<sup>40</sup> Trumpener’s argument identifies the central role of the figure of the bard in Romantic-era nationalist and colonial discourse in Scotland, England, Ireland and Wales, decentering Romanticism’s prior focus on English cultural production, and illustrating how the ‘national tale’ was incorporated into the fictions of imperialism. Entering the theoretical debate surrounding nations and nationalism, Trumpener’s monograph offered a critique of Benedict Anderson’s historical-materialist thesis that national identity is a modern phenomenon, a ‘cultural artefact’ rather than essential value, aligning with the rise of print capitalism (including the emergence of the novel).<sup>41</sup> ‘Western Europe’s first modern nationalist movements emerge from different sets of circumstances to the collective interpellation of Anderson’ argues Trumpener, ‘displaying a far more complicated consciousness than the one Anderson postulates’.<sup>42</sup> Echoing elements of Trumpener’s critique of Anderson, Cairns Craig has used Scott to critique the ‘imagined community’ theory. For Craig, considering Scott’s dramatic and theatrical performativity allows us to push beyond Anderson by revealing the imagination as a medium through which values are contested, rather than a value in and of itself:

Scott understood that the dramatization of the nation was not about its fictionality or its truth, but about the values which its imaginings tested and

---

<sup>38</sup> Several of Hogg’s works appear to give voice to a variation of fratricide inasmuch as the author’s social marginalisation in Scotland leads him to deflect his sympathy onto the colonized peoples beyond its shores.’ See Alker and Nelson, ‘Empire and the ‘Brute Creation’: the limits of language in Hogg’s ‘the Pongos’, in *Literary Marketplace*, pp. 201-217 (p. 202).

<sup>39</sup> Pittock, ‘What is Scottish Romanticism?’, p. 1.

<sup>40</sup> See Katie Trumpener, *Bardic Nationalism: the Romantic Novel and the British Empire* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997).

<sup>41</sup> See Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism* 2<sup>nd</sup> edn (London: Verso, 1991), p. 4 and p. 36.

<sup>42</sup> Trumpener, *Bardic Nationalism*, p. 23.

which they projected as the path of action for the future. Imagination is not simply a value in itself: it is the medium through which, like the nation, our ultimate values are debated.<sup>43</sup>

Hogg scholars, including O'Halloran and Caroline McCracken-Flesher, have theorised Hogg's fictional representations of the imagined community of nation and have suggested that Hogg's approach 'exposes as fiction' the singularity of nationhood and stresses instead national fissure,<sup>44</sup> thus avoiding what Nigerian novelist Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie described as 'the danger of a single story'.<sup>45</sup> This thesis builds upon that scholarship by exploring how the national is signified within short stories, and considering how those national signifiers intersect with regional and class identities. Hogg is considered a Scottish writer, but he is not the *Scottish* Shepherd. It is perhaps in the latter chapters on Hogg in American magazines, and on Hogg in London magazines, where those national signifiers are foregrounded, given the change in audience and readerships. I argue that those signifiers of national distinctives (i.e. Scottishness) are tied to Hogg's performance of regional difference and class identities in his short stories, and that the form's characteristic portability brought Hogg's performance of authenticity into different modes of cultural encounters.

Craig's reflection on Scott and nationhood, discussed above, is also related to my argument because it introduces into the discussion the concept of the performative and theatrical text – and actions, citing Scott's role in the 1822 King's visit to Edinburgh - in 'staging' identities, values, and traditions. The notion of theatre and performativity in texts has found purchase in recent studies of the short story form, particularly in the work of Michael J. Collins.<sup>46</sup> Collins's argument takes issue with 'nationalist-

---

<sup>43</sup> Cairns Craig, 'Scott's Staging of the Nation', in *Studies in Romanticism* 40.1 (2001), 13-28 (p. 23).

<sup>44</sup> For more on the issue of nations, nationalism, and national identity in the work of Hogg, see Caroline McCracken-Flesher, 'Hogg and Nationality', in *Companion*, pp. 73-81 ; O'Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, Chapter 5; Penny Fielding, *Writing and Orality: Nationality, Culture, and Nineteenth-Century Scottish Fiction* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1996), pp. 122-31.

<sup>45</sup> Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie, 'The Danger of a Single Story', TED Talk (July, 2009) <[https://www.ted.com/talks/chimamanda\\_adichie\\_the\\_danger\\_of\\_a\\_single\\_story/transcript?language=en](https://www.ted.com/talks/chimamanda_adichie_the_danger_of_a_single_story/transcript?language=en)> [accessed 22/04/2019]

<sup>46</sup> See Michael J. Collins, *The Drama of the American Short Story, 1800-1865* (Michigan: University of Michigan Press, 2016).

formalist' histories of the short story form which have stressed the form's connection to bespoke national origins and traditions. Among the most prevalent in these nationalist-formalist histories, according to Collins, is the American short story:

In this landscape the search for authentically 'American' (or 'Scottish', 'English', 'Irish' etc.) cultural forms led to a renewed interest in the achievements of key exponents of the nineteenth-century short story. This was because an inheritance from German *Kultur* scholarship of seeing the genre as culturally authoritative and 'authentic' dovetailed neatly with pedagogical practices in the university that venerated close textual analysis.<sup>47</sup>

Collins suggests instead that we read the complex history of the form through a transnational, rather than national, lens, to understand the short story's formation out of processes of 'exchange and diffusion' – 'less a state of fixity to national character (registered by some twentieth-century critics as a comparable stability in the generic traits of short fiction) than an opportunity for a seemingly endless play with identities'.<sup>48</sup> Collins argues that to avoid formalist-nationalist exceptionalism in histories of the short story, we should instead:

look at a text's 'performance' of national or local particularity: not what it is, but what it does. For this reason, the most important counterpart for short fiction in the period was not the novel, or poetry, but theatre; specifically, a kind of touring show that adapted its meaning to localised needs and audiences.<sup>49</sup>

The above theory of the short story - 'not what it is, but what it does' – shapes my argument presented in the forthcoming chapters about the performance of authenticity in texts, conceived within my framework of portability and the short story. Collins's call for understanding the short story form not as an essence of national or local authenticity but as a textualised performance therefore underpins the analytical methodology of this thesis, and the likening of the short story to 'a kind of touring show', adaptable to changes in reception and audience, can, I suggest, be repurposed

---

<sup>47</sup> Collins, 'Transnationalism and the Transatlantic Short Story', in *The Edinburgh Companion to the Short Story in English*, ed. by Paul Delaney and Adrian Hunter (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2019), pp. 9-23 (p. 10).

<sup>48</sup> Collins, 'Transnationalism', p. 11.

<sup>49</sup> Collins, 'Transnationalism', p. 14.

within the paradigm of the form's characteristic portability. In the following thesis I offer a sustained examination of Hogg's performance of authenticity in his short stories, in which I argue that the form as a portable 'touring show' brought Hogg's narrational and authorial strategies into different cultural encounters. While particular meanings associated with authenticity alter, for example as the reception changes from London to America, the staging of marginality in Hogg's handling of the form is culturally transferable through the portable short story.

*The short story: a form with a heritage*

This thesis historicises the short story form by situating it within and across its mutable contexts of publication in the case of Hogg. Historicising the form in such a manner involves an engagement with the critical historiography of short story theory in English language scholarship, particularly in America and the United Kingdom. The later nineteenth century is significant in the short story's critical historiography, with the first recording of the term 'short story' appearing in 1877 according to *OED*, and the influential Brander Matthews essay 'The Philosophy of the Short Story' appearing in 1884. In a UK context, Claire Hanson in 1985 explained that 1880 'has been chosen as a convenient opening date for this study because it marks a point when the short story began to flower in England'.<sup>50</sup> There is some degree of overlap between uses of Britain and England in the form's scholarly history, which is worth drawing attention to when considering the short story in Scotland. 'It is a widely accepted argument', according to David Malcolm, 'that the modern British short story, and even the British short story *tout court*, dates from around 1880'.<sup>51</sup> Malcolm addresses Dean Baldwin's 1993 essay, 'The Tardy Evolution of the British Short Story', in which Baldwin argues that the 'modern short story' 'was late to blossom in Britain', not achieving prominence until the 1880s, a surprising tardiness for Baldwin given that 'Britain was the leader in the writing and dissemination of fiction' in the earlier decades of the nineteenth century.<sup>52</sup> Baldwin argues that literary economics determined the lower status of the short story in Britain, as the form 'brought little financial gain or public

---

<sup>50</sup> Clare Hanson, *Short Stories and Short Fictions, 1880-1980* (Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1985), p. 8.

<sup>51</sup> David Malcolm, *The British and Irish Short Story Handbook* (Chichester: Wiley, 2012), p. 3.

<sup>52</sup> Dean Baldwin, 'The Tardy Evolution of the British Short Story', in *Studies in Short Fiction*, 30:1 (1993), 1-10 (p. 1).

fame' to authors and was subordinate to the prestige of the novel in fiction writing.<sup>53</sup> Echoes of this can also be found in Harold Orel's study of Victorian short stories, which emphasises their status as 'by-products' in the work of writers such as Dickens.<sup>54</sup> 'The English... will have nothing to do with a story unless it is in three volumes', suggested an 1858 essay in *Fraser's Magazine* of London.<sup>55</sup> Through its historicist approach, this thesis shows that the short story was far from a 'by-product' in the work of James Hogg; it was a centrally important element of his writing career and his prolific treatment of the form appeared much earlier in the century than the supposed later-century flowering of the form in Britain. Broadly speaking, the case of Hogg suggests that prevailing ideas about the 'tardy' development of the form in Britain can be challenged and suggests instead that, in the words of Andrew Levy, the short story is a form with 'substantial heritage'.<sup>56</sup> This argument requires engagement with the troublesome issue of formal definitions, addressed in more detail below.

It is worth stressing here the dialectic between short story writing and short story criticism, with Tim Killick arguing that the shift from miscellaneous short fictions, such as the tale, sketch and vignette, to the notion of a short story 'proper' as the nineteenth century progressed was 'critically led ... that is to say, theoretical critiques of the short story began to appear around the mid-nineteenth century, and these efforts at definition invited stories which then endorsed the conventions established.'<sup>57</sup> The form's apparent emergence later in the century in Britain, then, could be considered a self-conscious formal development – a form that develops out of critical imaginings of itself. This analysis of a critical-formal self-consciousness in the dialectic between writing and criticism could also be applied to 'the leading document in the history of the short story', Edgar Allan Poe's 1842 review of Nathaniel Hawthorne's *Twice Told Tales*.<sup>58</sup> Poe, who is, according to Andrew Levy, 'the patron saint and the

---

<sup>53</sup> Malcolm, p. 3.

<sup>54</sup> Harold Orel, *The Victorian Short Story: Development and Triumph of a Literary Genre* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986), p. 64.

<sup>55</sup> Malcolm, p. 3.

<sup>56</sup> Baldwin, 'The Tardy Evolution of the British Short Story', p. 1; Andrew Levy, *The Culture and Commerce of the American Short Story* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), p.9.

<sup>57</sup> Tim Killick, *British Short Fiction in the Early Nineteenth Century: The Rise of the Tale* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008), p. 10.

<sup>58</sup> Levy, p. 11.

neighbourhood bully of the American short story’,<sup>59</sup> famously argued that a ‘tale’ (he does not use the term short story) is a narrative that one can read ‘at one sitting’, ‘a half-hour to one or two hours’, and should be focused towards creating a ‘unity of effect’ upon the reader. Levy argues that Poe’s review should be considered as part of his project to legitimise, and to market, his own short story writing in magazine form – to bestow upon the form a set of formalised poetics and aesthetics to grant it more cultural weight and value, moving away from a ‘by-product’ subsidiary-to-novel status, turning the form’s ‘disposability’ as a cultural artefact and its conciseness into positive formal values.<sup>60</sup> Poe, like Hogg, was a magazinist, and the concise and ‘disposable’ short story was ideal for publication in magazines. My argument foregrounds the role of the magazine in shaping the formal characteristics of the short story in the case of Hogg, dedicating chapters to specific magazine contexts including Hogg’s own magazine *The Spy*, his contributions to *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine*, his contributions to London magazines, and his appearances in US magazines.

There are two closely related issues in this critical overview of short story theory and writing: historical chronology in (and between) both Britain and America, and formal definitions. On the former, Levy, in his work on the American short story, has argued that there is a recurring emphasis on the short story as a ‘brash, new form’ or as a form continually undergoing renewal. ‘But the fact is’, argues Levy, ‘the short story does have tradition’.<sup>61</sup> David Malcolm troubles the formalist historical chronology of the later-century short story thesis in Britain by suggesting that ‘there had been short fictional narratives in British literature for centuries before the 1880s’.<sup>62</sup> Killick’s work, particularly in the 2008 monograph *British Short Fiction in the Early Nineteenth Century: The Rise of the Tale*, has been important in historicising what Levy called the ‘substantial heritage’ of the short story form,<sup>63</sup> and has looked to push

---

<sup>59</sup> Levy, p. 10.

<sup>60</sup> Levy, p. 21.

<sup>61</sup> Levy, p. 9.

<sup>62</sup> Malcolm, p. 4.

<sup>63</sup> Levy, p. 9.

beyond the standard departure point for histories of the modern short story, 1830s America:

Edgar Allan Poe and Nathaniel Hawthorne in America, and Charles Dickens in Britain, are held up as the forefathers of the genre, with a cursory nod to a few writers, such as Washington Irving ... the short fiction of the early decades of the nineteenth century remains a rich and varied area of publishing history which has historically been under-researched and undervalued.<sup>64</sup>

This thesis builds upon Killick's work by exploring Hogg's treatment of the form in the decades prior to the form's 1830s American and later-century British 'birth'. Killick addresses Hogg's short fiction writing by considering two of his book-format collections of short stories, *Winter Evening Tales* (1820) and *The Shepherd's Calendar* (1829), which are discussed in detail in chapter three of this thesis. Killick acknowledges the role of the magazine (particularly *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*) in Hogg's short story output and in the history of short fiction more broadly,<sup>65</sup> and his analysis reiterates established tropes within Hogg studies: the role of reader agency creating meaning from narrative inconsistency, Hogg's emphasis on the value of the superstitious and older beliefs which 'break the anthropological mould', and the playful 'debunking [of] notions of fact and truth'.<sup>66</sup> Killick argues that 'the formal qualities of Hogg's works, especially the short fiction, are inseparable' from his challenging of ideas of authorship, fictionality, truth, and identity.<sup>67</sup> Killick's synthesis of form with both aesthetics and ideological function is useful for my own argument, in which I suggest that Hogg uses the form of the short story to perform authenticity at the intersections of class, region, nation, and vernacularity to assert agency in the contest over author function(s).

There are some critical points of departure between Killick's work and the present thesis. *Winter Evening Tales*, according to Killick, 'never quite fulfilled [Hogg's] grand ambitions' because of this continued subversion of notions of truth in narrative,

---

<sup>64</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 2

<sup>65</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 16. For his discussion of Hogg in particular see p. 130-139.

<sup>66</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, pp. 34-37.

<sup>67</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 133.

and the collection is undermined by the chasing of ‘its tail’ and questions ‘its own relevance’.<sup>68</sup> This thesis does not attempt to evaluate Hogg’s output in such a manner nor measure texts against Hogg’s ‘grand ambitions’. Rather, Hogg’s ‘grand ambitions’ are considered as contestations of the author function(s) (a concept discussed in further detail below) in what Pierre Bourdieu called the ‘field of cultural production’, in which subject positions are shaped by forces including literary economics (the expansion, for example, of the periodical press, the success of *Waverley*, and the state of copyright law), the literary marketplace (that is, other writers such as Scott, and publishers such as William Blackwood), and class status and social and cultural capital. Hogg’s agency in this process, I argue, is wielded through form, its dialogue with contexts of publication, and the performance of authenticity within that dialogue, a process which is shown to be in continual contest and renegotiation between texts, the literary marketplace, and media of publication throughout Hogg’s writing career. Rather than limiting texts and authorship in the way Killick suggests, narratives which question their own relevance and chase their textual tails are an integral part of this paradigm, and of the Hoggian short story aesthetic.

The issue of formal and generic definition is integral to the historical chronology of the form, and to the notion of a developmental formal history, a kind of formal stadialism, towards the ‘modern short story’ proper.<sup>69</sup> ‘Die short story ist sympathitisch resistant gegen über Definitionen’, according to Renate Brosch, translated to English as ‘the short story charmingly resists definitions’.<sup>70</sup> As Levy reminds us, ‘over the past six generations, what we now call the short story has been written in numerous formal shapes’.<sup>71</sup> ‘It isn’t even true’, argues Joyce Carol Oates, ‘that short stories are necessarily short’.<sup>72</sup> Furthermore, Mary Louise Pratt argues that

---

<sup>68</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 139.

<sup>69</sup> Stadias theory is a Scottish Enlightenment-era concept of progress in which human societies can be considered as existing on a staged scale between ‘savagery’ and ‘civilisation’. See Aaran Garrett, ‘Anthropology: the ‘original’ of human nature’, in *The Cambridge Companion to the Scottish Enlightenment*, ed. by Alexander Broadie (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), pp. 79-93.

<sup>70</sup> Malcolm, p. 35.

<sup>71</sup> Levy, p. 3.

<sup>72</sup> Levy, p. 4.

there is no consistent use of the term 'genre' itself, and that genre criticism has been too concerned with distinguishing one from the other in an unambiguous way.<sup>73</sup>

This system-orientated, structural approach needs to be complimented by a genre criticism that concerns itself not only with criterial features of genre alone, but with non-essential occasional ones.<sup>74</sup>

More recently, Collins has problematised formalist-definitionist histories of the short story by suggesting that scholarship should look, as Killick's work has, to the diffuse nature of forms which feed in to the short story, including eighteenth-century periodical forms such as the sketch, didactic tales, epistolary fictions, Socratic dialogues, and reveries. Collins also takes issue with the concept of a 'short story proper':

It is worth saying that much of what is understood to be the 'short story proper', as Charles May and others have defined it, was the provenance of authors working for the bourgeois audience. A fuller account of the short story's 'origins' would include the work of writers operating in alternative traditions such as the enormously influential *Cheap Repository Tracts* of Hannah More or the innumerable broadsides and pamphlets that circulated in the Atlantic world of the eighteen and nineteenth centuries.<sup>75</sup>

Collins suggests that scholarship should move away from attempts to fix upon a settled definition of the form, arguing instead that 'there is more than simply one form of the short story'.<sup>76</sup> Instead, Collins's argument conceives of a broadly-defined and mutable 'short story' form rejecting a teleological formal-historical evolution, encompassing a diffuse range of forms.

The historicising work of Killick and Collins on the short story builds upon, and partly works against, older arguments about the short story as a form and its history, some of which have been discussed above. Brander Matthews in 1884 and H.E. Bates in

---

<sup>73</sup> Mary Louise Pratt, 'The Short Story: The long and the short of it', *Poetics* 10 (1981) 175-194 (p. 176).

<sup>74</sup> Pratt, 'The long and the short of it', p. 178.

<sup>75</sup> Collins, 'Transnationalism', p. 11.

<sup>76</sup> Collins, 'Transnationalism', p. 11.

1941 built respectively upon Poe's argument about the form of 1842, and, importantly, rebranded the discussion under the header 'short story'. Robert Mahler argues that the 1850s was the key moment in a new conception of the genre as the 'short story' broke away from the 'tale':

The ability to suggest, to evoke, without resorting to explanations was increasingly praised. Tacked-on moral tags became a sign of mediocrity.<sup>77</sup>

Killick summarises Charles May's attempt to historicise the form as one that 'has managed to avoid the elaborate realism of the novel and retain its connections to mythic, elemental story forms'. For May, the genre operates through a poetic technique of 'metaphoric projection and hierophantic revelation', and in doing so retains strong links to its romance heritage'.<sup>78</sup> The Romantic era occupies an uncomfortable position in the history of the short story, not least because, as Collins reminds us, later critical attempts to define a 'short story proper' are ahistorical and ill-suited to application to the period. 'The Romantic period', explains David Stewart, 'is frequently passed over in accounts of the rise of the short story, yet it was witness to a remarkable increase in its publication'.<sup>79</sup> Stewart suggests that this has led to not only the existence 'of a critical blind-spot, but also the curious resistance Romantic stories have to absorption into narratives of, in Harold Orel's phrase, the 'development and triumph of a literary genre', the 'modern short story'.<sup>80</sup>

For May, 'one of the most important and influential short story theorists',<sup>81</sup> Romantic-era aesthetics and sensibilities are intimately bound to the development of the short story:

The romantics attempted to demythologise folktales, to divest them of their external values, and to remythologise them by internalising those values and self-consciously projecting them onto the external world ... The folktale, which previously had existed seemingly in vacuo as a received story not influenced

---

<sup>77</sup> Mahler, pp. 59-60.

<sup>78</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 10.

<sup>79</sup> David Stewart, 'Romantic Short Fiction', in *The Cambridge Companion to the English Short Story*, ed by Ann-Marie Einhaus (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 73-86 (p. 73).

<sup>80</sup> Stewart, 'Romantic Short Fiction', p. 73.

<sup>81</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 8.

by the teller, became infused with the subjectivity of the poet and projected onto the world as a new mythos ... Just as the uniting of folktale material with the voice of an individual perceiver in a concrete situation gave rise to the romantic lyric, as Robert Langbaum has shown, the positioning of a real speaker in a concrete situation, encountering a specific phenomenon that his own subjectivity transforms from the profane into the sacred, gave rise to the short story.<sup>82</sup>

Killick considers May's account 'wishful thinking' that does not bear any resemblance to the historical record of short fiction in the Romantic-era. 'The notion of a clear-cut and homogeneous Romantic tradition of the short story does not exist', insists Killick.<sup>83</sup>

Both Stewart and Collins share Killick's stress upon a heterogeneity of forms that make up the early nineteenth-century short story. Indeed, Killick prefers the term 'short fiction' as opposed to the 'theoretically loaded' short story.<sup>84</sup> 'It is hard to know what to call it', argues Stewart, pointing to the anecdote, the sketch, the tale, novellas, fictional essays and other miscellaneous and unclassifiable forms.<sup>85</sup> 'Romantic-era short fiction is so interesting', argues Stewart, 'because it seems so uncertain of its own form', making it 'hard to theorise, but it is also a source of the fiction's vitality'.<sup>86</sup> It is this diffuseness, this blurring of generic and formal boundaries, and crossing of print media (and national borders) from magazine to book, that is characteristic of Hogg's treatment of the form. It is a form that refuses fixity, preferring instead portability.

Collins, however, sticks with the term short story, qualifying its use through an acceptance of its formal diffusion and heterogeneity: 'it is perhaps enough to say that there is more than simply one form of the short story'. Taking forward Collins's

---

<sup>82</sup> Quoted in Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 8.

<sup>83</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 8.

<sup>84</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 10.

<sup>85</sup> Stewart, 'Romantic Short Fiction', p. 82.

<sup>86</sup> Stewart, 'Romantic Short Fiction', p. 82.

reasoning, this thesis deploys the term short story in its discussion of Hogg's treatment of short fictional narratives. As shall be shown throughout, Hogg's stories are neither homogenous in style nor in terms of their content. Some, for example, including 'Maria's Tale' (1810), 'A Scots Mummy' (1823) and 'Singular Letter from Southern Africa' (1829), deploy epistolary fictional forms. Many of his short stories contain folktale idioms and motifs identified by the Soviet formalist and folklore-narrative theorist Vladimir Propp as 'functions' of the folktale. Take for example Hogg's story 'The Brownie of the Black Hags' (1828), in which a villain (Merodach) effects a substitution, replacing himself with the sleeping son and enabling a murder to be committed – mixing two archetypal folktale 'functions' identified by Propp.<sup>87</sup> Others, such as 'Some Terrible Letters from Scotland', fuse together multiple shorter epistolary forms. Some, despite John Plotz's characterisation of Hogg the short story writer as 'an almost anti-Poe', could be read as a 'unity of effect', such as Hogg's 'Emigration' which deals singularly (a term much-used by Hogg) with the emotional response of Scottish emigration to north America, involving uncertainty, sadness, and then relief through narrative resolution.<sup>88</sup> Hogg's stories, like the short story more broadly, particularly in the earlier nineteenth century, are multifarious in style, length, and content, and resist fixed formal definitions.

Accepting the formal slipperiness of Hogg's short stories in this manner is not to suggest that they cannot be theorised together. If attempts to search for a 'short story proper' in the era have been ahistorical in their tendency to view the form according to twentieth-century expectations of short story aesthetics as Collins suggests, this thesis re-historicises the study of the form by reconstructing the specific historical contexts of publication, including considering media such as the periodical magazine, the chapbook, and the bound-book, and situating Hogg's short stories in relation to those historical contexts. The structure of the thesis is broadly chronological though it is organised according to form, medium, and place, with individual chapters grouped together according to the contexts of their publication. It also considers those print contexts in relation to geography, with chapters four and five analysing how their

---

<sup>87</sup> Vladimir Propp, *Morphology of the Folk Tale*, trans. by Laurence Scott and Louis A. Wagner, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Austin, Texas: University of Texas Press, 1968), p. 33.

<sup>88</sup> Plotz, 'Hogg and the Short Story', p. 115.

appearance in the periodical press of both London and America respectively shaped the function of Hogg's short stories. The importance of contexts of publication in the historical record of the short story is foregrounded in the structure and methodology of this thesis. Historicising contexts allows for the diffuse form(s) of the early nineteenth-century short story in the case of Hogg to be theorised together as a portable form, and suggests that the form has a longer history than pre-Killick scholarship had suggested. This heritage is not that of a 'by-product' of other prose forms, it is considered as a central aspect of Hogg's literary production in its own right.

### *Periodical magazines and the book*

One of the reasons why the short story proves so fruitful for the study of Hogg's narrational and authorial strategies concerning authenticity and agency is because of the form's important relationship with the periodical magazine in the early nineteenth-century. Magazines were a medium which sustained Hogg's literary production from his first publications of poetry in the *Scots Magazine*, to his own periodical paper *The Spy* in 1810 when he had arrived in Edinburgh to begin life as a professional writer, to the launch of *Blackwood's* in 1817, and to the publication of his stories in London and US magazines up to (and following) his death in 1835 after the breakdown in relations with William Blackwood of Edinburgh by 1829. For these reasons, perhaps the most important context of publication concerning Hogg's short story output is the periodical magazine. This is not only because of the sheer quantity of stories he produced in magazine form, but because of the chronology of the 'ephemeral life' of the short stories.<sup>89</sup> Broadly speaking, although there are important outliers, the direction of travel in the case of Hogg is from magazine to book, as short stories begin their lives as forms within magazines before then being collected into book-format anthologies and collections. As well as providing an important critical context in terms of the amount of items Hogg produced throughout his career, the magazine as a literary medium, I argue, shapes how short stories function.

---

<sup>89</sup> Emma Liggins, Andrew Maunder and Ruth Robbins, *The British Short Story* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), p. 4.

In arguing for the importance of the magazine form in shaping how short stories function, this thesis builds on periodical studies by scholars such as Mark Parker who argue that the periodical as a medium ‘does not simply stand in secondary relation to the literary work it contains’; rather, it contains ‘a dynamic relation among contributions [that] informs and creates meaning’.<sup>90</sup> Jon Klancher’s work on the readership and audiences between 1790 and 1832 stressed that periodicals, rather than being passive receptacles, engage an active relationship between audience and magazine through a process that he terms ‘making audiences’, which meant ‘evolving readers’ interpretive frameworks and shaping their ideological awareness’.<sup>91</sup> This move towards a consideration of the periodical press as a form, genre, or medium (dependent on preferred terminology)<sup>92</sup> has stressed that ‘literary magazines should be an object of study in their own right’.<sup>93</sup> Robert Mayo has argued that periodicals were the only economically viable medium for short fiction in the early nineteenth century.<sup>94</sup> While the role of the magazine in shaping Hogg’s short story output has been noted by scholars in Hogg studies, however not all studies of Hogg’s handling of the short story has recognised the role of the magazine. Penny Fielding foregrounds the role of the periodical magazine and reads Hogg’s short stories as displaying an awareness ‘of their own location in magazines’.<sup>95</sup> While Fielding emphasises the magazine contexts of Hogg’s stories, more recent work on Hogg and the short story by Plotz neglects the role of magazines in conditioning the short story’s aesthetics and function.<sup>96</sup> Given the space limitations of Plotz’s essay, this is not a criticism of the scholarship it provides. Indeed, the ideas offered by Plotz on Hogg’s narrational strategies in the short form have influenced this thesis. Rather, I wish to stress that there is value in offering a sustained and expansive study of Hogg’s short stories in the manner offered by this thesis, taking into account the various ways in which magazines shaped Hogg’s narrational and authorial strategies in his short stories.

---

<sup>90</sup> Mark Parker, *Literary Magazines and British Romanticism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), p. 3.

<sup>91</sup> Jon Klancher, *The Making of English Reading Audiences, 1790-1832* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987), p. 4.

<sup>92</sup> In this thesis I use the term ‘medium’ for books and periodicals.

<sup>93</sup> Parker, *Literary Magazines*, p. 1.

<sup>94</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 23.

<sup>95</sup> Fielding, *Writing and Orality*, p. 122.

<sup>96</sup> Plotz, ‘Hogg and the Short Story’, p. 115.

The magazine was, according to Parker, ‘the preeminent literary form of the 1820s and 1830s in Britain’.<sup>97</sup> Ian Duncan has discussed the magazine’s role in shaping serialised fiction, such as John Galt’s *The Ayrshire Legatees; or the Correspondence of the Pringle Family*, serialised in *Blackwood’s* between 1820 and 1821. Serialisation, according to Duncan, ‘provided a dynamic framework for the effects of fragmentation and heterogeneity’.<sup>98</sup> Both the *Legatees* and Galt’s *The Steamboat* ‘thematise the magazine’s infrastructure of circulation and distribution’ new transport technology and new networks of exchange, and the short epistolary form those narratives take allowed readers to enter a dialogue with texts which occupy a middle-ground between reference and invention.<sup>99</sup> Some of those elements, such as the ‘Responsive Notices’ at the end of each serialised entry, did not appear in the collected narrative within the book format.<sup>100</sup> In the case of Hogg we see this process of altered functions of narratives as they are transported between media of publication. The editor’s end-note in ‘Affecting Narrative of a Country Girl’ in Hogg’s magazine *The Spy* (1810), for example, does not appear in the collected book version of the short story, as ‘Maria’s Tale’, in *Winter Evening Tales* (1820). This small textual alteration has a significant effect upon how the narrative functions, removing it from the dialogic magazine print environment of *The Spy* and eliminating the explicit expression of sympathy for a destitute single mother.

More recent studies have built upon Mayo’s work to suggest that periodicals should be considered in their totality. ‘As such’, suggests Killick, ‘periodicals require study as complete and integrated texts, where the editorial matter, criticism, essays, and literary content constitute a dialogue both inside and outside the pages of magazines.’<sup>101</sup> David Stewart reworks the arguments of periodical culture scholars such as Klancher which emphasised the distinctiveness of magazines and their

---

<sup>97</sup> Quoted in Duncan, ‘Altered States: Galt, Serial Fiction, and the Romantic Miscellany’, in *John Galt: Observations and Conjectures in Literature, History and Society*, ed. by Regina Hewitt (Washington DC: Lexington Books, 2012), pp. 53-71 (p. 55).

<sup>98</sup> Duncan, ‘Altered States’, p. 55.

<sup>99</sup> Duncan, ‘Altered States’, p. 56 and p. 57.

<sup>100</sup> Duncan, ‘Altered States’, p. 59.

<sup>101</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 23.

engagement of audiences, arguing that Romantic-era magazines were distinctive because they were at once ‘permanent and throwaway’, and are ‘conscious of their culturally in-between status’:<sup>102</sup>

At once literary and extra-literary, ephemeral and permanent, magazines offer the best clue to understanding the vexed relationship between literature and material culture that characterised the writing of the post-war decade.<sup>103</sup>

For Stewart, magazines ‘offered a form of cultural experience which was influenced by, though not exclusively tied to, the metropolis’.<sup>104</sup> This ‘metropolitan model’ of literary culture involves the function of audiences in shaping literary forms as ‘a miscellaneous format reflects a miscellaneous readership’, and magazines as a literary genre mirror the ‘metropolis’s capacity to place different categories together in juxtaposition’.<sup>105</sup> Stewart’s argument about metropolitan reading cultures is important when thinking about Hogg’s short stories in the periodical press, because Hogg’s stories self-consciously perform their ‘other-ness’ to the metropolitan magazines in which they appeared, such as *Blackwood’s* in Edinburgh and *Fraser’s* in London. Though the respective metropolitan identities that these magazines address are often significantly different from one another, Hogg’s short stories retain a dialectic between the margins and the metropolis, a mutable tension carried between the contexts of Ettrick and Edinburgh, rural southern Scotland and London, and ‘old world’ Scotland and US cities. This dynamic deepens our understanding of Hogg’s self-fashioning as a rustic outsider by showing how the historical print culture of the short story shaped and foregrounded those questions of authenticity and agency.

Hogg writes against the ‘metropolitan model’, yet in doing so he operates within it by speaking to an assumed metropolitan audience. This process is perhaps most acute in his later short stories in London magazines, such as ‘Some Terrible Letters from Scotland’ in the *Metropolitan Magazine* in 1832, discussed in chapter four. Stewart’s emphasis on the materiality of the magazine alongside its literariness also helps to

---

<sup>102</sup> David Stewart, *Romantic Magazines and Metropolitan Literary Culture* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), p. 6.

<sup>103</sup> Stewart, *Romantic Magazines*, p. 13.

<sup>104</sup> Stewart, *Romantic Magazines*, p. 7.

<sup>105</sup> Stewart, *Romantic Magazines*, p. 9 and p. 7.

shape the concept of portability as put forward by this thesis, which considers the characteristic portability of Hogg's short stories in both textually and physically portable terms. Killick echoes Poe's 1842 theory of the disposability of short fiction, arguing that magazines and other periodicals 'are cultural artefacts which are far more ephemeral and disposable than the book', and that short fiction within magazines 'represents an insubstantial part of an insubstantial medium'.<sup>106</sup> The concept of portability, I argue, allows an analysis of the short story and the magazine to push beyond thinking about the form in the descriptive categories of insubstantiality and ephemerality, or as a foil to the book. Instead, the concept of portability as a means for understanding the early nineteenth-century short story involves both the material and the literary nature of historical texts and their contexts of production, publication, and circulation, moving between notions of ephemerality and permanence.

As well as (and often appearing originally) in magazines, Hogg's portable short stories appeared in book format publications during his lifetime, and this thesis (particularly in chapter three) discusses the extent to which, and in what ways, the medium of the book shaped both the form and the content of short stories.<sup>107</sup> Stewart has argued that the novel, particularly Scott's *Waverley Novels* (published from 1814):

are usually taken as providing a foil to the short story. Scott's novels combine a rambling multi-volume picture of the diverse realities of historical fact with the romance desire to find a full and comfortable resolution (a marriage, a death, the restoration of the ruling order).<sup>108</sup>

---

<sup>106</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 33.

<sup>107</sup> The collection of short works of literature into book formats took varying forms in the Romantic period, largely the miscellany, the gift-book, and the anthology or short story collection. These forms, according to O'Halloran, embody a tension in the Romantic-era between notions of 'high' and 'low' cultural production, with 'high' art being superior to popular taste and consumption habits, and therefore enduring in time, whereas 'low' art was conceived as being produced for immediate consumption by 'increasingly large' reading audiences (O'Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, pp. 24-25; p. 222). See chapter three for more discussion on this.

<sup>108</sup> Stewart, 'Romantic Short Fiction', p. 76. It is important to note that Ian Duncan has warned against the assumption that Scott's novels contain within them 'closures': 'The impulse to read Scott's novels as closing down the formal and political potentialities of Romantic-era fiction has made it harder, perhaps, to attend to all that they opened up – as though their author's counterrevolutionary politics must have determined a general dynamic of closure. Yet opening up, rather than closure, characterises the revolutionary impact of these novels on the nineteenth-century literary field'. See Duncan, *Scott's Shadow*, p. 98.

The association of the novel with the bound-book, often triple-decker, format, has led some scholars to read the short story collection as an attempt to find cultural and literary parity with the novel form:

Indeed, as Meredith McGill has argued in relation to Hawthorne and Poe, the push for many authors to collect their disparate short fictions within the more stable and locatable form of the book, [bringing] the unstable genre of the short story under the auspices of the evolving form of the modern novel through means of framing devices, identifiable narrators (singular and plural) and thematic consistency.<sup>109</sup>

The ‘more stable and locatable’ medium of the book has thus been defined against the less stable magazine. Ian Duncan, however, warns against considering Hogg’s relationship to competing literary forms as a binary between heterogeneity and canonical unity. ‘Instead of a stately procession of historical romances’, writes Duncan, ‘Hogg’s tales and sketches reiterate their miscellaneous, popular origins and resist absorption into a larger, synthetic, uniform genre – a ‘Waverley novel’’.<sup>110</sup> There is, insists Duncan, a difference between Hogg’s ‘collected works’, such as *Winter Evening Tales* and *Altrive Tales*, and the canonical formation of the Scottian novel.<sup>111</sup>

This thesis argues that the major book format collections of Hogg’s short stories which appeared during his lifetime can be considered together as part of Hogg’s long-running project to, in his own words, ‘have [his short fiction] brought into some *tangible* form’.<sup>112</sup> Heeding scholarship that has identified the importance of the book format collection as significant in shaping narratives and how they are read, I consider book form collections of short stories not in binary opposition to the magazine short

---

<sup>109</sup> Collins, ‘Transnationalism’, p.11. For discussion of the function of the ‘frame tale’ in Hogg’s narrative poem *The Queen’s Wake* (1813/19) and novel *The Three Perils of Man* (1822) see Mark Ittensohn, ‘Fictionalising the Romantic Marketplace: Self-reflexivity in the Early-Nineteenth-Century Frame Tale’, *Victoriographies* 7.1 (2017) pp. 25–41. Ittensohn briefly discusses the frame tale as a connector between items within a book collection, using Peter Murphy who argues that it provided for the ‘need to make a book’ in Romantic-era literary culture (p. 29).

<sup>110</sup> Ian Duncan, ‘Introduction’, in James Hogg, *Winter Evening Tales*, ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh university Press, 2002), p. xxi.

<sup>111</sup> See Duncan, ‘Introduction’, *Winter Evening Tales*, pp. xi-xli.

<sup>112</sup> Mack, ‘Introduction’, *The Shepherd’s Calendar*, pp. xi-xxix (p. xv). Italics my own.

story, but rather as a medium which shaped not only the content of narratives, but also how those narratives were encountered. I consider the book format short story collection as a fragmented totality ‘complete with missing parts’, through which Hogg attempted to seize the cultural production of the author functions of the Ettrick Shepherd.<sup>113</sup> *Altrive Tales*, for example, when read alongside its planned (and failed) publication history as the first part of a twelve volume Hoggian ‘magnus opus’, as a fragment offers a vision of totality – a life’s work, reclaiming the entirety of the ‘Ettrick Shepherd’ and pre-empting the condescension of posterity. Hogg’s book format collections of stories also contained paratextual material which shaped the function of texts. *Altrive Tales*, for example, contained an autobiographic introductory text and *Winter Evening Tales* had the subtitle ‘collected among the cottagers in the south of Scotland’. These paratexts engaged with the stories within the books through their foregrounding of the performance of regional, national and social-class based authenticity.

Hogg sought the idea of ‘tangibility’ represented by the book as a literary medium and object in an attempt to seize and reclaim the Ettrick Shepherd from its ‘co-option’ and ‘identity theft’ within the emergent magazine culture of *Blackwood’s*.<sup>114</sup> In foregrounding the book as material-literary object in shaping short stories, this thesis argues that book format collections of short stories are contested and contestable mediums which involve a continual process of re-shaping power dynamics in their production.<sup>115</sup> Examining Hogg’s book collections as a publishing context enhances our understanding of Hogg as a marginalised labouring-class writer whose attempts to reclaim agency through the performance of authenticity were continually mediated through power dynamics within the field of literary production. As a form which moved between the magazine and the book, the portable short story allows for an analysis of those processes of literary production across media.

---

<sup>113</sup> Adrian Hunter, ‘Complete with missing parts’: *Modernist short fiction as interrogative text* (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Glasgow, 1999), p. 12.

<sup>114</sup> Schoenfield, p. 8.

<sup>115</sup> The most explicit example of this being Robert Hogg’s textual edits of Hogg’s short stories for the 1829 *Shepherd’s Calendar*, at the behest of William Blackwood. See chapter two for discussion of this, including an overview of Douglas Mack’s study of the textual alterations made to the *Shepherd’s Calendar* stories.

*Authenticity, orality and vernacularity*

I argue throughout this thesis that Hogg uses the short story to exert agency in the construction, and contestation of, his authorial identities through the textual performance of authenticity. For Mark Schoenfield, periodical culture was the site through which notions of identity were constructed in the Romantic-era, and magazines such as *Blackwood's* exploited 'the fluid structure of identity to formulate literary identity', which in its case was an identity operating 'within the scheme of Tory historical consciousness'.<sup>116</sup> This process of identity-making in periodical culture, argues Schoenfield, was particularly marked in the case of James Hogg:

The malleability of the self allowed for its incorporation into other structures of identity – the Ettrick Shepherd, *Noctes Ambrosianae*, Romanticism – and its function as both threat and opportunity for literary inventiveness. This dynamic, if more extreme for James Hogg than most other authors, operated as the ongoing dialectic between periodicals and Romantic identity.<sup>117</sup>

Magazines like *Blackwood's*, which, as Stewart reminds us, were rooted in metropolitan culture, shaped Hogg's construction of his literary identities. For Timothy Baker, Hogg 'frequently exploits his dual position as a representative of unlettered, rural identity ... and as a member of Edinburgh's literary establishment: Hogg is presented as an authentic countryman who has infiltrated the urban intellectual sphere'.<sup>118</sup> Hogg's authenticity forms part of the thesis put forward by Suzanne Gilbert, who writes that Hogg's use of the 'authority of tradition' across genres challenged the metropolitan literati's Enlightenment ideas of tradition, particularly concerning the oral tradition. 'With Hogg's adoption of traditional forms of expressions came the emergence of his mission to represent subaltern Scottish

---

<sup>116</sup> Mark Schoenfield, *British Periodicals and Romantic Identity: The 'Literary Lower Empire'* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), p. 7

<sup>117</sup> Schoenfield, p. 8.

<sup>118</sup> Timothy C. Baker, 'The Short Story in Scotland: From Oral Tale to Dialectal Style', in *The Cambridge History of the English Short Story*, ed. by in Dominic Head (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 202-218 (p. 203).

experience rather than to be represented by the literati's constructions of it', a mission that was according to Gilbert 'deeply rooted in Hogg's own life'.<sup>119</sup>

Hogg's connection to authentic 'subaltern' cultures of oral tradition forms an important strand running through Hogg criticism, recognising him as a writer whose 'whole creative identity can be seen as held in tension between these oral and written traditions'.<sup>120</sup> As Penny Fielding reminds us, however, 'the more we examine the relationship between 'orality' and 'writing', the less stable it seems to be, and the less confident we become in deciding quite what these terms signify'.<sup>121</sup> Fielding points to what she terms the 'paradox of orality', in which the idea of truth in the 'authentic' peasant voice operates alongside the idea of the instability of orality set against the permanence of print.<sup>122</sup> Fielding's argument relates partly to a 1936 Walter Benjamin essay, 'The Storyteller: Reflections on the works of Nikolai Leskov'. In it, Benjamin wrote that the short story, as a printed artefact, works to undermine the value of storytelling by removing the 'thin layers' of narration and the experiential moment of recitation:

We have witnessed the evolution of the 'short story,' which has removed itself from oral tradition and no longer permits that slow piling one on top of the other of thin, transparent layers which constitutes the most appropriate picture of the way in which the perfect narrative is revealed through the layers of a variety of retellings.<sup>123</sup>

At the crux of Benjamin's essay is a concern about the advance of modernity and its subversion of tradition that turns on an opposition between print and orality. For Benjamin, the tradition of storytelling is crucially bound to conceptualisations of the *oral* tradition and 'the realm of living speech'.<sup>124</sup> Benjamin argues that writers such as Nikolai Leskov, and others including J. P. Hebel, Rudyard Kipling, Edgar Allan

---

<sup>119</sup> Suzanne Gilbert, 'James Hogg and the Authority of Tradition', in *Literary Marketplace*, pp. 93-109 (p. 94 and p. 95).

<sup>120</sup> Douglas Gifford, quoted in Kirsty Macdonald, *Spectral Ambiguities: The Tradition of Psychosomatic Supernaturalism in Scottish Fiction* (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Glasgow, 2005), p. 64.

<sup>121</sup> Fielding, *Writing and Orality*, p. 3.

<sup>122</sup> Fielding, *Writing and Orality*, p. 4.

<sup>123</sup> Benjamin, 'The Storyteller', p. 6.

<sup>124</sup> Benjamin, 'The Storyteller', p. 3.

Poe and Robert Louis Stevenson, stay true to the oral storytelling tradition because of their attentiveness to storytelling as a craft in which traces of the teller cling to the story ‘the way the handprints of the potter cling to the clay vessel’.<sup>125</sup> While Benjamin avoids empirical analysis, his conceptualisation of the oral tradition rests upon an understanding of modernity defined through print culture. According to Benjamin, modern fictional forms, particularly the novel, are isolated from the oral tradition because of their very nature as printed items.<sup>126</sup> The short story as a form shares this print-based isolation from the oral tradition, and on top of that carries with it a brevity of informative conciseness which, for Benjamin, is both antithetical to the oral storytelling tradition and emblematic of the usurpation of imaginative and critical thought by ‘the dissemination of information’.<sup>127</sup>

Yet, as Paula McDowell has recently argued, the concept of oral tradition is itself an effect - a ‘back-formation’ - of an increasingly self-aware print culture in the eighteenth-century, during which ‘tradition’ as a concept moved from the theological to the (largely) secular and modern idea of oral tradition as Benjamin deploys it.<sup>128</sup> In other words, the concept of the oral tradition is one borne out of the idea of print culture, rather than one rooted in an essential difference between timeless tradition and encroaching modernity. Maggie Awadalla and Paul March-Russell have recently argued that ‘the short story has a much more troubled – and troubling– relationship to modernity than Benjamin necessarily suggests.’<sup>129</sup> Building upon the work of McDowell, Awadalla and March-Russell, this thesis argues that the Romantic-era short story situated in its historic contexts of publication can offer an insight into the form’s ‘troubling’ relationship between the oral tradition and a modernising print culture. I suggest that Benjamin’s binarism of modernity and tradition is problematised when situated within the historical record of the early nineteenth-century short story in the case of Hogg. Stories could textually perform Benjamin’s

---

<sup>125</sup> Benjamin, ‘The Storyteller’, p. 5.

<sup>126</sup> Benjamin, ‘The Storyteller’, p. 3.

<sup>127</sup> Benjamin, ‘The Storyteller’, p. 4.

<sup>128</sup> Paula McDowell, *The Invention of the Oral: Print Commerce and Fugitive Voices in Eighteenth-Century Britain* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2017), p. 288.

<sup>129</sup> Maggie Awadalla and Paul March-Russell, ‘Introduction: the short story and the postcolonial’, in *The Postcolonial Short Story: Contemporary Essays*, ed. by Awadalla and March-Russell (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), pp. 1-14 (p. 2).

idealised authentic oral storytelling through its formal characteristics within both the periodical print medium and the bound-book short story collection, problematising Benjamin's distinction between traditional oral storytelling and the printed short story as vanguard of modernity. I argue that the Hoggian short story embodies modernity while performing tradition.<sup>130</sup>

One of the central features I identify in Hogg's performance of authenticity is his depiction of orality in print and in his representation of vernacular Scots speech. 'Vernacular writing', writes Scott Hames:

is freighted with powerful associations of authenticity and verisimilitude. It seems to plug directly into the 'real' language of 'real' people. This aura of 'truthiness' is not natural or inherent to the vernacular, but *ascribed* to it over a long period of history.<sup>131</sup>

Hogg's short stories use their connection to tradition – their embodiment of rural culture, of Lowland Scots speech, and of orality – to perform an authentic mode of storytelling which complicates Benjamin's binary conceptualisation of the short story and the oral storytelling tradition. The performance of authenticity functions through the form's textuality, in the deployment of multiple framing narratives and shifting narratological perspectives, and in the self-referential constructed-ness of the form which points to the sources of narrative authority underpinning stories. In other words, print technology in both the medium of the magazine and the medium of the book forms the basis upon which tradition is performed, and through which the oral storytelling ideal, its 'thin layers' and 'retellings', is textually mimicked. Tradition is mediated through modernity in the short story form. Moreover, the brevity of the short prose narrative form within the pages of the periodical magazine and within book format collections meant that explanatory narrative resolutions are often avoided in

---

<sup>130</sup> Hogg's disruption of the binary distinction between literary and oral modes of production has been noted within Hogg scholarship. See Ian Duncan's introduction to Hogg's *Winter Evening Tales*, where Hogg's stories are described as 'simulat[ing] the improvisatory charm of oral storytelling', which 'mix oral – and print – cultural conventions [...] promiscuously'. See Duncan, 'Introduction', in *Winter Evening Tales*, ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002), p. xxix and p. xiii.

<sup>131</sup> Scott Hames, 'Kelman's Art-Speech', in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Kelman*, ed. by Scott Hames (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2010), pp. 86-98 (p. 87).

favour of an interrogative mode of storytelling, in which meanings are left open to readers' interpretations. Multiplicity, instability and reader agency in Hogg's narrative praxis has long been noted.<sup>132</sup> What I suggest herein is that those narrative characteristics can be grounded in the particular form of the short story by historicising the form's aesthetics and ideological functions relative to mutable publishing contexts.

The short story as a form has been associated with important signifiers of authentic marginality associated with Hogg, particularly in orality, region and regionalism, and class. 'The short story', argued Ian Reid in 1977, 'seemed especially suitable for the portrayal of regional life, or of individuals who, though situated in a city, lived there as aliens.'<sup>133</sup> Levy has argued that the short story, throughout the 'first hundred years of its history', was strongly associated with regionalism, 'local color' and dialect.<sup>134</sup> Frank O'Connor characterised the short story as a 'lonely voice', a genre that 'never had a hero' which lends itself to stories of outsider and those marginalised by society.<sup>135</sup> Levy identified an idea in the twentieth-century that the short story is a 'democratic' form,<sup>136</sup> pointing to Raymond Carver's 1983 essay 'Fires' which explicitly linked the form of the short story to poverty. To write a novel, argued Carver, 'a writer should be living in a world that makes sense.' Raymond chose to write in the short story form because 'I couldn't see or plan any further ahead than the first of next month and gathering to get enough money, by hook or by crook, to meet the rent and provide the children's school clothes'.<sup>137</sup> The politics of the short story was one intimately tied to the form's connection to marginality. I argue for a disruption of this association by showing that in the textual production of the Hoggian short story, 'authenticity' is not an innate essence but a performative function of form.

---

<sup>132</sup> See Plotz, p. 115, and O'Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, p. 157.

<sup>133</sup> Pratt, p. 188.

<sup>134</sup> Levy, p. 42.

<sup>135</sup> Frank O'Connor, *The Lonely Voice: A Study of the Short Story* (London: Macmillan, 1963), p. 18

<sup>136</sup> Levy, p. 40.

<sup>137</sup> Levy, p. 25.

Ian Duncan's concept of 'authenticity effects' in Hogg's fiction is important to this discussion. Duncan describes these 'unprecedented' literary innovations – the manuscript facsimile, the 'real' letter in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* in 1823 - in relation to Hogg's 1824 novel *Confessions of a Justified Sinner*. Duncan argues that these 'authenticity effects' 'address not only, not even primarily, a residual, metaphysical nostalgia for orality but an emergent, modern idealization of writing as a transfigured mode or medium of industrial production' and, particularly in the case of Hogg, this functions to iterate the novel's 'material condition as a text'.<sup>138</sup> While Duncan's argument reads Hogg's textuality as a function of his authenticity effects, that relationship can be inverted in the case of Hogg's short fiction, where textuality works towards the performance of authenticity.

*Author functions, the 'Ettrick Shepherd', and the aesthetics of portability*

One of the key areas of ideational synthesis within this thesis is that the textual performance of authenticity, historicised in the aesthetics of a particular form and its contexts of publication, asserts Hogg's authorial agency in the 'author function'. Issues concerning authorship, identity, and agency have a particular resonance in the study of Hogg. Having helped to found *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, he found his own identity fractured across multiple representative subject positions. His authorial identity was, according to Mark Schoenfield, 'co-opted in a form of identity theft'.<sup>139</sup> As discussed above, Schoenfield argued that periodicals played an important role in Romantic-era construction, and contestation of, not fixed but dialogic identities in the case of Hogg and elsewhere.<sup>140</sup> The performance of Hogg by Wilson and Lockhart as the 'Ettrick Shepherd' in the *Blackwood's* satirical sketch series *Noctes Ambrosianae* (1822-1835) 'relegated [Hogg] to historical object' and 'enforced a nascent Tory historiography' through repeated references to his vocational and class background and national/regional located-ness.<sup>141</sup> The Romantic-era literary marketplace was for Hogg 'the site of contention that revealed the self as a product

---

<sup>138</sup> See Ian Duncan, 'Authenticity Effects: The Work of Fiction in Romantic Scotland', *The South Atlantic Quarterly*, 102:1 (2003), 93-116 (p. 102, p. 111).

<sup>139</sup> Schoenfield, p. 8.

<sup>140</sup> Schoenfield, p. 8.

<sup>141</sup> Schoenfield, p. 203.

of, and mediation between, personal agency and institutional power.’<sup>142</sup> According to the scholarship of Hughes, Hogg’s attempts to write dialogue as well as songs for *Noctes* were all rejected, in which Hogg was depicted as a socially-excluded clown with limited education.<sup>143</sup> ‘Hogg’s attempts to move beyond the Blackwoodian remit of folk representation’ argues Hughes, ‘were likely to be discouraged, published anonymously or referred to subsequently as not his work at all’.<sup>144</sup> Peter Garside argues that the appearance of the Shepherd in *Noctes* was something of a mixed blessing, giving access to publicity and fame while denying Hogg the ability to move beyond the ‘limitations’ of his background or the class-laden expectations of the ‘peasant poet’ idiom.<sup>145</sup>

Against this ‘co-option’ and ‘identity theft’, Hogg’s self-representation of his authorial identity is evident throughout his career, in, for example, the three versions of his ‘Memoir’: the first in a preface to his first major publication in 1807, *The Mountain Bard*, the second appearing in a revised edition of *The Mountain Bard* published 1821, and the third appearing in the first item of the 1832 collection of mostly shorter prose narratives *Altrive Tales* in 1832. Hogg also writes ‘himself’ into the narrative in *Justified Sinner*.<sup>146</sup> This thesis looks to recover the function of Hogg’s agency in the contest over authorship, identity and power relations in the literary marketplace, by looking to his contributions to the short story form, in which, as outlined above, Hogg’s narrative and literary aesthetics foreground associations with discourses of authenticity and marginality. Furthermore, the short story’s

---

<sup>142</sup> Schoenfield, p. 238.

<sup>143</sup> Hughes, ‘The Edinburgh of *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine* and James Hogg’s fiction’, in *Romanticism and Blackwood’s Magazine: ‘An Unprecedented Phenomenon’*, ed. by David Morrison and Daniel S. Roberts (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), pp. 175-185 (p. 180).

<sup>144</sup> Hughes, ‘*Blackwood’s* and Hogg’s fiction’, p. 180.

<sup>145</sup> Garside is quoted in Suzanne Gilbert, ‘Hogg’s Reception and Reputation’, in *Companion*, p. 41. For discussion of how the ‘peasant-poet’ idiom ‘celebrated but also confined the work of working-class writers’ see Alker and Nelson, ‘James Hogg and working class writing’, *Companion*, p. 56.

<sup>146</sup> For discussion of Hogg’s self-representation in these, and in other, texts see Douglas Mack, *Memoir of the Author’s Life and Familiar Anecdotes of Sir Walter Scott*, ed. by Douglas Mack (Edinburgh and London: Scottish Academic Press, 1972); Silvia Mergenthal, ‘Naturae Donum: Comments on Hogg’s Self-Image and Image’, in *SHW* 1 (1990), 71-9; Gillian Hughes, ‘Introduction’ and ‘Notes’ in James Hogg, *Altrive Tales*, ed. by Gillian Hughes, (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. xi-lxvii and pp. 213-285; Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson, ‘James Hogg as Working-Class Autobiographer: Tactical Manouvres in a ‘Memoir of the Author’s Life’, in *SHW* 16 (2006), 63-79; Valentina Bold, *James Hogg: A Bard of Nature’s Making* (Oxford: Peter Lang, 2007); Alker and Nelson, ‘Introduction’, in *Literary Marketplace*.

characteristic portability brought Hogg's performance of authenticity into diverse cultural encounters, amplifying and reshaping questions of agency and authenticity. Rather than looking to literary representations of the self, or to self-representation as character (as in *Justified Sinner*), this thesis grounds its analysis of agency within the stories themselves and their mode of storytelling, and shows how different print contexts (such as specific magazines, the medium in which a story is contained, and place of publication) shape in distinctive ways Hogg's performance of authenticity in relation to his narrational strategies.

Hogg's short story aesthetic of textual portability, which is grounded in the materially portable short story form situated within and shaped by various media of publication, foregrounds the storytelling 'I' of the self-reflexive and intrusive storyteller to elide resolution and tend toward ellipsis and fragmentation and resistance to fixity. His stories point to their sources of narrative authority and recount the 'thin layers' of retellings which frame the experiential level of story and its tellings within ethnographic frameworks of hearing (from a member of a community or family), reading (for example, from a letter), and telling, layers which are situated often simultaneously in both orality *and* within print culture. Portability at the level of narrative and storytelling is, therefore, connected to both an awareness of form and media of publication, and to the historical record of Hogg's associated author functions as a labouring-class autodidact – a 'peasant poet' – from Scotland's rural southern margins. Stuart O'Donnell, writing on Hogg and the 'paratext', argued that Hogg's attempts to assert control over his associated author functions was an attempt 'to break into, and then secure, his place in his contemporary literary world', and 'argued for his (albeit subordinated) place in the literary sphere'.<sup>147</sup> I disagree. Rather, I conceive of Hogg's contestation of author functions as an attempt not to allocate himself a place within a canon, but as an attempt to reshape the discourses from which canonicity is constructed.

---

<sup>147</sup> Stuart O'Donnell, *The Author and the Shepherd: The Paratextual Self-Representations of James Hogg (1807-1835)* (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Stirling, 2012), p. 12.

It is worth returning to the substance of Michel Foucault's essay 'What is an author?' (1969), which argued that the author as a concept is contested in and through discourse. Foucault conceived of authorship as a set of contested and contestable discourses operating through 'a series of precise and complex procedures'.<sup>148</sup> The 'author function' is less about the identity of an author as an individual than it is about a set of questions relating to the 'modes of existence of this discourse', including where it came from, how it is circulated and who controls it, rather than questions centred upon originality and 'real' authorship.<sup>149</sup> His 1969 essay has been characterised as a response to Roland Barthes's 1967 essay 'The Death of the Author', and argues for a more complex understanding of 'the author' than one which necessarily falls into either the archaic 'the man and his work' approach to literary criticism or the anti-authorial stance of, in the words of Beckett, 'what matter who's speaking'.<sup>150</sup> His idea of the 'author function' does this by challenging any stable lineation of the author and the actual person who has written, and instead looks to the 'author' as an identity, or more accurately, a mutable subject position that functions in relation to the control of discourse in and across texts in a similar way to how Schoenfield describes the experience of Hogg and the making of Romantic-era identity above. Hogg lost agency over the 'author function' of the Ettrick Shepherd identity in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, particularly in the class-based *Noctes* appropriation of the 'boozing buffoon'.<sup>151</sup> In the satirical sketch series, Wilson patronised Hogg as a labouring-class writer:

When the book was sent out a' printed to Yarrowside, od! I just read the maist feck on't as if I had never seen't afore; and as for that sang in particular ['Come all ye jolly shepherds'], I'll gang before the Baillies the morn, and tak' my affi-davy that I had no more mind o' *when* I wrote it, or *how* I wrote it, or onything whatever concerning it – no more than if it had been a screed of heathen Greek. I behoved to have written't sometime, and someway, since it was there – but

---

<sup>148</sup> Michel Foucault, 'What is an author?' (1969), in *The Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism*, ed. by Vincent B. Leitch (New York and London: Norton, 2001), pp. 1622-1636 (p. 1631).

<sup>149</sup> Foucault, 'What is an author?', p. 1636.

<sup>150</sup> Foucault, 'What is an author?', p. 1623.

<sup>151</sup> Lockhart in the *Quarterly Review* (1831). Quoted in Bold, *A Bard of Nature's Making*, p. 69.

that's a' I kent. – I maun surely hae flung't aff some night when I was a thought dazed, and just sent it in to the printer without looking at it in the morning.<sup>152</sup>

Here, Hogg is characterised by Wilson as not being able to account for, nor fully understand, his own literary talent. The Noctean Ettrick Shepherd is cast as a 'thought dazed' rustic Scots speaker who happens to have a talent for writing. Moreover, his lack of ability to comprehend his own talent is ventriloquized through the writing of someone from a more privileged social background.

Those questions of authorial control are explored within this thesis, showing how, for example, Hogg's relationship with powerful figures at the centre of economic-literary production such as William Blackwood conditioned the ability of Hogg to produce short stories and determined the geographic remit of their publication. These forces also shaped the form and content of the stories published, especially so in textual edits made to the *Shepherd's Calendar* in its transportation of short stories from magazine to book. As well as showing the material impact of power dynamics in the literary marketplace upon Hogg's authorial control, this thesis conceives of Hogg's assertion of agency over the author function(s) associated with his cultural production as one rooted in the contestation, and the reshaping, of discourses associated with his authorial persona. Discourse matters because of its representative function in constructing ideology, in the Gramscian and Althusserian understanding of the concept, and in constructing identity.<sup>153</sup> In showing the textual performance of authentic identity signifiers in Hogg's short stories and situating that analysis within

---

<sup>152</sup> 'Noctes Ambrosianae' 8, *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* 13 (May 1823), p. 599.

<sup>153</sup> The Italian philosopher Antonio Gramsci theorised an understanding of society and power through the concept of hegemony, which stressed that oppression and power functions in and through ideas as well as through physical manifestations of coercion and control. Therefore, Gramsci suggests, the contestation of socialised ideas and shared meanings has the potential to challenge capitalist hegemony over time (see *An Antonio Gramsci Reader: Selected Writings, 1916-1935*, ed. by David Forgacs (New York: Schocken, 1988)). This has been an influential idea within Marxist thought throughout the twentieth and twenty-first centuries. The French philosopher Louis Althusser built upon the idea of hegemony and proposed that power is maintained in society through ideology, in the existence of what he termed ideological state apparatuses (ISAs). While the concept of ISAs (as well as their respective approach to history) departs from Gramsci, Althusser's concept of ideology is Gramscian in the sense that it 'represents the imaginary relationship of individuals to their real conditions of existence' (see Louis Althusser, 'Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses' (1970), <<https://www.marxists.org/reference/archive/althusser/1970/ideology.htm>> [accessed 2/5/2019]). More recent interpretations of these modes of understanding the ideological basis of society, and how individuals conceive of themselves within societies, include the English political and cultural theorist Stuart Hall whose work explores how representation functions in society in relation to hegemony and ideology, and in the construction of identity through language (see *Representation 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition*, ed. By Stuart Hall, J. Evans and S. Nixon (London: Sage, 2013)).

a historicised form, this thesis asserts the function of representation to push scholarly understandings of Hogg beyond a reliance on essential values. This process, I argue, liberates Hogg from fixed categories of identity by revealing his agency in the representation of those identities of class, region, and nation.

### *Portability in materiality and aesthetics*

This thesis explores those processes of contestation of identity and authorship in the cultural field of production by examining how both form, in the case of the short story, and its relation to contexts of publication, in terms of both media of publication (the magazine and the book) and in terms of the geographic location of readerships of his texts, shaped the function of Hogg's characteristic performance of authenticity. Chapter one, for example, examines how Hogg constructed an author function as the mysterious editor and Edinburgh flâneur, 'Mr Spy', who operated dialogically in and between stories in his 1810-11 periodical magazine, *The Spy*. Chapter two discusses Hogg's short story contributions to *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, and argues that the characteristic textual and narrative portability within those stories functioned against the containing impetus of the Noctean Shepherd and its 'peasant-poet' class-based stereotyping. Chapter three argues that the book format collection of short stories represented an attempt to seize the means of control of the identity of the Ettrick Shepherd to create a 'Magnus Opus' in bound-book form, reclaiming the Ettrick Shepherd from its Blackwoodian 'co-option'. This attempt, however, does not signal the rebirth of the single author 'man and his work'. Instead, the processes of editorial control in the construction of book format short story collections are shown to reshape the form and content of stories, and, in turn, their associated author functions. Chapters four and five on London and America show Hogg's author functions 'translated' to different cultural and historical contexts, where his performed authenticity is, in the case of London, amplified as the ethnographic reportage of subaltern – Scottish labouring, working and peasant-class – voices. In America, where his stories proliferated via unauthorised reprints in magazines, the performance of authenticity associated with Hogg's short stories is shown to function in new cultural contexts – of western expansionism, of urban-rural dialogues, and of diasporic and 'Old World' interests. Although there is evidence that Hogg had some knowledge of these reprints, and gave tacit approval to them, this chapter shows how the 'author

function' does not need the author for it to continue to function and be reshaped by new contexts of publication.

I argue that the concept of portability can be used as a means through which to bridge the material history of the transportable short story form with an analysis of the narrative aesthetics of the form and its function in relation to contexts of publication. I define the concept of portability in terms of the physical transferability of the short story form, something that can, as in the case of 'A Scots Mummy' (1823) and 'A Singular Letter from Southern Africa' (1829), be readily transmitted from their magazine roots into other contexts such as the bound-book format novel and story collection. Portability also allows us to theorise the ability of the form to proliferate in reprints in both London and America.<sup>154</sup> I also define the form's portability in terms of its 'fragmented and restless'<sup>155</sup> textuality, characterised by a self-awareness of its constructed-ness in print, its active invocation of reader participation in its interrogative aesthetics, and its use of multiple perspectives and sources of narrative authority. Hogg constructs portability *within* texts, by pointing to sources of narrative construction and sources of narrative authority, and by foregrounding acts of iteration and telling, involving both print and orality such as spoken testimony, the author and/or narrator's own memory, a letter, or, as appears in 'Wat Pringle o the Yair' in *Tales of the Wars of Montrose* (discussed in chapter three), written historical texts and documents. Self-reflexive narration often points to gaps in the storytelling, and even draws in conflicting accounts of events (as is famously explored in *Justified Sinner*).

Hogg existed 'between worlds' of the marginal and traditional world of Ettrick and the modern metropolis of Edinburgh, and the portability of his short stories allows a means to understand how that between-ness functioned in different contexts, and how Hogg's between-ness was represented. By historicising the short story form through

---

<sup>154</sup> London and America are not the only places where Hogg's short stories appear during his lifetime. New research shows the importance of Dublin's periodical print culture to Hogg's fictional output. Future projects in this field hold much promise. See *James Hogg's Contributions to International Periodicals*, ed. by Adrian Hunter and Suzanne Gilbert (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, forthcoming).

<sup>155</sup> Nadine Gordimer, 'The Flash of Fireflies', in *The New Short Stories Theories*, ed by Charles E. May (Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press, 1994), pp. 263-267 (p. 265).

the concept of portability, I argue that authenticity can be considered as a performative function of the specific conditions of a form, rather than an innate essence of authorship drawn from class, region and national identities. Historicising a form and its aesthetics shows how the representation of those identities in discourse and storytelling allow authenticity to function. In showing how authentic marginality can be staged within texts and through author function(s), this thesis re-ascribes to Hogg agency as a labouring-class writer from the rural Scottish Borders writing during a formative, and understudied, moment in the history of the short story form.

## CHAPTER ONE: Hogg, Benjamin, and The Spy as short-storyteller

For that a common shepherd who never was at school, who went to service at seven years of age, and could neither write nor read with accuracy when twenty, yet who, smitten with an unconquerable thirst after knowledge, should run away from his master, leave his natural mountains, and his flocks to wander where they chose, come to the metropolis with his plaid wrapt round his shoulders, and all at once set up for a connoisseur in manners, taste and genius, has certainly much more of the appearance of a romance than a matter of fact.<sup>1</sup>

This chapter argues that among the range of ‘authenticity effects’ Hogg conjures through his treatment of the magazine short story is that of the outsider.<sup>2</sup> In doing so, the chapter foregrounds the role of the magazine as a publishing medium in shaping both the aesthetics of the short story form and its ideological function. I draw upon Walter Benjamin’s 1936 essay ‘The Storyteller’, discussed in detail in the previous chapter, to argue that the interrogative narrative praxis within the Hoggian short story’s characteristic portability is rooted in both the conditions of form and its publishing contexts. Hogg constructs *The Spy* as an authentic storyteller, rooted in the traditions of oral cultures and communitarian retellings, while situating those notions of tradition within the print culture in which it appears. As Penny Fielding suggests, Hogg’s oralistic short stories in this way display a self-awareness of their own locatedness in print.<sup>3</sup> While the authorial identity of the ‘Etrick Shepherd’ is more well known in both popular and scholarly understandings of Hogg, I suggest that the authorial identity of ‘Mr Spy’ draws upon similar authenticating identities of regional locatedness and functions through the dialogism of the margins and the metropolis.

---

<sup>1</sup> James Hogg, ‘The Spy’s Farewell to his Readers’, *The Spy: A periodical paper of literary of amusement and instruction*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2000), pp. 514-521 (p. 515).

<sup>2</sup> Duncan, ‘Authenticity Effects’, p. 111.

<sup>3</sup> Penny Fielding, *Writing and Orality*, p.122.

In rooting my argument in the short story form, I emphasise the performative function of texts. Rather than looking to define what the short story is, whether a fragment of authentic orality from what Frank O'Connor called 'submerged population groups' or a 'minor and lesser genre with respect to the novel',<sup>4</sup> something to, in Hogg's words, 'keep the banes green',<sup>5</sup> I look instead to what short story *does* in Hogg's treatment of the form.<sup>6</sup> Through a process of what I call performed authenticity, in which texts stake a claim in their proximity to cultures and traditions peripheral to the metropolitan centres of their readerships, the Hoggian short story is a form in and of modernity, rather than a nostalgic representative medium of marginal labouring-class life in Scotland. Indeed, among the oral tradition features that Benjamin sees in Leskov include a closeness to 'the people' and to 'folk belief', as well as the importance of and the role of memory in the narratives and the recital of how the teller happened upon the story – features that are shown below to be common in Hogg's stories. Hogg's short stories perform a folkish anti-modernity, whilst being a thoroughly modern form in terms of its textuality and its writerliness.<sup>7</sup> Authenticity is performed through the textualisation of orality, which includes the representation of 'authentic' dialect speech, the deployment of frame tales and editorial commentary, and a recurring emphasis on the oral sources of narratives within the stories and their framings. As explained in the previous chapter, I theorise these features together under the concept of portability.

Hogg's short-lived periodical venture, *The Spy; Being a Periodical Paper of Literary Amusement and Instruction*, ran from 1810 to 1811 and has been described by Robert Crawford as 'one of the places the modern short story was nurtured'.<sup>8</sup> While recent decades have witnessed a scholarly interest in Romantic-era periodical culture,

---

<sup>4</sup> Frank O'Connor, *The Lonely Voice*, p. 18; Pratt, 'The long and the short of it', p. 187.

<sup>5</sup> James Hogg, *Altrive Tales, Featuring a 'Memoir of the Author's Life'*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2005), p. xix.

<sup>6</sup> Tim Killick prefers the term 'short fiction' as opposed to the 'theoretically loaded' short story. I use the term 'short story' in this chapter to refer to prose fiction that is short enough to fit within the pages of Hogg's weekly magazine. See Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 10.

<sup>7</sup> For discussion of 'writerly' texts see Roland Barthes, *S/Z* (London: Blackwell, 1974), p. 5.

<sup>8</sup> Robert Crawford, *Scotland's Books: A History of Scottish Literature* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), p. 433.

particularly in studies of *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*,<sup>9</sup> and individual scholars such as Mark Schoenfield have identified Hogg's *Spy* as an important precursor to *Blackwood's*,<sup>10</sup> *The Spy* remains an understudied and undervalued source for the study of Romantic short fiction and periodical studies.<sup>11</sup> Running for 52 issues from 1 September 1810, Hogg's eight-page weekly paper was eventually published by James Robertson in Edinburgh (latterly switching to Andrew Aikman) after being rejected by several of the city's publishing houses including that of Archibald Constable, and as Wendy Hunter has shown, was priced at four-pence per issue.<sup>12</sup> Despite Scott's early hesitancy toward the project,<sup>13</sup> Hogg pressed ahead with his plans to launch a periodical under his own editorship after having left his native Ettrick earlier that year, with the aim of establishing himself as a professional writer in Edinburgh. The editorial identity of 'Mr Spy', played-out in the first-person narratives of the opening and closing editions of the magazine and in editorial framings throughout its existence, provided a formal framing with which the periodical's short stories functioned in dialogue and this dialogue in part enabled the 'slow piling one on top of the other' of 'retellings' that Benjamin ascribed to the oral tradition. Furthermore, the periodical's self-referential approach to literary identity, authorship and textual constructed-ness acts as a precursor to the characteristic Hoggian short story form as it appeared in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* (launched in 1817), a magazine which, since Edgar Allan Poe's satire of the magazine's 'Terror Tales', scholars of the short story have recognised as significant in the development of the form.<sup>14</sup> *The Spy* as a periodical 'does not simply stand in secondary relation to the literary work it contains'; rather, it contains 'a dynamic relation among contributions [that] informs and creates meaning'.<sup>15</sup>

---

<sup>9</sup> See *Romanticism and Blackwood's Magazine*, ed. by Morrison and Roberts; Stewart, *Romantic Magazines*.

<sup>10</sup> Schoenfield, p. 217.

<sup>11</sup> Gillian Hughes has written on *The Spy* and its context of production in Edinburgh. See Hughes, 'The Spy and Literary Edinburgh', *Scottish Literary Journal* 10.1 (1983), 42-5.

<sup>12</sup> Wendy Hunter, 'The Spy; Being a Periodical Paper of Literary Amusement and Instruction', *The Literary Encyclopedia* (2007)

<<http://www.litencyc.com/php/sworks.php?rec=true&UID=7814>> [accessed 10 August 2017]

<sup>13</sup> Hogg recounted in *Familiar Anecdotes of Sir Walter Scott* that Scott 'said he would first see how I came on and if he saw the least prospect of my success he would support me'. From Hughes, 'Introduction', *The Spy*, p. xxi.

<sup>14</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, pp. 24-26.

<sup>15</sup> Parker, p. 3.

Hogg had only recently arrived in Edinburgh, Scotland's bustling metropolis, from his native Ettrick Valley in the rural Scottish Borders (on foot, after another farming disaster had led to bankruptcy) when he embarked upon his ambitious periodical venture. The periodical itself is centred upon the idea of a rural outsider looking-in on a city, a spy in more ways than one. Hogg's outsider status can be located across three intersecting areas. Firstly, he was an outsider to Edinburgh in terms of regional identity. Edinburgh functioned as a metropolitan centre of Romantic cultural production,<sup>16</sup> whereas Hogg's native rural Ettrick was peripheral and, as Alice Munro reminds us in *The View from Castle Rock*, held 'no advantages'.<sup>17</sup> Secondly, he was an outsider in terms of his Lowland Scots speech, his dress and his manners. Thirdly, he was an outsider to metropolitan literary culture in Edinburgh in terms of his class position as a labouring-class autodidact. Place, language and class combined to inform both the periodical's identity and the short stories which operate in dialogue with it. 'The short story', argued Ian Reid in 1977, 'seemed especially suitable for the portrayal of regional life, or of individuals who, though situated in a city, lived there as aliens.'<sup>18</sup> *The Spy* embodies this country-city alienation in its identity as a periodical, and in the short stories within it. A 'lonely voice', bringing rural labouring-class Scotland to the nation's cultural centre.

As Ian Duncan has argued, 'the editors and reviewers who monitored the literary marketplace would invoke [his rural] origins to disqualify Hogg's attempts to write in metropolitan genres'.<sup>19</sup> Structural and institutional forces could function against Hogg's attempt to establish himself as a serious writer. At the same time, however, Hogg, largely through his friendship with Walter Scott, did have some kind of foothold in Edinburgh's literary culture. He was not, like one of the magazine's character-come-storytellers John Miller, completely isolated in his attempts to establish himself in the literary marketplace of Romantic-era Edinburgh. Crucially, the foothold that he did have in Edinburgh's literary culture allowed him an

---

<sup>16</sup> See Duncan, *Scott's Shadow*.

<sup>17</sup> Alice Munro, *The View from Castle Rock* (London: Vintage, 2007), p. 3.

<sup>18</sup> Pratt, p. 188.

<sup>19</sup> Duncan, *Scott's Shadow*, p. 148.

opportunity via *The Spy* to construct his persona as that of a literary underdog. Studies of *Blackwood's* have focused upon the periodical's contribution to the phenomena of the personality, played out through authorial identities and the problematisation of emergent Romantic ideas of authorship.<sup>20</sup> In *The Spy*, the textualised performativity of identities, which throughout the periodical's existence engaged with ideas of authorship, narration and storytelling in short fiction, is what characterises the periodical – seven years prior to *Maga*.

Gillian Hughes has suggested that the early numbers of the paper 'appear to have been very successful', and Scott had 'probably persuaded some of his friends to support Hogg's venture'.<sup>21</sup> *The Spy*'s early successes however were short-lived. As Hogg recounts in his 1832 *Memoir*:

On the publication of the first two numbers, I deemed I had as many subscribers as, at all events, would secure the work from being dropped; but, on the publication of my third or fourth number, I have forgot which, it was so indecorous, that no fewer than seventy-three subscribers gave up.<sup>22</sup>

The 'unlucky expressions' which led to the mass cancelation of subscriptions after Number 4 were most likely in relation to the reference to seduction and sex in 'Story of the Berwick-shire Farmer, continued'.<sup>23</sup> As a newcomer to the city, while having some crucial literary connections in Scott, Hogg encountered difficulties in establishing himself in the literary marketplace and his authorial persona Mr. Spy had the capacity to affront the respectability of Edinburgh's middling and upper-class reading publics.

The constructed authorial identity of Mr. Spy provides the over-arching authorial framing for his short stories in the periodical. Mr. Spy functions within the 'connective

---

<sup>20</sup> Tom Mole, 'Blackwood's 'Personalities'', in *Romanticism and Blackwood's Magazine*, pp. 89-99 (p. 97).

<sup>21</sup> Hughes, 'Introduction', p. xxii.

<sup>22</sup> Hogg, 'Memoirs of the Author's Life', *Altrive Tales*, p. 25.

<sup>23</sup> Hughes, 'Introduction', p. xxiii.

tissues' of the periodical, such as introductory text and paratextual notes,<sup>24</sup> and within the short stories themselves. This contextualisation is key to understanding the role of Romantic-era periodical print culture in shaping the development of short fiction. Hogg's short fiction in *The Spy* was in a state of negotiation and dialogue with the print context in which it appeared, and with the editorial identity of Mr. Spy. Furthermore, the identity of Mr. Spy was constructed out of, and in opposition to, Edinburgh's literary marketplace. *The Spy*, as suggested by its title, self-referentially performed its outside-ness, and the editorial identity of Mr. Spy spoke to issues concerning Hogg's status as an outsider to, yet with a foothold within, the literary cultures of early nineteenth-century Edinburgh. Class, language and locality were forces which could work to exclude Hogg, to confirm his status as an outsider. On the other hand, however, those same forces could be wielded through the performance of authenticity to assert Hogg's place in the literary marketplace and his agency in the Romantic-era field of cultural production. As Schoenfield has argued:

For Hogg, the literary marketplace was not a place for the expression of Romantic identity. It was, rather, the site of contention that revealed the self as a product of, and mediation between, personal agency and institutional power.<sup>25</sup>

In *The Spy*'s engagement with questions of regional and class-based authenticity, I suggest, Hogg asserts personal agency as a labouring-class from Selkirkshire writer newly arrived in Edinburgh.

Although Hogg was at an early stage of his career and was far from being established as a successful writer, by textually performing the Spy's outsider qualities and its connection to folkloric oral traditions the short stories published within the periodical could assert their authenticity as insights into, and from, the perspective of those at the margins of society – the rural peasant grieving for her husband in 'Peasant's Funeral', the destitute single mother alone in a city in 'Affecting Narrative of a

---

<sup>24</sup> 'Connective tissues' is Alison Lumsden's term, used in relation to Scott's *Chronicles of the Canongate*. See Lumsden, *Walter Scott and the Limits of Language* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2010), p. 177.

<sup>25</sup> Schoenfield, p. 238.

Country Girl', the hodden-grey clad broad Scots speaking Nithsdale shepherd in 'Encounter with John Miller'.<sup>26</sup> The stories function in dialogue with that context of the outsider; a process helps guide the reader toward the textual performance of authenticity regarding the stories being told. This dialogism between text and context functioned in different ways, including, as in the case of 'Peasant's Funeral', Mr. Spy playing a role in the portrayal of character and narrational perspectives within a text, or, as in the case of 'Affecting Narrative of a Country Girl', functioning as a letter to Mr. Spy published alongside an editorial response.

In publishing as his constructed persona Mr. Spy as opposed to himself, Hogg poses questions to readers of their assumptions about who could - and should - be writing in a genre which had a well-established pedigree, via publications like the *Spectator*, *The Rambler* and the *Lounger*, as a 'high' literary and cultural site of performance. Susan Manning has explored *The Spy* as a 'close Scottish analogue' to other periodical ventures, and Gillian Hughes has commented on the risk that Hogg took by publishing his own periodical as an unknown writer at a time when he would draw direct comparisons with more established, and highly regarded, periodical publications.<sup>27</sup> In creating the persona of *The Spy*, a country gentleman who has recently arrived in Scotland's capital, the periodical creates a hyper-textual authorial identity at once present and removed from the society in which he exists.

By becoming a 'spy', Hogg is able to claim agency in a society to which he does not belong; an outsider observing, not from the outside, but from within:

For though there is scarcely a single individual in Edinburgh who has not seen me, as have great numbers in the country besides, yet not one of a thousand amongst them know who I am, or what I am about: so that though I am bound

---

<sup>26</sup> Hodden is a Scots term for a 'coarse homespun, undyed woollen cloth, of a greyish colour, due to a mixture of white and black wool', associated with eighteenth and nineteenth-century Scottish working and labouring-class dress. See <<https://www.dsl.ac.uk/entry/snd/hodden>> [accessed 3/7/2019] for definitions and examples of its usage. See also 'The old way of living in Scotland', *Chambers's Edinburgh Journal* 5-6 (1827), 259-260 (p. 259).

<sup>27</sup> Susan Manning, *The Puritan-Provincial Vision: Scottish and American Literature in the Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), p. 110; Hughes, 'The Spy and Literary Edinburgh', p. 44.

to tell the truth, I am not bound to tell the whole truth; and the omissions which I chuse to make have very little chance of being discovered.<sup>28</sup>

Mr Spy here is presented as a shadowy presence in Edinburgh, seen by all while remaining successfully hidden from discovery. Yet we see in the above passage, taken from the first page of the very first issue of *The Spy*, the challenge to the reader regarding the ‘truth’ of the reporting of this spy. ‘I am not bound to tell the whole truth’, says Mr. Spy, ‘and the omissions which I chuse to make have very little chance of being discovered’.<sup>29</sup> *The Spy* is declaring the presence and activity of the role of the editor in the production of texts, drawing the reader’s attention to the periodical as self-aware textual construct. This self-referential textual constructed-ness would become a key characteristic of Hogg’s short fiction as it developed, particularly in *Blackwood’s*. The reader is invited to ask questions of what is being omitted by the editor and prompted to consider *why* those omissions have taken place. Meiko O’Halloran, in a recent monograph, identified Hogg’s characteristic invocation of the agency of the reader via what is described as Hogg’s ‘kaleidoscopic’ aesthetic.<sup>30</sup> *The Spy*, by drawing attention to its constructed-ness and to the presence of the editor in the text, demands that interpretative agency from the very outset.

With its admission of omissions, *The Spy*’s editorial notes work to foreground the periodical’s formal instability in terms of evoking questions as opposed to providing answers. Indeterminacy is a significant thread within Hogg studies, and John Plotz has sketched how it looks in relation to some Hogg short stories.<sup>31</sup> As well as admitting to the readers that there will be silences and omissions in the narratives contained in *The Spy*, the editor explains that ‘I cannot give a distinct account in what manner my thoughts were drawn away so completely from my subject’.<sup>32</sup> Incomplete and itinerant thoughts permeate *The Spy*’s short stories with some common motifs appearing, which the Spy’s account of his own life gives a clue to when he explains that ‘I awaked as from a dream.’<sup>33</sup> Dreams appear as constitutive elements of

---

<sup>28</sup> Hogg, ‘The Spy’s Account of Himself’, *The Spy*, pp. 1-11 (p. 1).

<sup>29</sup> Hogg, ‘The Spy’s Account of Himself’, p.1.

<sup>30</sup> O’Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, p. 9.

<sup>31</sup> See Plotz, ‘Hogg and the Short Story’, in *Companion*.

<sup>32</sup> Hogg, ‘The Spy’s Account of Himself’, p. 3.

<sup>33</sup> Hogg, ‘The Spy’s Account of Himself’, p. 3.

storytelling in later issues of *The Spy*, most notably in ‘Evil Speaking Ridiculed by an Allegorical Dream’.

The Spy’s position as narrator in the text is placed upon contradictory and unstable ground from the outset:

I do intend in the course of this work to laugh at a great deal of my fellow-subjects, and to make other people laugh at them likewise; but if I were to give a true and literal detail of all my adventures and misadventures, and the blunders of various kinds which I have committed, they might well laugh at me in their turn. I do not like this entirely; it does not altogether suit my taste to be laughed at; and he who would reclaim others, should reserve a certain degree of consequence to himself. ... I am a bachelor, about sixty years of age; have spent the most of my days in the country, where I have been engaged in innumerable projects, which have all miscarried: but nothing in the world disturbs or perplexes me.<sup>34</sup>

The Spy’s aim is to ‘laugh at a great deal of my fellow-subjects’. The crucial qualifier here, however, is that the narrator admits that ‘they might well laugh at me in their turn’. He then goes on to provide an anecdote in which this is realised, where he watches three young women, loses track of his own footsteps and falls into a canal. The women laugh openly at him before helping him out. This gives the reader an impression of the problematic identity of The Spy. Mr. Spy is not simply an omnipresent all-knowing and all-seeing narrator, revealing to the audience truths about themselves and society. Rather, he is an observer whose attempt at spying is disturbed – he is tripped up because he is looking. The unity of the narrative is undermined by the activity of narration itself. So, whilst ‘nothing in the world disturbs or perplexes’ him, that assuredness is contradicted by his failure in *The Spy*’s opening passages to be an effective spy, that is, to blend in, to observe, and to not get caught. The reader has already caught him in the act of spying, inviting a degree of interrogative questioning from the reader from the very outset. Self-referentiality of its own limitations is characteristic of *The Spy*, and, according to Schoenfield,

---

<sup>34</sup> Hogg, ‘The Spy’s Account of Himself’, pp. 1-2.

demarcates Hogg's paper from periodicals like *The Spectator* which embodied order and stability through the flexibility and malleability of the narrator.<sup>35</sup>

Through such episodes of self-referential satire, *The Spy* draws attention to issues around the construction of authorial identities and personas. As Peter T. Murphy has argued, the 'ventriloquism of *The Spy* fades into a real problem of identity'.<sup>36</sup> That 'problem of identity' is further refined by Schoenfield in his discussion of Hogg, literary identity and the intertextual relationship between *The Spy*, *Blackwood's* and *Confessions of a Justified Sinner*.<sup>37</sup> 'In this swirl of intertextuality', argues Schoenfield, 'subjectivity is not only mirrored by its representation but constituted by it.'<sup>38</sup> Those 'problems of identity' concerning the representation of the self in texts are, in the case of Hogg, closely bound to issues relating to authenticity. Building upon Ian Duncan's analysis of *Blackwood's* fascination with Hogg's body,<sup>39</sup> Schoenfield describes Hogg as 'an emblem of primordial Scottish authenticity'.<sup>40</sup> Hogg's outsider qualities are embedded in the construction of the authorial persona of Mr Spy, presenting a means through which he can construct a representation of his identity as an authentic purveyor of labouring-class and rural life.

The Spy uses the editorial notes to position himself as being close to the manners and traditions of the peasant communities of the countryside:

I am a bachelor, about sixty years of age; have spent the most of my days in the country... You will be very apt to suspect that a simple old man, who has only left the mountains a few years ago, can have no great stock of ideas wherewith to entertain the enlightened and polite circles: but, on my own behalf, let me remind you, that everything here being quite new to me, any incongruity of taste or character will be much more ready to strike me, than

---

<sup>35</sup> Schoenfield, p. 205.

<sup>36</sup> Peter T. Murphy, *Poetry as an Occupation and an Art in Britain, 1760-1830* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), p. 113.

<sup>37</sup> Schoenfield, pp. 201-238.

<sup>38</sup> Schoenfield, p. 204.

<sup>39</sup> Duncan, *Scott's Shadow*, p. 181.

<sup>40</sup> Schoenfield, p. 204.

such as I have been used to witness the same scenes all their days. Besides, I am constantly upon the look-out for singularities, and flatter myself that I have discovered a great abundance of them: certain it is, I have seen many things that have amused me, both among the books, the men, and the women; but to country manners I am still most attached, as my readers will soon discover; and my friends and correspondents living there, we will often be hearing from them; and as I have spent such a long life in doing nothing else but making observations, it would be mortifying to reflect that none had been the better of them but myself. But I must try to be a little more circumstantial.<sup>41</sup>

The above excerpt can operate as an analogue to Hogg's experience as a failed farmer from Ettrick. 'Mud and shite from his Borders sheep-pastures', writes Robert Crawford, 'fucked up the carpets of their New Town drawing-rooms'.<sup>42</sup> In the above passage, however, it is Mr. Spy rather than Hogg who is operating as the outsider to Edinburgh genteel society, a dissidence stressed through a staged intimacy with countryside communities and 'low' society. The Spy, though from the countryside, is no longer in the countryside; and though in the city, can never truly be of the city because 'to country manners I am still most attached'.<sup>43</sup> The above passage plays upon a sense of the Spy's dissonant connection to an urban environment in which he is 'constantly upon the look-out for any singularities' which are unusual to those of 'country manners' yet typical of Edinburgh's 'incongruity of taste [and] character'.<sup>44</sup> Gillian Hughes has described Hogg's life as 'between worlds', between his labouring-class identity and that of a professional literary man, between traditional oral culture and beginnings of mass print culture, and between ancient superstitions and social customs and the latest technological developments in printing and publishing. 'His writing', argues Hughes, 'was the natural expression of this double vision'.<sup>45</sup> In some ways, Wordsworth's 'Extempore Effusion upon the Death of James Hogg' reflects this ill-locatedness, attempting to situate Hogg among 'the braes of Yarrow' where 'Ettrick mourns with her their Poet dead', while recognising Hogg's place in a British Romantic-period literary culture by virtue of both the celebrity of the poet writing

---

<sup>41</sup> Hogg, 'The Spy's Account of Himself', pp. 1-2.

<sup>42</sup> Crawford, 'Bad Shepherd', p. 28.

<sup>43</sup> Hogg, 'The Spy's Account of Himself', p. 1.

<sup>44</sup> Hogg, 'The Spy's Account of Himself', p. 1.

<sup>45</sup> Duncan, 'Introduction', *Companion*, p. 6.

about Hogg and the choice of subject-content in the poem.<sup>46</sup> Hogg's death, like the recent deaths of Scott, Charles Lamb, George Crabbe, Samuel Coleridge, and Felicia Hemans, comes to signal for Wordsworth the end of an epoch which would later be termed 'Romanticism'.<sup>47</sup> Hogg is at once peripheral and central, and *The Spy*, one of his earliest literary outputs, embodies that between-ness.

### *Construction and constructed-ness of text*

'The Danger of Changing Occupations, - verified in the Life of a Berwickshire Farmer' is a short story serialised over three early issues of the paper. The tale is better known within Hogg studies in its book-format, appearing as 'Basil Lee' in *Winter Evening Tales* (1820). Unlike 'Basil Lee', however, the piece in its original periodical short story form is positioned as a letter to the Spy:

TO THE SPY

Sir,

Since you have begun business as a Spy, you must likewise act as a monitor, or else you will be of very little use in your occupation: for it is doing the community only a small service, to Spy out and expose the 'holes in their coats,' if you do not put them on some method of getting them mended, or keeping them whole that yet are so. Now, Sir, there is one thing, which I would suspect have been the leading cause of many a ragged coat, amongst the lower orders of Society in particular; and of that *one thing*, mine is a striking instance at this day: and as no one is better calculated to warn others of the dangers attending any course of life, than those who have suffered by that course, I intreat you will indulge me by publishing this in your paper Saturday next.<sup>48</sup>

In its positioning as a letter, the framing narrative for the short story operates in dialogue with the Spy and its self-aware 'problematic' authorial identity, contextually

---

<sup>46</sup> William Wordsworth, 'Extemporary Effusion upon the Death of James Hogg', in *Last Poems, 1821-1850*, ed. by Jared Curtis (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1999), pp. 1-4.

<sup>47</sup> Patrick Vincent, 'Elegiac Muses: Romantic Women Poets and the Elegy', in *Romantic Poetry Volume 7*, ed. by Angela Esterhammer (Amsterdam: John Benjamin, 2002), pp. 197- 219 (p. 197).

<sup>48</sup> Hogg, 'The Danger of Changing Occupations', *The Spy*, pp. 21-29 (p. 21).

attuned to the literary marketplace of Edinburgh. The letter writer demands more from *The Spy*, to not only ‘expose the holes in the coats’ of the ‘lower orders of Society’ but to provide to the readers some ‘method of getting them mended’.<sup>49</sup> The call for the *Spy*’s narrative to act not only as a passive teller of tales or observer, but as an active participant in the society within which he does the spying to help mend the ‘holes in [the] coats’ of the lower-orders of society.<sup>50</sup> The letter framing device provides an example in print of textual interchange between readers of *The Spy* and its editor, involving the active engagement of readers. As O’Halloran has argued:

Hogg’s non-didactic style of mixing genres, narrative perspectives and voices means that in his work the onus is characteristically placed on his readers’ shifting perceptions and instincts – and he invites readers to change their opinions repeatedly.<sup>51</sup>

The ‘onus’ is placed upon the reader to engage with the identity and social function of *The Spy*. In this way, staged reader participation in the letter framing of ‘Danger of Changing Occupations’ point to the expectation that Mr. *Spy* deal with matters relating to the ‘lower orders’ of society.<sup>52</sup> Furthermore, the letter functions to dramatise the periodical’s construction in print, asking *The Spy* to publish ‘this in your paper of Saturday next week’.<sup>53</sup> As well as Mr *Spy*’s authorial identity being attuned to its context of production in 1810 Edinburgh literary culture, the function of the epistolary mode within the periodical short stories foregrounds the self-referential textual constructed-ness of *The Spy*’s short fiction. Hogg’s periodical short stories at this stage operate at the intersection of self-referentiality, the encouragement of the active role of readers, and a deliberately staged ‘outsider’ authenticity.

The presence of the editor in the text of *The Spy*’s short fiction can be understood in relation to the periodical short story’s textual embodiment of Benjamin’s ‘transparent layers’ of narrative.<sup>54</sup> As well as the editor, a further narrative layer within *The Spy*’s

---

<sup>49</sup> Hogg, ‘The Danger of Changing Occupations’, p. 21.

<sup>50</sup> Hogg, ‘The Danger of Changing Occupations’, p. 21.

<sup>51</sup> O’Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, p. 54.

<sup>52</sup> Hogg, ‘The Danger of Changing Occupations’, p. 21.

<sup>53</sup> See chapter two for a more detailed discussion of how the letter trope functions in Hogg’s short stories, using Janet Altman’s theory of ‘epistolarity’.

<sup>54</sup> Benjamin, ‘The Storyteller’, p. 6.

short fiction is the self-referential constructed-ness of the text, as appears in the short story ‘Danger of Changing Occupations’:

Now in what manner it becomes so useful to them, I leave to you, and all who shall read this letter to discover, for it is an established rule with every good writer, always leave something *to the imagination of his reader*. But I have been insensibly led away from the thread of my story.<sup>55</sup>

Here too we see Hogg’s stress on ‘omissions’ and storytelling. Rather than offering explanation and resolution, Hogg prefers to say to his readers ‘I leave to you’ and is aware of the importance of individual imagination and readers’ agency in the reading process. The telling of the tale is dramatised in the above passage, alerting the readers that there is a ‘thread’ of the story being told and that the writer has been ‘insensibly led away’ from the telling of the tale. Indeed, the deployment of the letter trope itself adds a further layer of retelling to the tale.

In *The Spy* the short story form is self-consciously taken from its folkish, vernacular and oral origins and placed explicitly in print culture. Hogg positions Mr. Spy as a fabricator while using his staged closeness to rural communities to give a platform to subaltern, rural and labouring-class voices. ‘Danger of Changing Occupations’ shows how the periodical short form’s self-positioned closeness to orality performs the clash between speech and the printed word, as the narrator recounts his rural education:

although we all pronounced the words differently from the present and proper diction of the English language, that made little difference in the main, as we did not aim at either the pulpit or the bar. We sounded Earth *yirth*, Plough *pleuch*, Abraham *Aubrahaum*. When we spoke of singing Psalms at church, we called them *sawms*; but when we came to the word in course of a lesson, we pronounced it *psalms*. We likewise made a palpable difference in the pronunciation of all the following monosyllables, - *wright*, *right*, *write*, and *rite*, which are long ago become one and the same.<sup>56</sup>

---

<sup>55</sup> Hogg, ‘The Danger of Changing Occupations’, p. 28.

<sup>56</sup> Hogg, ‘The Danger of Changing Occupations’, p. 22.

There is a staged tension here between orality and the printed word, between ‘the present and proper diction of the English language’ and the Berwickshire dialect where ‘we all pronounced the words differently’ to the formal English they encountered in schooling. The incongruity between speech and spelling is outlined, with ‘we sounded Earth *yirth*, Plough *pleuch*’ and Psalms ‘sawms’. Berwickshire speech is bestowed with ‘outsider’ status, marginalised by ‘proper’ written English, a language encountered when reading printed items, ‘Mason’s Collection’, as opposed to in the lived experience of rural life.

The staged tension between spoken Scots and printed English combines with local knowledge of history and tradition in ‘Story of the Berwickshire Farmer, continued’ to help foster the formation of authenticity effects in *The Spy*’s short fiction:

‘Lang syne, when foks were a’ Papishes, they keepit a porridge or a graven image o’ the Virgin Mary, i’ that chapel; and they pretendit that it cou’d baith wurk miracles and pardon fo’ks sins. Lord help them, I wonder how ever they cou’d think sic a thing! Atweel it cou’d do nae mair at that than I cou’d do. But the Papish priests about Mewros made a great deal o’ siller wi’t, and land baith.’<sup>57</sup>

The deployment of Scots here is set against the earlier depiction of formal taught English as official and hegemonic. Scots is connected to a pre-Reformation Scottish past, which can be viewed within the framework of ideological tension identified by Ian Duncan between an ‘older, mythic’ Romantic ideology and that of modern Enlightened rationality.<sup>58</sup> In the passage above, the authenticity of Scots is strengthened by its ability to communicate a ‘papish’ Scottish past, whereas formal and written English clashed with that ancient and native orality. Orality combines with history to stress the short story’s authenticity in relation to matters relating to rural labouring-class Scotland.

---

<sup>57</sup> Hogg, ‘Story of the Berwickshire Farmer, continued’, pp. 32-43 (p. 35).

<sup>58</sup> Quoted in Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 138.

Benjamin's essay stresses the importance of the experiential moment of recitation in storytelling. Framing narratives, a recurring feature of *The Spy's* fiction, can perform that function in periodical short stories. An example of how this formal context engages with a story's content can be found in a story called 'Affecting Narrative of a Country Girl – Reflections on the Evils of Seduction', which tells of a young woman who becomes pregnant and destitute at the whim of a man who had promised her his wealth, and she eventually loses her child:

I am sir your most obedient and wretched.

M. M.

*The Spy sends his kindest respects to M.M. and requests to be favoured with a continuation of her correspondence.*<sup>59</sup>

By the time the tale appears as 'Maria's Tale' in the 1820 book-length collection of Hogg's short fiction, *Winter Evening Tales*, it loses the editorial endnote. The tale is removed from its dialogic periodical context, where it stood as a letter in dialogue with the editor, Mr. Spy. One of the effects that this has is to distance the narrative once again from *The Spy's* positioning as 'real' or 'authentic'. Another effect of the framing narrative in the above excerpt is the explicit expression of sympathy towards the 'country girl'. Mr. Spy is displaying to his readers his sympathy for the outsiders of society, siding with those oppressed by patriarchy and poverty. *The Spy's* exploration of Edinburgh's outsiders is here performed through the form-content relationship between the periodical context of a story and the short story itself. In this way, we also see how the 'thin layers' of the telling of a tale operate – editorial notes 'speak to' fictional correspondents who have submitted their stories.<sup>60</sup> The content of a story (M. M.'s narrative) interact with the editorial framing (Mr. Spy's sympathy) which in turn keys into the over-arching periodical framework of *The Spy's* authenticating project of its outsider identity. Jefferson Hunter's monograph on Edwardian writing draws out a similar double function in the frame-tale: it is at once a simulation of an (older) orality, and yet also a vehicle for conveying a modern scepticism (the relativistic, speaker-centred account, rather than the omniscient

---

<sup>59</sup> Hogg, 'Affecting Narrative of a Country Girl – Reflections on the Evils of Seduction', *The Spy*, pp. 223-230 (p. 230).

<sup>60</sup> Benjamin, 'The Storyteller', p. 6.

impersonal narration).<sup>61</sup> Hogg's framings work similarly—operating inside the oral and traditionary, yet for highly literate purposes.

*The Spy* uses techniques available to it as a periodical, such as the frame-tale, the editorial note and fictional epistolary correspondence, to launch a critique of the exclusively patriarchal nature of literary society and Edinburgh's club culture. In both 'Letter from Alice Brand' and 'Fanny Lively's Letter', Hogg masquerades as a female correspondent to *The Spy*. Both tales offer an insight into the exclusive nature of Edinburgh's literary forums and social clubs and societies and take aim at the 'unnatural practice of shutting us out from their convivial parties'.<sup>62</sup> Despite Alice's desire to talk about literature, she is met with a condescending exclusion from Edinburgh's literary society:

I hate disputations yet would often be glad to obviate the restraint, which so evidently pervades our parties, at the expense of a little controversy; and though I sometimes advance things which I know to be ridiculous, for the sake of being opposed, yet the polite condescension of my guests defeats this also, and leaves me often in a situation particularly disagreeable. Last night I said, I thought Milton the most absurd and stupid author with whom I was acquainted, - expecting to hear his beauties pointed out, which would have delighted me. I was disappointed – A reverend divine who sat over against me fixed his eyes on me, lifted his hand slowly from his knee, as if conceiving some weighty argument against my hypothesis, but he let it fall as slowly back – opened his mouth, and said just-nothing; but shook his head! Oh how I was vexed! After a long pause Dr. Jellaberry remarked that 'he never thought him such a genius as he was reported to be, for though he could bear with such a mass of notorious lies, he could have wished they had borne some distant resemblance to truth.' This vexed me more; so after another speech from the

---

<sup>61</sup> Jefferson Hunter, *Edwardian Fiction* (Cambridge, MA and London: Harvard University Press, 1982), p. 28.

<sup>62</sup> Hogg, 'Fanny Lively's Letter on the impropriety of the Ladies withdrawing from the Table', *The Spy*, pp. 66-72 (p. 67).

doctor on the difference betwixt truth and fiction, the subject was dropped: and Milton and I both passed for block-heads.<sup>63</sup>

As well as revealing how women are unfairly belittled as ‘block-heads’ by Edinburgh’s male-dominated literary society, the letters take aim at the intellectual vacuity of those literary societies where conversations ‘are the most insipid and dull, every individual appearing as if under some restraint.’ Female intellectual insight and agency is here shown to be present yet repressed by patriarchy in Scotland’s ‘elite’ literary cultures of metropolitan sociability.

The ‘letters’ to *The Spy* also show an awareness of the cultural constructions of gender norms in Edinburgh’s literary social life:

Ah! Sir, what have many parents to answer for? The female mind has been well compared to wax, but it is wax of the most delicate texture, which, when softened by the fire of youth, receives impressions with the utmost ease, but when age has cooled it, these remain fixed and immovable, whether they be good or evil. Nay, the smallest and most minute of these early impressions, time itself can hardly wear away.<sup>64</sup>

The social construction of gender identities is attested to here by being described as ‘wax’, where it is not the innate nature of femininity which excludes women from ‘high’ intellectual discussion but the moulding of societal expectations and education. Crucially, wax has the potential to be remoulded, even if those changes can only happen ‘by the fire of youth’. The ‘letters’ of Alice Brand and Fanny Lively take aim at a socially-incubated male privilege, described in Fanny Lively as the ‘folly of that sex, which we are taught to regard as our superiors in knowledge, and every rational attainment’.<sup>65</sup> *The Spy* is not a work of radical feminist discourse; however it does provide voices to socially excluded outsiders.

---

<sup>63</sup> Hogg, ‘Letter from Alice Brand’, *The Spy*, pp. 64-66 (p. 65).

<sup>64</sup> Hogg, ‘Fanny Lively’, p. 66.

<sup>65</sup> Hogg, ‘Fanny Lively’, p. 68.

The epistolary form of these short stories is used to refer to previous issues of the magazine and engage with Hogg's authorial identity, Mr. Spy:

Now, Sir, I would very fain see this long letter of mine, which I really think is a good sensible one for a girl like me to have written, printed in your paper. [...] My letter is surely too good for nobody to see it save you and I: if you will therefore publish it in your next number, I give you my promise, that the next time I see you in a pool, I will lend a hand to pull you out myself.<sup>66</sup>

In the first issue, *The Spy* recalls an anecdote which sees him fall into a pond after being distracted by the sight of young women. Here, Hogg writes as the young women who had previously witnessed Mr. Spy falling in to the water. This is an inversion of the trope of the spy, again troubling the authority of Mr. Spy by drawing out multiple narrative perspectives within and across periodical short stories. 'I am constantly on the look-out for singularities', explained Mr. Spy in the opening number.<sup>67</sup> Narrative authority is not fixed but contested in Hogg's aesthetic of portability, and the search for the 'singular' usually results in the multi-vocal. This is a widely recognised trope in studies of Hogg's narrative praxis,<sup>68</sup> and, in the case of *The Spy*, it is a function grounded in the particular formal conditions of the periodical short story.

*The Spy* uses this heteroglossic magazine environment to stage characters, narrators and fictional correspondents from a wide range of occupational backgrounds, social classes and regions, a multi-vocality achieved in the examples provided here through the form of the short story and its location in periodical print culture.<sup>69</sup> The term 'ethnographic authority' is useful for thinking about the ideological function of a notable example of this heteroglossia, John Miller, who appears across layers of narrative within *The Spy* number 12 as both subject-content and as storyteller. Maureen McLane has shown this to be 'bound up with other cultural modes invoking knowledge of local topography, dialect and lore, and which also carries potential class

---

<sup>66</sup> Hogg, 'Fanny Lively', p. 71.

<sup>67</sup> It should be noted that here that Hogg uses the term 'singular' often in his work, and it is usually deployed to mean something unusual or out of the ordinary, rather than denoting one person, thing, or instance.

<sup>68</sup> See Chapter One for discussion of scholarship on Hogg's narrative praxis, especially n.13.

<sup>69</sup> For a discussion of Mikhail Bakhtin's concept of 'heteroglossia' applied to Scottish Romantic-period writing, see Pittock, *Scottish and Irish Romanticism*, p. 25.

constraints for labouring-class authors'.<sup>70</sup> In the text of 'The Spy's Encounter with John Miller' – both in the framing narrative and in the interpolated narrative 'Description of a Peasant's Funeral, by John Miller' – references to specific customs and traditions work to ground John Miller's narrative as an authentic account of the rural peasantry and labouring-classes in southern Scotland. The text uses its constructed authenticity and closeness to 'subaltern' communities to disrupt the certainties of patronage, power and social hierarchies in early nineteenth-century Scotland.

The Spy himself, the narrator in the periodical's framing narratives and editorial commentary, foregrounds John Miller's ethnographic authority:

He let me understand that he came to Edinburgh depending upon being introduced to the world in my paper; and with the most cheerful alacrity, engaged to furnish me with a great number of anecdotes illustrative of country manners in general, delineations of many singular characters in Nithsdale and Galloway, old legends, and stories of ghosts and bogles.<sup>71</sup>

The publisher of *The Spy* thought that Hogg was the middle-man between the publisher and the author,<sup>72</sup> with the identity of The Spy being presented within the periodical as a highland gentleman in Edinburgh. We are repeatedly confronted with the issue of Hogg deploying multiple fictional versions of himself. To return to Catherine Belsey, the interrogative text is one in which 'the positions of the 'author' inscribed in the text, if it can be located at all, is seen as questioning or contradictory'.<sup>73</sup> Those multiple versions of authorial identity, via The Spy, John Miller, and behind it all Hogg himself, are played out through layers of narrative framing which consolidate a sense of indeterminacy over the place of the author in the text. Indeed, it is hard not to read the appearance of John Miller, the Scots-speaking Nithsdale shepherd migrant to Edinburgh with literary aspirations as an allegory for

---

<sup>70</sup> This is O'Halloran's paraphrasing of McLane's argument in *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, p. 253. See Maureen McLane, *Balladeering, Minstrelsy, and the Making of British Romantic Poetry* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), p. 192.

<sup>71</sup> Hogg, 'The Spy's Encounter with John Miller', *The Spy*, pp. 118-122 (p. 122).

<sup>72</sup> Hogg, 'The Spy's Farewell', p. 516.

<sup>73</sup> Catherine Belsey, *Critical Practice* 2nd ed. (London: Routledge, 2002), p. 84.

Hogg's recent experiences. Miller's connection to the folkloric traditions of the countryside, particularly relating to the supernatural, is spoken of in 'a kind a familiar tone', in 'the broadest dialect of the district'.<sup>74</sup> Hogg performs that dialect and its connection to Ettrick oral story-telling forms through reported Scots speech within the framing: 'I dinna care ... I can write about ony thing I' the Yirthly world'.<sup>75</sup>

The short story framed by that editorial paratext, 'Description of a Peasant's Funeral, by John Miller', places the teller at the centre of the telling. 'I went with my father to the funeral of George Mouncie', where 'we got each a glass of whisky as we entered'.<sup>76</sup> This equips the telling with a close knowledge of issues affecting the rural peripheries of Scotland and their encounter with an encroaching modernity in its discussion of ecclesiastical patronage:

One man said, in the course of some petty argument, 'I do not deny it, David, your minister is a very good man, and a very clever man too; he has no fault but one.' 'What is that?' said David. 'It is patronage,' said the other. 'Patronage,' said David, 'that cannot be a fault.' 'Not a fault, Sir? But I say it is a fault; and one that you and every one who encourages it by giving it your countenance will have to answer for. Your minister can never be a good shepherd, for he was not chosen by the flock.' 'It is a bad simile,' said David, 'the flock never chuses its own shepherd, but the owner of the flock.' The greatest number of inhabitants of that district being dissenters from the established church, many severe reflections were thrown out against the dangerous system of patronage, while no one ventured to defend it save David.<sup>77</sup>

The issue of patronage appears in the narratives of both Miller and that of Mr. Spy, with the former dealing with religious patronage and the latter literary patronage. The text offers no concrete answers to the issue of patronage in Scottish society, which has been identified by historians as 'the phenomenon which oiled the wheels of society'

---

<sup>74</sup> Hogg, 'Encounter with John Miller', p. 119.

<sup>75</sup> Hogg, 'Encounter with John Miller', p. 120.

<sup>76</sup> Hogg, 'Description of a Peasant's Funeral, by John Miller', pp. 122-126 (p. 122).

<sup>77</sup> Hogg, 'Peasant's Funeral', p. 123.

in eighteenth-century Scotland. The Patronage Act of 1712 gave Scottish lairds the right to appoint ministers in local parishes – a right long-held by the English landowning classes. The issue of ecclesiastical patronage came to dominate theological, and political, debates throughout the eighteenth century and into the nineteenth in Scotland, with many violent anti-patronage protests recorded across lowland Scotland as congregations sought to assert the basic right to select ministers.<sup>78</sup> Dissenters, mentioned above in ‘Peasant’s Funeral’, refers to those who dissented from the established kirk on the issue of patronage and organised their own presbyteries upon the principle of the congregation’s right to choose, rather than the ministry being imposed upon people by a landowner. Dissenting communities were often characterised as being rural and labouring-class, as they are in Hogg’s story.<sup>79</sup>

Andrew Newby describes the extensive reach of patronage throughout Scottish society:

In addition to ecclesiastical and political patronage, the more usual ‘artistic’ patronage helped to develop not only branches of arts and literature, but also the philosophical undertakings of the Enlightenment in Scotland.<sup>80</sup>

In *The Spy*, John Miller responds to Mr Spy’s critique of artistic patronage in Scotland by exclaiming his desire to ‘confound the bodies’ and press ahead with a literary career despite being an outsider in terms of his class and culture. This sense of ‘confounding the bodies’ of hierarchies of power returns at the end of Miller’s telling of ‘Peasant’s Funeral’, which deals with religious rather than literary patronage. The comedic reference (‘the flock never chuses its own shepherd, but the owner of the flock’) to Hogg’s background as a shepherd again points to Hogg’s labouring-class background and biographical ‘authenticity’ as the ‘Etrick Shepherd’. It is John Miller,

---

<sup>78</sup> See W. Hamish Fraser, ‘Patterns of Protest’, in T.M. Devine & R. Mitchison, eds, *People and Society in Scotland* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 1988), p. 282.

<sup>79</sup> Andrew G. Newby, ‘The patron-client relationship in eighteenth-century Scotland’, *SHP Seminar, Volda* (2008) p. 3.

<[https://www.hivolda.no/sites/default/files/documents/AndrewNewby\\_Client\\_Patron\\_Scotland.pdf](https://www.hivolda.no/sites/default/files/documents/AndrewNewby_Client_Patron_Scotland.pdf)> [accessed 20/05/2016]

<sup>80</sup> Newby, p. 1.

the character in the frame tale and the narrator of the excerpt above, who benefits here from the text's authority on matters concerning labouring-class rural life.

Gérard Genette's concept of narrative distancing can be useful in dealing with the passage above from 'Peasant's Funeral' by providing a model for understanding how narrative praxis can achieve ideological effects.<sup>81</sup> Quoted speech is used in the opening exchanges between the two men taking oppositional positions on the issue of patronage, and, given Miller's textual authority and closeness to the communities in question, the reader is invited to trust his account. The account then switches to reported speech – 'David; who said that...' – as the narrator summarises the argument being made in favour of patronage. The use of free indirect discourse is the key to the paragraph in terms of unlocking the significance of these narratological strategies. There are two words that the narrator deploys which reveal his position on the issue, and, given his ethnographic authoritative clout, the position of the community at large. The first instance is 'in some petty argument'. 'Petty' feels out of place somewhat, given the effort made in the sentences that follow to explain the patronage debate and convey the depth of feeling behind the issue. It clashes with the second instance of free indirect style, found in 'the dangerous system of patronage'. There is a lack of certainty over whose word 'dangerous' is: it seems to be somewhere between the narrator, Miller, and the community to which he is closely bound. 'Dangerous' therefore can operate at once as both Miller's personal and the community's collective condemnations of patronage. Yet it is the clash between 'petty' and 'dangerous' that proves most significant here in disentangling the ideological strands of the tale.

After the exchanges on patronage, the text becomes focalised through the wife of the 'peasant' who has died. Again, the narrative uses quoted speech to recount a conversation ('it was the language of nature') between the bereaved wife and a character, James, who is evidently close to the family although the connections

---

<sup>81</sup> Gérard Genette, *Narrative Discourse: An Essay in Method*, trans. Jane Lewin (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1980), pp. 171-172. For a discussion of how narratology functions in terms of ideology, see Jeremy Tambling, *Narrative and Ideology* (Milton Keynes: Open University Press, 1991), pp. 26-30.

between the pair remain hidden from the reader's view. In the final paragraph of the tale the quoted speech ends, leading to the appearance of textual features that provide an ideological function:

Her heart was full, and I do not know how long she might have run on, had not one remarked that the company were now all arrived, and there was no more time to lose. James then asked a blessing, which lasted about ten-minutes; - The Bread and wine were served plentifully around – The coffin was brought out, covered, and fixed on poles – The widow supported that end of it where the head of her late beloved partner lay, until it passed the gate way – then stood looking wistfully after it, while the tears flowed plentifully from her eyes – A turn in the wood soon hid it from her sight for ever – She gave one short look up to Heaven, and returned weeping into her cottage.<sup>82</sup>

Up until this point, the narrator has been seeing and telling in mimetic fashion, through quoted speech, reportage, and paraphrasing. The narrative pivots on 'her eyes', in the above excerpt, drawing the reader to the issue of focalisation. The selection of detail in the narrative is important, as James Wood reminds us:

The artifice lies in the *selection* of detail. In life, we can swivel our heads and eyes, but in fact we are like helpless cameras. We have a wide lens, and must take in whatever comes before us. Our memory selects for us, but not much like the way literary narrative selects.<sup>83</sup>

Wood's cinematographic metaphor can be extended here. If we imagine the narrative focalisation in 'Description of a Peasant's Funeral' as a camera, the tale thus far has been viewed through the lens of John Miller, but with the detail of 'her eyes', the camera zooms-in and at that specific point we are able to see through those eyes – 'the turn in the wood hid it from her sight'. We no longer see from the perspective of the narrator, but from the peasant woman. The focus on detail is important here, particularly on the linkage of the images of coffin, corpse, tears, and wife's eyes. Death – what Benjamin described as 'the sanction of everything that the storyteller can tell' - comes in to focus.<sup>84</sup> 'Her eyes' then lead to 'her sight', allowing the reader

---

<sup>82</sup> Hogg, 'Peasant's Funeral', p. 125.

<sup>83</sup> James Wood, *How Fiction Works* (London: Vintage, 2009), p. 47.

<sup>84</sup> Benjamin, 'The Storyteller', p. 7

to see from the perspective of a peasant. The peasant experience of death ends the story. This has the effect of aligning the reader with the grief of the peasant wife, and it also has ideological implications.

Miller's narrative opens with fierce discussion over religious politics and doctrine among the men. It is noted by the servants that while the men talk about religion, it is the women who show more sympathy to the issues of loss and grief during the funeral. It is only through the wife's eyes that we garner a sense of how rural peasants, already framed within ethnographic authority, see 'for ever', heaven, and loss. Providence, for the wife of the deceased peasant, is an everyday concern rather than one that rests in the interpretations of competing religious doctrines. Patronage and power hierarchies are thus subverted as the text's focalisation on the wife's grief prompts the reader to 'confound the bodies' of the 'petty'-ness of competing religious doctrines and their ideological certainties.

This is where the free indirect clash between 'petty' and 'dangerous' takes on a greater significance. The ideology of patronage is shown as anti-intellectual and undemocratic in *The Spy's* narrative, and judged as 'dangerous' in Miller's narrative, yet the 'petty' reminds us to focus upon the personal and the individual experience of larger structural inequalities. Miller responds to those structures by saying 'confound the bodies', and his narrative of the 'Peasant's Funeral' itself therefore becomes an act of subversion in its very being. The text enables the labouring-class rural woman to respond to structures of power by allowing the reader to see through her eyes the rural labouring-class experience of death – which I would argue becomes an act of radicalism in itself in a period in which societal authorities viewed labouring and working-class communities with suspicion, in particular following the politically tumultuous 1790s. It is worth noting here the allegorical significance of the name 'The Spy' with popular political agitation and the climate of fear and accusation around government spies, which, as Gordon Pentland has shown, are discourses that permeated popular political culture and rhetoric in Scotland in the early nineteenth

century.<sup>85</sup> There are too suggestive political implications in the discussion over sheep choosing their shepherd – patronage, and the right to choose, becomes ‘dangerous’ on a number of interpretative levels. Like Benjamin’s effusion on storytelling, ‘the most extraordinary things, marvellous things, are related with the greatest accuracy’ – the women’s detailed visual farewell to her husband’s coffin, and the debate about patronage – ‘but the psychological connection of the events is not forced on the reader’.<sup>86</sup>

John Miller functions as an intermediary level of staged storytelling between the authentic oral culture of labouring-class, peasant Scotland and the print environs of the Edinburgh periodical press. In the staging of levels of storytelling, *The Spy*’s short fiction makes explicit its construction in print. In ‘Story of the Ghost of Lochmaben, by John Miller’, Hogg discusses the form’s shortness as a material object in the periodical paper head-on:

Well, to make a long tale short, one morning the poor unhealthy woman was found drowned in a loch adjoining the town; and as all the burghers believed that she had put herself down, they refused her Christian burial.<sup>87</sup>

The reference to the required conciseness of the periodical short story displays a self-awareness of the characteristics of the form. Such an awareness of form, displayed to the reader from the outset, combines with the story’s content in which a woman’s ghost accuses her husband of her murder and the townsfolk, believing the supernatural testimony, pursue justice:

though acquitted in the eye of the law, he was not so in the eyes of his neighbours, who all looked upon him as the murderer of his wife. And one night, after his return home, the mob assembled ... and made them ride the stang through all the streets of the town, and then threw them into the lock, and gave them a hearty ducking.<sup>88</sup>

---

<sup>85</sup> Gordon Pentland, ‘“Betrayed by Infamous Spies”? The Commemoration of Scotland’s ‘Radical War’ of 1820’, *Past and Present* 201 (2008), 141-173.

<sup>86</sup> Benjamin, ‘The Storyteller’, p. 4.

<sup>87</sup> Hogg, ‘Story of the Ghost of Lochmaben, by John Miller’, *The Spy*, pp. 191-194 (p. 192).

<sup>88</sup> Hogg, ‘Ghost of Lochmaben’, p. 193.

The shortness of the story contributes to the mystery and unresolved ending, in which the townsfolk's judgement is not necessarily the 'right' judgement. Multiple explanations – jealousy, suicide, retribution – exist alongside the popular supernatural explanation, a ubiquitous trope in Hogg's work. The authorial voice does not do the explanatory work for the reader. While the story appears in *Winter Evening Tales*, it loses the 'by John Miller' tag – and so the reader of *Winter Evening Tales* misses out on the *The Spy*'s efforts to construct its auto-ethnographic authority as short storyteller.

The self-referential brevity of Hogg's short stories in *The Spy*, like in 'Ghost of Lochmaben' and its use of John Miller as teller, dramatise their own existence as stories in a magazine print culture. In 'Dreadful Narrative of Major Macpherson', the story's shortness adds to the indeterminacy of the subject-content, providing an example of how Hogg's portable narrative aesthetic is shaped by the form of the magazine short story. While the story also appeared in *Winter Evening Tales*, there are distinctive features in its original form. It positions itself as a letter to *The Spy* and so engages directly with the periodical's identity. The story stages its levels of tellings in print, by firstly positioning itself as a letter, but also in its opening lines:

I received yours of the 20<sup>th</sup> October, intreating me to furnish you with the tale, which you say you have heard me relate ... I think the story worthy of being preserved, but I have never heard it related save once ... being told by one who was well acquainted both with the scene and the sufferers yet I fear my memory is not sufficiently accurate, with regard to particulars; and without these the interest of a story is always diminished, and its authenticity rendered liable to be called in question. I will however communicate it exactly as it remains impressed on my memory, without avouching for the particulars relating to it; in these I shall submit to be corrected by such as are better informed.

I have forgot what year it happened.<sup>89</sup>

---

<sup>89</sup> Hogg, 'Dreadful Narrative of the Death of Major MacPherson', *The Spy*, pp. 135-138 (p. 135).

The fictional correspondent, already one layer of the telling, explains to the reader that he has already heard the story, in oral form, from someone who was more immediately connected to the experience of the event being told. The sources of narrative authority that underpin these layers of telling are made explicit. The oral form from the experiencer is able to make a ‘considerable impression’ upon the hearer, whilst the retelling in print, being based upon memory, is made unstable as ‘my memory is not sufficiently accurate’ and the story is thus ‘diminished ... its authenticity liable to be called in question’. In this way, the short story’s oral roots are textually performed within the periodical, in a similar way to the treatment of Scots vernacular discussed in relation to ‘Danger of Changing Occupations’. The story of the ‘Dreadful Narrative’, in which a hunting party go missing and are discovered dead in mysterious circumstances, is itself left open to interpretation, between the rational impulses of the implied metropolitan readership and the ‘belief in supernatural agency’ which prevails in ‘every mountainous district of Scotland’.<sup>90</sup> The story subtly suggests a possible explanation for the deaths:

Macpherson was said to have been guilty of some acts of extreme cruelty and injustice in raising recruits in that country, and was, on that account held in detestation by the common people.<sup>91</sup>

Like in the ‘Ghost of Lochmaben’, local cultures of orality in ‘Dreadful Narrative’ contain competing explanations of events, and explanations that exceed the purely rational are mobilised by Hogg. The four-page magazine story is unable to resolve the Enlightenment versus traditional orality dialectic. That tension is staged within form and is a tension which functions towards Hogg’s broader authenticating project, and authorial identity, of between-ness.

This staged tension of metropolitan rationality versus ‘authentic’ traditional orality in marginal regions appears in ‘Malise’s Journey to the Trossachs, with a romantic Highland Tale’, through Hogg’s ‘self-othering’ in relation to the *inauthentic* Scott. This process of ‘self-othering’ is achieved through the form of the magazine short story. The story makes explicit The Spy’s attack on Scott’s perceived inauthenticity,

---

<sup>90</sup> Hogg, ‘Major MacPherson’, p. 138.

<sup>91</sup> Hogg, ‘Major MacPherson’, p. 136.

and ergo Hogg's own authority in matters relating to 'real' depictions of rural and peripheral life in Scotland. The story, like so many of the *The Spy*'s articles, takes the form of a letter to the magazine's editor, 'Mr. Spy'. The tale is narrated through Malise, who looks upon his Highland guide, a 'feudal baron', with a mixture of respect for the order and respect he commands from the local population, and condescension of the 'otherness' of an older way of life in rural Scotland.<sup>92</sup> The framing narrative opens with Malise's critique of the Scottian construction of romantic Scotland:

I cannot help remarking here, Mr. Spy, that I think the greatest fault attached to the delightful poem of the *Lady of the Lake*, is, its containing no one fact, on which the mind of the enraptured peruser can rest as the basis of a principle so inherent in the human mind, as the desire of affixing the stamp of reality on such incidents as interest us. The soul of man thirsts naturally and ardently for truth; and the author that ceases to deceive us with the appearance of it, ceases in a proportional degree to interest our feelings in behalf of the characters which he describes, or the fortunes of the individuals to which these characters are attached... in this poem he never once leaves the enchanting field of probability, yet the mind is forced reluctantly to acknowledge, that it has been pursuing an illusion, and interesting itself in a professed fiction... I admire the easy and simple majesty of that sweet tale as much as any person can possibly do; but I have never read it without regretting, that it had not been founded on a fact, though ever so trivial.<sup>93</sup>

Scott's poem – or 'sweet tale' - is denied the 'affixing stamp of reality', and is deemed trivial by the narrator. Malise describes his awe at the picturesque Highland scenery and recalls an encounter with 'an old crusty Highlander'.<sup>94</sup> Hogg's narrator finds the hostility towards outsiders both amusing and quaint, and uses the position of the narrator in the text to construct a distinction between a rational, urban viewpoint and an authentic, barbed 'noble-savage' rural Scots people.

---

<sup>92</sup> Hogg, 'Malise's Journey to the Trossachs, with a romantic Highland Tale', *The Spy*, pp. 397-402 (p. 397).

<sup>93</sup> Hogg, 'Malise's Journey', p. 398.

<sup>94</sup> Hogg, 'Malise's Journey', p. 399.

The story appears in book format in *Winter Evening Tales* (1820), which is the version studied by Killick in his survey of early nineteenth-century short fiction in Britain. Killick too recognises the dual existence in the narrator of enlightened sensibilities and Romantic aestheticism, who ‘reconfigures all that he witnesses until it adheres to both his rigid convictions of reality and his desire to imbibe poetic sensation from the culture through which he passes’:

The narrator loses his footing on the descent and slides haphazardly and swiftly down in the snow, exiting the scene with both his own imported simplistic preconceptions, and the complex actuality of rural life, intact and unaffected by their interaction.<sup>95</sup>

The tension between Enlightened rationalism and what Ian Duncan calls the ‘older, feudal and mythic order’ is well established in Hoggian criticism.<sup>96</sup> Whilst that binary distinction appears in ‘Malise’s Journey’, it is a constructed tension, *performed* within the text through the letter-format it takes, the dialogue with Mr. Spy, and the story’s emphasis on Scott as the inauthentic ‘other’. By framing the story as a letter to *The Spy*, Hogg removes himself from the text to make Malise a character. It is not *The Spy* or Hogg who is casting aspersions over the truth of Scott’s work whilst awkwardly and condescendingly encountering the local populace, it is Malise. The urban and rational outsider and interloper to the Highlands – i.e. Scott - is thus satirised through Malise. Scott’s inauthenticity – and thus Hogg’s authenticity - is constructed through the lens of the urban narrator. This multi-vocalic narrative layering is achieved through the form of the magazine short story.

### *The Spy’s farewell*

‘The magazine’, argued Karl Miller, ‘can be characterised by beginning at the end’.<sup>97</sup> This circular narrative of editorial performativity, and its fictionalisation of the periodical’s identity, is a context inseparable from the short stories contained within it, speaking as it does to issues of orality, class, language, and closeness to the

---

<sup>95</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 138.

<sup>96</sup> Quoted in Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 138

<sup>97</sup> Karl Miller, *Electric Shepherd: A likeness of James Hogg* (London: Faber and Faber, 2005), p. 77.

outsiders and the subaltern communities of Scotland. In the final number of *The Spy*, the editor dramatically reveals his identity as a labouring-class autodidact from Scotland's rural margins, an outsider to literary Edinburgh:

They have had, at all events, the honour of patronizing an undertaking quite new in the records of literatures; for that a common shepherd who never was at school, who went to service at seven years of age, and could neither write nor read with accuracy when twenty, yet who, smitten with an unconquerable thirst after knowledge, should run away from his master, leave his nature mountains, and his flocks to wander where they chose, come to the metropolis with his plaid wrapt round his shoulders, and all at once set up for a connoisseur in manners, taste and genius, has certainly much more of the appearance of a romance than a matter of fact. Yet a matter of fact it certainly is, and such a person is the editor of the *Spy*.<sup>98</sup>

He takes a swipe at the literary marketplace of Edinburgh and its reading public, many of which 'are too indolent to read any thing till its reputation is established, others too envious to promote that fame which gives them pain by its increase'.<sup>99</sup> He reveals how he had played tricks on the readers and their literary prejudices by publishing contributions written by himself, 'which he was certain were his worst, and insinuated that they were the productions of such and such gentlemen, famous for their literary abilities'.<sup>100</sup>

The *Spy* performs his outsider identity in the closing number by pointing to his uniqueness in comparison to other periodical writers and stresses the connection to oral storytelling modes. Functioning as the traditionary while operating through print, this is an 'authentic' orality performed through highly literate modes of communication in the magazine short story. 'No periodical writer before him was perhaps necessitated to struggle with' the outsider characteristics of class, region, manners, and language, which left the editor of *The Spy* confined from 'his infancy to the conversation of the lowest classes of mankind' leaving him a wealth of

---

<sup>98</sup> Hogg, 'The *Spy*'s Farewell', p. 515.

<sup>99</sup> Hogg, 'The *Spy*'s Farewell', p. 518.

<sup>100</sup> Hogg, 'The *Spy*'s Farwell', p. 514.

‘unpolished gems’ in storytelling material.<sup>101</sup> In the final performance of *The Spy* as outsider, he reveals more than the ‘true’ identity of the editor. He reveals the authenticating processes of the storytelling ideal – closeness to the speech of the ‘lowest classes’, ‘unpolished gems’ of folk material – which forms the crux of the identity of the *The Spy*. This chapter has shown how the identity of the outsider, as ‘Mr. Spy’, was forged within and through the form of the magazine short story. This authenticity effect was achieved through *The Spy*’s formal heteroglossia in the use of, for example, frame-tales and letter tropes, which operated in dialogue with the editorial ‘connective tissues’ – points of synthesis and of rupture – between short stories.

The identity of ‘Mr. Spy’ in Hogg’s magazine is constructed in a Benjaminian ideal story-teller mould – one rooted in oral culture, and one in which the experience of the telling is as much a part of the story as the contents being re-laid to the audience. A story according to Benjamin:

does not aim to convey the pure essence of the thing, like information or a report. It sinks the thing into the life of the storyteller, in order to bring it out of him again. Thus traces of the storyteller cling to the story the way the handprints of the potter cling to the clay vessel. Storytellers tend to begin their story with a presentation of the circumstances in which they themselves have learned what is to follow.<sup>102</sup>

Traces of ‘Mr Spy’ permeate Hogg’s short stories in the magazine and across its connective tissues of para-textual material and framings. The magazine stakes a claim as an authentic collection of fragments of subaltern life from Scotland’s rural peripheries, presented to a metropolitan audience. Mr. Spy’s outsider identity is rooted in Hogg’s biography as a labouring-class autodidact from the regional margins of Scottish society.

---

<sup>101</sup> Hogg, ‘The Spy’s Farewell’, p. 519.

<sup>102</sup> Benjamin, ‘The Storyteller’, p. 5.

Through the textualisation of the Benjaminian oral storytelling ideal, Hogg's short fiction in *The Spy* can be considered as what Belsey termed an 'interrogative form' - one in which the reader plays an active role in making sense out of the periodical's lack of formal stability, and one in which the place of editor and author within the text is 'seen as questioning or contradictory'.<sup>103</sup> As Benjamin argues in his discussion of the difference between information and storytelling:

Actually, it is half the art of storytelling to keep a story free from explanation as one reproduces it. ... It is left up to [the reader] to interpret things the way he understands them, and thus the narrative achieves an amplitude that information lacks.<sup>104</sup>

The *Spy*'s interrogative short stories omit explanatory narrative features, avoiding narrative resolution and drawing the reader's attention towards modes of (re)tellings in both print and in oral culture. Hogg's Benjaminian performance of the authentic subaltern storyteller in his short stories draws readers towards questions regarding the axis of narrative authority in the text. Maggie Awadalla and Paul March-Russell have recently argued that 'the short story has a much more troubled – and troubling– relationship to modernity than Benjamin necessarily suggests.'<sup>105</sup> The Romantic-era short story and its relationship to magazine culture can offer an insight into the form's 'troubling' relationship between the oral tradition and a modernising print culture. As such, the historical biases of short story theory and criticism toward the later nineteenth century are further challenged by the Hogg presented here.<sup>106</sup> This is, after all, a form with a heritage.

In his short-lived periodical, Hogg's short stories use their connection to tradition - their embodiment of rural culture, of Lowland Scots speech, and of orality – to perform an authentic mode of storytelling which complicates Benjamin's binary conceptualisation of the short story and the oral storytelling tradition. The

---

<sup>103</sup> Belsey, p. 84.

<sup>104</sup> Benjamin, 'The Storyteller', p. 4.

<sup>105</sup> Maggie Awadalla and Paul March-Russell, 'Introduction', p. 2.

<sup>106</sup> The problematic, yet pervasive, idea of the short story as a modern and new form is discussed by Levy in *The Culture and Commerce of the American Short Story*, p.9. See the introduction chapter of this thesis for more on later nineteenth century criticism and theory of the short story form, including Brander Matthews's influential 1884 essay 'The Philosophy of the Short Story'.

performance of authenticity functions through the form's textuality, in the deployment of multiple framing narratives and shifting narratological perspectives, and in the self-referential constructed-ness of the form which points to the sources of narrative authority underpinning stories. In other words, print technology forms the basis upon which tradition is performed, and through which the oral storytelling ideal, its 'thin layers' and 'retellings', is textually mimicked.<sup>107</sup> Tradition is mediated through modernity in the short story form. Moreover, the brevity of the short prose narrative form within the pages of the periodical meant that explanatory narrative resolutions are often avoided in favour of an interrogative mode of storytelling, in which meanings are left open to readers' interpretation. Benjamin's essay on storytelling and the short story draws a binary distinction between modernity and tradition that begins to falter upon closer analysis of the function of the periodical short form in the case of Hogg.

Hogg's periodical short story form was self-consciously an object of print, which could textually perform 'authentic' orality. Through Hogg's rural incomer and Edinburgh flâneur Mr Spy, metropolitan readers encountered a textual performance of Scotland's margins while being presented with a critique of the class-based exclusionary literary marketplace of which they, as consumers, were a part. A Benjaminian reading of James Hogg's short stories in *The Spy* can therefore offer a new way of thinking about modernity and its connection, rather than opposition, to tradition. In the textual production of the Hoggian short story and its characteristic portability, 'authenticity' is not an innate essence but a performative function of form.

---

<sup>107</sup> Benjamin, 'The Storyteller', p. 6.

CHAPTER TWO: Authentic Shepherds? Hogg's short stories and *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*

That magazine of [Blackwood's], which owes its rise principally to myself, has often put words and sentiments into my mouth of which I have been greatly ashamed, and which have given much pain to my family and relations, and many of those after a solemn written promise that such freedoms should not be repeated.<sup>1</sup>

The following chapter argues that Hogg used the form of the short story, situated in its specific contexts of publication in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, to assert agency in the contest over his associated author functions and subvert the class-based stereotypes imposed on him as 'peasant-poet'. In doing so, the chapter consolidates the broader thesis argument about form, agency, authenticity and the author function, while foregrounding the distinctiveness of the Blackwoodian context in shaping how stories functioned in relation to both narrative and ideology. What makes the *Blackwood's* example distinctive from, say *The Spy* or from *Fraser's Magazine*, is that, from 1823 in the satirical sketch series *Noctes Ambrosianae*, the magazine contained within its pages a ventriloquised version of Hogg's Ettrick Shepherd. As suggested by a large body of concomitant critical literature, *Blackwood's* offers a unique perspective on the issues of authorship, identity, and performativity in relation to Hogg.<sup>2</sup> I argue in this chapter that those Blackwoodian issues of identity and authenticity are grounded in the form of the short story and its relation to contexts of publication. Hogg's stories in *Maga* frequently displayed an explicit discussion of how narratives had been constructed, a recurrent trope in these stories was the use of epistolarity. Letters, partly by way of their association with the authority of the printed word alongside their ability to perform the 'real' perspectives of people other than the named author of the story, functioned to authenticate narratives. The first section of this chapter discusses stories in which allusions to the printed word, such as the letter

---

<sup>1</sup>Hogg, 'Reminiscences of Former Days', in *Altrive Tales: Collected from Among the Peasantry of Scotland and from Foreign Adventures*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2005), pp. 53-78 (p. 59).

<sup>2</sup> For a starter point into scholarly debates about *Blackwood's* and authorship, identity and Romantic literary culture, see *Romanticism and Blackwood's Magazine*, ed. by Robert Morrison and Daniel Roberts.

trope, are deployed, and shows how, while having different specific connotations of connectivity, such as emigration and empire, the letter trope in short stories functioned to authenticate Hogg's stories while simultaneously cultivating a self-reflexive narrative aesthetic. This section also discusses other elements of a self-aware print culture, such as the frame tale and non-fiction material, within the magazine which operated in dialogue with Hogg's short stories, shaping how stories functioned at the levels of both narrative and ideology.

As well as a self-conscious textuality within print culture, Hogg's stories contained multiple sources of narrative authority – namely the memory of the storyteller, and the storyteller's connection to orality – which had the effect of staging the closeness of the storyteller to peripheral cultures of labouring-class and rural southern Scotland and enabling the agency of Hogg as the Ettrick Shepherd vis a vis ethnographic authority. The discussion will illustrate that self-referential narrative praxis by exploring examples of Hogg's short fiction in *Blackwood's* in which the narrative foregrounds the sources from which the stories are drawn. The main devices by Hogg deployed to this end include explaining to readers that he is telling a tale from his own memory, which usually involved testimony drawn from the oral culture of the labouring-classes in the Scottish Borders. In these examples, Hogg positions his authorial voice to merge with the voice of a community more broadly, as an 'authentic' voice of a community which lies out of reach of educated, urban post-Enlightenment Edinburgh – at times even directly 'othering' Walter Scott. Hogg's use of register and the vernacular in his representation of speech is a key facet of this authenticating project. The authenticity of Scots vernacularity is shown to be staged within stories. In the performance of authenticity as a textual effect in the periodical short story, I argue that Hogg asserts agency in the Blackwoodian contest over the authorial identity of the 'Ettrick Shepherd'. John Wilson and John Gibson Lockhart's Noctean Shepherd was an attempt, in part, to enclose Hogg according to his class-position as a labouring-class 'peasant poet'.<sup>3</sup> Hogg's portable short stories subverted those attempts to restrain the Ettrick Shepherd.

---

<sup>3</sup> For discussion of the limiting and pigeon-holing impetus of the 'peasant poet' idiom, see Valentina Bold, *'Nature's Making': James Hogg and the Autodidact Tradition in Scottish Poetry*, (unpublished

The launch of *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* in 1817 marks a key point in both the literary career of James Hogg, and in the history of the short story in the periodical press. Scholarly interest in *Blackwood's*, particularly from the perspective of Romantic periodical studies, has increased significantly in recent years, with many of those studies acknowledging Hogg's role in the 'unprecedented phenomenon' that was *Blackwood's*.<sup>4</sup> The work of Thomas Richardson has added significantly to our understanding of the relationship between Hogg and *Blackwood's*.<sup>5</sup> Furthermore, scholars such as Tim Killick and Gerard Carruthers have noted the importance of *Blackwood's* to the development of the short story.<sup>6</sup> Hogg studies, as part of the broader project of Hogg's scholarly rediscovery led by the Stirling/South Carolina research edition, has recently begun to unravel the extent to which periodical publication and circulation was vital to the reception of Hogg during his lifetime, and beyond.<sup>7</sup> Whilst Killick has written on *Blackwood's* and the short story with reference to Hogg's work, his important scholarship on early nineteenth century short fiction is relatively limited in scope with regards to Hogg's periodical short fiction output.<sup>8</sup> Thus far no study has sought to synthesise an analysis of the three intersecting areas

---

doctoral thesis University of Glasgow, 1997), pp. 603 -604. For discussion of the ways in which *Blackwood's* writers like John Wilson negatively characterised Hogg using class stereotypes, see Suzanne Gilbert, 'Hogg's Reception and Reputation', in *Companion*, p. 41.

<sup>4</sup> *Romanticism and Blackwood's Magazine*, ed. by Robert Morrison and Daniel Roberts; Schoenfield, *British Periodicals*, and Schoenfield, 'Butchering James Hogg: Romantic Identity in the Magazine Market', in *At the Limits of Romanticism: Essays in Cultural, Feminist, and Materialist Criticism*, ed. by Mary A. Favret and Nicola J. Watson (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1994), pp. 207-24; Stewart, *Romantic Magazines*.

<sup>5</sup> See Thomas C. Richardson, 'James Hogg and *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*: Buying and Selling the Ettrick Shepherd', in *Literary Marketplace*, pp. 185-200.

<sup>6</sup> Killick, 'Blackwood's and the Boundary of the Short Story', in *Romanticism and Blackwood's Magazine*, pp. 163-174; Gerard Carruthers, 'Gender and the Short Story in the Twilight Years', in *International Companion to John Galt*, ed. by G. Carruthers and C. Kidd (Glasgow: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2017), pp. 125 -136.

<sup>7</sup> Janette Currie, 'From Altrive to Albany: James Hogg's Transatlantic Publication' *Scotland's Transatlantic Relations Project Archive* (2003) <<http://www.star.ac.uk/archive/Papers/Currie.pdf>> [accessed 2/8/2017]. Research is currently underway at the University of Stirling towards the publication of *Hogg's Contributions to International Periodicals*, for the Stirling/South Carolina Research Editions of Hogg's work.

<sup>8</sup> Killick's article on Hogg, *Blackwood's* and the 'boundaries' of Romantic short fiction focuses his argument with respect to Hogg upon one of his stories, 'Storms' (Killick, 2013, pp. 163-174). His monograph study focuses upon Hogg's book-format collections *Winter Evening Tales* (1820) and *Shepherd's Calendar* (1829). See Killick, *British Short Fiction in the Early Nineteenth Century: The Rise of the Tale* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008) pp. 130 -149.

of *Blackwood's* print culture, the short story form, and James Hogg's narrative praxis. The following chapter seeks to supply that deficit.

### *Blackwood's Ettrick Shepherd?*

*Blackwood's* and the 'Ettrick Shepherd' author function have a distinctive and inter-related history. As detailed in the introductory chapter, the contestation of authorial identities is important to understanding Hogg's writing career and his narrative aesthetic, and the performance of authorial identities within a short story's title and framing device was an important aspect of the self-conscious constructed-ness characteristic of Hogg's Blackwoodian short fiction. In 1830 Hogg had a short story published in *Blackwood's* entitled 'The Mysterious Bride, By the Ettrick Shepherd'. The title's inclusion of the Ettrick Shepherd authorial persona is worth noting. Hogg deployed various authorial signatures for his stories throughout his career, including his 'real' name, anonymity, and a selection of constructed authorial personas. These authorial identities included a mysterious rural gentleman looking-in on metropolitan post-Enlightenment Edinburgh in Mr. Spy, who represented an inversion of his own class background, and also, in a mimicry of Scott, a tale-collecting landowner in 'J. H. Craig of Douglas Esq.'. <sup>9</sup> His authorial identities also include, as in the case of Hogg's *Maga* short stories 'A Singular Letter from Southern Africa' (1829) and 'Strange Letter from a Lunatic to Christopher North Esq.' (1830), fictional narrational characters, in a similar way to the function of the shepherd-come-writer John Miller in *The Spy*. Each of these authorial identities perform different ideological functions, although all are rooted in the authenticating discourses of place, class and language. Perhaps Hogg's best-known authorial persona is the 'Ettrick Shepherd', itself a moniker which signifies place (Ettrick) and class (Shepherd), and an identity which had a particular relationship to the culture within, and production of, *Blackwood's*. By the time of publication of 'The Mysterious Bride' in the early 1830s, Hogg's use of the moniker 'The Ettrick Shepherd' becomes notable in its ubiquity, particularly in the stories published in London magazines such as *The Metropolitan*. <sup>10</sup> As Peter Garside has argued, 'Publicity in the 'Noctes' was as always a mixed blessing, on the

---

<sup>9</sup> Ian Duncan, 'Introduction', *Companion*, p.2; Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 135.

<sup>10</sup> See chapter four of this thesis for analysis of Hogg's London magazine stories.

one hand severely threatening Hogg's claim to be treated seriously as a literary figure, yet at the same time offering personal publicity on a scale that could not be found elsewhere'.<sup>11</sup>

Before the 'Ettrick Shepherd' persona had become established within the pages of *Blackwood's*, Hogg had published anonymously in the magazine, most infamously in 'The Translation from an Ancient Chaldee Manuscript' (1817). Thomas Richardson explains that 'Chaldee Manuscript' was:

begun by Hogg as a playful satire on the efforts by Blackwood (represented in the 'Chaldee' as 'a man clothed in plain apparel' whose 'name was as it had been the colour of ebony') to establish the *Edinburgh Monthly*; the difficulties with his editors, who are represented as beasts (Pringle a 'lamb' and Cleghorn a 'bear'); and the move of Pringle and Cleghorn to Blackwood's publishing competitor, Archibald Constable ('a man who was crafty in counsel, and cunning in all manner of working'). The work was written in the style of the Authorised Version of the Bible, and Hogg drew his imagery from the apocalyptic language of the second half of the biblical book of Daniel.<sup>12</sup>

Hogg sent his manuscript to Blackwood for consideration. On receiving Hogg's work, Blackwood, Lockhart and Wilson reportedly 'drank punch one night from eight till eight in the morning', adding 135 verses and changing the nature of Hogg's playful satire into 'a work that in places is mean-spirited and sometimes vicious and libelous'.<sup>13</sup>

As the fall-out played out in the months after the 'Chaldee' publication in the first of the newly-titled *Blackwood's*, Hogg was clearly anxious to maintain his anonymity:

---

<sup>11</sup> Garside is quoted in Suzanne Gilbert, 'Hogg's Reception and Reputation', in *Companion*, p. 41. For discussion of how the 'peasant-poet' idiom 'celebrated but also confined the work of working-class writers' see Alker and Nelson, 'James Hogg and working class writing', *Companion*, p. 56.

<sup>12</sup> Thomas C. Richardson, 'James Hogg, 'the beginner and almost sole instigator' of *Blackwood's* – Not Once, but Twice', *Romanticism* 23.3 (2017), pp. 205-214 (p. 211).

<sup>13</sup> Richardson, 'Not Once, but Twice', p. 211.

For the love of God open not your mouth about the Chaldee M.S. All is combustion there have been meeting and proposals and an express has arrived from Edin to me this morning. Deny all knowledge else they say I am ruined if it can by any means be attached – Let all be silence.<sup>14</sup>

In a further letter to Blackwood, dated 28<sup>th</sup> October 1817, Hogg again expresses unease about the controversy:

I have had an express from Edin. To day telling me of a dreadful eruption about a certain article and the imminent danger the author is in should he be discovered.<sup>15</sup>

Hogg follows this by offering to Blackwood a non-fiction essay on sheep farming and admits to the Edinburgh editor that ‘I have chosen a different signature lest they should despise a poet’s advice’.<sup>16</sup> One of these signatures was, of course, ‘the Ettrick Shepherd’, an authorial identity which, although regularly used by Hogg himself, had been commandeered by *Noctes Ambrosianae*, which ran between 1822 and 1835. Hogg was never allowed to write as ‘himself’ in *Noctes*. ‘Trapped behind his Ettrick Shepherd *Noctes* persona’, argues Meiko O’Halloran, ‘Hogg is all too aware of his reductive, comic image as a target for mimicry and mock beatings.’<sup>17</sup> The notorious sketch series was authored by Wilson and Lockhart, who had also made significant alterations to Hogg’s ‘Chaldee’ manuscript after it had been submitted it to Blackwood, showing the ways in which Hogg was subjected to loss of control over authorial voice and identity in Blackwood’s outwith *Noctes* alone, and showing how Hogg was subject ‘mock beatings’ before the launch of the sketch series.

### ‘A Scots Mummy’

---

<sup>14</sup> Alan Lang Strout, ‘James Hogg’s ‘Chaldee Manuscript’’, *PMLA* 65.5 (1950), 695-178 (p. 704). For further information on ‘Chaldee’, see: Thomas C. Richardson, ‘Introduction’, in James Hogg, *Contributions to Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine vol. 1, 1817- 1828*, ed. by Thomas C. Richardson (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), pp.xviii- xxv.

<sup>15</sup> Strout, p. 704

<sup>16</sup> Strout, p. 704

<sup>17</sup> O’Halloran, ‘Treading the Borders of Fiction: Veracity, Identity, and Corporeality in *The Three Perils*’, *Studies in Hogg and his World* 12 (2001), 40-55 (p. 45).

Hogg's short story 'A Scots Mummy. To Sir Christopher North' was published in *Blackwood's* in August 1823 and illustrates the ways in which Hogg sought to reclaim agency over associated author functions through the performance of authenticity in his short stories at the level of narrative and form.<sup>18</sup> It is a story which uses Blackwoodian allusion to subvert the reductive Noctean shepherd stereotype and is a story which is thoroughly aware of its magazine status. The narrative is transported from the periodical to the novel form in 1824, appearing as the famous grave-digging scene in Hogg's novel *Justified Sinner*. The story will therefore be familiar to many Hogg scholars and has attracted the attention of critics, however the original short story is worthy of study in its own right as a magazine short story which engages in the Blackwoodian contest over the Ettrick Shepherd. It deploys tropes and narrative features which are characteristic of Hogg's short story contributions to *Blackwood's* more broadly, such as the use of the epistolary format and self-awareness its printed nature, its use of vernacularity and Scots speech to stage authenticity, its intertextual play on *Noctes* tropes, and its locating of the storyteller within the layers of community retellings to foreground ethnographic authority within the narrative structure. These are features that I identify as part of my broader thesis of portability and the Hoggian short story. In 'A Scots Mummy', portability gets a distinctively Blackwoodian twist.

In its original form, as opposed to its appearance in *Justified Sinner*, the story is very much a product of the distinctive *Blackwood's* cultural environment and its competing literary personalities. The introductory framing narrative is positioned as a letter – 'Dear Sir Christy' – and tells of a time when 'Christopher North', the pseudonym of John Wilson, had asked Hogg at the morning close of an overnight drinking session at 'that celebrated' Ambrose's tavern (the location of *Noctes Ambrosianae*), as a purveyor of pastoral Scottish life and as an authentic shepherd, to produce for *BEM* some tales of the 'phenomena of nature'.<sup>19</sup> It is not 'lambs and rams' North is after in his request of Hogg, but 'the substance of nature itself':

---

<sup>18</sup> A digitized copy of the original can be found on Google Books. See James Hogg, 'A Scots Mummy. To Sir Christopher North', *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* (August 1823), pp. 188-190 <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=oYJHAQAAMAAJ&pg=PA188>> [accessed 22/6/2019]. My excerpts are taken from the S/SC *BEM* Vol 1 version of the story.

<sup>19</sup> Hogg, 'A Scots Mummy', *Contributions to Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, Vol 1 1817-1828*, ed. by Thomas C. Richardson (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), pp. 139-143 (p. 139).

‘Nothing to write about? For shame! how can you say so? Have you not the boundless phenomenon of nature constantly before your eyes?’

‘O, to be sure, I hae; but then –’

In the meantime I was thinking to myself, what the devil can this phenomena of nature be, when you interrupted me with, ‘None of your *but then’s*, shepherd. A man who has such an eye as you have, for discerning the goings on of the mighty elements, can never want the choice of a thousand subjects whereon to exercise his pen. You have the night, with her unnumbered stars, that seem to rowl through spaces incomprehensible.’ [...]

‘Gude sauf us, Christy’s mair nor half seas ower!’ thinks I; ‘but I maunna pretend to understand him, for fear he get intil a rage. – Ay, ye’re no far wrang man’, I says; ‘there are some gayen good things to be seen atween the heaven an’ yirth sometimes. Weel, gude night, or rather gude morning, honest Sir Christy. I’ll try to pick you up something o’ yon sort.’

‘By all means, Hogg. I insist on it. Something of the phenomena of nature, I beseech you. You should look less at lambs and rams, and he-goats, Hogg, and more at the grand phenomena of nature. You should drink less out of the toddy-jug, shepherd, and more at the perennial spring. However, we’ll say no more about that, as matters stand to-night; only hand me something of the phenomena of nature.’<sup>20</sup>

Register – that is, the writing in both Scots and English – does some of the work here in subverting the Noctean shepherd by framing the story in the marginalising discourses to which Hogg was subject as a Scots speaker and writer. The narrator, functioning simultaneously as James Hogg and his Blackwoodian identity, the Ettrick Shepherd, directly reports his own speech in Scots, although uses English for his first-person narration. Yet, the narrator’s thoughts elsewhere merge with the reportage style

---

<sup>20</sup> Hogg, ‘A Scots Mummy’, p. 139.

of his own speech, in Scots, with ‘‘Gude sauf us’... thinks I’. Indeed, that sentence, remaining in Scots and within the same reportage punctuation, begins as the inner workings of the narrator’s thoughts, and moves outward to speech with: ‘‘–Aye, ye’re no far wrang man’’. Although the text has one single narrative voice, it contains different levels of register and reportage, between the inner workings of thoughts and the outward textual projection of speech. In this framework, Scots is the language of thoughts and speech, whereas writing – that is, the self-aware narrative voice of the printed page – requires English.

The textually-performed dialectic of spoken Scots and written English has particular resonance within the culture of *Maga* and its Ambrosianian contest over authorial identity - a contest to which the above passage directly speaks. The Shepherd’s directly reported speech in the *Noctes* series is the Scots of Wilson and Lockhart, a Scots which seeks to fit the uneducated lower-class character of their Shepherd. In *Noctes Ambrosianae* 8, which appeared in *Maga* three months prior to ‘A Scots Mummy’, Wilson characterises the Ettrick Shepherd as a forgetful fool who is nevertheless bestowed, by accident of nature, with the ability to compose rustic songs:

When the book was sent out a’ printed to Yarrowside, od! I just read the maist feck on’t as if I had never seen’t afore; and as for that sang in particular [‘Come all ye jolly shepherds’], I’ll gang before the Baillies the morn, and tak’ my affi-davy that I had no more mind o’ when I wrote it, or how I wrote it, or onything whatever concerning it – no more than if it had been a screed of heathen Greek. I behoved to have written’t sometime, and someway, since it was there – but that’s a’ I kent. – I maun surely hae flung’t aff some night when I was a thought dazed, and just sent it in to the printer without looking at it in the morning.<sup>21</sup>

Scots here is the language of the ‘thought dazed’ peasant-poet of Yarrowside, and, interestingly, reinforces the speech-print binary by suggesting that Hogg’s rightful home is in the oral tradition rather than in an alienating and unrecognisable print culture, meanwhile rejecting the ability of Scots to be the language of education with its ‘heathen Greek’. Jennifer Bann and John Corbett’s statistical analysis of Scots

---

<sup>21</sup> *Noctes Ambrosianae* 8, *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine* 13 (May 1823), p. 599.

orthography in *Noctes* and Hogg's *Justified Sinner* reveals the proximity of the written Scots in each publication, a verisimilitude which is perhaps of little surprise given Wilson and Lockhart's obsession with satirising Hogg's writing.<sup>22</sup> For Wilson in particular, the obsession with Hogg – his writing, his speech, and, as Ian Duncan has shown in his essay 'Hogg's Body', his physical appearance – would reveal more about the satirists than it did the satirised.<sup>23</sup>

The significance of this, in the first instance, is to further cement Hogg's authority to talk about matters relating to Lowland Scotland and rural labouring-class and peasant communities. While *Noctes* has been understood as an attempt to debase Hogg, the opening section of 'Scots Mummy' shows that Hogg was not without agency in the contest over his 'Ettrick Shepherd' identity. He exerted that agency by ensuring that his short stories were constantly engaging with ideas of authorship and identity. Hogg is textually performing his skill in recording 'authentic' Scots orality while showing a mastery of the more formal English register which would typically be found in the pages of a respectable periodical. Furthermore, he explicitly places the teller of the tale as an agent in the tale itself. In this way Hogg's short fiction, while relying upon folktale narrative tropes, cannot be simply understood as folktales if we understand the genre according to Charles E. May's suggestion that 'in the folktale the personality of the teller seldom intrudes' upon the tale.<sup>24</sup> Not only was the teller of the tale present in Hogg's 'Scots Mummy', the story itself can be read as an entry into a periodical print culture's negotiation of an authorial identity. The form of the narrative, as a distinctively Blackwoodian magazine short story, shapes its ideological function through its foregrounding of authenticity.

The layering of, and blurring of boundaries between, writing, thoughts and speech in the passage cited above from 'A Scots Mummy' functions in a similar way to what John Plotz describes as 'polydoxy'<sup>25</sup>: Hogg's deployment of multiple simultaneous

---

<sup>22</sup> Jennifer Bann and John Corbett, *Spelling Scots: the orthography of literary Scots, 1700-2000* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015), pp. 127-138

<sup>23</sup> Duncan, 'Hogg's Body', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 9 (1998), 1-15.

<sup>24</sup> Charles E. May, *The Short Story: the reality of artifice* (London: Routledge, 2002), p. 6.

<sup>25</sup> Plotz, p. 116.

perspectives within a single text. More recently, this multiplication of perspectives in Hogg's texts has been characterised by Meiko O'Halloran as the 'kaleidoscopic'.<sup>26</sup> Those perspectives, in the case of, for example, Hogg's novel writing, are sometimes made multifarious by the use of discrete narrative voices based upon characters who tell 'their side of the story' during a particular section of the narrative, such as in *The Three Perils of Man* (1823) and in *Justified Sinner* (1824). In the passage above from 'A Scots Mummy', however, it is the narratological layering within a single narrative voice which creates 'polydoxy'— the thickening of one narration, as opposed to a dialogue between distinct narrations. The formal structure of the story, with its letter-based framing narrative, adds a further layer to that thickening of textuality. As I argue throughout this thesis, in the case of the short story form shapes Hogg's narrative praxis and its ideological function, both in terms of the contest over authorial identities specific to *Blackwood's* and in the broader project of Hogg's performance of authenticity as a labouring-class writer from rural Selkirkshire.

Hogg claims that he gained the story in 'A Scots Mummy' from the oral culture of the region, specifically from 'two young shepherds, neighbours of my own', and the 'moment I first heard the relation, I said to myself, 'This is the very thing for old Christy'''.<sup>27</sup> A young man, whose background is mysterious, 'not a native of the place' and since being accounted for by 'little traditionary history', appears to work at 'Eltrieve' as a farm-hand.<sup>28</sup> Attempting to lure the master's son, aged 10, into the hope with him, the man attempts to blackmail him under threat of death by suicide:

Then if you winna stay wi' me, James, ye may depend on't I'll cut my throat afore ye come back again.<sup>29</sup>

Hogg here takes the established parameters of his creative boundaries which North mockingly invoked in the framing section, and by asserting a dark Gothicism, subverts those expectations with the effect of reclaiming his own authorial agency and personality in the *Maga* project. There is a lurking moral lesson at play here regarding

---

<sup>26</sup> O'Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, p. 6

<sup>27</sup> Hogg, 'A Scots Mummy', p. 140.

<sup>28</sup> Hogg, 'A Scots Mummy', p. 140.

<sup>29</sup> Hogg, 'A Scots Mummy', p. 140.

mysterious individuals and the threat posed to children – a notable characteristic of German romantic short fiction’s use of the folk tradition, most famously in Grimm’s fairy tales.<sup>30</sup> The folkish roots of this short story are evident, though the inflection of moralism and the folk traditions informs but one of the many layers of Hogg’s synthesis of the short form. ‘A Scots Mummy’ is a story drawn from folk narratives, a ‘disgusting oral tale’ and an ‘ugly traditional tale’, and the importance of the teller and the construction of the narrative is at the heart of ‘Scots Mummy’.<sup>31</sup> Oral testimony – both Hogg’s framing of the tale and in the account of the lamb herder – competes with ‘real’ history, in a broader ideological collision between the folkish tradition and the printed word. ‘A Scots Mummy’, then, is as much a self-reflexive narrative about storytelling in the 1820s, as it is a tale of death by suicide, supernaturalism, history and antiquarianism. The narrator operates simultaneously as a fictional character of *Blackwood’s* (‘The Etrick Shepherd’) and as James Hogg the author, just as ‘Christopher North’ operates pseudonymously as John Wilson’s authorial identity. Hogg himself, or, rather the ‘Etrick Shepherd’, goes to inspect the body and finds that the ‘features were all so plain, that an acquaintance might easily have known him’.<sup>32</sup> Like the editorial persona of ‘Mr Spy’ discussed in the previous chapter, the ‘Etrick Shepherd’ is simultaneously a narrator and a character.

Although a similar praxis of narratological layering is present in Hogg’s novel *Justified Sinner*, the framing at the close of ‘A Scots Mummy’ is of particular interest in terms of detailing how the short story operates independently of the novel context of the narrative. In the cut-and-thrust spirit of *BEM*, Hogg turns the narrative back to Christopher North:

If you should think of trying the experiment on yourself, you have nothing more to do than hang yourself in a hay rope, which, by the way, is to be made of risp, and leave orders that you are to be buried in a wild height, and I will venture to predict, that though you repose there for ages an inmate of your

---

<sup>30</sup> Paul March-Russell, *The Short Story: An Introduction* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2009), p. 8.

<sup>31</sup> Hogg, ‘A Scots Mummy’, p. 142.

<sup>32</sup> Hogg, ‘A Scots Mummy’, p. 142.

mossy cell, of the cloud, and the storm, you shall set up your head at the last day as fresh as a moor-cock. I remain, my worthy friend, yours very truly,

James Hogg<sup>33</sup>

That framing is lost in the *Justified Sinner* narrative. The suggestion that North hang himself as the culmination of a forthright rebuttal and subversion of his request for a tale from nature highlights the degree to which a competitive edge infused the experimental periodical impetus of *Maga*. While we can categorise the above as falling into the playful Blackwoodian context, it is worth reflecting on the fact that literary competitiveness in the periodical press spilled over into actual violence in the 1820s. The deployment of litotes – ‘you have nothing more to do than hang yourself’ – adds to the humorous tone of the framing device, and the tonal parallel of gravity and levity is summed up in the return to North’s original request for a tale from nature in Hogg’s assertion that North’s body, post-suicide, would be preserved ‘as fresh as a moor-cock’. This is a Blackwoodian short story, and one in which Hogg’s Ettrick Shepherd comes out fighting against its limiting Noctean counterpart. ‘We are left with the brilliant paradox of a novel’, argues Ian Duncan of *Justified Sinner* through his analysis of the suicide’s grave scene, itself a narrative taken from ‘A Scots Mummy’, ‘that articulates the radical failure of its author’s career, project, and, indeed, cultural identity: yet in the mode of a terse, defiant assertion of aesthetic strength.’<sup>34</sup> Duncan could easily be describing the short story original, where the resistance to the challenge posed to Hogg’s cultural identity within the magazine is articulated in distinctively Blackwoodian terms.

#### *Letters and the printed word as ‘authenticity effects’*

The letter format is common in Hogg’s Blackwoodian short stories, and functions towards what Ian Duncan called ‘authenticity effects’, in which in Hogg’s texts ‘iterate ... not the fictional status of what we have been reading ... but [their] material condition as a text.’<sup>35</sup> As well as ‘A Scots Mummy’, there are several notable

---

<sup>33</sup> Hogg, ‘A Scots Mummy’, p. 143.

<sup>34</sup> Duncan, ‘Authenticity Effects’, p. 113

<sup>35</sup> Duncan, ‘Authenticity Effects’, p. 111

examples Hogg's formal use of the letter, though the earliest of his letter-based *Blackwood's* contributions appeared in 1820, and blurs the boundary between the non-fictional and the fictional. In 'Letter from the Ettrick Shepherd, Enclosing a Letter from James Laidlaw', Hogg includes a letter he has, he claims, received from his cousin James Laidlaw (an antecedent of Canadian short story writer and Nobel Prize for Literature winner, Alice Munro), who left Hopehouse in Selkirkshire for Canada in 1818. By referring to real people – i.e. to Laidlaw – Hogg suggests that the letter itself is an authentic artefact. However, Laidlaw's response, which also came in the form of a letter published in Canada's *The Colonial Advocate* in 1827, accused Hogg of being creative with the truth:

Hogg poor man has spent most of his Life in coining Lies and if I read the Bible right I think it says that all Liars is to have there part in the Lake that Burns with fire and Brimston.<sup>36</sup>

Although it would be difficult to attest to the veracity of the letter which Hogg submitted to Blackwood,<sup>37</sup> the integration of letters into stories illustrates how Hogg's use of form functions toward blurring the dividing lines between truth and fictionality.

As well as the broader project of authentication, Hogg's formal use of the letter in short stories can have specific ideological functions related to their signification of printed artefacts which enable material connections between people and places in a further iteration of the Hoggian short story form's characteristic portability. In these examples, the thematic contents of the stories – migration, empire, diaspora, alienation, and integration – are bound to the formal deployment of the letter. Janet Altman's theory of 'epistolarity' in fiction stresses that the 'letter's formal properties

---

<sup>36</sup> William McKenzie, *Sketches of Canada and the United States* (Carlisle, MA: Applewood Books, 1833), p. 471.

<sup>37</sup> Whilst the manuscript for Hogg's framing letter to *Blackwood's* is held by the NLS, no manuscript of Laidlaw's letter remains (Richardson, 'Notes', p. 458). Richardson, however, notes that 'the idiosyncratic style and spelling of Laidlaw's *Colonial Advocate* letter serve to authenticate the *BEM* letter' (p. 459).

... create meaning'.<sup>38</sup> Epistolary works of fiction, according to Altman, 'not only dramatise the act of writing' but also 'tell the story of their own publication'.<sup>39</sup>

As an instrument of communication between sender and receiver, the letter straddles the gulf between presence and absence ... Because of its 'both-and,' 'either-or' nature, the letter is an extremely flexible tool in the hands of the epistolary author. Since the letter contains within itself its own negation, epistolary narrators regularly make it emphasise alternately, or even simultaneously, presence and absence, candour and dissimulation, mania and cure, bridge and barrier.<sup>40</sup>

There are two key points to take from Altman's theory. Firstly, epistolarity in fiction is self-referential towards its textual construction in print. Secondly, epistolary narratives provide a way of connecting people and places, although that connectedness is, according to Altman, fundamentally ambiguous, straddling as it does the dichotomies of presence/absence and bridge/barrier. As Amanda Gilroy and W. M. Verhoeven have more recently argued, 'the very materiality of the letter' and 'its potentially nomadic trajectory' lends itself towards analysis of 'historically specific cultural connections and disconnections.'<sup>41</sup>

The letter as it appears in *Maga* in 1820 provides an account of Scottish emigration in the early nineteenth century, although Hogg clearly positions it as a piece of amusement to mock his cousin. Hogg's framing narrative - a letter addressed to Blackwood - characterises Laidlaw as a religious fanatic who refuses to accept advancement in science and reason, and, in a drunken argument over faith and the Kirk, is quick to lose his temper and resort to slap-stick violence, to the amusement of those around him. Laidlaw's letter itself is fraught with spelling and grammatical errors, though nevertheless functions as an artefact for the social history of Scots emigration. Laidlaw's hope of a new life and concern for the future of his family sit

---

<sup>38</sup> Janet G. Altman, *Epistolarity: Approaches to a Form* (Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 1982), p. 4.

<sup>39</sup> Altman, p. 110

<sup>40</sup> Altman, p. 43.

<sup>41</sup> Amanda Gilroy and W. M. Verhoeven, 'Introduction', in *Epistolary Histories: Letters, Fiction, Culture*, ed. by Gilroy and Verhoeven (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 2000), p. 20.

alongside the cultural practicalities of migrant integration. Neither the condescension of Hogg nor of posterity can dull the raw emotion of Laidlaw's letter to his son, Robert:

I do not Expect Ever to See you hear ... If I had thought that you would have deserted us, I should not have comed hear; it was my ame to get you all near me made me Come to America; but mans thoughts are vanity, for I have Scattered you far wider, but I cannot help it now.<sup>42</sup>

As well as the sadness of leaving families behind, religious cultures in the New World provide a source of chagrin for the Presbyterian Scot emigrant arrivals:

they are the Baptists that we hear; there is no Presbeterean minister in this Town as yet, but there is a Large English Chapel, and a Methidest Chapel; but I do not think that the Methidists is very Sound in their Doctrine; they Save all infanct, and Saposes a man may be Justified to day, and fall from it to-morrow.<sup>43</sup>

Hogg, then, was not the only member of his family to be concerned with the 'Justified'. In this coming together of form and subject matter, the letter format allows the James Laidlaw text, as with 'Southern Africa' discussed below, to function as a cultural artefact of emigration, a portable object connecting diaspora to home. Furthermore, the effect of verisimilitude created through epistolarity in short stories foregrounds Hogg's authorial identity as an authentic voice of the labouring-class lowland experience of emigration to the 'new world' in the early nineteenth century.

One of Hogg's most popular periodical tales took the form of a letter. 'A Singular Letter from Southern Africa. Communicated by Mr Hogg, The Ettrick Shepherd' was originally published in *Maga* in 1829, and positioned itself as a letter 'communicated' by Hogg, originally from a Scot called William Mitchell living in Cape Town in 1826.<sup>44</sup> The story, which has been discussed at length by Sharon Alker and Holly Faith

---

<sup>42</sup> Hogg, 'Letter from the Ettrick Shepherd, Enclosing a Letter from James Laidlaw', *Contributions Vol. 1*, p. 80.

<sup>43</sup> Hogg, 'Letter from James Laidlaw', p. 81.

<sup>44</sup> Hogg, 'A Singular Letter from Southern Africa. Communicated by Mr Hogg, The Ettrick Shepherd', *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* (November, 1829), pp. 809-816.

Nelson, encroaches upon issues of race, Scottish colonialism and the Scots' active role in the British empire.<sup>45</sup> Recent scholarship has gone some way to detailing the central involvement of Scots in empire and slavery, and has shown how important Scottish institutions such as the University of Glasgow benefitted from capital derived from the exploitation of enslaved humans. While Alker and Nelson, through a detailed close-reading, read the story as evidence of the subaltern Hogg's sympathy with colonised people across the globe, there is plenty within the narrative to trouble any straightforward alignment of 'subaltern' Scottishness with the experience of those colonised by the British Empire, an Empire within which – militarily and administratively - Scots were at the forefront.<sup>46</sup>

Mitchell's wife and child are kidnapped by Orangutans (or 'Pongos'), and British colonialists are eager to provide armed assistance to the Annandale man. The depiction of the Highland regiments in British Army garrisons is further testament to the Scottishness of the British Imperial presence in Africa in the early nineteenth century. The 'Pongos' reflect something of the noble savage, with another colonial Scot, Peter Caruthers, coming face to face with an orangutan holding two clubs and offers him one as if for a fair duel: 'there was something so bold, and at the same time so generous, in this'.<sup>47</sup> The local tribal leader is 'othered' through a process of mockery of his grasp of English, and the depiction of local custom, in particular relating to women:

The language of this fellow being a mixture of Kaffre, High Dutch, and English, was peculiarly ludicrous, and most of all so when he concluded with

---

<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=ybMCAAAAIAAJ&dq='A%20Singular%20Letter%20from%20Southern%20Africa'&pg=PA809>> [accessed 22/6/2019]

<sup>45</sup> Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson. 'Empire and the 'Brute Creation': The Limits of Language in Hogg's 'The Pongos.'', in *Literary Marketplace*, pp. 201-217.

<sup>46</sup> Tom Devine and Stephen Mullen's work has been particularly important to this body of scholarship. *Recovering Scotland's Slavery Past: The Caribbean Connection*, ed. by T. M. Devine (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015). Alker and Nelson argue that 'several of Hogg's works appear to give voice to a variation of fratricide inasmuch as the author's social marginalisation in Scotland leads him to deflect his sympathy onto the colonized peoples beyond its shores' in Alker and Nelson, 'Empire and the 'Brute Creation'', p. 202.

<sup>47</sup> Hogg, 'A Singular Letter from Southern Africa', *Contributions Vol. 2*, pp. 65-76 (p. 69).

expressing his lord's desire to have my wife to be his own, and to give me in exchange for her four oxen, the best that I could choose from his herd!<sup>48</sup>

While the 'great Karoo' is mocked for disrespecting white women, the respectable British-Scot narrator and letter-writer William Mitchell is able to describe the female Pongos as 'more comelier than negro savages which I have often seen... they would make the most docile, powerful, and affectionate of all slaves'.<sup>49</sup> Altman's theory of epistolarity in fiction stressed its function in situating writing within specific historical moments of connection, and in the case of 'A Singular Letter', that specificity emerges as the link between home (Scotland) and away (colonised Africa), a connection that is communicated in the racialised idiom of imperialism and gender.

Epistolarity in the Hoggian short story in *Maga*, then, stresses the material condition of a text by mimicking the letter as artefact while performing the effect of authorial authenticity as both Hogg and the Ettrick Shepherd, with 'A Singular Letter' detailing each authorial identity in its full titling 'communicated by Mr Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd'. As well as within framing narratives, letters appear within the narrative body of his short fiction and function towards similar effects of authentication. In 'Story of Adam Scott' (1830), the action in the narrative pivots on the appearance of a letter. Adam is saved from an English jail on account of evidence told via letter from respectable Scots men, including the Sheriff of Selkirkshire, Alexander Murray:

The letter also bore a list of the English witnesses who behoved to be there. Linton hastened back with it, and the letter changed the face of affairs mightily ... From that time forth there remained little doubt of the truth of Scott's narrative.<sup>50</sup>

The letter as it appears in the narrative acts as a signifier of authority and truth. There is 'little doubt' of the authenticity of Adam Scott's position now that the letter has appeared. The power of print is able to transcend the discord between the two nations in the wake of the 1707 Union, the historical setting for the story.<sup>51</sup> It is worth noting that Walter Scott was himself Sheriff of Selkirkshire, like the co-signatory of the letter

---

<sup>48</sup> Hogg, 'A Singular Letter', p. 66.

<sup>49</sup> Hogg, 'A Singular Letter', p. 76.

<sup>50</sup> Hogg, 'Story of Adam Scott', *Contributions Vol. 2*, pp. 112-121 (p. 121).

<sup>51</sup> Richardson, 'Notes', *Contributions Vol. 2*, p. 407.

in ‘Adam Scott’ was – rendering an additional meaning to the phrase ‘there remained little doubt of the truth of Scott’s narrative’. In the realm of justice and upholding the law, it is the assuredness of the printed word, in this case in the form of the letter, that holds weight. As Penny Fielding has suggested, the printed word at this stage in Lowland Scotland was equipped with social and cultural authority:

What seemed to matter most to the protesters, however, was the way in which their lives and futures depended on the written word. In the *London Chronicle* report of the Selkirk [riot against the Militia Act in 1797], the protestors seized documents—papers from the Sheriff Clerk's office, recruitment lists from the constables, and a pocket book from a local ‘gentleman.’<sup>52</sup>

In a countryside ‘alive with unrest following the 1707 Act of Union between England and Scotland’, it is the printed word that holds authority.<sup>53</sup> The self-referential materiality of the letter trope in short stories like ‘Adam Scott’ foreground their role as signifiers of the printed word, allowing them to function as authenticating devices as a currency of authority within Hogg’s stories. This focus upon narrative authority and troubling of notions of authenticity – placing the printed word in dialogue with the spoken – is distinctive of Hogg’s narrative praxis. In stories like ‘Adam Scott’ and ‘A Scots Mummy’, Hogg grounds that narrative aesthetic of portability within the specific conditions of the form of the magazine short story.

#### *Orality and memory: reclaiming Ettrick as Hogg-land*

As well as through self-conscious textuality in their allusions to print culture, Hogg’s Blackwoodian short stories performed the authorial authenticating project by cultivating interrogative strategies within their narrative praxis. In ‘A Strange Secret’ (1828), for example, Hogg deploys narrative tropes which function in a similar way to the letter-framing trope, to self-consciously draw attention to how the story was constructed. Here, Hogg explains that the narrative was told to him by someone:

---

<sup>52</sup> Fielding, ‘Black Books: Sedition, Circulation, and the *Lay of the Last Minstrel*’, in *English Literary History* 81.1 (2014), pp. 197-223 (p. 204).

<sup>53</sup> Fielding, ‘Black Books’, p. 202.

Yesterday there was a poor man named Thomas Henderson came to our door, and presented me with a letter from a valued friend. I was kind to the man; and as an acknowledgement, he gave me his history in that plain, simple and drawling style, which removed all doubts of its authenticity. It is not deserving of a recital; but as I am constantly on the look-out for fundamental documents of any sort relating to Scotland, there was one little story of his that I deemed worthy of preservation; and consequently here have I sat down to write it out in the man's own words, while yet they are fresh in the memory.<sup>54</sup>

Hogg here positions within the text a fusion of narrative sources – a letter, orality, and memory. The ‘plain’ simplicity of rural orality is positioned as authentic, although tedious in content - ‘not deserving of recital’. Hogg is making the reader aware that he is making selective decisions as to what to include in his short story – there may be more to the story, but we as readers are made aware that we are being fed a designed narrative. In the above passage Hogg also cultivates an authorial identity as an authentic protector of culture, as opposed to a hawkish outside antiquarian. The Ettrick Shepherd, with one foot remaining in the Ettrick community and the other well-established on the Edinburgh literary scene, can deem what material is authentic and what is ‘worthy of preservation’. Crucially in the above in terms of detailing how Hogg's short fiction drew attention to its portability and performed authenticity is the reference, once again, to sources of narrative-building and storytelling. Memory is granted authority, belonging as it does to the ‘Ettrick Shepherd’, whilst drawing the reader's attention to the temporal fragility of memory as a source for storytelling and the need for it to be ‘fresh’, as opposed to disintegrated or blurred by time.

Narrative temporality works to dramatise the constructed-ness of the story. The temporal deixis of the framing device is in the present tense. ‘Yesterday’ makes clear the temporal setting of the telling is *today*, when ‘here have I sat down to write it out’. The spatial indicators ‘here’ and ‘sat down’ are also important in that they stress the physical act of writing a story, or, perhaps more accurately, they draw attention to a textual performance of the physical act of storytelling. The centrality of the telling of the tale to the tale being told – how the story was discovered and how it is currently

---

<sup>54</sup> Hogg, ‘A Strange Secret’, *Contributions Vol. 1*, pp. 315-339 (p. 315).

being told in the ‘here’ and now, to avoid the freshness of memory being diminished – ensures a deep intertwining of story and text. The readers are effectively being told: you are being told a story, and this is how that story is being told. The aesthetic prowess of an ‘authentic’ storyteller is staged within Hogg’s narrative practice, in which the author exists at once within the story and in its telling. This is the cultural authority of the margins, bringing authentic narratives from peripheral Scotlands to a metropolitan readership within a hostile print environment for a labouring-class writer.

This print environment meant that Hogg’s 1830 *Blackwood’s* short story ‘The Mysterious Bride, By the Ettrick Shepherd’ sat between two stools – the ‘Ettrick Shepherd’ of *Noctes*, and Hogg’s own Shepherd. The former had gained Hogg fame and opportunity to expand economic capital, yet cast him as boorish and uneducated, depriving Hogg of cultural capital through a class-based pejorative stereotype of a lowland rural Scotland’s speech and manners. As Gillian Hughes explains, the Noctean Shepherd:

variously stood as the acquiescent Tory peasantry of Scotland, a virtuoso of the Scots language, the power of imagination and natural taste uncorrupted by formal manners and education, and the butt of the condescending middle classes.<sup>55</sup>

Hogg’s own Shepherd, on the other hand, is both representative of his long-running attempt to authenticate his textual voice as a synecdoche for rural labouring-class Scotland in the early nineteenth century, and of his willingness to exploit the capital – cultural and economic - afforded by the *Noctes* Shepherd. As Garside suggested above, The Noctean Shepherd was, after all, better known than Hogg himself during his lifetime.<sup>56</sup>

---

<sup>55</sup> Hughes, ‘Magazines, Annuals, and the Press’, *Companion*, p.34.

<sup>56</sup> See also Hughes, ‘Magazines, Annuals, and the Press’, p. 35.

The opening paragraph of 'Mysterious Bride' is worth quoting at length, encroaching as it does upon the relationship between subject-content (authentic authorial identity) and form (Hogg's narrative practice in the short story):

A great number of people nowadays are beginning broadly to insinuate that there are no such things as ghosts, or spiritual beings visible to mortal sight. Even Sir Walter Scott is turned renegade, and, with his stories made up of half-and-half, like Nathaniel Gow's toddy, is trying to throw cold water on the most certain, though most impalpable, phenomena of human nature. The bodies are daft. Heaven mend their wits! Before they had ventured to assert such things, I wish they had been where I have often been; or, in particular, where the Laird of Birkendelly was on St. Lawrence's Eve, in the year 1777, and sundry times subsequent to that.

Be it known, then, to every reader of this relation of facts that happened in my own remembrance that the road from Birkendelly to the great muckle village of Balmawhapple (commonly called the muckle town, in opposition to the little town that stood on the other side of the burn)<sup>57</sup>

There is much to tease out from these densely-layered opening lines. The story claims to be drawn from the memory of Hogg's Ettrick Shepherd, benefitting from his authenticity as a shepherd in Ettrick and ensuring the veracity of the 'facts that happened'. Scott's Enlightened and rational approach to the supernatural in his fiction comes in for specific criticism, and Hogg – or, rather, the Ettrick Shepherd - pours scorn on his attempts to 'throw cold water on the most certain... phenomena of human nature'. Scott acts as a synecdoche for the rational urban readership of the Enlightened metropolis, an audience which, according to Klancher's theory, was created by the periodical press as much as it was a consumer of it.<sup>58</sup> That readership is set at a distance to the community and place where the story is rooted, that is, the Scottish Borders. Hogg's Shepherd is endowed with a local's knowledge and given a situatedness in, and familiarity with, place with the phrase 'I wish they had been where I have often been'.

---

<sup>57</sup> Hogg, 'The Mysterious Bride', *Contributions Vol. 2*, pp. 155-167 (p. 155).

<sup>58</sup> See Jon P. Klancher, *The Making of English Reading Audiences, 1790-1832* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987).

As well as geographic and cultural proximity, the axis of difference between the *Maga* readership and the teller of the tale hinges upon approaches to the supernatural. Klancher's theory of periodical readerships stressed that:

periodical texts and their myriad writers give us a new way to see how 'making audiences' meant evolving readers' interpretative frameworks and shaping their ideological awareness ... Always supremely conscious of the audiences their writers imagine, assert, or entice, periodicals provide perhaps the clearest framework for distinguishing the emerging publics of the nineteenth century.<sup>59</sup>

Hogg shapes the ideological awareness of *Blackwood's* readers, who would not have been from the 'lower-orders', by creating an association between the supernatural and the rural demotic cultures of Scotland, and, in doing so, creates in the opening passages of 'Mysterious Bride' an association between urban 'elite' readerships and Scottian rationalism. The tension between the supernatural and the rational has a long-established strand of critical interpretation in Hogg studies.<sup>60</sup> What I wish to suggest here is that Hogg stages the conflict between supernatural/rational and rural/urban within his texts. It is a tension from which, after all, he benefits, as the authentic voice of an 'othered' community in the periodical press. Hogg is active in creating, as much as he is subject to, the processes of 'othering'.

---

<sup>59</sup> Klancher, p. 4. Klancher argues that Romantic-era periodicals 'often deliberately smudged social differences among their readers... to make one's intended reader potential, not already well-defined, prior to the journal's own discourse. The intended audience must be defined by its ethos, its framework of educational capacity, ideological stance, economic ability, and cultural dispositions... Only at the outer limits of this audience would the essential determinations be made, and these were mainly economic: the quarterlies cost four to six shillings each, monthly magazines two to three shillings. Even if workingmen had joined together to buy a copy at these prices ... such reading matter would have cost a member of the 'lower orders' an unthinkable full day's pay' (Klancher, p. 50).

<sup>60</sup> Killick discusses this tension in relation to stories in *Winter Evening Tales*. See Killick, *British Short Fiction*, pp. 137-139. Other studies which discuss the supernatural-rational tension in Hogg's texts include Jonathan C. Glance, 'Ambiguity and the Dreams in James Hogg's *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *Studies in Scottish Literature* 28.1 (1993), 165-177 (p. 165); Douglas Gifford, *James Hogg* (Edinburgh: The Ramsey Head Press, 1976) p. 145; Andrew Hook 'Hogg, Melville and the Scottish Enlightenment', *SLJ* 4 (1977), 25-39 (p. 26); Duncan, 'The Upright Corpse: Hogg, National Literature and the Uncanny', *SHW*, 5 (1994), 29-55.

We see in the passage from ‘Mysterious Bride’ quoted above the processes of authentication at work, functioning along a self-other dynamic. Scott is positioned as being unable to engage with the ‘true facts’ of the customs, traditions and identities of the Scottish Borders, while Hogg, through the Ettrick Shepherd, earns authenticity both through his familiarity with local geography and through his sympathetic treatment to belief and custom. Furthermore, and central to the development of the argument in this chapter, is that memory is positioned from the outset as the source for the story. The Ettrick Shepherd becomes a bardic voice, speaking at once with the ‘I’ of his own authorial identity and with the communal voice of a people – ‘commonly called the muckle town’. The process of authenticating, indeed, the *staging* of authenticity – is laid bare to the reader. Memory is endowed with authenticity via the narrators’ textually-performed connection to rural culture, yet with the phrase ‘relation of facts that happened’, the text draws attention to the juxtaposition of memory’s potential for fragmentation with the fixed nature of print. ‘The Mysterious Bride’, with the mention of memory alongside the positioned authorial identities at play in the text and its title, draws attention to its textual construction in its opening lines.

Self-conscious textuality through the discussion of a narrative’s sources is also evident in ‘The Marvellous Doctor’, published in *Maga* in 1827. A tale of manipulation and attraction, containing suggestions of female sexual desire, Blackwood initially rejected the story, writing to Hogg:

I have laughed prodigiously at your Doctor, but the fun I fear is too strong for delicate folks to tolerate.<sup>61</sup>

The story was eventually published in *Maga* after Hogg’s nephew, Robert Hogg, made amendments to the (now lost) original manuscript to ‘obliterate any appearance of indelicacy’.<sup>62</sup> The story begins with Hogg – rather than ‘the Ettrick Shepherd’ - recounting his youth as a child in Ettrick, when a stranger lodged with his parents for half a year. In a further instance of the narrative voice knowing both the viewpoint and ideology of the community, Hogg explains that his Ettrick neighbours thought the

---

<sup>61</sup> Richardson, ‘Notes’, *Contributions Vol. I*, p. 536.

<sup>62</sup> Richardson, ‘Notes’, *Contributions Vol. I*, p. 537.

stranger was ‘uncanny [...] which in that part of the country means a warlock’.<sup>63</sup> Hogg here acts as a semantic interpreter, translating the meaning of ‘uncanny’ so that the reader is sure of the supernatural meaning inferred - ‘or one some way conversant with beings of another nature’.<sup>64</sup> Returning to the idea of a text manipulating the ideological subject-positions of the readership, the reader’s perspective is positioned by the narrator as outside-looking-in, reaffirming the supernatural-rational cultural and geographic tension which underpins Hogg’s staged ‘otherness’. In a similar vein to Sarah Sharp’s reading of Hogg’s short fiction and its tendency to show the pernicious side of oral culture in small communities,<sup>65</sup> Hogg explains that the Ettrick community would call the story’s protagonist the ‘Lying Doctor’, the ‘Hern Doctor’, and the ‘Warlock Doctor’.<sup>66</sup> Hogg’s authorial voice is aligned with that of the Ettrick community from which the story emerges, and his authorial identity as an authentic Ettrick storyteller is situated within discourses of class and place. Those authenticating discourses are constructed through both the telling of the story and in what is being told.

Given Hogg’s efforts to position himself as an authentic voice of a community, his memory is bestowed with authority as a narrative source. At the same time, however, Hogg draws attention to the instability of memory as a source in the fixed and concrete nature of a printed text. The framing section in ‘The Marvellous Doctor’ explains that Hogg will tell ‘one or two’ of his stories, ‘but with this great disadvantage, that I have, in many instances, forgot the names of the places where they happened’.<sup>67</sup> The teller of the tale is equipped both with authenticity and with authorial shortcomings. Hogg explains that as a child he didn’t know much about geography and place-names, and that ‘the faint recollection I have of them will only, I fear, tend to confuse my narrative the more’.<sup>68</sup> To adopt the terms of narratology temporarily, Hogg’s text here draws attention to the distinction between the narrating self (the ‘I’ who is speaking: Hogg as an adult and a writer) and the experiencing self (the ‘I’ who experiences: Hogg as

---

<sup>63</sup> Hogg, ‘The Marvellous Doctor’, *Contributions Vol. 1*, pp. 263-283 (p. 263).

<sup>64</sup> Hogg, ‘The Marvellous Doctor’, p. 263.

<sup>65</sup> Sarah Sharp, ‘Hogg’s Murder of Ravens: Storytelling, Community and Posthumous Mutilation’, *SHW*, 23 (2013), 31-39.

<sup>66</sup> Hogg, ‘The Marvellous Doctor’, p. 263.

<sup>67</sup> Hogg, ‘The Marvellous Doctor’, p. 263.

<sup>68</sup> Hogg, ‘The Marvellous Doctor’, p. 263.

a child). This creates an effect of controlled indeterminacy – the narrator is showing narration as a constructed process, drawn from sources which can add to the authenticity of the story while undermining the authority of its contents.

After the deployment of Hogg's childhood memory trope in the frame-tale contained within 'The Marvellous Doctor', the narrative remains in the first-person, with the narrator switching from Hogg to the central character of the story. Thanks to the framing device, however, we are aware that this is Hogg ventriloquising the Doctor's words based on his own memory. We are also aware of competing tensions as to the authority of the story's contents – not only the instability of early memory, but the Ettrick community's distrust of an outsider imbued with superstition, and the influence of Hogg's parents on how his early memories are recounted. Towards the end of the story, the first-person narration reverts from the Doctor to Hogg, who compares the essence of the story of the 'Doctor' – the ability to control the sexual desire of others through the use of mysterious substances - with other oral folktales which exist in Ettrick. Through the deployment of a story within a story, the oral culture of storytelling in the region is used as a tool for judging the veracity of the tale and the benchmark of authenticity. The framing passages at the end of 'Marvellous Doctor' tells the story of Sophy Sloan from Kirkhope, a village in the Ettrick Valley, who was, according to Ettrick folktale tradition, 'taken by gypsies' – a narrative strategy which itself functions toward what Duncan calls 'authenticity effects'.<sup>69</sup> Her father and uncle followed, and on discovery of her found that although she was distressed, she could not bring herself to leave – despite the 'gypsies' insisting that they had never asked her to follow, and had even threatened her with murder if she continued to follow.

Likewise, the tale of the Earl of Cassillis's lady and her supposed elopement with Johnny Faa is also told at the end of the story, a traditional oral tale well-known in Ettrick.<sup>70</sup> 'Notices Concerning the Scottish Gypsies', an article published in *Maga* in April 1817 contains an account of the story of Cassillis by the poet John Finlay,

---

<sup>69</sup> Hogg, 'The Marvellous Doctor', p. 283; See Ian Duncan, 'Authenticity Effects', p. 113.

<sup>70</sup> Richardson, 'Notes', *Contributions Vol. I*, p. 539.

alongside Finlay's explanation that rather than it being the gypsy king Johnny Faa, the story in truth refers to a Sir John Faw of Dunbar disguised as a gypsy. The 'Notices' contains editorial comment, by Scott and Thomas Pringle, who state:

As [John Finlay] however, has not brought forward any authority to support this opinion, we are inclined still to adhere to the popular tradition, which is very uniform and consistent.<sup>71</sup>

Not only is the intertextuality between the 1817 article and Hogg's 1827 story evidence of the kind of cross-fertilisation of content and form which is characteristic of what Pittock calls the 'heteroglossic' periodical print environment,<sup>72</sup> it also attests to the status and authenticating function of orality in a print environment.

The 'Marvellous Doctor' and its interpolated narratives speak of a rural community's distrust of outsiders, whether that be the 'uncanny Doctor' or travelling peoples and does so through its formal qualities as well as its content. Importantly, that communal voice of distrust is not granted a governing position over the narrative, with the narrator drawing the reader's attention towards the constructed-ness and fragility of the mode of telling. The various sources of authority within the narrative – memory as a source, the stance of a community, the subjectivity of first-person narration, and oral culture more broadly – are held in mutual tension in the text. Moreover, orality's textual function is revealed as both authenticating and destabilising, and, crucially, oral culture is shown not as an autonomous area which print attempts to reach out from or to, but rather, as an integral element in the construction of textuality. Penny Fielding has shown how the blurring of the print-speech binary is an important element of Hogg's work, an argument echoed by Tim Killick.<sup>73</sup> In analysing 'The Marvellous Doctor' and its publishing context(s), we can see that textualised orality at work.<sup>74</sup>

---

<sup>71</sup> Walter Scott and Thomas Pringle, 'Notices Concerning the Scottish Gypsies', *Edinburgh Monthly Magazine* 1.1 (April, 1817), p. 50.

<sup>72</sup> Pittock, *Scottish and Irish Romanticism*, p. 22.

<sup>73</sup> Fielding, *Writing and Orality*, p. 99; Killick, *British Short Fiction*, pp. 129-30.

<sup>74</sup> Though not part of the original *Shepherd's Calendar* series in *Blackwood's*, an edited version of the 1827 periodical story appeared in the 1829 anthology of the *Shepherd's Calendar*, edited by Robert Hogg. For further information see Richardson, 'Notes', *Contributions Vol. 1*, pp. 536-538.

Hogg's frequent use of the trope of attesting to the veracity of a narrative is deployed to end the story:

This story was a fact; yet the Doctor held all these instances in utter contempt, and maintained his prerogative, as the sole and original inventor of THE ELIXIR OF LOVE.<sup>75</sup>

The story referred to is the interpolated narrative of Sophy Sloan, which can be verified as a 'fact' on the basis of its belief by the community of Ettrick as a whole – a principle established by Scott and Pringle in *Maga* in 1817. Oral culture is placed in a position of esteem, yet that esteem exists alongside an admission of the fragile nature of oral and folk narratives. We are also given an insight into how narratives can be transported from different modes, from the oral to the written, and how a story's portability by means of a story within a story can inflect meaning and the authoritative base of a narrative.

Vernacularity – that is, writing in Scots – is an important feature in Hogg's print performance of orality. In 'Some Remarkable Passages in the Remarkable Life of the Baron St Gio by the Ettrick Shepherd' (1830), one of the 'strangest and most striking he has ever written' according to D. M. Moir who often worked as a reader of submissions to *Maga*,<sup>76</sup> Hogg again shows the reader how he has synthesised the narrative, this time pointing to its source as a personal memoir:

I have often wondered if it was possible that a person could exist without a conscience ... I was led into this kind of mood to-night by reading a sort of Memoir of the life of Jasper Kendale, alias the Baron of St Gio, written by himself, which, if at all consistent with truth, unfolds a scene of unparalleled barbarity, and an instance of that numbness of soul of which we have been speaking, scarcely to be excelled.<sup>77</sup>

---

<sup>75</sup> Hogg, 'The Marvellous Doctor', p. 283.

<sup>76</sup> Richardson, 'Notes', *Contributions Vol. 1*, p. 403

<sup>77</sup> Hogg, 'Some Remarkable Passages in the Remarkable Life of the Baron St Gio', *Contributions Vol. 2*, pp. 90–112 (p. 90).

A 'sort of' written personal testimony, or diary, forms the basis for the ensuing narrative, and a reference to narrative authority with the line 'if at all consistent with truth' creates an effect of textual instability from the story's outset. Hogg takes it upon himself to translate the memoir into a periodical short story from the original author's narrative which displayed a 'simplicity of heart'. The reader is involved in that process of translation, particularly at the moment of transition between Hogg (or, rather, the Ettrick Shepherd) as first-person narrator, reporting the 'memoir' in direct speech, to the first-person perspective of Jasper, or 'the Baron', whose memoir Hogg had been reading in the framing section:

but from many of his expressions, I should draw the conclusion, that he comes from some place in the west of Scotland.

'My father and mother were unco good religious focks,' says he, 'but verry poor. At least I think sae, for we were verry ragged and duddy in our claes, and often didna get muckle to eat.' This is manifestly Scottish, and in the same style the best parts of the narrative are written; but for the sake of shortening it two thirds at least, I must take a style more concise.

When I was about twelve years of age, my uncle got me in to be stable-boy at Castle Meldin, and a happy man I was at this change.<sup>78</sup>

Hogg makes it clear to the reader that he is making stylistic choices in his re-telling of the narrative, changing the 'manifestly Scottish' register of Jasper to 'a style more concise'. In the following sentence, the 'I' in the first-person narration has switched from the Ettrick Shepherd to Jasper. The authority of Hogg, via the Ettrick Shepherd, to speak as, and translate from, the voice of ordinary people in Lowland Scotland, is once again foregrounded by means of this translation technique. Expanding the remit for his ethnographic authority, the locality of that authoritative narrative voice has extended from Ettrick and the Scottish Borders, to include the western Lowlands. Hogg's skill in writing in Scots is flaunted but withdrawn before the substantive narrative ensues, informing the readers of *Blackwood's* that not only can he speak and write in Scots, he can translate it into a register of English to fit the environs of the respectable metropolitan periodical press. This outside-ness is itself, of course, not a

---

<sup>78</sup> Hogg, 'Baron St Gio', p. 90.

great revelation in Hogg criticism. Hogg, after all, ‘fucked up the carpets of the New Town’ with ‘mud and shite’.<sup>79</sup> What I wish to stress here, through the exemplification of Hogg’s narrative praxis discussed above, is that Hogg used the form of the magazine short story to perform his authentic outsider identity within *Blackwood’s*.

In foregrounding the role of form in shaping narrative aesthetic and its ideological function, Hogg’s short stories in *Blackwood’s* can be considered self-referential texts which draw attention to their ‘material condition as text’,<sup>80</sup> and show particular concern with narrative construction, sources of cultural authority, and publishing contexts. Through this narrative practice, Hogg encroaches upon competing Romantic-era notions of the ‘authentic’ – the countryside from the perspective of the city, rationality against the supernatural – by showing the construction of authenticity as a textual effect, an effect embodied in the form’s portability. The textual performance of authenticity is particularly acute in relation to the positioning of orality in the narratives. Indeed, Hogg’s staging of the oral tradition in his Blackwoodian short stories amplifies the argument made by Paula McDowell that the print-orality binary is not a binary of ‘lost’ old modes of communication and modern technology, rather, the notion of the ‘oral tradition’ is an effect of print culture itself.<sup>81</sup> Orality functions as a narrative source, emphasising the closeness of the texts to Lowland rural communities whose oral centrality is marginalised by print culture. Speech itself is performed in the text, with Hogg making it clear to the reader that he is making stylistic choices with regards to register. He ‘translates’ English to Scots in the ‘Life of Baron St Gio’ (1830), combining the voice of Ettrick and the voice of its Shepherd so that Hogg can become a cultural spokesperson for an entire community and dramatising its textual construction in print in a similar manner to that which was discussed above in relation to epistolary narratives. Frank O’Connor called the short story a form which lends itself to the margins, to ‘submerged population groups’.<sup>82</sup> As has been well established within Hogg studies, the ‘between worlds’ Hogg was at once marginal and central.<sup>83</sup> I want to reiterate the central claim of the thesis here to argue that form is important to that issue of marginality. More specifically, Hogg self-

---

<sup>79</sup> Crawford, ‘Bad Shepherd’, pp. 28-29.

<sup>80</sup> Duncan, ‘Authenticity Effects’, p. 111.

<sup>81</sup> McDowell, p. 288.

<sup>82</sup> O’Connor, *The Lonely Voice*, p. 18.

<sup>83</sup> See the ‘Introduction’ chapter of this thesis for a detailed overview of this body of literature.

consciously performs his marginality through the characteristic portability of the short story form in its magazine contexts. Portability in the case of Hogg's *Blackwood's* short stories is characterised by a self-conscious textuality and self-referential narrational practice which draws attention to the text as material and moveable object, a process within which questions of authenticity and agency are foregrounded. Hogg creates a textual effect of authenticity – an effect attuned to the authenticating discourses of class, place, and language. In *Maga*, the presence of the Noctean Shepherd meant that the performance of authenticity had an acute articulation in relation to Hogg's authorial identity.

Fundamental to Hogg's short fiction contributions to *Blackwood's*, their characteristic portability, and their performance of authenticity, is the dialectic between city and countryside. As argued in the previous chapter through my analysis of Hogg's periodical *The Spy* (1810-11), Hogg had agency in the construction of his betweenness through his performance of authenticity, a process situated in textuality and form while operating in dialogue with representations of his biography as a labouring-class rural writer working in the metropolis. His *Blackwood's* short stories similarly move between the city and the countryside, through letters, speech, and collective memory. The portable form is forged amid that dialectic. His rural *Borders* is neither quaint nor sentimental, nor is it a 'Golden Age' of perpetually-distanced pastoral tranquillity in the Raymond Williams sense.<sup>84</sup> Rather, Hogg's use of the supernatural and folktale tropes operate in a similar way to what Robert Macfarlane described as, with reference to contemporary English 'eerie' writing, 'a busting of the bucolic, a puncturing of the pastoral.'<sup>85</sup> Perhaps Hogg's 1823 story 'A Scots Mummy', in its subversion of Christopher North's request for a story of 'nature', is the most acute 'puncturing' of expectations surrounding the pastoral *Etrick Shepherd*.

---

<sup>84</sup> See Raymond Williams, *The Country and the City* (London: Hogarth Press, 1993).

<sup>85</sup> Robert Macfarlane, 'The eeriness of the English countryside', *The Guardian* 10 April 2015 <<https://www.theguardian.com/books/2015/apr/10/eeriness-english-countryside-robert-macfarlane>> [accessed 1/5/2017]

In terms of the history of the short story, we see how in Hogg's contributions to *Blackwood's* folktale elements can be used in short fiction with multiple resultant effects. The supernatural and folktale are textually constructed elements of Hogg's *Blackwood's* stories and serve as authenticating functions, with orality a key element of those processes. Yet, as we established above, these examples cannot be accurately marshalled by Northrop Frye's definition of the tale, in opposition to the short story. In Hogg's short fiction we see an ambidextrous critique of realism and romanticism, of folk tradition and of emergent fictional forms. Hogg's ambidexterity does not happen by accident; it is achieved through the richly-textualised and self-aware synthesis of portable short fiction in the periodical press.

*Blackwood's* during Hogg's lifetime was characterised by its attempts to restrict the agency of the Ettrick Shepherd as a labouring-class writer. Wilson and Lockhart's Noctean Shepherd sought to contain Hogg, to restrict his cultural authority according to his class-status as a self-taught 'peasant poet'. Hogg did not reject this characterisation outright: he used it. If cultural capital could be undermined by the Noctean Shepherd, then economic capital could be gained.<sup>86</sup> Moreover, that cultural capital could be re-earned through a subversion of the Noctean Shepherd via his own Ettrick Shepherd, and through Hogg's richly textualised efforts to construct his own authenticity. In his short fiction, that performance of authenticity is particularly acute thanks to the specific periodical print ecology – experimental, intertextual, and genre-crossing – of *Blackwood's* and its strident literary personas. The self-aware textual construction of Hogg's short fiction as a portable form ensured that efforts by Wilson and Lockhart to infix Hogg within the bounds of *Maga* was a project which proved ultimately fruitless.

---

<sup>86</sup> For discussion of cultural capital, see Pierre Bourdieu, 'The Field of Cultural Production, or: The Economic World Reversed', in *The Field of Cultural Production: Essays on Art and Literature*, ed. by Randal Johnson (New York: Columbia University Press, 1993), pp. 29-73. For an analysis of how these concepts relate to Hogg, particularly in his use of frame tales, see Ittensohn, 'Fictionalising the Romantic Marketplace', pp. 25-41.

CHAPTER THREE: Reclaiming the Ettrick Shepherd: Hogg and the short story collection

so the Spy was executed, the dead body given up to his friends, where buried, remains a secret until this day.<sup>1</sup>

The ‘suicide’s grave’ scene in Hogg’s 1824 novel *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* was originally published as a magazine short story in *Blackwood’s* as ‘A Scots Mummy’ (1823), alongside a framing narrative by Hogg telling of John Wilson’s request for a tale of a ‘phenomena of nature’ at the morning close of an overnight drinking session.<sup>2</sup> This dialogic periodical material is lost when it is incorporated into Hogg’s novel. In the novel, however, the scene comes just after Hogg’s cameo as the broad Scots-speaking shepherd who refuses to take the editor’s party to the site of the grave. This is itself an example of Hogg’s reclaiming project of the author function of the ‘Ettrick Shepherd’ identity, where the book form offers Hogg an environment in which to assert his own agency in the writing of ‘himself’, seizing the discursive means of production over the authorial identity of the Ettrick Shepherd. There are two points from thinking about ‘A Scots Mummy’ and *Justified Sinner* to take forward into the proceeding discussion. Firstly, a problematisation of distinct categories of form and its relationship to mediums of publication when thinking about the short story, a form that finds a degree of portability between magazine and book. Secondly, the ‘suicide’s grave’ scene shows how a short story’s aesthetic characteristics are conditioned by the formal contexts in which it appeared. Those aesthetic features of self-reflexivity, meta-fictionality and questions of narrative authority appear in both the periodical context of ‘A Scots Mummy’ and in the narrative as it appears in Hogg’s novel, and while the former was an explicit riposte to the Noctean shepherd stereotype, the latter was written on Hogg’s terms.

---

<sup>1</sup> ‘Familiar Epistles to Christopher North, from an Old Friend with a New Face.’, *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine*, 10 (August, 1821)  
<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=eWshAQAAIAAJ&pg=PA43#>> [accessed 14/7/2019] pp. 43-52 (p. 45).

<sup>2</sup> Hogg, ‘A Scots Mummy’, *Contributions Vol. 1*, and *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*, ed. by Peter Garside (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2001), pp. 171-176.

This chapter argues that Hogg's book format collections of short stories represent an attempt to reclaim agency over the author function of the Ettrick Shepherd identity from the 'heterogeneous' magazine environment.<sup>3</sup> Hogg lost agency over the 'author function' of the Ettrick Shepherd identity in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, particularly in the class-based *Noctes* appropriation of the 'boozing buffoon'. *Blackwood's* therefore controlled the discourse associated with the author function of the Shepherd, meaning that Hogg's short stories, as shown in chapter two, were conditioned by those discourses when they were published in *Blackwood's* where their characteristic portability functioned to subvert those discourses of containment. The aesthetic of portability in Hogg's short stories – the textualisation of orality, the performance of authenticity, questions of narrative authority, self-reflexivity and the role of reader agency – which in Hogg's *Blackwood's* short stories were in open textual conflict with the Noctean Shepherd, appear in the book form collection freed to an extent from the explicit contest with the 'boozing buffoon' class-based pejorative Shepherd, though they are conditioned by the formal contexts of the short story collection. Indeed, the major Hogg collections discussed can be considered together as part of Hogg's long-running project to, in his own words, 'have [his short fiction] brought into some *tangible* form'.<sup>4</sup>

The short story collection as a form is important to Hogg's reclamation of the Ettrick Shepherd identity. Within some Romantic-era scholarship there has been an association made between the book as a form and the Lukácsian idea of 'totality' and a 'paradigm of resolution', largely through the book's association with the triple decker Scottish historical novel.<sup>5</sup> The short story, on the other hand, is a form which itself comes with aesthetic assumptions about its fragmentary nature. From Edgar Allan Poe's 'single effect' to James Joyce and the 'epiphany', the form has been

---

<sup>3</sup> See Stewart, *Romantic Magazines*, p. 5.

<sup>4</sup> Mack, 'Introduction', *Shepherd's Calendar*, p. xv. Italics my own.

<sup>5</sup> Killick, for example, has argued that 'the first three Waverley novels, with their inexorable march through a generation or so of Scottish history, demonstrate this linear discourse. History is presented as a sequence which needs to be correctly interpreted' (*British Short Fiction*, p. 125). Lumsden has argued of Scott's novels that they 'frequently follow at least a surface Lukácsian paradigm of moving towards reconciliation' (*Walter Scott and Limits of Language*, p. 180).

characterised as something that tells ‘us only one thing, and that, intensely’.<sup>6</sup> As David Stewart has argued, ‘The ‘Waverley Novels’ (published from 1814) are usually taken as providing a foil to the short story’.<sup>7</sup> If the Scottian historical novel encompasses ‘totality’, the short story has been associated with incompleteness. ‘The tendency is to treat the form’, argues Adrian Hunter, ‘in Beckett’s suggestive formulation, as a ‘partial object’ requiring fulfilment by the reader, rather than as a [t]otal object, complete with missing parts’.<sup>8</sup> That formal binary between totality and the fragment can be disrupted through a consideration of the book form collection of short stories in the case of Hogg. Book format collections of short fiction matter in how we read a story and considering them as a form in their own right can help push beyond the binary of fragment-totality in relation to literary form and mediums of publication.

Each section of this chapter discusses the relationship between ‘totality’ and the ‘fragment’, and considers book form collections of short stories as a fragmented totality ‘complete with missing parts’,<sup>9</sup> through which Hogg attempted to seize the cultural production of the author functions of the Ettrick Shepherd. *Altrive Tales*, when read alongside its planned (and failed) publication history as the first part of a twelve-volume Hoggian ‘magnus opus’, offers a vision of totality – a life’s work, reclaiming the entirety of the ‘Ettrick Shepherd’ and pre-empting the condescension of posterity. The plans failed, and so we are left with a fragment in which the ‘Volume One’ on the facsimile was hastily removed from prints. Yet what this remaining fragment reveals is significant in its inclusion of materials which deal directly with the author function, particularly through the inclusion of the ‘Memoir of the Author’s Life’ in its opening pages. *The Tales of the Wars of Montrose* (1835), on other hand, presents a more direct subversion of the Lukácsian totality of the historical novel by offering a version of the historical short story, which, when read as a collection, shows how the fragment can present an alternative representation of history in fiction, within which the individual’s relationship to society and history is seen as a contingency of mutable relations and subject positions, and where contested notions of historical

---

<sup>6</sup> V. S. Pritchett, *The Oxford Book of Short Stories* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981), p. xi.

<sup>7</sup> Stewart, ‘Romantic short fiction’, p. 76.

<sup>8</sup> Hunter, ‘*Complete with missing parts*’, p. 6.

<sup>9</sup> Hunter, ‘*Complete with missing parts*’, p. 12.

authenticity are explored through a ‘variegation’ of narrative perspectives within the collection as a form. Hogg uses the term ‘variegation’ in the story ‘An Edinburgh Baillie’ in *Tales of the Wars of Montrose*: ‘it is with regret that I must draw [the Baillie’s narrative] to a close in order to variegate this work with the actions of other men’.<sup>10</sup> The *OED* defines ‘variegation’ firstly in its botanical sense, denoting ‘the presence of patches of different coloured tissue in the leaves, petals, or other parts of a plant’.<sup>11</sup> It is in its alternate descriptive sense in which Hogg deploys the term, and which I use to characterise the short story collection as a medium: ‘the action or process of diversifying or making something varied in character’.<sup>12</sup> The historical short story collection, as shown through my analysis of *Tales of the Wars of Montrose* below, diversifies narrative perspectives to undermine any sense of cohesive totality, using a variety of fragments alongside the narrative aesthetics of portability – self-referentiality, self-conscious textuality, the multiplication and subversion of sources of narrative authority – within individual stories themselves to ‘variegate’ storytelling.

Two other book-length collections of short stories discussed deal in more detail with the short story’s move from magazine to book and disrupt the binary of fragment-totally in relation to form. *Winter Evening Tales* (1820) takes most of its stories from Hogg’s short-lived periodical venture, *The Spy* (1810-11). The stories were collected from a diffuse pool of fiction in a thoroughly dialogic textual environment, within which, as shown in chapter one, the presence of the storyteller – itself an author function – ‘Mr. Spy’ was tangible across the ‘thin layers’ of its short-storytelling.<sup>13</sup> *The Spy*, however, failed as a literary venture and Hogg ‘buried’ its body.<sup>14</sup> In the migration of short stories from magazines to book collections, Hogg revived ‘dead’ author functions inscribed within stories, excavating ‘graves’ in a similar fashion to

---

<sup>10</sup> The term ‘variegation’ is taken from Hogg’s story ‘Some Remarkable Passages in the Life of an Edinburgh Baillie. Written by himself’, in Hogg, *Tales of the Wars of Montrose*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002), pp. 1-98 (p. 97).

<sup>11</sup> ‘Variegation’, *Shorter Oxford English Dictionary*, 6<sup>th</sup> Edition, Vol. 2 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007), p. 3501.

<sup>12</sup> ‘Variegation’, *OED*, p. 3501.

<sup>13</sup> The ‘thin layers’ is Walter Benjamin’s phrase, discussed in more detail in the introduction and in chapter one. See Benjamin, ‘The Storyteller’, p. 6.

<sup>14</sup> ‘So the Spy was executed, the dead body given up to his friends, where buried, remains a secret until this day’, from ‘Familiar Epistles to Christopher North, from an Old Friend with a New Face.’ *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine*, Vol. 10 (1821), p. 45.

the scene in 'A Scots Mummy'. In this process of revival in the repurposing of short stories from magazine to book, Hogg reclaims elements of the associated authenticating identities of place and class. In the case of the short stories here discussed, this usually means taking the 'story' and removing the more explicit layers of 'telling', while maintaining the textual performance of authenticity in regionality and subalternity. The collection is also notable for its incorporation of popular chapbook short stories, bringing ephemeral and cheap material into the 'more stable and locatable' confines of something resembling a 'Waverley Novel' which could be used for circulating libraries.<sup>15</sup> *The Shepherd's Calendar* (1829) has its own distinct publishing history in relation to the magazine form. Much of its content is taken from *Blackwood's*, and so it offers the most direct act of reclamation of the magazine identity of the Ettrick Shepherd and of the concomitant discourses of authenticity. This too shows, however, the limitations of the agency of the author function as a subject position in the literary marketplace. At the request of William Blackwood, James Hogg's nephew Robert Hogg edited the book version of *Shepherd's Calendar*. As Foucault argues of the author as function, critics should ask not 'who is the real author?', but instead: 'what are the modes of existence of this discourse?', 'where does it come from; how is it circulated; who controls it?'.<sup>16</sup> In conceiving of the book form as a medium through which Hogg sought to seize control of the means of production of author functions, we emerge with a fragmented and contestable authorial identity, rather than the Ettrick Shepherd as a totality.

The structure of this chapter reflects the different roles played by the medium of the short story collection in relation to the performance of authenticity in Hogg's stories, and to the issue of authorial agency in relation to publication mediums. The discussion starts with a story collection, *Altrive Tales*, which is suggestive of the cultural roles associated with the bound-book in offering 'tangibility' and a measure of authorial control over diffuse and ephemeral magazine short stories, as well as its associations

---

<sup>15</sup> 'Indeed, as Meredith McGill has argued in relation to Hawthorne and Poe, the push for many authors to collect their disparate short fictions within the more stable and locatable form of the book, [brought] the unstable genre of the short story under the auspices of the evolving form of the modern novel through means of framing devices, identifiable narrators (singular and plural) and thematic consistency.' See Collins, 'Transnationalism and the Transatlantic', p. 13.

<sup>16</sup> Michel Foucault, 'What is an author?' (1969), in *The Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism*, ed. by Vincent B. Leitch (New York and London: Norton, 2001), pp. 1622-1636 (p. 1636).

with notions of permanence and posterity in comparison to the disposable qualities of the magazine short story celebrated by Poe. The chapter then moves on to consider how the medium of the short story collection affects how stories themselves can be read by examining *The Tales of the Wars of Montrose*. It considers the notion of the historical short story collection via an aesthetic category of ‘variegation’ – a multiplication of fragmented perspectives between the stories, reflecting narrative aesthetics within Hogg’s stories themselves which foreground questions of agency and authenticity. The final section of the chapter builds upon the analysis of the short story collection’s role in authorial agency and narrative aesthetics by examining more closely the process of collection from periodical magazines, and other ‘ephemeral’ forms such as chapbooks, into books such as *Winter Evening Tales* and *The Shepherd’s Calendar*. It explores how that process of collection from magazine to book shaped stories and the performance of authenticity within them, and argues that forms and mediums of publication deepen our understanding of Hogg’s agency by showing how authorship and narrative are shaped by those material contexts of textual production.

*Pre-empting the ‘condescension of posterity’: Altrive Tales*

Hogg’s story collection *Altrive Tales* (1832) is worthwhile considering first in the analysis of book-format short fiction collections, in spite of its relatively late appearance in his life. This is because Hogg’s plans for the collection as a starting point for a multi-volume ‘magnum opus’ reveal the cultural value, particularly concerning authorship, associated with the book as a medium of publication as opposed to periodical magazines, where many of his short stories had appeared first. Hogg’s letters can help substantiate the reclamation of author functions in the publishing of stories in book format as opposed to magazines. In an 1830 letter to the Edinburgh-based publisher Blackwood’s, Hogg made clear his plans to have a definitive series of book format collections out of what Ian Duncan described as his ‘loose, capacious, fluid stock of narratives’:<sup>17</sup>

---

<sup>17</sup> Duncan, ‘Introduction’, in James Hogg, *Winter Evening Tales* (hereafter *WET*), ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002), pp. xi-xli (p.xxii).

There is another [plan] which I think might raise me a supply. It is to publish all of my tales in numbers like Sir W Scott's to rewrite and sub divide them and they being all written off hand and published without either reading or correction I see I could improve them prodigiously. ... If the tales included [those which would become part of Wars of Montrose] they would not amount to less than twelve numbers one for every month of the year of the same size as Sir Walter's.<sup>18</sup>

As Gillian Hughes notes, the repeated mention of Scott in Hogg's pitch is no accident. The 1829 collected edition of the *Waverley* novels, the *magnus opus* edition, had sold well – 30,000 copies - among an expanding market of readers.<sup>19</sup> Reflecting the waning status of Edinburgh as a cultural capital of fiction output, especially in the challenging post-1826 market crash environment, Hogg published *Altrive Tales* (1832) with the new London publisher, James Cochrane. It was to be the first of twelve volumes, which was to include almost all of his fictional output including short stories, novellas and novels:

The Altrive Tales	
Vol. 1 <sup>st</sup>	Memoir of the Author
	Adventures of Capt. Lochy
	The Pongos
	Marion's Jock
Vol 2d	Adventures of Col. Aston
	The Brownie of Bodsbeck
Vol 3d	The Seige [sic] of Roxburgh
Vol 4 <sup>th</sup>	An Original Tale to be sent from Scotland and the remained selected from the Winter Evening Tales and Shepherd's Calender [sic]
Vol 5 <sup>th</sup>	An Original Tale to be sent from Scotland

---

<sup>18</sup> Hughes, 'Introduction', *Altrive Tales*, p. xvi.

<sup>19</sup> Hughes, 'Introduction', *Altrive Tales*, p. xvii.

The Wool-Gatherer and

The Hunt of Eildon

If any thing more wanted to be selected from The Winter Evening  
Tales and Shepherd's Calender

Vol 6<sup>th</sup>

The Confessions of a Sinner

If any more wanted to be selected from The Winter Evening  
Tales and Shepherd's Calendar

Vol 7<sup>th</sup>

An Original Tale to be sent

The rest to be selected from The Winter Evening Tales and  
Shepherd's Calender

The rest I will come and superintend.<sup>20</sup>

The above list of the multi-volume plan had been left with Cochrane in London, and indicates the size of – and suggests a futurity in - the project that Hogg had envisaged.

Hogg's move to the London book trade, visiting between January and March 1832, came after a prolonged period of largely fruitless negotiation with the publisher William Blackwood in Edinburgh. In a letter to Blackwood dated May 1826, Hogg wrote that:

You must contrive some literary plan to replenish my purse a little once more in the course of the year else I must go straight to London and become what De-quinsey [sic] calls a *literary hack* and this in sooth appears to me the only plan by which I can make a tolerable shift. [...] But as good taste has been

---

<sup>20</sup> Proposed list of volumes, in a list of 19 March 1832 left with Roscoe and Richie, Cochrane's correctors of the press, quoted in Hughes, 'Introduction', *Altrive Tales*, pp. xxv-xxvi.

watched with a suspicious eye by the literati I would have the work published under the sanction of Lockhart [...] I think an edition of my Scottish tales by Lockhart for behoof of the author would have some effect. [...] But I will not write to Lockhart or any other body concerning it till I hear your opinion which I know will be a candid one.<sup>21</sup>

Hogg here presents London as a negotiating tool, stressing to Blackwood that he does not rely solely upon Blackwood and Edinburgh for his literary career. This negotiation comes at a time by which the satirical sketch series *Noctes Ambrosianae* (1822-1835) was a well-established feature of *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, discussed in more detail in the previous chapter. Through this, Blackwood's was benefitting from Hogg through the satire's control of the author function of the Ettrick Shepherd. While the above letter shows Hogg's efforts to claim agency in the cultural production of his author functions, it also suggests the limits of those efforts, as his threat of a London move is tempered by the suggestion that John Gibson Lockhart, Scott's son-in-law, could 'sanction' the stories for a Blackwood edition.

As financial pressure on Hogg increased, he continued his campaign for Blackwood to publish his collected works of fiction:

I hope that my 'Scottish Tales' published in 12 No's with a preface by Lockhart and some pains taken in the arrangement may be made available by and by but in the mean time I should have something going on to keep *the banes green*.<sup>22</sup>

Blackwood, however, was not forthcoming, and was clearly reluctant to agree to Hogg's plan for a totality of collected fictions:

You have never told me expressly what you think of my Scottish Tales in twelve monthly volumes with decorations Every volume to commence with an original tale or otherwise as may be deemed most meet. Would you like to try them yourself or shall I venture to correspond with another. I had a letter

---

<sup>21</sup> Hogg's letter to Blackwood, May 1826, quoted in Hughes, 'Introduction', *Altrive Tales*, p. xvi.

<sup>22</sup> Hogg's letter to Blackwood, October 1830, quoted in Hughes, 'Introduction', *Altrive Tales*, p. xix.

from apparently a new London firm the other day requesting to publish something for me. I have not seen Lockhart yet but hope to see him soon.<sup>23</sup>

Hogg again presents the prospect of London before Blackwood, this time hinting that he has actual plans in place in the UK capital. In a final pitch, Hogg suggested that Robert Hogg (Hogg's nephew), who had harshly edited Hogg's short stories for the book length collection *Shepherd's Calendar* in 1829 for Blackwood's, could edit more of his fiction in order to avoid 'doubt or difference of opinion to appeal to you':

I am still depending on your writing a preface for me and taking the responsibility of my edition of Scottish tales. My principal hope is anchored there and I intend to purge thoroughly and improve greatly and submit every thing to Robt Hogg Ebony and a third one; and if there ever should occur any doubt or difference of opinion to appeal to you for I could not desire you to superintend the whole press. Do you not think a London publisher would be best? I want to publish my first No. in Jnr and continue till my tales are exhausted.<sup>24</sup>

Blackwood remained unforthcoming on a Hoggian *magnus opus* despite Hogg's stress that he was willing to have Robert Hogg's involvement which would, as evidenced by his involvement in *The Shepherd's Calendar* (1829) discussed below, significantly alter the content of his stories. Before leaving for London from Edinburgh, taking his 12-volume plan with him, on December 23<sup>rd</sup>, 1831, Hogg wrote to Blackwood that 'you have starved me fairly out of my house and country'.<sup>25</sup>

Shortly after arriving in London Hogg arranged with Cochrane and Lockhart to publish *Altrive Tales*. While Hogg enjoyed social functions and events across the city (including a Burns dinner on January 25<sup>th</sup>, suggesting a willingness to cultivate a Scottish 'peasant poet' image in London), he had doubts, expressed here to his wife, about the security of Cochrane as a publisher:

---

<sup>23</sup> Hogg's letter to Blackwood, June 1831, quoted in Hughes, 'Introduction', *Altrive Tales*, p. xix.

<sup>24</sup> Hughes, 'Introduction', *Altrive Tales*, p. xxii

<sup>25</sup> Hughes, 'Introduction', *Altrive Tales*, p. xxiii.

For I am afraid that this connection of mine with Mr Cochrane may turn out a hoax. Several of my literary friends have been hinting to me that he is venturing far beyond his capital and that his credit is already tottering. Lockhart on the other hand thinks quite contrary and none of the Booksellers and I have been in company with very many have ever hinted at the thing. I rather however begin to suppose it as he is not pushing the work through the press with any degree of vigour but rather as it were waiting for something and I dare not push him till I see how his accounts for the year are settled.<sup>26</sup>

Indeed, despite promising initial sales of *Altrive Tales*, Cochrane went bankrupt only weeks after Hogg had left London in March 1832.<sup>27</sup>

Hogg's desire for a tangible collection of his life's fictional work, a Hoggian *magnus opus*, was never realised during his lifetime. Hughes explains that:

the *Tales of the Wars of Montrose* was eventually published by James Cochrane early in 1835. The posthumous and heavily bowdlerised six-volume *Tales and Sketches by the Ettrick Shepherd* published by Blackie and Son between December 1836 and December 1837 is a poor shadow of Hogg's original conception of a twelve-volume collected prose works in 'Altrive Tales', and the resemblance of the volume of *Tales and Sketches* edited by Thomas Thomson in 1865 is yet more tenuous.<sup>28</sup>

*Altrive Tales*, then, is the single remnant of Hogg's planned gathering of his fictions – both short and long – into collected volumes of bound books.

The appearance of the autobiographical 'Memoir of the Author's Life' in the first section of *Altrive Tales* would have stood as the opening to the twelve-volume series had it gone ahead as Hogg had planned. Hogg wrote three autobiographical 'Memoirs' during his career, in 1807 and 1821, in editions of *The Mountain Bard*, and in 1832 as

---

<sup>26</sup> Hogg's letter to his wife, January 1832, quoted in Hughes, 'Introduction', *Altrive Tales*, p. xxiv.

<sup>27</sup> Hogg's relationship with London, including with Cochrane, is discussed in more detail in chapter four.

<sup>28</sup> Hughes, 'Introduction', *Altrive Tales*, p. xxxiv.

part of *Altrive Tales*. Accusations of egotism have long been cast toward Hogg. In a 2016 newspaper review of Bruce Gilkison's *Walking with James Hogg*, the literary critic Stuart Kelly writes of the 'strange exaggeration and egomania in Hogg's boast' of being a 'Mountain bard'.<sup>29</sup> Of Hogg's treatment of the supernatural in the folkloric, and familial, traditions of the Borders, Kelly accuses Hogg of 'self-promoting hype.' Hogg's 1832 'Memoir' in *Altrive Tales* pre-empted and humorously undermines criticisms of this nature:

I like to write about myself: in fact, there are few things which I like better... often I have been laughed at for what an Edinburgh editor styles as my good-natured egotism, which is sometimes anything but that; and I am aware that I shall be laughed at again. But I care not: for this *important* Memoir, now to be brought forward for the fourth time...<sup>30</sup>

Kelly's critique falls somewhat flat if Hogg's egotism is viewed as self-referential authorial performativity. Hogg's short stories, as argued in chapter one, bear the imprint of the storyteller, in which the hand of the author is present not as an all-seeing narrator, often associated with the nineteenth-century realist novel, but as an interrogative site of textuality and reader participation. As Hughes has argued, the 'Memoir' in *Altrive Tales* performs this function by establishing a first-person narrative style which is continued in the first story in the collection, 'The Adventures of Captain John Lochy', although the 'I' of the teller has moved from Hogg himself to John Lochy, the fictional character-come-narrator.<sup>31</sup> A similar process happens in *The Spy* number 12, published more than twenty years prior at the outset of Hogg's literary career, where the 'I' of the *Spy*'s editorial switches to the 'I' of John Miller's interpolated narrative with 'Description of a Peasant's Funeral'.

Read as part of a collection, Hughes argues that 'Memoirs' and 'John Lochy' 'reverberate strongly together', their 'juxtaposition' drawing readers towards the

---

<sup>29</sup> Stuart Kelly, 'Book review: Walking with James Hogg by Bruce Gilkison', *Scotsman*, 1 August 2016 <<https://www.scotsman.com/lifestyle/culture/books/book-review-walking-with-james-hogg-by-bruce-gilkison-1-4190927>> [accessed 26/5/2018]

<sup>30</sup> Hogg, 'Memoir of the Author's Life', in *Altrive Tales*, pp. 11-52 (p. 11).

<sup>31</sup> Hughes, 'Introduction', *Altrive Tales*, p. xlv.

‘Memoir’ as a narrative construct.<sup>32</sup> ‘John Lochy’ is an incomplete narrative containing multiple explanations. As Lochy’s first-person narrative draws to a close, an unnamed narrator, one of Hogg’s author functions, interjects at the story’s close to include authenticating documents, apparently from an 1827 newspaper advertisement and two follow-up letters to the editor, which may provide clues as to the narrative’s resolution:

From these simple documents the reader is left to judge for himself; they require no exposition of mine. But I only regret that our intrepid hero did not write out his autobiography to the last of his life; yet perhaps he did, as I know not what became of him.<sup>33</sup>

Where printed documents provide in ‘John Lochy’ what Duncan called ‘authenticity effects’, another story in the collection, ‘Marion’s Jock’, offers authenticating devices which are rooted in orality.<sup>34</sup> The story opens with a Scots narrator, who explains that ‘There wad aiblins nane o’ you ken Marion’.<sup>35</sup> As the first paragraph progresses, the narrator’s Scots starts to give way to English (‘Marion railed all the while’). The use of standard English is continued for most of the remaining third-person narration however it is, particularly in the early pages, still inflected with some Scots (‘None of them had the good sense to give Jock ony sic orders’).<sup>36</sup> The reported-speech of the characters is Scots throughout. Authenticity is here grounded in the textual representation of orality, and in reading the story as part of a collection, including the ‘Memoir’, that concept of oral authenticity is linked to the textualisation of the author function within the collection. In his ‘Memoir’ Hogg stresses his lack of formal education and his rooted-ness in the locality of Ettrick and its environs.<sup>37</sup> His first encounter with Burns came through orality.<sup>38</sup> In ‘Marion’s Jock’, then, the shifting registers of narrative perspective and speech representation reflect a textual performance of Hogg’s authenticity as the ‘Ettrick Shepherd’. This reading is strengthened by considering the story as part of a collection.

---

<sup>32</sup> Hughes, ‘Introduction’, *Altrive Tales*, p. xlv.

<sup>33</sup> Hogg, ‘The Adventures of Captain John Lochy, written by himself’, in *Altrive Tales*, pp. 79-159 (p. 159).

<sup>34</sup> See Duncan, ‘Authenticity Effects’, p. 111.

<sup>35</sup> Hogg, ‘Marion’s Jock’, in *Altrive Tales*, pp. 172-186 (p. 172).

<sup>36</sup> Hogg, ‘Marion’s Jock’, p. 173.

<sup>37</sup> Hogg, ‘Memoir’, *Altrive Tales*, pp. 12-14.

<sup>38</sup> Hogg, ‘Memoir’, *Altrive Tales*, p. 17.

Tales of the Wars of Montrose *and the historical short story collection*

The case of *Altrive Tales* suggests the cultural role of the book format in determining Hogg's authorial desire for some measure of control over his loose body of short stories which had existed hitherto mostly in ephemeral magazine form. It also shows how Hogg's narrative aesthetics and authenticating strategies within his short stories were shaped by their being part of a collection. A later collection of Hogg's short stories, *Tales of the Wars of Montrose*, helps to build the case for considering the role of the book format collection in shaping Hogg's performance of authenticity by showing how the variety and diversification characteristic of a story collection interacted with the portable narrative aesthetics within the stories themselves. *The Tales of the Wars of Montrose*, a collection of loosely connected historical short stories dealing with the civil wars of seventeenth-century Scotland, was published in 1835 by Cochrane in London though it had begun its life in the 1820s. Hogg's letters reveal the difficulty he faced in trying to get Blackwood to publish his stories:

I have a M.S. work by me for these several years which Blackwood objected to or at least wished it delayed two years ago till better times. I know and am sure it will sell and if you could find me a London publisher for it I would like excessively well that it should come out ere ever Blackwood was aware. ... They are all fabulous stories founded on historical facts and would make two small volumes.<sup>39</sup>

Hogg's letter to Allan Cunningham again shows how Hogg was increasingly looking to London rather than Edinburgh as the publishing base for the 'Ettrick Shepherd'. It also suggests that Hogg was thinking about the particulars of the short story collection as a form, suggesting that his manuscript would 'make two small volumes'.

---

<sup>39</sup> Hogg's letter to Allan Cunningham, October 1828, quoted in Hughes, 'Introduction', *Montrose*, p. xi.

Hogg persisted in trying to have his stories, conceived as an early collection to be titled *Lives of Great Men* and which would later make up *Montrose*, published by Blackwood in Edinburgh:

I send you The Life of Colonel Aston which you once read before. You know it was written originally for a volume of *lives of great men* An Edinburgh Baillie Sir Simon Brodie and Col. Peter Aston.<sup>40</sup>

Two years later, Hogg again attempts to have Blackwood publish from this body of work, although this time suggesting it (the story 'Sir Simon Brodie') be published in *Maga*:

Though I have seventeen tales in M.S. after looking them all over I find not one of proper Magazine length. I have sent you the funniest that I can find to begin the series although it is a pity the others had not been in before it both of which you refused or neglected. If it [sic] too long as I suspect it may be you must divide it into chapters or parts [...]<sup>41</sup>

Hogg was clearly aware of the formal discrepancy between stories of 'proper magazine length' and those which require to be divided into 'chapters or parts'. Turning to London, where Cochrane's publishing business was back up and running in partnership with John McCrone, Hogg wrote to the latter in June 1833 offering 'Genuine Tales of the days of Montrose' and specified that it was to be published in a single volume. McCrone and Cochrane's wife engaged in extra-marital relations, which delayed Hogg's publishing plans. Hogg persisted with Cochrane in plans to publish the work, with Cochrane asking for 'a little addition': that it be published in two, rather than a single, volumes. Cochrane wanted three volumes:

But remember I can only furnish two vols. Of the Tales of the Wars of Montrose. I have two by me and your three will make two handsome circulating-library vols but I cannot as yet promise a third of that area.<sup>42</sup>

---

<sup>40</sup> Hogg's letter to Blackwood, October 1831, quoted in Hughes, 'Introduction', *Montrose*, p. xii.

<sup>41</sup> Hogg's letter to Blackwood March 1833, offering 'Sir Simon Brodie' to *BEM*. Blackwood refused. Quoted in Hughes, 'Introduction', *Montrose*, p. xii.

<sup>42</sup> Hogg's letter to Cochrane, November 1834, quoted in Hughes, 'Introduction', *Montrose*, p. xiv.

Interestingly, Hogg's wish for two volumes is aimed at circulating libraries, which, as discussed below in relation to *Winter Evening Tales*, were growing especially in the US. In a letter to Cochrane, Hogg stressed that the Montrose volumes should 'be printed in the style of the Waverley Novels (first edition), paper and type, which is by far the best style for a circulating library book'.<sup>43</sup>

The first of Hogg's historical short stories in *Montrose*, 'Some Remarkable Passages in the Life of an Edinburgh Baillie. Written by himself', is written in the first-person from the perspective of Archibald Sydeserf. As in all the stories in the collection, the Marquis of Montrose, whose military campaign the collection centres around, does not appear directly in the story, and nor do we get a narrative from his perspective at any point. Instead, we get five short stories which vary in style and use different narratological strategies. Within the text of 'An Edinburgh Baillie' appears an additional first-person narrational layer, in both the opening and closing passages, and midway through the narrative. It is not made explicitly clear who the 'I' who is speaking is in these sections, but his tone is authoritative and checks the Baillie's 'insufferably tedious and egotistical' narrative story against 'all the general as well as local histories of that period' and finds it favourable in relation to historical accuracy.<sup>44</sup> Furthermore, the framing narration makes it clear to the reader that this found memoir has been edited and 'abridged' by the narrator, removing the 'so low so despicable' sections which 'might have been amusing to some' and passing 'over the long chapters relating to his family'.<sup>45</sup>

Midway through Sydeserf's narrative, the narrator interjects and surmises the Baillie's account for the reader. 'He says the army of the Gordons amounted to about 2,500 men', and 'he says in one place they never derived good from [the King's] plans'; 'he never speaks favourably of the king'.<sup>46</sup> The Baillie's words are thus indirectly reported through the nameless narrator, and while in the opening section the narrator has

---

<sup>43</sup> Hogg letter to Cochrane, undated, quoted in Hughes, 'Introduction', *Montrose*, p. xv.

<sup>44</sup> Hogg, 'Edinburgh Baillie', p. 1.

<sup>45</sup> Hogg, 'Edinburgh Baillie', p. 1, p. 2.

<sup>46</sup> Hogg, 'Edinburgh Baillie', p. 63, p. 64.

explained that the Baillie's account is a written one, the narrator's reportage midway through the narrative uses markers of speech and orality as opposed to writing. While this may appear a small detail, the role of orality and the issue of authentication is a key feature in Hogg's historical short story collection project, focussed on in more detail below in the discussion of 'Wat Pringle O Yair'.

Narrative and narrational perspective are significant in the function of the story, especially when read as part of a short story collection form. The first-person returns to Sydeserf, before another interjection by the nameless narrator explaining that 'we must not pass over several years the history of which is entirely made up of plot and counterplot'.<sup>47</sup> Hogg's historical short story, therefore, can omit historical material due to the form's brevity. Crucially in this, the narrator admits to the reader that omissions have taken place. The mode of telling, and its relationship to form, is being foregrounded in the text. Towards the end of the story, the narrator again interrupts the narrative to explain that 'these are the most notable passages in the life of this extraordinary person and it is with great regret that I must draw them to a close *in order to variegate this work with the actions of other men*' (italics my own).<sup>48</sup> Here, then, the narrator is explaining the aesthetic approach to history presented within the story collection, which is one of 'variegation'. As a visual metaphor, this has interesting parallels with Meiko O'Halloran's notion of Hogg's 'kaleidoscopic' aesthetic.<sup>49</sup> Indeed, O'Halloran's monograph is one of the few critical studies to closely study Hogg's 1835 collection of historical short stories and examines narrative aesthetics in *Montrose* and the issue of history. In it, O'Halloran argues that in *Montrose*, through a process of aesthetic and ethical 'disorientation', Hogg challenges readers to 'co-produce' meaning.<sup>50</sup> Hogg's collection embodies 'rupture, incompleteness, fragility, loss and uncertainty – reflected through the multiple perspectives of characters', an approach that 'expands the capacities of fiction [...] [in

---

<sup>47</sup> Hogg, 'Edinburgh Baillie', p. 65.

<sup>48</sup> Hogg, 'Edinburgh Baillie', p. 96.

<sup>49</sup> See O'Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, pp. 217-255.

<sup>50</sup> O'Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, p. 217.

an] implosion of literary form which is entirely apposite' to its subject matter: civil war and fragmented nationhood.<sup>51</sup>

The nameless narrator in 'An Edinburgh Baillie' who sets out the aesthetic of history through 'variegation' in the short story collection can be considered as Hogg's London – as opposed to the Edinburgh - 'Ettrick Shepherd', published as it was through Cochrane rather than Blackwood. If not explicitly named within the text or paratext, the stories within the collection contain framings and interjections by a narrator. Writing of Scott's 1827 short story collection, *Chronicles of the Canongate*, Alison Lumsden argues that the narrator of the stories, Chrystal Croftangry, whose framing narrative appears at the opening and closing of the collection, provides the 'connective tissue which binds [the] tales together'.<sup>52</sup> *Montrose* functions in a similar fashion of connectivity through narrational identity. The contestation of notions of authenticity in history and narrative is the central concern of the *Montrose* narrator. In 'An Edinburgh Baillie', Hogg's narrator takes the effort to situate Baillie's narrative within the empirical historical record, authenticating its veracity:

I had great doubt of the Baillie's sincerity in this, till I found the following register in Sir James Balfour's annals vol 3 p. 272-3.<sup>53</sup>

The printed word is the basis for the story's authenticity. Yet it is not solely print which offers claims to historical authenticity in *Montrose*. In 'Colonel Peter Aston', the second story in *Montrose*, the 'I' of the narrator returns to guide the story and shape its historicity, this time by suggesting orality:

And here I judge it requisite to be a little more particular on the events relating to this battle than perhaps the thread of my narrative requires because I know that I am in possession of some documents relating to it which are not possessed by any other person, and which have never in our day been related and as they were originally copied from the mouth of a gentleman who had a

---

<sup>51</sup> O'Halloran, *A Kaleidoscopic Art*, p. 220.

<sup>52</sup> Lumsden, *Walter Scott and Limits of Language*, p. 177.

<sup>53</sup> Hogg, 'Edinburgh Baillie', p. 96.

subordinate in the Royal army the truth of them may be implicitly relied on. And moreover they prove to a certainty the authenticity of this tale.<sup>54</sup>

The printed documents have their basis in the ‘mouth of a gentleman’ connected directly to the historical event. This admission of oral history transcription provides an authenticating function which occupies different ground to the ‘annals vol 3 p. 272-3’-style empirical historical accuracy offered in ‘An Edinburgh Baillie’. Orality here combines with print to authenticate the historical record, rather than being positioned as antithetical to it. Not only is *Montrose* presenting an aesthetic of ‘variegation’ through the historical short story collection form, it presented a variegation of authoritative sources of historical authenticity. Orality, first-hand accounts, and empirical historical texts situate the collected stories, extending the principle of ‘variegation’ to history itself – diversifying historical perspectives to provide a multi-perspectival narrative of past events and eschewing the desire for a single authoritative explanation.

In ‘Wat Pringle o’ the Yair’, the final story in *Montrose*, Hogg’s narrator uses oral history and folk tradition to provide the authenticating material to corroborate the narrative. The initial narrator is Wat Pringle, a local of Yair, outside Selkirk, ‘well known to every body thereabouts’ and the story is told mostly through reported speech.<sup>55</sup> The story opens when a character called Robin Hogg calls at the door of Wat, a subtle nod at the involvement of Hogg’s author functions as character within the text. Another, unnamed, narrator interrupts the narrative to provide historical context to Wat’s story of the Battle of Philiphaugh. The narrator’s personal connection to local cultural memory of the battle is foregrounded:

Now I must tell the result in my own way and my own words for though that luckless battle has often been shortly described it has never been truly so and no man living knows half so much about it as I do. My Grandfather who was born in 1691 and whom I well remember was personally acquainted with

---

<sup>54</sup> Hogg, ‘The Adventures of Colonel Peter Aston’, *Montrose*, pp. 99-137 (p. 123).

<sup>55</sup> Hogg, ‘Wat Pringle o’ the Yair’, *Montrose*, pp. 191-222 (p. 196).

several persons about Selkirk who were eye witnesses of the battle of Philiphaugh.<sup>56</sup>

Here then, the role of the ‘eye witness’ is key to the ‘true’ history of the battle, which has since been handed down the generations of family within a locality in order to eventually appear on the printed page as it does in ‘Wat Pringle o’ the Yair’. The Grandfather’s narrative of the battle, passed down to the narrator through an uncle William, is not one of direct connection but is one situated in retellings, having heard it from acquaintances who witnessed events first-hand. This is a history enveloped in layers of storytelling.

As was evident in ‘An Edinburgh Baillie’ in the opening story of the collection, the narrator also substantiates the historical record through reference to written historical documents. ‘Mr Chambers who has written the far best and most spirited description of this battle that has ever been given’, explains Hogg’s narrator, ‘has been some way misled by the two Rev’d Bishops Guthrie and Wishart on whose authority his narrative is principally founded’.<sup>57</sup> Addressing the conflict between the oral tradition of the battle and the printed record, the narrator looks to defend the historical value of the former:

It may be said and will be said that my account is only derived from tradition. True; but it is from the tradition of a people to whom every circumstance and every spot was so well known that the tradition could not possibly be incorrect and be it remembered that it is only the tradition of two generations of the same family.<sup>58</sup>

The defence of oral tradition as history is supported through corroboration with ballad culture, as his uncle sang ‘‘The Battle of Philliphaugh’ [...] generally every night during winter. I therefore believe that my account is perfectly correct or very nearly so’.<sup>59</sup> The aesthetic of ‘variegation’ in *Montrose* is therefore not confined to character and content, and to differing narrative perspective, but also involves a variegation of

---

<sup>56</sup> Hogg, ‘Wat Pringle’, p. 197.

<sup>57</sup> Hogg, ‘Wat Pringle’, p. 198.

<sup>58</sup> Hogg, ‘Wat Pringle’, p. 198.

<sup>59</sup> Hogg, ‘Wat Pringle’, p. 199.

sources of historical authority and authenticity which emerge through layers of storytelling and perspective.

The narrator reveals himself as the author function of James Hogg when discussing the conflicting historical record about the slaughter of the unarmed camp followers, including children:

But the cause why I mention is it that Sir Walter Scott once told me that it was from the bridge of the Yarrow that they were thrown and likewise mentioned his authority which I have forgot but it was a letter and the date of the transaction proved it.<sup>60</sup>

The narrator of *Montrose* who interrupts the short stories to substantiate the discussion regarding historicity, while unnamed in the text and lacking any narrational framing paratext like those which appear in Scott's *Chronicles of the Canongate*, is James Hogg. *Montrose* was published in 1835, three years after Scott's death and one year after Hogg's *Familiar anecdotes of Sir Walter Scott* had appeared, and the mention of Scott in 'Wat Pringle' grounds the story (and its concomitant treatment of history and tradition) in the literary relationship between the 'Ettrick Shepherd' and the author of *Waverley*, two key figures in the literary landscape of Selkirkshire and the Scottish Borders in the early nineteenth century. The connection to the locality of Ettrick and its environs is embedded within the short stories, particularly in 'Wat Pringle o' the Yair' where local tradition combines with Hogg's family traditions of storytelling. In the *Tales of the Wars of Montrose* as a collection of short stories, Hogg reasserts the cultural authority of authenticity, bound to locality, tradition, orality and storytelling, in the contested discourses associated with the 'Ettrick Shepherd' as author function. Read as a collection, *Montrose* presents the historical short story through an aesthetic of 'variegation', a combination of loosely-related component parts which subvert any sense of 'totality' and settled history. Rather, it is a history involving a dialogue between fragments of narrative and sources of historical authenticity, and the author-function of the 'Ettrick Shepherd' navigates the reader through that dialogue by situating its authorial identity in discourses of authenticity.

---

<sup>60</sup> Hogg, 'Wat Pringle', p. 201.

## Unpacking Winter Evening Tales: 'The Long Pack' from chapbook to book

In the discussion of *Altrive Tales* above, I mentioned the role of the book as offering to Hogg a sense of solidity and stability for his short stories through which he had hoped for a degree of control over how his work would appear in posterity, in comparison to the more ephemeral periodical magazines. *Winter Evening Tales* and *The Shepherd's Calendar* offer an opportunity to consider the relationship between magazine stories and book stories in more detail, given the close relationship between those book publications and the periodical magazines *The Spy* and *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* respectively. As in the case of *Tales of the Wars of Montrose*, both *Winter Evening Tales* and *The Shepherd's Calendar* as story collections affect the narrational concern with authenticity within and between the short stories themselves. In other words, the context in which short stories appear affect how stories can be understood. Furthermore, particularly in the case of *Winter Evening Tales*, considering story collections allows for a focus upon where stories have been collected from. As I argue below, this approach strengthens our understanding of the short story as being a portable form in the case of Hogg.

Hogg's 1820 collection of short stories, *Winter Evening Tales* (hereafter referred to as *WET*), shows how the portability of short stories between forms of publication – the chapbook, the magazine, and the book – shaped how those stories functioned, what their narratives contained, and who read them. Although appearing much later in Hogg's literary career than *Montrose* and *Altrive Tales*, *WET* represents an attempt to gather together disparate short fictions from chapbook and magazine formats into what Hogg described as 'some tangible form'.<sup>61</sup> In a similar way to Hogg's twelve-volume *magnus opus* had hoped to, *WET* selected and reworked stories from an existing body of material. As Duncan argues:

Faithful to its partial origins in *The Spy*, Hogg's miscellany (which includes verse narratives) insists on an incongruous variety of forms, voice, register, style and texture. In this formal insistence *WET* presents itself as constituting

---

<sup>61</sup> Mack, 'Introduction', *Shepherd's Calendar*, p. xv.

not simply a lack in relation to the novel, something imperfect or unfinished – but an alternative, non-novelistic genre of national fiction, close to its roots in popular print media (miscellaneous, chapbooks, as well as in oral storytelling).<sup>62</sup>

There are, furthermore, a range of themes and styles within the collection, from the novella length adventure narrative ‘Basil Lee’, to the supernaturalistic oral cultures explored in ‘Tibby Johnston’s Wraith’ and ‘The Wife of Lochmaben’. Looking at the roots of *WET*’s short stories, which for the most part derive from *The Spy* but elsewhere come from *Blackwood’s Magazine* other periodicals and chapbooks, it is perhaps unsurprising to see that mix of ‘previous lives’ reflected in a lack of uniformity of style, theme or form in the collection. To apply what Kasia Boddy has argued in relation to the short story anthology as a form (Boddy’s argument itself reworking the formal criticism of C. Alphonso Smith) Hogg’s collections embody a ‘variety in unity and ... unity in variety’.<sup>63</sup>

Hogg’s *Winter Evening Tales* was a collection of mostly short fiction including some poetry and songs published by Oliver & Boyd in Edinburgh in April 1820. *WET* would become Hogg’s ‘most successful [work of] fiction during his lifetime’, with the first edition of 1500 copies selling well and sellers reporting ‘lively business’ in London.<sup>64</sup> The book achieved widespread success and some degree of critical acclaim both in Scotland and further afield, including the rest of the United Kingdom, the USA, and Germany. As Duncan explains, the lack of international copyright meant that despite the ‘remarkable’ success of *WET* in the USA, Hogg didn’t see that commerciality reflected in income.<sup>65</sup> Two competing editions appeared in New York in 1820, with another appearing in Philadelphia in 1836. *WET* was also published in Berlin in 1822 and in Vienna in 1826.<sup>66</sup> Peter Garside has unearthed *WET*’s appearance in circulating libraries among new middle-class reading publics in Scotland and England, including

---

<sup>62</sup> Duncan, ‘Introduction’, in James Hogg, *Winter Evening Tales* (hereafter *WET*), ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002), pp. xi-xli (p. xxvi).

<sup>63</sup> Kasia Boddy, ‘Variety in Unity, Unity in Variety: the liminal space of the American short story anthology’, in *Liminality and the Short Story: boundary crossings in American, Canadian and British writing*, ed by J. Achilles & I. Bergmann (Abingdon: Routledge, 2015), pp. 145-158 (p. 147).

<sup>64</sup> Duncan, ‘Introduction’, *WET*, p. xix.

<sup>65</sup> Duncan, ‘Introduction’, *WET*, p. xix.

<sup>66</sup> Duncan, ‘Introduction’, *WET*, p. xx.

new Mechanical Institutes circulating libraries.<sup>67</sup> If the miscellaneous *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* catered, as David Stewart has argued, for the heterogeneous metropolitan reader, Hogg's book-length collections of fiction covered too the newer artisan classes of literary consumers.<sup>68</sup>

Tim Killick has reflected on the readership of Hogg's 1820 collection of short fiction:

Collections such as *Winter Evening Tales* were not written for consumption by those people who formed their subject matter. Instead, they offered a glimpse of an intriguing but largely inaccessible subculture to an educated audience. Hogg seeks to break out of the anthropological mould into which such stories were usually placed, and to place emphasis on the value and belief still given to superstitions by people in rural Scottish communities. However, by mediating those tales for a supposedly 'rational' audience he occasionally comes close to destroying his carefully constructed web of credulity.<sup>69</sup>

Although outwith the scope of this thesis in terms of empirical analysis, a brief consideration of archive material relating to circulating and subscription library catalogues can go some way toward reconstructing the key book-historical question asked by William St Clair and others of 'who read what'.<sup>70</sup> The success of *WET* in terms of the output of editions from north American publishers was reflected in its widespread appearance in circulating libraries in the region. As the letters discussed above to the London-based publisher Cochrane in the early 1830s reveal, Hogg was clearly attuned to the opportunities presented by the circulating library market for his book length collections. New York's Irving Circulating Library contained an 1820 version of *WET* in an 1842 record of its catalogue,<sup>71</sup> and another New York circulating

---

<sup>67</sup> Duncan, 'Introduction', *WET*, p. xxi.

<sup>68</sup> See Stewart, *Metropolitan Magazines*, pp. 7-13.

<sup>69</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 139.

<sup>70</sup> William St Clair, *The Reading Nation in the Romantic Period* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), p.8. See also Robert Darnton, 'First Steps Toward a History of Reading', *Australian Journal of French Studies*, 23: 1 (1986), 5-30, and Darnton, 'What Is the History of Books? Revisited', *Modern Intellectual History*, 4.3 (2007), 495-508. Richard Altick first asked the same question as early as 1957 in *The English Common Reader: A social history of the mass reading public* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1957).

<sup>71</sup> *Catalogue of the Irving Circulating Library, 120 Nassau Street, Conducted by William H. Attree* (New York, 1842) <[https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=K1w\\_AQAAMAAJ](https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=K1w_AQAAMAAJ)> [accessed 20/11/2017], p. 43.

library, the Parthenon Circulating Library, contained a copy in an 1834 catalogue.<sup>72</sup> Boston Literary Society's subscription library also contained a copy of the collection according to its 1844 records.<sup>73</sup>

Jeffrey Croteau's work on New York circulating libraries can help toward contextualising these appearances of Hogg's collected short fiction in the region. The early nineteenth century was a 'heyday' for the for-profit, usually bookseller affiliated, circulating library, thanks to the lack of public libraries:

The success of American circulating libraries during the nineteenth century was attributed by [US book historian David] Kaser to the fact that they catered 'to women and ... [supplied] what the public wanted to read'. This willingness to serve a broad clientele, especially women, set them apart from other libraries. While the social, apprentices' and mercantile libraries of the time catered almost exclusively to (white) males, circulating libraries distinguished themselves from their inception in America by their willingness — even eagerness — to include women among their clientele. Supplying what the public wanted to read, resulted in circulating libraries providing fiction to their customers. Circulating libraries gained a bad reputation because they were accused of 'unabashed trafficking in 'low' or 'unfit' novels to 'young' and 'impressionable' females'. This criticism would eventually be levelled at public libraries, which had to answer to tax-payers whose money funded the libraries, a responsibility that the for-profit circulating libraries never had to contend with.<sup>74</sup>

The suggestion that circulating libraries catered in particular to female book consumers offers some interesting reflection for Hogg's collections. As a general rule, the more controversial of Hogg's short fiction, usually published initially in periodicals, with regards to sexual content was softened in the collected book version

---

<sup>72</sup> *Catalogue of the Parthenon Circulating Library and Reading Rooms, Charles S Francis 252 Broadway* (New York: C. S. Francis, 1834)

<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=Uz4RAAAAIAAJ>> [accessed 19/11/2017], p. 108.

<sup>73</sup> *A catalogue of books of the Boston Literary Society* (Boston, MA: T. R. Marvin, 1844)

<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=orFfAAAACAAJ>> [accessed 21/11/2017], p. 128.

<sup>74</sup> Jeffrey Croteau, 'Yet more American circulating libraries: a preliminary checklist of Brooklyn (New York) circulating libraries', *Library History*, 22.3 (2006), 171-180 (p. 172).

of stories, such as ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream’ and ‘The Long Pack’, discussed in more depth below.

Many of the stories included in *WET* had appeared in Hogg’s miscellaneous periodical *The Spy* (1810-11), however one notable work of short fiction among the *WET* collection, ‘The Long Pack’, took a different path before being selected for the pages of the 1820 book. The 2002 S/SC edition of *WET* recognised the story as having ‘circulated as a chapbook previous to its appearance in *Winter Evening Tales* (and would continue to circulate afterwards...)’. The earliest circulating copy that Ian Duncan’s 2002 S/SC edition had located was an 1817 chapbook version published by George Angus in Newcastle Upon Tyne. ‘The Long Pack’ is thought to have been widely read and distributed in chapbook form across northeast England and the Scottish Borders before it appeared in *WET*. The chapbook versions of the ‘Long Pack’ present a different picture of readership. Peter Wood is among the scholars who have recently shown the extent to which Newcastle was a thriving centre for chapbook publication in Britain, which were generally cheap and widely circulated medium among the ‘lower classes’.<sup>75</sup> In a revised S/SC edition of *WET*, published in 2004, research by Janette Currie unearthed earlier versions of ‘The Long Pack’ which had appeared in magazines in both London and the USA as early as 1809.<sup>76</sup> Not only did the short story have chapbook origins as a widely circulated ephemeral piece in particular regions close to Hogg’s productive base, it had traces of circulation and transmission in periodicals and magazines in metropolitan centres in England and across the Atlantic. The circulation of the story therefore elides any neat national categorisation as a particularly ‘Scottish’ short story, despite *WET*’s positioning as a distinctively Scottish collection of authentic fragments of folk culture in its full title: *Winter Evening Tales, collected among the cottagers in the south of Scotland*.

---

<sup>75</sup> See Peter Wood, ‘The Newcastle Song Chapbooks’, in *Street Ballads in Nineteenth-Century Britain, Ireland, and North America: The Interface between Print and Oral Traditions*, ed. by David Atkinson and Steven Roud (Farnham and Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2014), pp. 59-76.

<sup>76</sup> Duncan, ‘Appendix: Hogg’s manuscript of ‘The Long Pack’’, in *Winter Evening Tales* 2<sup>nd</sup> edn. (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004), pp. 509-513.

The chronology of the tale's transmission is notable in that the international metropolitan periodicals published 'The Long Pack' before we find evidence of its regional chapbook circulation, so any assumptions about a stadial progression of literary vessels from the 'low' origins of the ephemeral chapbook, to the 'higher' status of literary magazines, and then to the even higher cultural authority of the collected book form, are complicated here. 'The Long Pack' appeared in various print formats prior to being collected for *WET*. The 1809 version appeared as a two-part serial between the October and November issues of the *Sporting Miscellany*, a London periodical magazine aimed at metropolitan gentlemen.<sup>77</sup> Indeed, Wood's work on northern English chapbooks has suggested that Newcastle, and other northern English centres, published material specifically aimed at Scottish audiences and pointed to evidence which suggested that a great deal of chapbook material published in Edinburgh in the eighteenth century was recycled material originally published in London.<sup>78</sup> Interestingly, the title of the story as it appeared in *Sporting Miscellany* in 1809 is different to that of its later chapbook counterparts. Entitled 'The Dead Shot, A Tale. By the Ettrick Shepherd', presented to a metropolitan London audience, 'The Long Pack' does not have the same specific regional located-ness that it was to be given in Northumbrian chapbooks. While it loses the northern English regionalism, it performs its authentic *Scottish* character by inserting the 'Ettrick Shepherd' in the title – 8 years prior to the launch of *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, and 13 years before the Noctean Shepherd emerged. By 1810 Hogg's story had crossed the Atlantic, appearing in New York's *Lady's Weekly Miscellany*, under the heading 'The Dead Shot. Or, the Long Pack', which had been 'lightly bowdlerised' for polite, metropolitan, and female sensibilities. The story also appeared in magazines in Richmond (*The Visitor*, March 1810) and Philadelphia (*Literary Register*, April 1814), with the latter returning to the original text of the London *Sporting Miscellany* version.<sup>79</sup> It seems fair to suggest that the London magazine version was the one transported to the US, showing the degree of inter-connectedness between the London and American literary marketplaces in the early years of the nineteenth century.<sup>80</sup>

---

<sup>77</sup> Duncan, 'Appendix: Hogg's manuscript of 'The Long Pack'', p. 510.

<sup>78</sup> Wood, 'The Newcastle Song Chapbooks', p. 69.

<sup>79</sup> Duncan, 'Appendix: Hogg's manuscript of 'The Long Pack'', p. 509.

<sup>80</sup> Duncan, 'Appendix: Hogg's manuscript of 'The Long Pack'', p. 510.

Comparing the different versions of ‘The Long Pack’ can offer some fruitful insights into understanding the significance of form in shaping how short stories function, and how Hogg’s author function was mediated by contexts of publication. Both the magazine and chapbook versions of the tale largely correspond to Hogg’s manuscript, held at Harvard. In *WET*, however, significant changes have taken place in the language of some sections of the story, which has implications for the narrative as a whole. Returning to the 1810 magazine version, the New York *Lady’s Weekly Miscellany*, the language in certain sections had been ‘lightly bowdlerised’ more befitting of a metropolitan female readership.<sup>81</sup> It is unclear who had made these changes, though it is possible that it was the American editors of that magazine as opposed to Hogg himself. Sex and gender are an important point of departure between the two versions. As Duncan has noted, the *WET* version of ‘The Long Pack’ strips Alice, the female servant of the house, of her youth, significantly altering the reader’s perception of the interaction between her and the traveller:

For it would be impossible to for him to keep his own bed and such a sweet creature lying alone under the same roof.<sup>82</sup>

Unlike the manuscript version, the *WET* story removes the suggestiveness of sexuality from that by suffixing to the sentence that ‘Alice was an old maid, and anything but beautiful’.<sup>83</sup> As Duncan has noted, ‘many of the variants between manuscript and winter evening tales show Hogg polishing his chapbook tale for a more genteel readership’.<sup>84</sup>

The muted sexuality of Alice is more than a passing detail. Indeed, the narrative, in its early stages, is focalised through Alice:

One afternoon as Alice was sitting spinning some yarn for a pair of stockings to herself, a pedlar entered the hall with a comical pack on his back. Alice had

---

<sup>81</sup> Duncan, ‘Appendix: Hogg’s manuscript of ‘The Long Pack’’, p. 509.

<sup>82</sup> Hogg, ‘The Long Pack’, *WET*, pp. 130-140 (p. 130).

<sup>83</sup> Hogg, ‘The Long Pack’, p. 130.

<sup>84</sup> Duncan, ‘Appendix: Hogg’s Manuscript of ‘The Long Pack’’, p. 511.

seen as long a pack, and as broad a pack; but a pack equally long, broad, and thick, she declared she never saw. It was the middle of winter, when the days were short, and the nights cold, long, and wearisome. The pedlar was a handsome, well dressed man, and very likely to be a very agreeable companion for such a maid as Alice, on such a night as that.<sup>85</sup>

Although this is in the third person, there are subtle suggestions that it is Alice who is ‘telling’ the story. She is the one ‘spinning some yarn’. We, as readers, are pointed towards what Alice sees: the pack looks ‘comical’ to Alice, and the pedlar is ‘handsome’ and a potentially ‘agreeable companion’. Her sexuality may be muted in *WET*, though it has not been smothered outright. We are informed, in the third person, what she had seen in the past, and how her experience frames her understanding of the present scene. Indeed, ‘she declared’ that she had never saw a pack so long. It is not clear to whom she is declaring, given that we have already been informed that she is ‘to herself’. Towards the end of the narrative, we are told that Edward, Alice’s fellow servant, lives his later life on the Scottish side of the border. It is midway through the second last paragraph that the narration switches from third to first person: ‘I have often stood at [Edward’s] knee and listened with wonder and amazement to his stories’.<sup>86</sup> This is the ‘I’ of Hogg’s author function, the Ettrick Shepherd. Hogg’s connection to the narrative is thus revealed through the layers of retellings: he has heard the tale directly from Edward who experienced it, who has, through Alice’s ‘declaring’ in the opening paragraphs, constructed elements of the story from other tellings. In the relation of those layers of retelling, we have, like Edward, crossed borders – the Northumbrian tale by the Ettrick Shepherd has become a Scottish tale, ‘collected among the cottagers’ for a story in a book consumed by readers in Edinburgh, Berlin, Vienna, Philadelphia and New York.

In a flourish of self-reflexive satire upon the Edinburgh literary marketplace in its final edition in 1811, Hogg’s short-lived periodical *The Spy*, and its associated author function Mr. Spy, ‘was executed, the dead body given up to his friends, where buried,

---

<sup>85</sup> Hogg, ‘The Long Pack’, p. 130.

<sup>86</sup> Hogg, ‘The Long Pack’, p. 140.

remains a secret until this day'.<sup>87</sup> In *WET*, Mr Spy makes a partial return. Many *WET* stories including 'Maria's Tale', 'A Peasant's Funeral', and 'The Dreadful Story of MacPherson' were all originally published in *The Spy*. However, the collected book form has muted Mr Spy. In 'Maria's Tale', for example, the periodical editor's note expressing sympathy and support for the ill-fated protagonist cast aside by patriarchy at the end of the story has been removed in *WET*. In *The Spy*, 'A Peasant's Funeral' is framed by 'An Encounter With John Miller', in which Mr Spy meets with a Scots-speaking south of Scotland shepherd with literary ambitions in Edinburgh – a nod to Hogg's author function at play within the text - who proceeds to 'tell' the story of the funeral. This material is removed when the story appears in *WET*. Traces of Mr Spy, which had been so visible in the layers of storytelling in Hogg's 1810-11 magazine, have been removed in *WET*. Nevertheless, it is through the discourses of authenticity which shaped Hogg's author functions – the cultural authority of the margins, of labouring-class and 'peasant' culture – that the 'secret' of Mr Spy's burial can be located. *Winter Evening Tales* staked its claim to authenticity not only in its subject content but in its subtitle: *collected among the cottagers in the south of Scotland*. Hogg's performance of authenticity is textually restrained outwith its *Spy* origins, losing much of the dialogic magazine framings. Hogg's authenticity project is nevertheless performed through paratexts, including in title subheadings of volumes, and within the narrative themselves, through the storytelling 'I' of the Ettrick Shepherd repurposed from magazine to book within the portable short story form.

#### The Shepherd's Calendar: *subverting the Noctean Shepherd*

Hogg's 1829 collection of short stories, *The Shepherd's Calendar*, reflects Hogg's attempted reclamation of the Ettrick Shepherd identity by means of the book form collection by offering an insight into how stories in a specific periodical, *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, were transported into a more 'tangible' medium. The example of *Shepherd's Calendar*, however, also shows the limitations of Hogg's authorial control over stories and the performance of authenticity within them in this move from magazine to book. The 'Shepherd's Calendar' series originated in *Blackwood's*

---

<sup>87</sup> 'Familiar Epistles to Christopher North, from an Old Friend with a New Face.' in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, Vol. 10 (1821), p. 45.

*Magazine*, though it also appeared as a collected edition in two volumes published by Blackwood's in 1829, in a significantly extended series compared to that which had appeared under the same name in *WET*. In a similar fashion to the processes of collection and bowdlerization discussed above, James Hogg's nephew, Robert Hogg, at the behest of the publisher, William Blackwood, extensively edited the stories collected for the 1829 *Shepherd's Calendar*. In the S/SC edition of the 1829 *Shepherd's Calendar*, Douglas Mack wrote that:

the 'Shepherd's Calendar' stories from Blackwood's form a coherent group; and the present volume is offered in the belief that, if seen as a group and read in the original versions, they combine, like the stories of Joyce's Dubliners, into a resonant and convincing portrait of the life and spirit of a particular society.<sup>88</sup>

Mack's S/SC edition looks to rediscover the 'authentic' *Shepherd's Calendar* series 'as Hogg wrote them',<sup>89</sup> removing the changes made to the stories by Robert Hogg, unearthing a 'coherent group' of collected stories offering an 'convincing' mimesis of rural lowland Scots, their culture and traditions. Killick, writing of the 1829 collection, grants it high praise and a place in the canon of Romantic short fiction:

In spite of the harsh editing it received in its collected version, *The Shepherd's Calendar* remains one of James Hogg's finest prose works and perhaps the best collection of traditional and regional tales from the Romantic period. Its stories combine to produce a positive vision of provincial existence that avoids both sentimentalisation and heroicisation of rural life.<sup>90</sup>

Despite this critical acclaim, *Shepherd's Calendar* did not prove a commercial success in the way that *WET* had.

Three stories appeared in the 1829 publication which Mack decided against inclusion in the S/SC edition, because they had not appeared in the original *Blackwood's* series under the 'Shepherd's Calendar' title. Those stories, 'Nancy Chisholm', 'The

---

<sup>88</sup> Mack, 'Introduction', *Shepherd's Calendar*, p. xix.

<sup>89</sup> Mack, 'Introduction', *Shepherd's Calendar*, p. xix.

<sup>90</sup> Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 53.

Marvellous Doctor’, and ‘A Strange Secret’, do appear, however, in the S/SC edition of *Contributions to Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine*. Although Mack desired to create a ‘coherent group’ in his editorial decisions in his 1995 research edition, the diffuse nature of the ‘Shepherd’s Calendar’ – between the *Blackwood’s Magazine* series, the Blackwood’s collected volumes, the S/SC *Shepherd’s Calendar* edition and the S/SC *Contribution to Blackwood’s* editions – is resistant to any rounded sense of ‘totality’.

The first story in the collection, ‘Storms’, establishes the ethnographic authority and authenticity to which the book lays claim. The narrator explains how storms:

constitute the various areas of the pastoral life. They are the red lines in the shepherd’s manual – the remembrancers of years and ages that are past – the tablets of memory by which the ages of his children the times of his ancestors and the rise and downfall of families are invariably ascertained.<sup>91</sup>

Storms, then, are more than a meteorological phenomenon affecting pastoral life, they are part of the texture of storytelling, memory and community in rural peripheries. They are ‘tablets of memory’, to which ‘traditionary stories’ are tied.<sup>92</sup> ‘It is said’ that the snow drift stood for 13 days;<sup>93</sup> ‘it is said’ only 40 out of 20,000 Eskdalemoor sheep survived.<sup>94</sup> What ‘was said’ constitutes a central element of the storytelling. The narrative source of oral culture is accompanied by personal testimony, as the narrator explains how ‘I myself witnessed one particular instance of this...’.<sup>95</sup> The ‘Ettrick Shepherd’ is positioning his experience of the pastoral to assert the *Calendar’s* claim to rural authenticity. As Mack explains of the 1829 *Shepherd’s Calendar*:

This account is presented partly through reminiscences of Hogg’s own early days, and partly through his attempts to re-create on paper the manner and the content of traditional Ettrick oral story-telling.<sup>96</sup>

---

<sup>91</sup> Hogg, ‘Storms’, *Shepherd’s Calendar*, pp. 1-21 (p. 1).

<sup>92</sup> Hogg, ‘Storms’, p. 1.

<sup>93</sup> Hogg, ‘Storms’, p. 1.

<sup>94</sup> Hogg, ‘Storms’, p. 2.

<sup>95</sup> Hogg, ‘Storms’, p. 4.

<sup>96</sup> Mack, ‘Introduction’, *Shepherd’s Calendar*, p. xi.

The 'Ettrick Shepherd' of the Blackwoodian *Shepherd's Calendar* series was, as discussed in chapter two, a contested authorial identity, one subject to appropriation, theft and subversion at the hands of Wilson and Lockhart's Noctean Shepherd. The 1829 *Shepherd's Calendar*, on the other hand, represented a more controlled environment in which Hogg could perform his authenticity as a labouring-class rural autodidact, and reassert agency over the 'Ettrick Shepherd' as an author function. The collected book form of short fiction was less open to dialogic interference than was the intertextual 'swirl' of *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, although traces of the magazine can be found in the collection such as the reference to the 'Chaldee Manuscript' and to Christopher North, the pseudonym of *Blackwood's* John Wilson.<sup>97</sup>

The narrator places himself within the narrative of 'Storms'. He tells the reader that a group of young shepherds had formed their own literary society, of which he was a member.<sup>98</sup> They would meet to discuss, debate and circulate essays and texts. The storm struck as the narrator had set off with a 'flaming bombastical essay' in his pocket, preventing his attendance at the meeting of the shepherd's literary society.<sup>99</sup> The storm's ferocity was enough to 'arouse every spark of superstition that lingered among these mountains – It did so – It was universally viewed as a judgment sent by God' for the surreptitious meeting of the literary society, which had in the eyes of the community engaged in 'some horrible rite, or correspondence with the powers of darkness'.<sup>100</sup> Rumours among the community abound regarding the literary society's 'deil raising', and are retold by the narrator: 'I think I remember ... every word'.<sup>101</sup> It is an eyewitness account that proves significant in addressing the supernatural rumours among the community. 'I [...] shall give it verbatim as nearly as I can recollect', explains the narrator, who then switches into the 'I' of the first-hand eyewitness narrative.<sup>102</sup> A young female servant, who had been privy to the literary meeting, is questioned on whether they had been raising the devil:

---

<sup>97</sup> Hogg, 'Storms', p. 17; Hogg, 'Dogs', *Shepherd's Calendar*, pp. 57-67 (p. 57).

<sup>98</sup> Hogg, 'Storms', p. 5.

<sup>99</sup> Hogg, 'Storms', p. 5.

<sup>100</sup> Hogg, 'Storms', p. 15.

<sup>101</sup> Hogg, 'Storms', p. 16.

<sup>102</sup> Hogg, 'Storms', p. 17.

‘What were they saying about *him*?’

‘I thought I aince heard Jamie Fletcher sayin that there was nae deil ava.’<sup>103</sup>

For the community, the suggestion that there is no such thing as a devil is as blasphemous as is meeting to raise him: “‘Ah! The unworldly rascal! How durst he for the life o’ him! I wonder he didna think shame... I hope nane that belangs to me will ever join him in sic wickedness!’”.<sup>104</sup>

The suggestion that the literary society were discussing radical texts on secularism, politics and atheism, and the way in which the narrative binds that to folk-belief in the devil and a punishing God, renders ‘Storms’ less a pastoral tale of harsh weather, and more an exploration into inter-generational tensions and competing sources of authority between the textual and oral, as rural traditions encounter and encroaching modernity. “‘Oo they were just gaun through their papers an’ arguing’”, explained the young woman who had witnessed the literary meeting.<sup>105</sup> For the community, however, those papers and those arguments presented as perilous a threat as did the sheep-burying snowdrift.

In ‘Storms’, (or ‘Snow-storms’, as Robert Hogg’s edition rendered the title in 1829), layers of storytelling –personal testimony, collective and individual memory, and orality – are embedded within the narrative. These layers embody a variety of interpretations regarding the narrative and its meanings. The story refuses resolution by the narrator, whose brother convinces him of the ‘falsehood and absurdity of the whole report’ of the eyewitness account.<sup>106</sup> Narrative authority of one interpretation of the story is suggested through the level of detail in the first-hand account, further strengthened by the narrator’s focalisation shift to the ‘I’ of the eyewitness. Yet that narrative authority is subverted by the narrator’s brother’s dismissal. A Lukácsian paradigm of resolution is found wanting.

---

<sup>103</sup> Hogg, ‘Storms’, p. 18.

<sup>104</sup> Hogg, ‘Storms’, p. 18.

<sup>105</sup> Hogg, ‘Storms’, p. 18.

<sup>106</sup> Hogg, ‘Storms’, p. 19.

The inability of ‘Storms’ to present a totalised narrative to the reader is significant to our consideration of short story collections as a as a form. Kasia Boddy has written on American short fiction anthologies, and referred to the early nineteenth-century US critic C. Alphonso Smith whose work on the role of the short story, a form associated with regional variety, in constructing a national literature in America stressed ‘variety in unity and [...] unity in variety’.<sup>107</sup> A national literary form which embodied, rather than stymied, regional variety could be found in a fusion of the novel and the short story:

An alternative way of conceiving of the relation between the local and the national was to recognise that any one story merely represented a single component of American experience and that only when many such perspectives were ‘pieced together’ [...] would a ‘complete’ picture of the whole emerge. On this view, the ‘big book’ was not redundant but simply needed to take a new form – that of an anthology of short stories.<sup>108</sup>

The anthology, then, could contain within it what Horace Kallen called ‘cultural pluralism’, and what Brandeis described as ‘a language of nation that would convey ‘differentiation’ without chaos, coherence without ‘uniformity’’.<sup>109</sup>

Hogg’s *Shepherd’s Calendar* stories reflect that sense of local differentiation within a nationalist framing, in a similar way to *WET* having been ‘collected among the cottagers in the south of Scotland’. As well as ‘Storms’, other stories in *Shepherd’s* embody Smith’s ‘unity in variety’. ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream, and the Sequel’ opens with the narrator situating the narrative in a specific region of southern Scotland, and grounds the narrative authority in orality and personal experience:

In the year of 1807, when on a jaunt through the valleys of Nith and Annan, I learned the following story on the spot where the incidents occurred, and even

---

<sup>107</sup> Boddy, p. 147.

<sup>108</sup> Boddy, p. 146.

<sup>109</sup> Boddy, p. 147.

went and visited all those connected with it, so that there is no doubt with regard to its authenticity.<sup>110</sup>

As in ‘Storms’, narrative authority and issues of ‘authenticity’ are foregrounded. The text’s treatment of locality is given a specific located-ness in ‘the valleys of Nith and Annan’. The narrative’s references to the sexual pursuit of Tibby by her employer, as Mack noted, were downplayed through edits made by Robert Hogg in the 1829 collection version of the story,<sup>111</sup> which had originally appeared in *BEM*, reflecting a similar process of editorial censorship of sexuality to that discussed above in ‘The Long Pack’. While the *BEM* story contains the line in which Tibby’s employer ‘it is likely to be a long while before you and I part, if I get my will’, Robert Hogg cuts the line ‘if I get my will’ from the *SC* version.<sup>112</sup> ‘In the nature of things’, argues Mack, ‘a story of a sexual pursuit loses something if all the references to sex are carefully removed’.<sup>113</sup>

The dream to which the story’s title refers is Tibby’s. In it, Mr. Forret, her employer, lies with his throat slit though neither ‘dead, nor yet dying, but in excellent spirits’.<sup>114</sup> Rooks, hooded crows and ravens pick out his eyes, ‘some his tongue, and some tearing out his bowels’, and Forret ‘appeared much delighted, encouraging them on all that he could’.<sup>115</sup> A raven devours Forret’s heart to end his life. The narrator explains that ‘this was precisely Tibby’s dream as it was told to me, first by’ one friend and then by another who Tibby had related it to the morning after the dream.<sup>116</sup> The dream turns out to be a ‘Twa Corbies’-infused vision of the future, as Tibby finds Forret lying dead behind a dyke after losing his fortune and found guilty of criminal proceedings.<sup>117</sup> The

---

<sup>110</sup> Hogg, ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream’, *Shepherd’s Calendar*, pp. 142-162 (p. 142).

<sup>111</sup> Douglas Mack, ‘Hogg, Blackwood’s and The Shepherd’s Calendar’ in *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference, Edinburgh 1985*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1988), p. 30.

<sup>112</sup> Mack, ‘Introduction’, *Shepherd’s Calendar*, p. xviii.

<sup>113</sup> Mack, ‘Introduction’, *Shepherd’s Calendar*, p. xviii.

<sup>114</sup> Hogg, ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream’, p. 152.

<sup>115</sup> Hogg, ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream’, p. 152.

<sup>116</sup> Hogg, ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream’, p. 152.

<sup>117</sup> ‘The Twa Corbies’ was a popular Scottish ballad about two crows picking at the remains of a human corpse, references to which appeared across Hogg’s texts. See Valentina Bold, ‘*Nature’s Making*’: *James Hogg and the autodidactic tradition in Scottish poetry*. (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Glasgow, 1997), p. 203; Elaine E. Petrie, *James Hogg: a study in the transition from folk tradition to literature* (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Stirling, 1980), p. 93.

narrator couches the narrative authority of dreams in the pastoral othering of urban life:

A city dream is nothing but the fumes of a distempered frame, and a more distempered imagination; but let no man despise the circumstantial and impressive visions of a secluded Christian; for who can set bounds to the intelligences existing between the soul and its Creator?<sup>118</sup>

Tibby, a poor young woman subject to the dual oppressors of patriarchy and class, emerges as the story's heroine thanks to her rural character. Furthermore, the narrator's rhetorical address assumes a 'distempered' metropolitan reader, and in part addresses their imagined rational explanation of the story as the 'impressive visions of a secluded Christian' in Scotland's rural – and backward – peripheries. Scottish regionality in the text is self-referentially differentiated from the metropolitan, and its narrative authority is rooted in a performance of authenticity through the textual traces of orality and the retelling of the stages the story passed through before it reached the narrator.

Douglas Mack has written on the textual differences between the *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* version of 'Tibby Hyslop's Dream' and the 1829 *Shepherd's Calendar* version of the tale edited by Robert Hogg, which can give an insight into the limitations of the book as a site for Hogg's reclamation of the 'Ettrick Shepherd'. The phrase 'in a wee cottage', appearing in the magazine original, becomes 'in a cottage' in the 1829 *Shepherd's Calendar*, and 'from thence nobody where' becomes 'from thence nobody knew whither'.<sup>119</sup> 'Singly', argued Mack in 1985, 'such changes are of no great consequence', though 'cumulatively – and they are very numerous – they destroy the conversational tone'.<sup>120</sup> As well as the diminishment of 'authentic' orality, Robert Hogg's amendments diminished the sexual content of the tale, discussed above, and made textual edits to sections which may have proven

---

<sup>118</sup> Hogg, 'Tibby Hyslop's Dream', p. 161.

<sup>119</sup> Mack, 'Hogg, Blackwood's and The Shepherd's Calendar', in *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference, Edinburgh 1985*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1988), p.29. For a complete overview of textual alterations between the two versions see Mack, *Editing James Hogg* (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Stirling, 1984), pp. 126-40.

<sup>120</sup> Mack, 'Hogg, Blackwood's and The Shepherd's Calendar', p. 30.

controversial on religious grounds, so ‘the kindest man that ever the Almighty made’ became ‘the kindest man that ever existed’.<sup>121</sup> On evidence of *The Shepherd’s Calendar*, Hogg’s short stories underwent a more rigorous editorial process in their publication in book format collections than they had done in their magazine formats. While the book form allowed Hogg a format through which he could reassert agency over the identity of the Ettrick Shepherd, the publishing history of *The Shepherd’s Calendar* show the limits to authorial agency and the book form in the literary marketplace.

*‘Auld friends’ with new faces*

At the opening of ‘Wat Pringle o’ the Yair’ in *Montrose*, Wat calls upon the house of a character named Robin Hogg. Robin asks:

‘But wha is it that’s sae kind as to speer?’

‘An auld friend, Robin, an’ ane that never comes t’ye wi a new face.’<sup>122</sup>

As the story progresses, it becomes clear that Wat does have more than the one face, as he hides an Irishwoman from discovery by the Selkirk community, the community to which both Wat and Hogg’s narrator is so closely bound, to protect her from reprisal in the wake of the Battle of Philiphaugh. Hogg’s author functions, among which could be included his namesake Robin in ‘Wat Pringle o’ the Yair’, had many ‘new faces’, not all of which Hogg himself was behind. Whether they appeared in the context of the periodical, like ‘A Scots Mummy’, or in the context of a short story collection, as in ‘Wat Pringle’, those ‘faces’ of authorial identity within short stories were conditioned by the forms of publication in which they appeared.

The move from magazine to book characterised much of Hogg’s short story output during his literary career. In the periodical environment, Hogg was afforded much less control over the author function than he was in the book format. In *Blackwood’s Magazine*, Hogg’s Shepherd was subverted by a pejorative stereotype of his class and

---

<sup>121</sup> Mack, ‘Hogg, Blackwood’s and The Shepherd’s Calendar’, p. 30.

<sup>122</sup> Hogg, ‘Wat Pringle’, p. 191.

his culture in *Noctes Ambrosianae*, authored by individuals who occupied a more privileged economic, cultural and social position than Hogg. In the case of *The Spy*, Hogg's author function 'was executed' at the hands of a hostile Edinburgh literary marketplace. Hogg's short story collections represent an attempt to seize control of the means of production of author function associated with the Ettrick Shepherd. The book format story collection was, however, far from a *carte blanche* for Hogg to exercise unfettered authorial agency. As the experience of bowdlerization in *The Shepherd's Calendar* shows, the book format brought with it different editorial processes which shaped the look of and the readings within a short story.

For Foucault, the role of discourse is key in shaping, and contesting, the author function. In the case of Hogg, it was discourses of authenticity – orality, regionality, and labouring-class culture – which present the grounds upon which the Ettrick Shepherd, and its associated authorial identities, was contested. His story collections sought to wield those signifiers of authenticity in their paratextual material and within the stories themselves. Reading the texts as part of a collection allows for those discourses to be bound together through the 'connective tissues' of narration and the author function. In *Tales of the Wars of Montrose*, for example, the narrator corroborates the historical short stories through his own personal connection to the oral culture of the south of Scotland alongside the 'empirical' historicism of print. What emerges is a historical and narrative aesthetic of 'variegation' grounded in the textual performance of authenticity, an aesthetic strengthened through reading the text as a collection. In *Altrive Tales*, the author function is more explicitly performed through the inclusion of autobiographical materials stressing an autodidactic and labouring-class authenticity which interact with the fictional texts within the collection.

Hogg's short story 'The Long Pack' appeared at various points in chapbook and periodical contexts before (and after) it was collected into book format in 1820. Its history therefore reflects the way in which the 'fragments' of a diffuse body of short stories located across forms were collected into what Hogg described as 'some tangible form'. At the end of 'The Long Pack', the body of the man who had been

shot remains unclaimed and the corpse's identity, like the narrative in which it exists, is unresolved. Where 'The Long Pack' ends in burial, 'A Scots Mummy' ends in grave-digging as the dead interrupt the living. Hogg's book format collections of short stories could partially revive 'dead' author functions, like *The Spy*'s mutation into *WET*, and reclaim contestable living author functions, like *The Shepherd's Calendar* and the Noctean Shepherd. Between those formal contexts, and within the form of the short story itself, the Ettrick Shepherd emerges not as a single discernible 'face', but as a fragmented and variegated totality, 'complete with missing parts'.<sup>123</sup>

---

<sup>123</sup> Hunter, 'Complete with missing parts', p. 6.

## CHAPTER FOUR: An Ettrick Shepherd in London: bringing the margins to the metropolis

I hate London.<sup>1</sup>

Studies in ‘Romanticism’ have long taken 1832 as the cut-off point for thinking about Romantic-era periodicity in English-language literature. Hogg’s writing career overlaps that temporal disjunction. Although shaped by particular circumstances in his relationships with powerful publishers like William Blackwood of Edinburgh, Hogg’s experience of writing and publishing periodical short stories in the early 1830s reflects a broader change in the diminishment of Edinburgh’s status as the literary capital of the UK, as he increasingly looked to London to publish material and to engage in the contested authorial identities surrounding the Ettrick Shepherd. ‘I hate London’, wrote Hogg in a letter to his wife, Margaret, in January 1832, and the celebrity status he encountered in the English capital brought with it vexed issues concerning literary identity, the functions of authorship, and notions of authenticity. This chapter explores the complexity of Hogg’s experience of publishing in London, including Hogg’s own desire to move beyond Scotland and Edinburgh in an effort to divest himself of the Noctean stereotypes, as argued in chapter three, particularly as it related to the failed *Altrive Tales* project with the London-based publisher James Cochrane. Hogg’s experience of publishing stories in London magazines also involved the economic and literary necessity of publishing outside of Scotland post-Blackwood’s, as his relationship with the Edinburgh publishing giant broke down completely, and involved the mixed motives of London publishers and editors, such as Cochrane, in their uses – and abuses – of Hogg and the celebrity of the Ettrick Shepherd.<sup>2</sup> In his short stories published in London magazines during his lifetime, Hogg partly played up to expectations surrounding the literary identity of the Ettrick Shepherd and the commercial opportunities it represented, and partly divested himself

---

<sup>1</sup> Hogg’s letter to Margaret Hogg, 10 June 1832, quoted in *The Collected Letters of James Hogg Vol. 3, 1832 to 1835* (hereafter cited as *Letters Vol. 3*), ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), p. 7.

<sup>2</sup> Cochrane’s *Metropolitan* was more interested in the commercial potential of the Ettrick Shepherd than in Hogg *per se*. See the anonymous review of *The Club Book* in the first number of the *Metropolitan* (August, 1831), pp. 146-148.

of the Ettrick Shepherd, a dialectic of authorial agency and publishing functions which was shaped by the *Blackwood's* 'co-option' of Hogg in the Noctean Shepherd, the breakdown in relations between Hogg and *BEM*, and by the role of publishers and editors in London.<sup>3</sup>

Hogg visited London in the first two months of one of the most significant years in the study of Scotland's and the UK's nineteenth century. Sir Walter Scott died in September 1832, three months after the Reform Act had received royal assent (Hogg remarked that the passing of the Act had proven the final burden for Scott to bear).<sup>4</sup> Hogg experienced something like a celebrity status during and after his London visit, and had, 'rather unexpectedly, been the lion of the London social season'.<sup>5</sup> In spite of his initial protestations to his wife, it didn't take long for Hogg to start having a more positive experience of the English capital. A letter, again to Margaret, sent 21 January 1832, describes how he had been at many parties, often until 'far in the morning'.<sup>6</sup> Hogg established new, and strengthened existing, connections with publishers and editors in London, particularly among the city's expatriate Scots literary community. Letters to the editor of the London periodical *Fraser's Magazine* change from 'Dear Sir' to 'Dear Frazer' after his visit to the city. As well as literary connections, Hogg established relationships among the political elites, including the two-time Conservative Prime Minister Sir Robert Peel (dubbed 'Orange Peel' by the Irish nationalist leader Daniel O'Connell) who was later able to use his political influence to secure two payments of cash to Hogg. Indeed, if Hogg's friend Lord Montague was to be believed, there were suggestions of a proposed knighthood for Hogg whilst in London.<sup>7</sup> This never came to fruition, but it does suggest the celebrity that Hogg had as a Scottish writer in London, where the 'name of Burns is necessarily coupled with

---

<sup>3</sup> It is worth noting here that Hogg contributed both original material to London magazines and had material reprinted, in magazines such as *The Olio* and *The New Casket*. Full analysis of how reprinting as a form of cultural production shaped Hogg's short stories appears in chapter five in the discussion of American periodical reprinting. 'Co-option' is Schoenfield's phrase. See p. 8 of Schoenfield's *British Periodicals*.

<sup>4</sup> Hogg, *The Domestic Manners and Private Life of Walter Scott* (Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, 1834), p. 131.

<sup>5</sup> Hughes, 'Introduction', *The Collected Letters Vol. 3*, pp. xiii-xlvi (p. xxx).

<sup>6</sup> Hogg's letter to Margaret Hogg, January 1832, *Letters Vol. 3*, p. 14.

<sup>7</sup> *Letters Vol. 3*, p. 50.

mine',<sup>8</sup> and also suggests the liminal position of Hogg as an outsider with a (sometimes unsteady) foothold in centres of power.

This chapter argues that Hogg used the form of the periodical short story to perform his 'authentic' marginality to a metropolitan London audience through a process of 'self-othering' which involved the curation of an authoritatively explanatory authorial voice and identity. These texts distanced themselves from their implied readership, not just in terms of the subject content (including supernaturalism, folk belief, and labouring-class rural life, thematic features well-established in Hogg scholarship), but in the form the narratives took. The aesthetic of the Hoggian short story was by this stage in his career well-established, characterised by interrogative strategies of reader participation, multi-layered narrational perspectives in the representation of speech and thought, and a self-referential textuality which included raising questions of narrative authority within texts. His short stories commonly involved the deployment of vernacularity as style, in which orality is conceived as an effect of print rather than print as a realist depiction of authentic orality. As I have argued throughout this thesis, these features are a function of the form of the portable short story and its context(s) of publication. In order to show that, this chapter reads Hogg's stories published in the London periodical press and explores how their narratological strategies, in conjunction with their contexts of publication, function towards the authenticating discourses of 'other-ness' of marginalised labouring-class and rural Scottish culture. The chapter situates those formalist close readings within histories of the London periodical publishing trade.

*Fraser's Magazine* has attracted more attention from Hogg scholars in recent years, and its particular post-Blackwoodian history provides a considerable insight into the workings of the London-Scots literary marketplace. The Scot James Cochrane, who is discussed in more detail in chapter four in the study of Hogg's book format publishing ventures in London, is a significant figure in Hogg's London periodical short story output. In a letter to Alexander Elder, of 14 January 1833, Hogg wrote 'I

---

<sup>8</sup> Hogg's letter to Margaret Hogg, January 1832, *Letters Vol. 3*, p. 14.

never saw a more hopeless and absurd thing in the world than [Cochrane's] Metropolitan!!'.<sup>9</sup> In spite of this, Hogg published short stories in *The Metropolitan* and possibly even played an editorial role in the magazine during his 1832 London visit, the title of which is suggestive of the margins-metropolis dialectic dramatised within the texts.<sup>10</sup>

*The 'Real' Shepherd? Hogg's 'Barber of Duncow'*<sup>11</sup>

In an anonymously published review of the works of Leith poet Robert Gilfillan for Cochrane's London magazine *The Metropolitan* in 1832, Hogg laments what Walter Benjamin would later describe as the 'mechanical age of reproduction',<sup>12</sup> 'by which [a publisher] can manufacture capital poetry at a penny a page' by tearing out a leaf of an existing book or magazine and using a machine to 'grind him off as much as he likes', to an extent that it 'defies any one to distinguish the difference between the original composition and the imitation'.<sup>13</sup> To guard against 'unauthenticated' cultural production in which a signature does not equate to originality, Hogg explains that 'we have let Gilfillan speak thus copiously for himself' by printing whole poems without alteration.<sup>14</sup> This argument partly reflects Hogg's anxiety surrounding his own authorial identity and authenticity, particularly in relation to his experience of *Noctes* and the Ettrick Shepherd. It is also significant because this expression of anxiety concerning how author functions are shaped by contexts and means of (re)production appears in a London magazine.

One of the central claims of this thesis is that contexts of publication and reception shape how short stories function. Looking at one example of Hogg's stories which

---

<sup>9</sup> Hogg's letter to Alexander Elder, *Letters Vol. 3*, p. 119.

<sup>10</sup> *Letters Vol. 3*, p. 121.

<sup>11</sup> Hogg, 'The Barber of Duncow. – A Real Ghost Story by the Ettrick Shepherd', *Fraser's Magazine* (hereafter cited as *FM*), 3 (March, 1831) <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=B3A-AQAAMAAJ&pg=PA174>> [accessed 3/6/2019] pp. 174-80

<sup>12</sup> Walter Benjamin (1936), *The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction* <<http://www.marxists.org/reference/subject/philosophy/works/ge/benjamin.htm>> [Accessed 21/02/2019]

<sup>13</sup> Anon. [James Hogg], 'Original Songs by Robert Gilfillan', *The Metropolitan*, 3 (March 1832), p. 65.

<sup>14</sup> [Hogg], 'Original Songs by Gilfillan', p. 67.

appeared in London, and its abridgement in another London magazine, can give an example case study of how this process looks in the case of Hogg in London. The portable short story could appear very shortly after an ‘original’ appearance as a reprinted version within a different magazine. One of Hogg’s *Fraser’s Magazine* stories, ‘The Barber of Duncow’ (March 1831), described as ‘one of Hogg’s finest extended piece in Scots,’<sup>15</sup> appeared the following month in another London periodical, *The New Casket*. The *Fraser’s* original contained the subtitle ‘ – A Real Ghost Story by the Ettrick Shepherd’. The *New Casket* version omits this detail from the longer title, altering how the story is being positioned in terms of its treatment of authenticity, narrative and authorship. The stress on the ‘Real’ is significant in terms of the structure of the storytelling within the original version of the story. The title’s foregrounding of the author function in its naming of the Ettrick Shepherd also shapes meaning within the story, given Hogg’s broader authorial project of proximity to ‘authentic’ discourses of labouring-class and rural culture in the south of Scotland which involves a distancing between the text and the implied London audience. It also suggests the extent of the celebrity of the Ettrick Shepherd persona in London and the assumption that London readers will know what it encapsulates as a literary identity, and the complex claims to authenticity within it.

The *Fraser’s* version of ‘The Barber of Duncow’ is a self-referential narrative in which the layers of retelling and processes of storytelling are foregrounded in the text. The opening paragraph sketches the moment of recital, depicting the event of storytelling:

As Will Gordon, the tinkler, was sitting with his family in his original but wretched cottage, called Thief’s Hole, one winter night, the dialogue chanced to turn on the subject of apparitions, when his son-in-law, Hob, remarked, that he wondered how any reasonable being could be so absurd as to entertain a dread of apparitions.<sup>16</sup>

The narrative voice here is, as suggested by the story’s full title, that of the Ettrick Shepherd. It is the only section of the narrative in which the Ettrick Shepherd functions

---

<sup>15</sup> Douglas Gifford, *James Hogg* (Edinburgh: Ramsey Head Press, 1976), p. 205.

<sup>16</sup> Hogg, ‘Barber of Duncow’, *FM*, p. 174.

as the 'I' of the storyteller. The narrative then turns toward directly reported Scots speech of the character Will Gordon, who reproaches his son-in-law for his disbelief. In the opening sections of the story, we are already being presented with an interrogation of the 'real' in supernatural storytelling. The story is, after all, positioned by the Ettrick Shepherd as 'A Real Ghost Story'.

Until Penny Fielding included it in the 1996 monograph study *Writing and Orality*, 'The Barber of Duncow' had escaped detailed analysis in Hogg criticism, although it had not been altogether ignored. Douglas Gifford in 1976 identified the storyteller as Will, the 'tinkler'. It is not Will who tells the main thrust of the narrative, however, but his 'goodwife':

For a' that, I hae heard the goodwife there tell a story that frightit me sae ill I hardly kend what I was doing. Aye, whether I was fa'ing off the stool, or sitting on't, or sinkin down through the grund or rising up i' the air. ... Goodwife, tell us the story o' the Barber o' Duncow.

Will is a layer in the storytelling, passing on the telling role to his wife, but he does not function as the teller in the way Gifford had suggested. There are reasons for Gifford's reading, which come under new light below in a comparison of textual differences between the *Fraser's* original and *New Casket* 'abridged' reprint. Will's directly reported speech functions to frame the narratives within the story, and it also performs a self-referential role in the text by drawing attention to responses to the storytelling. He has already 'heard' the story that is now being retold in print and is recounting his 'frightit' reaction. The character Hob, Will's son-in-law, also acts as a hearer-response to the telling, what Fielding called 'hearing-acts',<sup>17</sup> and in doing so functions as an allegory for the implied London reader-response rooted in a metropolitan rational view of 'auld world' stories. The capitalisation of the story title within the narrative is another facet of the 'The Barber of Duncow's' foregrounded story-ness.

---

<sup>17</sup> Penny Fielding, *Writing and Orality*, p. 80.

It is Will's wife Raighel who tells the story about the ghost and events in the village of Duncow, near Dumfries:

‘Ohon an’ it’s een lang, sir, I tried to tell that tale, Willie,’ said old Raighel, with a grin and a snivel, ‘but sin ye desyre me, I’ll e’en try’t. It has only ill clag that till’t that story, an’ it’s this: when any body hears it, an disna believe it, the murdered woman is sure to come in.’

The issue of truth and narrative is turned toward the ‘hearer’ response. This playful take on the processes of storytelling is again centred upon the rational ‘hearer’ Hob. Through the repeated gauging of his response, the story presents an interrogative model of reader-response. It is for the reader to interrogate the ‘real’ in a narrative which tests the ability of the disbelieving to be ‘frightit’ by storytelling. As Fielding argued, the story ‘blurs the distinction between the hearth of the superstitious Gordon family and the drawing-rooms of the readers of *Fraser’s Magazine* by extending its fictional audience to include its actual readership.’<sup>18</sup>

In *The New Casket* ‘The Barber of Duncow’ is ‘Abridged from Frazer’s Magazine for April’. This processing of ‘abridgement’ significantly alters both the structure of the narrative and the reading of meanings within it. It removes some of the layers of the telling and takes away the moment of recital as a performative storytelling event introduced by the ‘I’ of the Ettrick Shepherd. Instead, the story cuts the opening seven paragraphs and goes directly to what was previously introduced as Raighel’s retelling:

‘It is a queer town, this Duncow’, said Will Gordon, the tinkler, as he was sitting with his family.<sup>19</sup>

The teller in the *New Casket* version has switched from Raighel, the ‘goodwife’ of the original, to Will. Douglas Gifford read Will as the teller, perhaps because there is not a reportage clause in the original to demarcate the directly reported speech between the seventh and the eighth paragraph, when the story ‘proper’ commences. We know

---

<sup>18</sup> Penny Fielding, *Writing and Orality* p. 124

<sup>19</sup> Hogg, ‘Barber of Duncow’, *The New Casket* 14 (April, 1831), 105-109 (p. 105).  
<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=qs88G62QO4MC&pg=PA105>>[accessed 3/7/2019]

the teller has become Raighel because when Hob interrupts the narrative in the *Fraser's* version, he says:

‘Oh, mercy, grannie, dinna tell nae mair,’ cried little Hobby.<sup>20</sup>

It is Hobby’s ‘grannie’ Raighel who is telling the story that Hob interrupts, not his grandfather Will. Indeed, the *New Casket* abridged story removes Hob from the narrative altogether, including his interruption when his disbelieving rationality begins to falter. This diminishes the complexity of how the *Fraser's* narrative engages with ideas of truth and the ‘real’.

The complexity of storytelling and narrative voice in ‘The Barber of Duncow’, including hearer and reader response, is heightened in the *Fraser's* version and diminished in the *New Casket* abridgement. The teller explains in the *Fraser's* story:

Ye ken it’s no our way to mind sic things a great deal, but we maun conceive sic characters, or else we canna tell the story, nor yet comprehend it.<sup>21</sup>

This self-referential approach to telling, and responding to, a story is hence lost in the abridged reprint. The last paragraph of the story returns to this interrogative method of storytelling, and makes reader reaction integral to the story:

This is the hale story of the barber; but the most curious part is, that if the tale be accurately tould, and one of the hearers or more should doubt its verity, the ghost o’ poor Grizel to this day comes in in the same guise, and gives its testimony. An’ mair by token, I hae a test to try you a’ wi’,’ she took a lamer bead out o’ her pocket, and held it to her own ear, then to the baby’s on her knee – the lurcher began to bristle and look frightened, uttering short, smothered barks, the pup followed the example – ‘Hush! What’s that at the door?’ –<sup>22</sup>

The above paragraph is cut altogether from *The New Casket* version. Issues of ‘verity’, accurate telling and testimony are thus removed too, as is the story’s climactic ‘reach-

---

<sup>20</sup> Hogg, ‘Barber of Duncow’, *FM*, p. 175.

<sup>21</sup> Hogg, ‘Barber of Duncow’, *FM*, p. 177.

<sup>22</sup> Hogg, ‘Barber of Duncow’, *FM*, p. 180.

out' to the reader through the knock-at-the-door motif. This is an example of the same types of processes which affected Hogg's texts elsewhere, such as in Robert Hogg's changes to the *Shepherd's Calendar* (see chapter three) in 1829, and in the 'bowdlerisation' of the Victorian-era. These textual alterations involved the removal of some of the more radical literary features of Hogg's writing, signalling a retreat of the author function from an association with modernity, to the realm of tradition where the nexus of authenticity – at the levels of both authorship and narrative – lies with essentialist categories of place, class and 'wild auld world stories'.<sup>23</sup> Indeed, one reading of Hogg's *Altrive Tales* project, a project based with Cochrane in London, is that it sought to privilege his claims to modernity rather than tradition by creating a collected edition only of his fiction, rather than the rural and folkloric poetry for which he was much better known. His association with the latter is represented in the illustration which appears alongside the *The New Casket* version of the *Barber of Duncow*, in which a woman and three men, the storytelling community depicted in the narrative, are raised from their seats and recoiling from a white ghostly female figure.<sup>24</sup> The men are kilted, one wears a Balmoral bonnet, and the woman wears a tartan shawl. Before London readers begin to read the first line of the story, they are shown by the magazine that this is a *Scottish* story about supernatural traditions. The modernity of Hogg's prose fiction – its self-reflexivity and textual portability – is reduced to signifiers of Scottish national traditions, nine years after George IV's visit to Edinburgh orchestrated by Scott in a pageantry of tartanism. Hogg's anxiety about the uses and abuses of authorial identities in the processes of cultural production as expressed in his Gilfillan review in *The Metropolitan* is not without justification in London.

#### *Beyond Blackwood's: Fraser's Magazine and Hogg's move to London*

In his later career, James Hogg had short story contributions published in *Fraser's Magazine*, as discussed above. *Fraser's* also had close connections to *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, and discussion of Hogg's stories in the magazine gives a further insight into the complexity of Hogg's encounter with London, including how it was

---

<sup>23</sup> Hogg, 'Barber of Duncow', *FM*, 177.

<sup>24</sup> Hogg, 'Barber of Duncow', *The New Casket* (April 1831), p. 105.

shaped by *Blackwood's*. Founded by the Scot Hugh Fraser and the Irishman William Maginn in London, the magazine was characterised by its ultra-Tory politics and its post-Blackwoodian literary aesthetics, presenting itself as 'functioning as a kind of freewheeling literary republic'.<sup>25</sup> The magazine sought to replicate the literary aesthetics of *BEM* as a periodical, embracing the deployment of satire, anonymity and personal attack, an approach which led to a violent assault on the editor James Fraser (who had taken over from his namesake Hugh) by an angry aristocrat in 1836 whose mother had been insulted within the magazine.<sup>26</sup> The subsequent duel and civil lawsuit were heavily publicised, not least within the pages of *FM* itself, adding to the notoriety of Fraserian culture. The magazine, founded in 1830, quickly became a literary focal point for the London-Scots writing community:

The *Blackwood's* circle was a fertile ground from which Fraser (himself a Scot) and Maginn recruited some of their best-known writers, including James Hogg and John Galt. John and Thomas Carlyle were close friends of their neighbour Edward Irving, a charismatic preacher who, after moving to London, soon became immersed in writing for periodicals and encouraged the Carlyles to join him. Carlyle was also associated at one remove, through his friendship and admiration for his fellow Scot Allan Cunningham, with what remained of the circle of writers who had looked to Sir Walter Scott in Edinburgh for encouragement and support. Fraser's contributors among these included R. P. Gillies, whose father was Scott's old friend and neighbouring landowner, poet Joanna Baillie, Cunningham and his son Peter, and Scott biographer and Maginn intimate John Gibson Lockhart.<sup>27</sup>

Indeed, Maginn drew up plans for his London magazine only after himself being temporarily banned from *BEM*.<sup>28</sup> The magazine was to be more *Blackwood's* than *Blackwood's*.

---

<sup>25</sup> Patrick Leary, 'Fraser's Magazine and the Literary Life, 1830-1847', *Victorian Periodicals Review*, 27.2 (1994), 105-126 (p. 110).

<sup>26</sup> Leary, p. 110.

<sup>27</sup> Leary, p. 115.

<sup>28</sup> Leary, p. 107.

Gillian Hughes argued that FM was the magazine most suited to Hogg's fiction in his later career, not least because it paid well.<sup>29</sup> As Patrick Leary explained in a 1994 essay on *Fraser's*:

Fraser also decided on the amount to be paid for material, personally handling the negotiations with potential contributors. By the custom of the trade, authors were paid according to how many pages of a number they filled; thus the standard payment method for articles and fiction was so much per "sheet." One sheet equalled sixteen pages of *Fraser's*, each issue of which contained eight sheets, or 128 pages. The rush to start new magazines in the 1830s led to a welcome escalation in prices paid for articles and stories. Publisher Henry Colburn was said to be offering as much as twenty guineas per sheet for his *New Monthly Magazine*, while the *Quarterly* was routinely paying about sixteen guineas.<sup>30</sup>

Hogg experienced multiple frustrations in his efforts to have his work published with William Blackwood from the late 1820s, forcing him to look beyond Edinburgh to publish his periodical stories in order to 'keep the banes green'.<sup>31</sup> 'I fear it is needless', wrote Hogg in a letter to Blackwood in June 1831, 'for me to attempt any thing farther for *Maga* without giving up writing for the London Magazines which I would with great pleasure do could I please you'.<sup>32</sup> Writing to his wife in January 1832, while he was in London, Hogg enclosed money 'which I received from Mr. Fraser, which you must make go as far as you can.'<sup>33</sup> Hughes explains that:

*Fraser's Magazine* showed itself more receptive to certain areas of Hogg's work than *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* as well as more receptive than the *Annuals*. With this in mind, it might be supposed that *Fraser's Magazine* gradually superseded the Edinburgh publication as the most important outlet for Hogg's fiction in the last years of his life. From the commencement of the

---

<sup>29</sup> Gillian Hughes, *James Hogg's Fiction and the Periodicals* (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1981), p. 272.

<sup>30</sup> Leary, p. 108.

<sup>31</sup> Quoted in Tim Killick, *British Short Fiction*, p. 15.

<sup>32</sup> Hughes, *James Hogg's Fiction and the Periodicals*, p. 259. The exchanges between Hogg and Blackwood in December 1831 suggest that the breach is total and final by that point. See also *The Collected Letters of James Hogg Volume 2, 1820-1831*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2006).

<sup>33</sup> Leary, p. 109.

magazine in February 1830 thirteen of Hogg's tales were printed there [...] in the same period only six tales appeared in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*.<sup>34</sup>

One such story rejected by Blackwood was 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic'. Hogg had likely submitted the short story to *BEM* in the later months of 1829 or early 1830, and requested the manuscript be returned in a letter to Blackwood in February 1830.<sup>35</sup> In April 1830, Hogg sent more stories to Blackwood:

I inclose you two tales though in my opinion no better than the two returned. At least the one The Tale of the Black art I can find no fault with it excepting too much of the broad Aberdeen dialect. The merits of the other 'The Lunatic' is rather equivocal. I will however try it in London.<sup>36</sup>

Hogg tried the story in London with *FM*, and it was published in the magazine the following December.

As Douglas Mack and Thomas C. Richardson have noted respectively, there are significant textual differences between the published *FM* and the unpublished *BEM* manuscript versions of 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic'.<sup>37</sup> Each version shares the epistolary format (by now a well-established trope in Hogg's fiction),<sup>38</sup> and both are written mostly in the first-person of the fictional correspondent, James Beatman. However, the *FM* version altered who the correspondent was writing to. The version published in the London magazine also included additional material at the end of the story in the form of a short letter from someone who claims to have known the original correspondent and offers witness accounts of the events within Beatman's narrative. An example of what Ian Duncan called 'authenticity effects' in relation to the 'real' letter form in Hogg's *Justified Sinner* and 'A Scots Mummy', this authenticating

---

<sup>34</sup> Hughes, *James Hogg's Fiction and the Periodicals*, p. 258.

<sup>35</sup> Thomas Richardson, 'Notes', *Contributions Vol. 2*, p. 394.

<sup>36</sup> Quoted in Mack, *Editing James Hogg*, p. 141.

<sup>37</sup> See Mack, *Editing James Hogg*, pp. 141-161; Thomas C. Richardson, 'Notes', *Contributions Vol. 2*, pp. 394-397.

<sup>38</sup> See, for example, 'A Scots Mummy' (*BEM*, 1823), 'Affecting Narrative of a Country Girl' (*The Spy*, 1810), 'Maria's Tale' (*WET*, 1820), and 'A Singular Letter from Southern Africa' (*BEM*, 1829).

device has a tangible effect on how the story can be read in comparison to the *BEM* version.<sup>39</sup>

The full title of the story as it appeared in *FM* was ‘Strange Letter of a Lunatic, to Mr James Hogg, of Mount Benger’. The manuscript submitted to *BEM*, however, was titled ‘to Christopher North, esq.’. Christopher North was the pseudonym of one of *BEM*’s principal drivers and personalities John Wilson. Although the satirical *Blackwood’s* series *Noctes Ambrosianae* (1822-1835) was published anonymously, Wilson penned over half of the 71 dialogues.<sup>40</sup> One of the main characters in the series was the ‘Ettrick Shepherd’, presenting a class-based pejorative mimicry of Hogg’s speech, perceived manners and literary style. Like ‘A Scots Mummy’, which appeared in *BEM* in 1823, the manuscript of ‘Strange Letter’ submitted to *BEM* functioned as a riposte to Wilson’s stereotype of Hogg and his work by situating itself in relation to *Noctes* through the inclusion of ‘North’ in the title. It does this by taking the themes of *Noctes*, particularly the ‘doubling’ of Hogg’s associated author functions and the troubling of ‘authenticity’ in relation to authorship and authority, and making them the subject of the story and its authenticating textual devices. As Richardson argues, the snuff box which appears in the opening sections of the story can be read as a reference to the ‘Chaldee Manuscript’ which appeared in the first edition of *BEM* in 1817, a ‘found manuscript’ narrative written in mock-biblical style, originally authored by Hogg and subsequently extensively revised and amended by Wilson and Lockhart before it appeared in the magazine’s controversial inauguration.<sup>41</sup> In ‘Chaldee’, William Blackwood is characterised as being fond of snuff. The unpublished *Blackwood’s* version of ‘Strange Letter’ in particular, then, can be read as an allegory for the relationship between Hogg and *BEM*.<sup>42</sup> In ‘Strange Letter’, Beatman takes snuff from ‘a strange looking figure of an old man’<sup>43</sup> on the castle hill in central Edinburgh, before being troubled by the figure of the doppelganger.

---

<sup>39</sup> Duncan, ‘Authenticity Effects’, pp. 93-116.

<sup>40</sup> ‘Overview: *Noctes Ambrosianae*’, *Oxford Reference*  
<http://www.oxfordreference.com/view/10.1093/oi/authority.20110803100236329> [accessed 03/09/2018]

<sup>41</sup> Richardson, ‘Notes’, p. 396.

<sup>42</sup> Richardson, ‘Notes’, p. 396.

<sup>43</sup> Hogg, ‘Strange Letter of a Lunatic to Mr James Hogg, of Mount Benger’, in *The Devil I Am Sure: Three Short Stories by James Hogg*, ed. by David Robb (Glasgow: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2017), pp. 55-70 (p. 55).

Beatman loses agency over his selfhood, in the same way that Hogg lost agency over his authorial identity in the Ettrick Shepherd(s) of *BEM*.

The *FM* version removed the layers of anonymity in its titling by naming ‘James Hogg, of Mount Benger’ as the ‘Sir’ to whom the letter addresses. As well as altering the story’s relation to the specifics of the Edinburgh literary marketplace, the inclusion of Hogg in the titling affects how the additional framing material functions, included in the *Fraser’s* version but not in the *BEM* manuscript. Hogg includes an editorial post-script to Beatman’s letter, in which he introduces another, much shorter, letter from Alexander Walker. The narrative voice in the adjoining section is James Hogg’s, in which he situates himself within the layers of storytelling through a stated personal connection to a character in the narrative:

[Beatman’s] letter puzzled me exceedingly, and certainly I would have regarded it altogether as the dream of a lunatic ... having once met with Mr Walker, of Crowell, at the house of my friend Mr Stein, the distiller, I wrote to him, requesting an explanation of these circumstances ... His answer was as follows:-<sup>44</sup>

Walker then becomes part of the storytelling rather than merely a character in the tale. The final section of the story is Walker’s letter, which provides witness testimony to events in Beatman’s narrative, including his supposedly being left in Stirling when Mr Walker went to the Highlands. Walker, in the accompanying letter, explains that ‘I took him from Stirling to Inverouran on the Black Mount with me in my own gig’.<sup>45</sup>

The second incident referred to in Walker’s letter is Beatman’s duel with his doppelganger:

This duel, is of all things I have ever heard of, the most mysterious. He was seen go by himself into the little dell at the head of the loch. I myself heard the two shots, yet there was no other man there that any person knew of, and still

---

<sup>44</sup> Hogg, ‘Strange Letter of a Lunatic’, p. 68.

<sup>45</sup> Hogg, ‘Strange Letter of a Lunatic’, p. 69.

it was quite impossible that the pistol could have been fired by his own hand. The ball had struck him on the right side of the head, leaving a considerable fracture, cut the top of his right ear, and lodged in his shoulder, so that it must have been fired at him while in a stopping position, or from the air straight above him. Both the pistols were found discharged, and lying very near one another.<sup>46</sup>

The ‘authenticity effect’ of Walker’s letter therefore alters the meaning of the narrative as a whole by suggesting that, rather than merely being ‘the dream of a lunatic’, there could be a supernatural explanation to events surrounding Beatman’s doppelganger. This lack of narrative closure through contra-explanatory devices is a widely recognised feature of Hogg’s work, not least in criticism of *Justified Sinner*. The *Fraser’s* version of ‘Strange Letter’ shows how the textuality of the periodical short story, particularly through the layering of epistolary formats within it, could function towards the Hoggian aesthetic of irresolution. My argument here partly echoes John Plotz’s description of Hogg’s short story aesthetic of ‘polydoxy’, characterised by between-ness, open-ness, and ‘inescapable variability’.<sup>47</sup> Plotz, however, neglects the role of the magazine as a mode of publishing in conditioning those aesthetics. I wish to stress in relation to ‘Strange Letter’ and *Fraser’s*, as I have throughout this thesis, the role of the magazine (and, indeed, the book) in shaping how short stories function.

The opening of ‘Strange Letter’ engages with the author functions associated with Hogg, and makes an appeal to explanation:

Sir; - As you seem to have been born for the purpose of collecting all the whimsical and romantic stories of this country, I have taken the fancy of sending you an account of a most painful and unaccountable one that happened to myself, and at the same time leave you at liberty to make what use of it you

---

<sup>46</sup> Hogg, ‘Strange Letter of a Lunatic’, p. 69.

<sup>47</sup> Plotz, p. 115.

please. An explanation of the circumstances from you would give me great satisfaction.<sup>48</sup>

To *FM*'s London audience, 'this country' is less clearly defined than in the unpublished *BEM* version, in which Scotland could be more readily assumed, than England or the United Kingdom. The function of the author in the text is foregrounded in the story's opening. In the *BEM* version, where the 'Sir' being addressed is Christopher North (or John Wilson), the phrase 'collecting all the whimsical and romantic stories' engages with the framing narrative of Hogg's short story 'A Scots Mummy' which appeared in *BEM* in 1823. In that story, North asks the Ettrick Shepherd for a tale of the 'phenomena of nature'. Hogg's story of grave digging, suicide and the suggested influence of the devil subverts any expectation of a bucolic narrative of sheep or dogs, as Hogg had, for example, contributed in the three-part 'Tales and Anecdotes of Pastoral Life' (1817) and in 'Further Anecdotes of the Shepherd's Dog' (1818). In the *FM* version, the 'Sir' is made clear to the reader to be James Hogg. It is Hogg, then, who takes on the mantle as the collector of fragments of a marginal culture, and who can bring these margins to the metropolis by publishing in London magazines.

The opening suggests that Hogg may be able to provide explanation for the events in the story. As discussed above, Hogg does this by including additional materials to authenticate Beatman's narrative, meanwhile strengthening the aesthetic of irresolution. The 'explanation' sought by the correspondent is left on unstable ground. In spite of this lack of narrative resolution, Gillian Hughes has argued that Hogg's

explanatory role may even have been emphasised rather than diminished by the removal from Edinburgh to London. In relating the two supernatural occurrences of 'Anecdotes of Ghosts and Apparitions' Hogg declares at one point, 'I like always best to tell a story with which I was some way connected, for in that case a man writes with more freedom and certainty'. Hogg claims

---

<sup>48</sup> Hogg, 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic', p. 55.

to have been an intimate friend of the hero of the first story, and to have discovered the body of one of the two principal characters of the second.<sup>49</sup>

Hogg's situates himself within the layers of retellings, either by naming himself as the addressee of a fictional letter then being communicated to a London periodical, or by placing himself within the narrative itself, as in 'Anecdotes of Ghosts and Apparitions'. In doing so, as Hughes argues, he positions himself as the authoritative explanatory voice of a community, bringing the Scottish margins to a British centre. *Fraser's*, as a focal point for London-Scots literature, presented Hogg with an ideal venue through which to authoritatively perform the margins to the centre.

*Bringing the margins to the metropolis: 'Some Terrible Letters from Scotland' and The Metropolitan Magazine*

*Fraser's* was an important medium through which Hogg staged encounters with the London literary marketplace, though it was not the only one. With the London-based Scot and aspiring publisher James Cochrane, Hogg published the book format short story collections *Altrive Tales* (1832) and *Tales of the Wars of Montrose* (1835), discussed in detail in chapter three. His work in *The Metropolitan Magazine*, particularly his 1832 short stories 'Some Terrible Letters from Scotland', shows how Hogg amplified the margins-metropolis dialectic, which had been evident in Hogg's Edinburgh projects such as *The Spy* and in *BEM*, for a London audience.<sup>50</sup> *The Metropolitan* was a London publication which was, like *Fraser's*, managed by Scots in the city, including the editor Thomas Campbell and the owner James Cochrane, with whom Hogg was already in contact in publishing plans for a collected volume series of fiction. The 'authentic' letters in Hogg's 1832 stories about the cholera epidemic from various (fictional) correspondents, are, according to the narrative's subheading as it appeared in the *Metropolitan*, 'communicated by the Ettrick Shepherd'. The title sets the tone for what follows – a mimesis of Scottish experience performed through 'authentic' fragments (taking the form of letters), guided by author

---

<sup>49</sup> Hughes, *James Hogg's Fiction and the Periodicals*, p. 265.

<sup>50</sup> Hogg, 'Some Terrible Letters from Scotland, communicated by the Ettrick Shepherd', *The Metropolitan*, 3 (April 1832)  
<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=GyMAAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA422&lpg>> [Accessed 21/02/2019] pp. 422-431.

function with the ability to ‘communicate’ it to a London print-consuming audience. The narrative voice of the Ettrick Shepherd operates between the letter submissions, and takes on an authoritative explanatory role of self-conscious cultural mediation, distancing the traditions of rural Scotland from the experiences and perspectives of a metropolitan readership. Through this process of self-conscious marginality, the text ‘others’ itself as different to the metropolis.

The ‘letters’ tell of various supernatural events associated with Scotland’s experience of the cholera epidemic in 1832.<sup>51</sup> Whilst in London, Hogg wrote north to his wife Margaret about the news reports of cholera in Scotland:

The accounts of cholera from Scotland are dreadful. Be sure to let no beggars come near the house I shall write to Dr Russell and request him to set guards at the public expense to prevent any from entering the parish. It is they who are carrying the infection over the whole country.<sup>52</sup>

Hogg’s story in *The Metropolitan* consisted of three ‘letters’ interspersed with short framing narratives from the perspective of the narrator, graphologically signposted through the deployment of squared brackets. These ‘connective tissues’ of narrative link together the three letters, which each share a thematic concern with cholera and formal appearance as a letter, though they are discrete narratives in their own right. ‘Some Terrible Letters’ could therefore be considered as a short-short story collection unto itself. Unusually for a Hogg narrative, the story is explicitly set contemporaneously, and engages with current events and news stories. Early in the narrative, that temporality is situated through reference to ‘that summer that Burke was hanged’:

DEAR SIR, - As I knew you once, and think you will remember me, - I having wrought on your farm for some months with William Colins that summer that Burke was hanged, - I am going to write you on a great and trying misfortune

---

<sup>51</sup> On this context see Joan McCausland, ‘James Hogg and the 1831-2 Cholera Epidemic’, *SHW* 10 (1999), 40-47.

<sup>52</sup> Hogg’s letter to Margaret Hogg, 5 February 1832, *Letters Vol. 3*, p. 24.

that has befallen to myself, and hope you will publish it, before you leave London, for the benefit of all those concerned.<sup>53</sup>

Burke was hanged in Edinburgh in 1829. The infamous Edinburgh body-snatchers, who had dug up graves in order to sell corpses illegally to medical schools, had captured the public imagination to the extent that the term ‘Burkers’ had entered into popular usage as a pejorative term to express distrust of the medical profession. What this does to Hogg’s story is to grant it a temporal situated-ness with contemporary events. As well as this temporality, the opening paragraph, cited above, in a by now well-used trope of Hoggian short fiction, situates the personal connection of the narrator - the ‘Sir’ to whom the letter is addressed, that being Hogg’s author function the Ettrick Shepherd – to the storytelling within the letter. This connection (‘I having wrought on your farm’) also performs the rural vocational and labouring-class identity of the narrator and author function to a London audience. Indeed, Hogg’s shift from Edinburgh to London in his later career is also evident in the story’s opening, with ‘before you leave London’.<sup>54</sup> The difference between Ettrick and London is staged in the story’s opening lines, referring already to both publishing context, author (‘Sir’) and implied audience (London readers).

As well as the reference to Burke, the story’s subject matter demarcates the text as a comment upon contemporary events and situates it within discursive trends in London’s periodical culture. Cholera began spreading rapidly through Europe in 1831, causing much alarm and panic in Scotland and across the United Kingdom. East Lothian was the first Scottish region to be affected by the epidemic. On hearing of the disease reaching Haddington, East Lothian in December 1831, the *Glasgow Herald* urged its readers away from panic:

---

<sup>53</sup> Hogg, ‘Some Terrible Letters from Scotland’, in *Tales of Love and Mystery*, ed. by David Groves (Edinburgh: Canongate, 1985), pp. 176-193 (p. 176).

<sup>54</sup> Hogg visited London in January and February, 1832. It is probable that ‘Some Terrible Letters of Scotland’ was written during that time, given Hogg’s proximity to London publishers and the temporal references within the narrative.

But when the circumstances connected with some of the cases are fully known, the alarm, naturally excited by the near approach of so dangerous a disease, will, we imagine, subside, or altogether vanish.<sup>55</sup>

An 1831 broadside showed less restraint on the cholera panic in Scotland:

The rich do pray with eyes upcast,  
The poor do hold a general fast,  
I hope they've stopt the plague at last,  
From coming into Glasgow.<sup>56</sup>

Rather than allaying panic, Hogg's narrative keys in to that fear through a mix of realism, particularly in terms of time and place, and supernaturalism. The first of the 'Terrible Letters' is from a fictional correspondent named Andrew Ker, who encounters cholera in Musselburgh, a town close to Haddington in East Lothian, near Edinburgh and around 50 miles north of Hogg's native Ettrick. The story was published just four months after the arrival of the disease in the location in which it is set. The spread of the disease was a particular fascination of Cochrane's magazine.<sup>57</sup> 'We have now evidence of the existence of the disease near, if not upon, our own shores', explained an 1831 article in *The Metropolitan*.<sup>58</sup> 'There can be no doubt that the dread of cholera is great', explains the anonymously authored article, but 'courage, generous but temperate living' should suffice to stem its spread, whereas 'the ignorance and prejudices of the lower orders will increase the mortality among them.'<sup>59</sup> Hogg's cholera story is from the perspective of those 'lower orders', and therefore acts in dialogue with prevailing trends within London's magazine culture of the early 1830s.

---

<sup>55</sup> *Glasgow Herald*, 30<sup>th</sup> December 1831.

<sup>56</sup> *Verses on the Report of the Morbus entering Glasgow*, 1831, National Library of Scotland, shelf mark: APS.3.96.5

<sup>57</sup> See Anon., 'Of our present state and future prospects on the cholera question', *The Metropolitan* Vol. 2 (November, 1831), pp. 332-337.

<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=zT45AQAAMAAJ&pg=PA332>> [accessed 21/02/2019]; Anon., 'Remarkable points connected with the epidemic cholera', *The Metropolitan* Vol. 3 (1832) pp. 328-448. <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=GyMAAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA422>> [accessed 21/02/2019]; Anon., 'Notices of new works: The history of the contagious cholera', *The Metropolitan* Vol. 2 (November 1831) p. 73. <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=zT45AQAAMAAJ&pg=RA1-PA73>> [accessed 21/02/2019].

<sup>58</sup> Anon., 'Of our present state', *The Metropolitan*, p. 332.

<sup>59</sup> Anon., 'Of our present state', *The Metropolitan*, p. 332.

The narrative addresses the implied London audience to other itself as a mimesis of a different and marginal culture:

It is amazing that the people of London should mock at the fears of their brethren for this terrible and anomalous plague; for though it begins with the hues and horrors of death, it is far more frightful than death itself; and it is impossible for any family or community to be too much on their guard against its baleful influence.<sup>60</sup>

It is suggested that London readers mock the fear and panic caused by the disease among non-metropolitan people of the countryside, examples of which are the experiences communicated in the letters in which a cholera victim rises from the dead, a Newfoundland dog is implicated in bringing cholera to a remote Gaelic-speaking community, and two ghostly sisters lead away their care-free mother who had likely brought cholera into their home. The ‘backwards’ beliefs and reactions of a marginal community, the Ettrick Shepherd’s community, are set apart from the London readership. The address to readers above follows the events recounted by the fictional correspondent Andrew Ker, in which he comes back to life after ‘dying’ of cholera:

the chillness of death had settled on my limbs and arms, and all the blood in my body had retreated to its conquered citadel; and a little before daylight I died.<sup>61</sup>

The ‘I’ in the above is the correspondent, Ker, and constitutes a layer of storytelling inside another, that being Hogg’s ‘communication’ of the letters as a contribution to the *Metropolitan*. This first-person narrative voice switches momentarily to the third, in order to indirectly report the speech of the doctor who ‘carried the news through the parish, that poor Andrew, the miller’s man, had died of a most malignant cholera’.<sup>62</sup> The first-person epistolary narrative, framed by the narrator’s commentary in squared brackets and by the story’s authorial subtitle, itself contains voices within a community. The doctor ‘carried the news’, and the knowledge of the community is

---

<sup>60</sup> Hogg, ‘Some Terrible Letters’, *Tales of Love and Mystery*, p. 181.

<sup>61</sup> Hogg, ‘Some Terrible Letters’, *Tales of Love and Mystery*, p. 178.

<sup>62</sup> Hogg, ‘Some Terrible Letters’, *Tales of Love and Mystery*, p. 178.

implied with Ker described as ‘the miller’s man’. In this way, what Walter Benjamin called the ‘thin layers of storytelling’ are displayed within the text and function towards the effect of ethnographic authenticity.<sup>63</sup> This closeness, which appears again at the end of the letter when Ker explains that ‘my name was Clapperton when I wrought with you’, is posited against the distance stressed through reference to the London readership.<sup>64</sup>

The reference to London readers and publishers appears again in the third letter of the story, which according to the narrator is:

.... the most hideous letter of all. We wish the writer may be quite in his right mind. But save in a little improvement in the orthography and grammar, we shall give it in his own words.<sup>65</sup>

The narrative voice then switches from the Ettrick Shepherd, who has made his authorial function of translation explicit with ‘a little improvement’ in orthography and grammar, to the narrative of the fictional correspondent:

SIR, - Although I sent the following narrative to an Edinburgh newspaper, with the editor of which I was well acquainted; yet he refused to give it publicity, on the grounds that it was only a dream of the imagination; but if a man cannot be believed in what he hears and sees, what is he to be believed in? Therefore, as I am told that you have great influence with the printers in London, I will thank you to get this printed; and if you can get me a trifle for it, so much the better.<sup>66</sup>

The letter acts, then, as an allegory for Hogg’s recent experiences of trying (and failing) to publish in Edinburgh with Blackwood, and instead looking to London. This authorial self-referentiality is given a typically Hoggian twist of tongue-in-cheek egotism, with the correspondent stressing Hogg’s ‘great influence with the printers in London’. The economic impetus of writing for money, one of the main reasons Hogg

---

<sup>63</sup> Benjamin, ‘The Storyteller’, p. 6.

<sup>64</sup> Hogg, ‘Some Terrible Letters’, *Tales of Love and Mystery*, p. 185.

<sup>65</sup> Hogg, ‘Some Terrible Letters’, *Tales of Love and Mystery*, p. 188.

<sup>66</sup> Hogg, ‘Some Terrible Letters’, *Tales of Love and Mystery*, p. 188.

looked to London as his publishing base in his late career, is referenced with ‘if you can get me a trifle for it’.

The second letter in the story again takes efforts to situate itself in relation to an implied London audience of the magazine:

I sent it a month ago to a friend in London, to put into the newspapers, but it never appeared; so if you think it worth while, you may publish it. But there be any paper or periodical that Campbell or Galt is connected with, I would rather it were sent to one of them, as they are both acquaintances and old schoolfellows, and will remember me very well.<sup>67</sup>

The Scottish writers Thomas Campbell and John Galt, acquaintances of Hogg, both lived in London at the time the story was published in the *Metropolitan*. It is possible that Hogg met with them during his trip to London in the early months of 1832. Hogg thus situates in the narrative in the literary marketplace of the London-Scots writing community. Again, the connection of the correspondent to writers, although this time not Hogg himself, is stressed. Where the Ettrick Shepherd was rooted in south-eastern Scotland, and eastern Dumfries and Galloway, Galt was a writer intimately connected with the western lowlands of Scotland. With locality and place in mind, the reference to Galt engages with the content of the story. The letter tells the ‘dismal account’ of cholera’s arrival to the west coast of Scotland via shipping. In Hogg’s story, the ship drops anchor in Gaelic-speaking ‘Argyleshire’, where the ‘natives had some way heard that the Cholera was come with the ship; but so little did they conceive what it was, that they were nothing afraid of coming in contact with me’:

But the most singular circumstance is yet to relate. On our return to the Clyde from Liverpool, where we rode quarantine, we learnt that the Cholera Morbus had actually broken out in that village [...] it was from thence that the disease was communicated to Kirkintilloch by a single individual.<sup>68</sup>

The columns of the *Glasgow Herald* reported the ‘Cholera Quarantine’ in February 1832: ‘in consequence to the cholera arriving at Kirkintilloch, all vessels [will] be

---

<sup>67</sup> Hogg, ‘Some Terrible Letters’, *Tales of Love and Mystery*, p. 185.

<sup>68</sup> Hogg, ‘Some Terrible Letters’, *Tales of Love and Mystery*, p. 187.

placed under a Precautionary Quarantine.’ This met immediate disagreement from sections of the readership of the *Herald*. ‘I oppose this... as being fraught with consequences of an injurious nature to the manufacturing trade’, detailed a letter from ‘the Member of the City’, despite being in favour of ‘some kind of medical surveillance’.<sup>69</sup> In a letter from James A Anderson of the Glasgow Chamber of Commerce to the *Glasgow Herald* in February 1832, Anderson warned that the ‘incalculable evils which would be the consequence to trade... aggravate to an infinite degree the poverty and distress of the manufacturing population’.<sup>70</sup>

Hogg’s 1832 story about cholera thus engages with contemporary events and news stories in a distinctive manner from the bulk of his short story output. As shown above, the narrative reflects Hogg’s experience of bringing the Ettrick Shepherd to London, referencing the London-Scots literary networks as well as referring to the economic reasons for the shift from Edinburgh and the need for ‘a trifle’ payment for the labour of writing. As in ‘The Unearthly Witness’ the story self-consciously brings the margins to the centre. The author function of the Ettrick Shepherd in ‘Some Terrible Letters’, as the story’s subtitle suggests, ‘communicates’ a collection of letters which function toward what Duncan described as ‘authenticity effects’.<sup>71</sup> The implied London audience is distanced within the text through the author function’s explanatory role which navigates the dialogue between supernatural ‘folk’ tradition, surrounding fears of an epidemic, and the temporal mimesis of experiences of cholera in Scottish towns and regions. It is also worth noting that ‘Some Terrible Letters’ does not itself constitute a totality. Rather than being a self-contained short story, it is a loose collection of thematically and formally linked narratives, woven together by the ‘connective tissue’ of the Ettrick Shepherd’s narration. Appearing as it did in *The Metropolitan*, the textuality of ‘Some Terrible Letters’ worked to underline the cultural authority of the Ettrick Shepherd as an authentic voice from the margins.

---

<sup>69</sup> *Glasgow Herald*, 3 February 1832

<sup>70</sup> *Glasgow Herald*, 6 February 1832

<sup>71</sup> Ian Duncan, ‘Authenticity Effects’, pp. 93-116.

*Witnessing a story: Fraser's, The Olio and 'The Unearthly Witness'*

Hogg's 1830 story 'The Unearthly Witness, by the Ettrick Shepherd' provides another example of how Hogg curated the textual effects of authenticity of both class and regional/national identities to an 'othered' London audience. Furthermore, it provides another case study of the material portability of Hogg's short stories within London's periodical culture. The story first appeared in *Fraser's* in September 1830 shortly before it appeared in *The Olio; or Museum of Entertainment*, a London periodical published and printed by Joseph Shackell, in the same month of 1830 as it appeared in *FM*, with the paratextual note: 'From Fraser's Mag.'<sup>72</sup> Like 'Strange Letter' discussed above, 'Unearthly Witness' takes the form of a letter, although the fictional addressee and correspondent is neither Hogg nor the Ettrick Shepherd. The title, unlike 'Strange Letter', does not name Hogg expressly, rather his associated author function the Ettrick Shepherd. In *The Olio* the story appeared across two weekly numbers, the first on Saturday 11<sup>th</sup> September 1830 and the second on Saturday 18<sup>th</sup> September 1830. In between is a miscellany of periodical contributions, reflecting what David Stewart calls the 'culture of miscellaneity' in the Romantic-era magazine.<sup>73</sup> The space between the two story segments includes an article on Roman custom, a piece of travel writing on Sweden, a poem by R. Jarman, and the posthumous letters of Hugh Delmore. Perhaps the most significant detail of the text, however, comes as the 'letter' is signed off, following which is an asterisk. At the foot of the same page is a note:

The date of the above letter is 1749 and is supposed to have been written by the Rev. R. Walker of the Episcopal communion, to a brother in office. If so, it must have been from some chapel in Morayshire, for undoubtedly Elgin must be the country town alluded to ... The original letter is directed to The Rev. J- S-n-n, Carrubers Close, Edinburgh.<sup>74</sup>

The narrative voice in the authenticating device of the footnote is the Ettrick Shepherd, the only time in the narrative in which Hogg operates as the speaking 'I'. The narrator

---

<sup>72</sup> Hogg, 'The Unearthly Witness, by the Ettrick Shepherd', *The Olio; or Museum of Entertainment* (September, 1830) <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=6t1PAAAAMAAJ&pg=PA177>> [accessed 3/7/2019] 177-183; 202-203 (p. 177).

<sup>73</sup> Stewart, 'Blackwoodian Allusion and the Culture of Miscellaneity', in *Romanticism and Blackwood's Magazine*, pp. 113-123 (p. 116).

<sup>74</sup> Hogg, 'The Unearthly Witness', p. 203.

in the first-person letter is the Episcopalian ‘Rev. Walker’. As well as functioning as an ‘authenticity effect’ to the narrative, the detail of the footnote equips the letter with local knowledge of the north-eastern Scottish Lowlands, ‘the heartland of Episcopalianism’ in Scotland.<sup>75</sup> This region is outwith the usual auto-ethnographic and geographic remit of the Ettrick Shepherd, whose stories are usually situated explicitly in the southern lowlands of Scotland, particularly in the Scottish Borders and Dumfries and Galloway.<sup>76</sup> This could be read as a broadening of Hogg’s ethnographic authority in relation to the London context of reception, amplifying his performance of authenticity in the English metropolis.

The form of the story is a textual mimicry of layers of telling, the Ettrick Shepherd communicating an ‘authentic’ letter to a London audience. The narrative itself reflects this thematic concern with layers of storytelling, not least in its suggestive title of a ‘witness’ account. Narrative authority is foregrounded in the text through a repeated stress upon the manner in which witness accounts relate to storytelling. ‘The scene’, in which the protagonist William Tibbers is accused of a crime by a rival claimant to inherited land, ‘was witnessed by twenty people, although none heard the accusation’.<sup>77</sup> The rival, a young baronet and soldier, brings with him a ‘witness’ to Tibbers’s alleged crime, called McGill.<sup>78</sup> ‘Hundreds of eyes saw’ their intense debate on a busy market day, which was ‘well remembered afterwards’.<sup>79</sup> The narrator situates his personal connection to events being told, in his retelling of the ‘extraordinary scene’ in which a supposed apparition gives witness testimony in a court causing a tragic courtroom crush killing nine, ‘of which I myself was an ear and eye witness, and even that was no decisive proof either way’.<sup>80</sup>

The narrator makes it clear to the reader that this is a story with missing parts:

---

<sup>75</sup> Rab Houston, *Scotland: A Very Short Introduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), p. 51.

<sup>76</sup> See for example ‘The Barber of Duncow’ (*FM*, 1831), ‘Story of the Ghost of Lochmaben’ (*Spy*, 1810), ‘Wat Pringle o’ the Yair’ (*Montrose*, 1835), and ‘The Bridal of Polmood’ (*WET*, 1820).

<sup>77</sup> Hogg, ‘The Unearthly Witness’, p. 179.

<sup>78</sup> Hogg, ‘The Unearthly Witness’, p. 179.

<sup>79</sup> Hogg, ‘The Unearthly Witness’, p. 179.

<sup>80</sup> Hogg, ‘The Unearthly Witness’, p. 202.

Here there is a great hole in the ballad, as the old singers were wont to say. My narrative must grow confused, because the real events are not known to me, nor, as far as I can gather, to mortal man.<sup>81</sup>

What ‘the people said’ is offered by the narrator to fill the gaps left by the ‘great hole in the ballad’.<sup>82</sup>

This then is the first great blank in the narrative, for I dare not even mention some of the reports that were current among the common people.<sup>83</sup>

The narrator, however, makes clear to the reader that information is being withheld as he refuses to write down the ‘crimes I dare not infer’.<sup>84</sup> By speaking for the voice of the community and the ‘common people’, the narrative functions towards its authenticating project shared by the epistolary form it takes, rooting itself in the oral culture of a local community.<sup>85</sup> As the story progresses, the uncanny events surrounding the disappearance of McGill and the young baronet are recounted and ‘the common people’ become ‘clamorous beyond measure’ in their distrust and disdain for Tibbers.<sup>86</sup> The story is left open, in characteristically Hoggian style. The competing sources of narrative authority – the voice of the ‘common people’, of the ‘crazy old woman’ who predicts Tibbers’s death and suggests his unspoken crimes in the story’s only instance of directly-reported Scots speech, and the narrator’s account in the letter – are left operating in an unresolved dialogic narrative tension.<sup>87</sup>

Hughes argued that in ‘The Unearthly Witness’:

the interpretative personality is not that of the author, but an Episcopal clergyman who narrates the story in a letter to a clerical brother. Walker is useful for he addresses an outsider as Hogg addresses the reader of the magazine. He is also a member of the community he describes without

---

<sup>81</sup> Hogg, ‘The Unearthly Witness’, p. 178.

<sup>82</sup> Hogg, ‘The Unearthly Witness’, p. 180.

<sup>83</sup> Hogg, ‘The Unearthly Witness’, p. 179.

<sup>84</sup> Hogg, ‘The Unearthly Witness’, p. 180.

<sup>85</sup> Hogg, ‘The Unearthly Witness’, p. 177.

<sup>86</sup> Hogg, ‘The Unearthly Witness’, p. 180.

<sup>87</sup> Hogg, ‘The Unearthly Witness’, p. 181.

unreservedly identifying his opinions with those of either the gentry or the common people.<sup>88</sup>

Like 'Strange Letter', the explanatory function of the author in the text is foregrounded in 'Unearthly Witness' through the form of the 'authentic' letter, and within the narrative itself. Positioning itself in the first person as a voice rooted within a locality, which can speak both for a community and to the outside world, Hogg's story, in form and in content, reflects his London periodical project of bringing the margins to the metropolis in his short stories. Hogg's treatment of the form here is characteristically interrogative, being both self-referential of its sources of narrative authority and favouring an aesthetic of irresolution and ellipsis. Part of Hogg's authoritative explanatory author function is, then, the inexplicability of a self-consciously marginalised world. Moreover, 'Unearthly Witness, by the Ettrick Shepherd' foregrounds the role of the Ettrick Shepherd as author function in its titling and in its paratextual footnote which operates as an authenticating device. Hogg's curation of authenticity as a narrative voice of the 'common people' – those marginalised in terms of class, region and nation - operates in dialogue with the literary aesthetic of Hogg's short stories and their situated-ness within their magazine contexts.

### *Conclusion*

Hogg's review of Robert Gilfillan in Cochrane's *Metropolitan* expressed anxieties surrounding the contest and control of the author function and its relation to contexts of production. His review stressed the need to authenticate the 'original' voice of writers, a concern which was particularly acute in Hogg's case given what Schoenfield described as 'a form of identity theft' in relation to Wilson and Lockhart's mimicry of the Ettrick Shepherd in *Noctes Ambrosianae*.<sup>89</sup> Hogg's Gilfillan review was published in London, and, after the complete breakdown in relationship with Blackwood, and, by extension, *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, London offered Hogg an opportunity to divest himself of the Noctean stereotype. His performance of authenticity in the marshalling of the discourses of marginality in terms of class,

---

<sup>88</sup> Hughes, *James Hogg's Fiction and the Periodicals*, p. 266.

<sup>89</sup> Schoenfield, *British Periodicals and Romantic Identity*, p. 8.

region and nation was amplified in his London short stories, which foregrounded a margins-metropolis dialectic within their narrative aesthetic of ellipsis, irresolution, reader participation in the explication of competing sources of narrative authority, and a self-conscious textuality. Hogg's encounter with London is, like his short story aesthetics, characterised by complexity. He was not 'free' of the Ettrick Shepherd, as the subtitles of 'Terrible Letters' and 'Unearthly Witness' suggest. The tartanised illustration printed alongside the bowdlerised *Casket* reprint of 'Barber of Duncow' suggests how national and regional stereotypes persisted to shape the author function of the Ettrick Shepherd, and an anonymous review of *The Club Book* in the first number of Cochrane's magazine in 1831 situated Hogg very much in the category of 'traditional voice' as opposed to a modern and experimental fiction writer. 'Though known over the whole reading world' explains the reviewer, Hogg is 'still every inch a shepherd', an 'honest countryman', and 'a poet of God's own making'.<sup>90</sup> '[Hogg's] pieces in prose are sometimes written in taste we cannot away with', but those literary transgressions are made up for by work in which 'the poet gets a ride on the airy broomstick of Scotch superstition'.<sup>91</sup>

---

<sup>90</sup> Anon, 'The Club Book', *The Metropolitan* 1 (August, 1831), p. 148.

<sup>91</sup> Anon, 'The Club Book', p. 148.

CHAPTER FIVE: Reprinting the Ettrick Shepherd: networks, authorship and the magazine short story in America

‘Hout man, no,’ said he, ‘write to the Ettrick Shepherd, Scotland, a’ the world kens him.’<sup>1</sup>

North American reprints of Hogg’s work represent an important, and understudied, area of his life and work. ‘The great majority of Hogg’s works, prose and poetry, were reprinted’, explains Andrew Hook, ‘and transatlantic critics and reviewers of the day were disposed to find much to admire in them’.<sup>2</sup> This chapter builds upon the earlier suggestive research of scholars such as Andrew Hook, R.J. Lyall and Janette Currie by tracing reprints of Hogg’s short stories in the North American periodical press and reading them in their ‘new’ contexts of publication. This chapter argues that reprints present a valuable site of cultural production for critics and scholars, allowing us not only to trace the presence of Hogg in transatlantic marketplaces at a formative point for the short story in America and its ‘cultures of reprinting’, but to critically re-appraise how we conceive of authorship within networks of cultural production. Transatlantic reprints present a challenge to concepts of authorial agency within the author function, as production shifts away from origination – what Walter Benjamin called ‘the cult of aura’ – towards iteration and re-production, which are, I argue, creative functions in literary production as much as origination is. Although there is very little evidence of Hogg having personal agency in the magazine reprinting of his work in North America, the textual portability within Hogg’s short stories, which foreground the role of the storyteller in navigating (and at times undermining) levels of narrative authority, mean that these stories carry within them Hogg’s ‘author function’ which was curated for ‘original’ sites of publication and was rooted in the authenticating discourses of class, region, and nation. The process of iteration, led by magazine editors, shaped how those authenticating discourses functioned as stories

---

<sup>1</sup> ‘A Visit to the Ettrick Shepherd by an American Tourist’, *American Monthly Magazine*, 3 (New York, 1834), 85-91 <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=3GzXAAAAMAAJ>> [accessed 3/5/2019] p. 89

<sup>2</sup> Andrew Hook, ‘Hogg, Melville and the Scottish Enlightenment’, *From Goosecreek to Gandercleugh: Studies in Scottish-American Literary and Cultural History* (East Linton: Tuckwell, 1999), pp. 116-134 (p. 128). See also R J Lyall, ‘Intimations of Orality: Scotland, America and the early development of the short story’, *Studies in Short Fiction* 36.3 (1999), 311-25.

were ‘translated’, without necessarily being textually altered, into new historical, national, and geographic contexts. The presence of reprints in America also emphasises the physical portability of the Hoggian short story form, which was able to migrate with relative ease thanks to its brevity and suitability for periodical editors, alongside the lack of international copyright law.<sup>3</sup> Portability, encompassing as it does both materiality and narrative aesthetics, joins ‘a growing scholarship devoted to connecting the history of material texts with a concern for aesthetics and literary form’.<sup>4</sup>

The previous chapters within the thesis have explored the portable Hoggian short story in various publishing contexts to stress Hogg’s agency in the textual and discursive processes relating to his associated author function(s). That agency fluctuated and was shaped and continually reshaped by particular power dynamics within the literary marketplace, including *Blackwood’s Noctes Ambrosianae* and the role of editorial policy and practice in book format versions of stories such as in *The Shepherd’s Calendar*. With reprints, the author function moves further away from James Hogg the writer, as stories circulated apparently without the input of Hogg himself. ‘I have no power over the American press’, wrote Hogg in a letter to American publisher Simeon De Witt Bloodgood, ‘save what I send you in Nos’.<sup>5</sup> I argue, however, that this process does not redirect us to the grave of the author. Rather, and returning to the substance of Foucault’s essay, if we conceive of authorship as a set of contested and contestable discourses operating through ‘a series of precise and complex procedures’, we can ask questions of the ‘modes of existence of this discourse’, including where it came from, how it is circulated and who controls it, rather than questions centred upon originality and ‘real’ authorship. American editors selected and circulated Hogg’s texts, though he did not exert full control over them. Perhaps even a *lack* of control is most characteristic of the pattern of reprinting in America. Furthermore, Hogg was aware of, and, as the historical record of his correspondence

---

<sup>3</sup> Collins, ‘Transnationalism’, p. 13.

<sup>4</sup> Joseph Rezek, *London and the Making of Provincial Literature: Aesthetics and the Transatlantic Book Trade, 1800–1850* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015), p. 7.

<sup>5</sup> Janette Currie, ‘Hogg in the Zodiac’, *James Hogg: Research, University of Stirling* <<http://www.jameshoggoriginal.stir.ac.uk/showrecord.php?id=56&fulltext=1>> [accessed 1/3/2018]

suggests, tacitly gave approval to and even encouraged, reprints of his American work. The author, traditionally understood, remains part of the story.

As well as showing how American reprints of his short stories involved Hogg's author function without Hogg having any direct personal involvement in their publishing, dissemination, and iteration, the following chapter emphasises the socialised nature of 'authorship' of texts beyond the figure of the individual author. Ryan Cordell, in a quantitative-driven study of reprints in antebellum newspapers, builds upon Meredith McGill's idea of the 'culture of reprinting' and 'decentralised mass production' of literature to argue that reprints in the periodical press are 'communally composed' socialised texts and proposes the concept of the 'network author' function.<sup>6</sup> In a very different context, that of the periodical comic press in the later twentieth century, Keith Friedlander has proposed the 'social function' of authorship, which can take into account the creative influence and agency of the editor. I apply that social function of the networked author to Hogg's North American short fiction reprints. Janette Currie's work on the transatlantic Hogg took a two-pronged methodological approach, which tracked what Currie called the 'physical migration' of Hogg texts, and examined how these contexts created different meanings among their new 'community of readers'.<sup>7</sup> Focusing upon Hogg's poetic material, her timeframe is relatively small (1807-16), and does not explore Hogg's short fiction, though her methodology provides part of the framework of analysis within this chapter, which traces the physical portability of short stories while, in Bella Brodzki's terms, 'tracking [...] meanings from one cultural sphere to another'.<sup>8</sup> Those meanings are the creative function of the editor's scissors, a creative function which does not, however, erase the author's pen.

### *Scotland and the 'American short story'*

---

<sup>6</sup> Meredith L. McGill, *American Literature and the Culture of Reprinting, 1834-1853* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003).

<sup>7</sup> Currie, 'Hogg in the American Literary Marketplace', in *Literary Marketplace*, pp. 219-234 (p.221, p. 222).

<sup>8</sup> Bella Brodzki, *Can These Bones Live? Translation, Survival, and Cultural Memory* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2007), p. 4.

Hogg's reprints appear at a key moment in the history of the short story in America. R. J. Lyall has argued that Hogg played an important role in its 'birth', influencing Hawthorne, Irving, Poe and Melville. Lyall's work, however, relied overly on suggestive connections, and while interesting to short story histories in Scotland and America alike, lacked the substantive transatlantic research to carry the claims beyond the suggestive. While beyond the scope of this thesis to fully explore the role of the Scottish short story in the birth of what was to become for many critics of the genre a quintessentially American form,<sup>9</sup> this chapter adds meat to the bones to Lyall's suggestive research by showing the extent of Hogg's American short story reprints and situating them within their contexts of publication. Thanks partly to a lack of international copyright law in America, British fiction was reprinted heavily in American magazines.<sup>10</sup> The short story form was particularly well-positioned for portability, given its brevity.<sup>11</sup> Lyall suggests that Hogg's early short fiction provided 'a model that would be adopted by Washington Irving' and Hawthorne, and argues that Hogg 'was an important influence on the creation of the short story in the US'.<sup>12</sup> The evidence for Lyall's claim lies partly in chronological coincidence of the formative years of 1810-30, during which Hogg 'progressed' from 'simple tales' to 'a much more literary technique', with the writing careers of, in particular, Washington Irving and Nathaniel Hawthorne. Lyall also deploys evidence from biographies and letters, citing Irving's visit to Abbotsford in 1817 where it is likely he encountered Hogg's work through the *Scots Magazine* and afterward displayed an intention to acquire a copy of Hogg's *The Brownie of Bodsbeck* (1818).<sup>13</sup> Hawthorne, in a letter to his sister Elizabeth in October 1820, reported that 'I have read Hogg's tales',

---

<sup>9</sup> Levy, p. 27. Levy cites Prescott's introduction to the *Norton Anthology of American Short Stories* (1988), Walton Litz's introduction to *Major American Short Stories* (1980), Heather McClave's introduction to *Women Writers and the Short Story* (1980), and Robert Lee's introduction to *The Nineteenth-Century American Short Story* (1985), all of which suggest that the short story is the American 'national art form'.

<sup>10</sup> For scholarship on the role of copyright laws in the reprinting of British texts in America in this period, see McGill, *Culture of Reprinting*; Collins, 'Transnationalism'; Rezek, *London and the Making of Provincial Literature*; Peter Baldwin, *The Copyright Wars: Three Centuries of Trans-Atlantic Battle* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2014); and Mark Rose, *Authors in Court: Scenes from the Theatre of Copyright* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2016).

<sup>11</sup> Collins argues this point similarly in 'Transnationalism', p. 13. He also suggests that 'the fact an editor did not need to commit to numerous 'episodes' month to month (as in the case of the serial novel), permitted its rapid and easy transmission within an Atlantic world where the financial success of a journal or publishing venture was often tenuous' (p. 13).

<sup>12</sup> Quoted in Currie, 'Hogg in the American Literary Marketplace', p. 219. See also Lyall, 'Intimations of Orality'.

<sup>13</sup> Lyall, p. 313; p. 314.

referring, most likely, to Hogg's 1820 short story collection *Winter Evening Tales*.<sup>14</sup> 'It does not require a great leap of the imagination', argues Lyall, 'to see in Irving's manipulation of oral narratives a response to the technique that Hogg had been developing since 1810'.<sup>15</sup> The present discussion pushes beyond the realm of the imagination in order to substantiate the influence of the Scottish short story in America by tracing its portable reprints in the case of Hogg.

In English-language short story theory and criticism, the idea that the short story is a quintessentially American genre is a prominent one.<sup>16</sup> Andrew Levy's 1993 monograph on the American short story, which sought to push back against the perceived 'newness' of the genre by historicising the form as one with a 'substantial heritage' while problematising the notion of the form as an inherently marginal one, recognised the role of magazines and reprints in the early to mid-nineteenth century.<sup>17</sup> Poe fought against international copyright laws that created unfavourable conditions for American authors by allowing legal piracy of British fiction, warning in 1843 that 'if we do not defend ourselves by some such coalition, we shall be devoured, without mercy'.<sup>18</sup> Levy argues that the 'magazinish' Poe sought in his famous treatise on the form in his 1842 review of Hawthorne's *Twice Told Tales* to encode within the genre the qualities and characteristics of his magazine project, which he intended to construct as a 'high site of cultural production'.<sup>19</sup> Although John Plotz has described Hogg's short story aesthetic as 'almost anti-Poe' in its lack of singleness of effect, Hogg was, like Poe, a magazinist.<sup>20</sup> The role of magazines in Hogg's short story writing career has been recognised by Penny Fielding, and it is an important aspect overlooked by Plotz.<sup>21</sup> One of his first major publishing ventures was his own magazine project, *The Spy* (1810-11). He was a key figure in the founding of *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* in 1817. He published original stories in London magazines, in Dublin magazines, and in magazines further afield. To Poe's chagrin,

---

<sup>14</sup> Lyall, p. 315.

<sup>15</sup> Lyall, p. 315.

<sup>16</sup> Levy, p. 27.

<sup>17</sup> Levy, p. 9, p. 57.

<sup>18</sup> Levy, p. 19.

<sup>19</sup> Levy, p. 21.

<sup>20</sup> Plotz, p. 115.

<sup>21</sup> Fielding, *Writing and Orality*, pp. 122-125.

Hogg's stories, in mostly iterative rather than original forms, also appeared in American magazines.

Hogg was aware of his textual presence in America. In 1834, the *American Monthly Magazine* reported a conversation between Hogg and American visitor to Hogg's home in Altrive the previous year:<sup>22</sup>

'They tell me', said he again, 'that my writings are kent in America.' I answered that they had all been reprinted there and were well known and as much esteemed as in Scotland.'<sup>23</sup>

According to the American, when asked if his address was 'Altrive Lake, Selkirk', Hogg replied 'Hout man, no ... write to the Ettrick Shepherd, Scotland, a' the world kens him.'<sup>24</sup> Andrew Hook argued that Hogg had large and enthusiastic transatlantic readership, and was 'probably the most popular [writer] in America as both poet and storyteller' on 'Scottish subjects and themes'.<sup>25</sup> This is a significant claim, and one that requires further research in empirical analysis of book historical sources such as library borrower records and circulating lists.<sup>26</sup> In 1836, a year after Hogg's death, a short supplement attached to *The Select Circulating Library* published by Adam Waldie in Philadelphia, published an 1834 letter by Hogg:

were it not that I am the very man that I am, 'the Ettrick Shepherd', I should be in America the first of them all, for I have long viewed, with wonder and amazement, the resources of that astonishing country. But my name has so long been identified with Scotland and Ettrick Forest, that I cannot leave them.

---

<sup>22</sup> There are two different versions of 'A Visit to the Ettrick Shepherd' published anonymously in American magazines. One in *American Monthly Magazine* 3 (New York, 1834), pp. 85-91 <https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=3GzXAAAAMAAJ> [accessed 2/5/2019], and another in *The Military and Naval Magazine of the United States* 6 (1836), pp. 329 – 334 <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=hbxLAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA329>> [accessed 4/5/2019]. Currie suggests that the former is a report from an 1833 visit (see Currie, 'Hogg in the Zodiac'), and the latter refers to an 1831 visit. See also Currie, 'Hogg in the American Literary Marketplace', p. 287.

<sup>23</sup> 'A Visit to the Ettrick Shepherd by an American Tourist', *American Monthly Magazine*, p. 89.  
<sup>24</sup> 'A Visit to the Ettrick Shepherd by an American Tourist', *American Monthly Magazine*, p. 89.

<sup>25</sup> Quoted in Gilbert, 'Hogg's Reception and Reputation', p. 44.

<sup>26</sup> Some of these sources are discussed in chapter three in relation to North American circulating library holdings of Hogg's short story collections. Other North American archival records, such as the City Readers project in New York, are in the early stages of digitisation and have not yet included the years in which Hogg's material would have appeared during his lifetime. See <<http://cityreaders.nysoclib.org/>> [accessed 14/4/2019]

True, my native country has been but a stepmother to me, though I think I have done her some honour. I was a poor shepherd, a very poor shepherd, more than half a century ago, and I have never got further to this day. But I know that I can never be an object of pity, either to myself or any other person, being conscious that my soul has been endowed by my Maker with the powers of immortal song. I am, however, happy to hear from every corner of the great community of the west that I am more read there, and oftener reprinted, than any other living author.<sup>27</sup>

As Currie has suggested, the letter was originally sent to Robert H. Rose of Susquehanna in September 1834.<sup>28</sup> In it, Hogg situates his authenticity in relation to place – ‘Scotland and Ettrick Forest’ – and to class status as ‘a very poor shepherd’, while stressing his ‘heaven-taught’ authorial qualities. Moreover, he acknowledges and gives tacit approval to reprints of his work in ‘the great community of the west’.

Hogg’s background was emphasised in the American reception of his work. Magazine reviews in periodicals such as the *Analectic Magazine*, *The Ladies Literary Cabinet* of New York, and the *Literary Gazette* discussed Hogg’s early life in the Scottish Borders, highlighting his lack of formal education.<sup>29</sup> An 1815 review of Hogg’s poem *The Queen’s Wake* in the *Port Folio* suggested that Hogg had overtaken Scotland’s other ‘unlettered bards’, Ramsay and Burns.<sup>30</sup> Boston’s *American Monthly Magazine* echoed this biography-heavy reception of Hogg in America:

The Publisher having been favoured with letters from gentlemen in various parts of the United Kingdom respecting the Author of the Queen’s Wake, and most of them expressing doubts of his being a Scotch Shepherd; he takes this opportunity of assuring the Public, that The Queen’s Wake is really and truly the production of James Hogg, a common shepherd, bred among the

---

<sup>27</sup> ‘Original Letter of the Ettrick Shepherd’, *Waldie’s Select Circulating Library: Journal of Belles Lettres* 7 (Philadelphia, 1836) <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=-rM-AAAAYAAJ&pg=PA447&lpg=PA447>> [accessed 8/7/2019]

<sup>28</sup> See Currie, ‘Marketplace’, p. 223, and ‘Hogg in the Zodiac’.

<sup>29</sup> Andrew Hook, *Scotland and America: A Study of Cultural Relations 1750-1835* (Glasgow: Blackie, 1975) p. 152.

<sup>30</sup> Hook, *Scotland and America*, p. 152.

mountains of Ettrick Forest, who went to service when only seven years of age; and since that period has never received any education whatever.<sup>31</sup>

The review situates Hogg in the geographic and cultural margins meanwhile placing him in a lineage of demotic and labouring-class Scottish cultural production, not from

‘the crowded city’s gay salons’, but from the river banks and vallies of the country; from the sunny fields of the lowlands [...] and the shepherd’s cottage on the shadowed hillside, and even from the humble hut of the poor farmer, built with his own hands, like that of the father of Burns.<sup>32</sup>

Arun Sood’s recent scholarship has shown the popularity and extensive readership of Burns in America in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, and argues that ‘the image of a rustic poet concerned with rural, nostalgic themes set in the Scottish countryside’ is common in periodical publications of the later eighteenth century which were publishing Burns.<sup>33</sup> Sood cites Rhona Brown, who noted that in the printing of Burns’s work in the *Pennsylvania Packet* the paper’s editorial practices displayed an ‘appetite for the sentimental, pious Heaven-taught ploughman’.<sup>34</sup>

In the printing of biographical material on Burns, some American periodicals drew parallels between the ‘peasantry’ of Scottish society and communities in America:

The prefatory remarks, concerning the character and conduct of the Scottish peasantry, which in some respects, may be applied to the people of New England, will be interesting to the American reader, and throw light on those circumstances which contributed to form the early character of Burns.<sup>35</sup>

American magazines would take up this language of ‘peasantry’ and apply it to Hogg. The *American Monthly Magazine* described the ‘peasant’ nature of Hogg, ‘but not in

---

<sup>31</sup> Quoted from the S/SC edition of *The Queen’s Wake*, ed. by Douglas Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2005), ‘Appendix’, p. 394. See also ‘The Ettrick Shepherd and Other Scotch Poets’, *American Monthly Magazine* 1 (November 1829), pp. 522-530.

<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=-3FBAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA522>> [accessed 8/7/2019]

<sup>32</sup> ‘The Ettrick Shepherd and Other Scotch Poets’, p. 523.

<sup>33</sup> Arun Sood, *Robert Burns and the United States of America: Poetry, Print and Memory 1786 -1866* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2018), p. 48.

<sup>34</sup> Quoted in Sood, p. 48.

<sup>35</sup> *The American Review and Literary Journal* 1 (1801), quoted in Sood, p. 68.

that sense in which the word would be understood almost any where out of their own country; for no peasantry in Europe, we may venture to say, can be compared in equal terms with the peasantry of Scotland.<sup>36</sup> Indeed, a key feature of Hogg's short story aesthetic, the textualisation of orality, is noted for its authentic qualities:

but there is evidence in every page, that the writer is 'thoroughly grounded' in his own tongue, as we hold no man ever was by intuition or instinct, and in the English also. Not that his style is perfect; but he writes good English, and good Scotch, though most at home with the latter, and therefore introducing it on all occasions—with a sort of natural affectation—a gentlemanly and nonchalant aping of rusticity, which, possibly, may have given superficial observers the impression that he was really as clownish as his own caricatures, as rustic in mind as in manner. There is something of this combination of artificial awkwardness with real grace and discipline in the *Wake*, but a great deal more in the *Shepherd's Calendar*.<sup>37</sup>

It is worth noting that it is Hogg's short stories in the *Shepherd's Calendar* (1829) that are singled out for their distinctive 'grace and discipline' in 'aping rusticity', displaying an ability to switch registers between 'good Scotch and 'good English'. Francis Jeffrey, in an 1809 review for a Philadelphia periodical publication, explained that concept of 'good Scotch' in relation to Burns:

Scotch is, in reality, a highly poetical language; and that it is an ignorant, as well as an illiberal prejudice, which would seek to confound it with the barbarous dialects of Yorkshire or Devon. In composing his Scottish poems, therefore, Burns did not make an instinctive and necessary use of the only dialect he could employ [...] he could write in the dialect of England with far greater purity and propriety than nine tenths of those who are educated in that country.<sup>38</sup>

These reviews, of both Hogg and his 'heaven-taught' Scots 'predecessor' Burns, suggest that American readers were attuned to the discourses of authenticity associated with Hogg's author function – language, orality, class, and place - shaped

---

<sup>36</sup> 'The Ettrick Shepherd and Other Scotch Poets', p. 523.

<sup>37</sup> 'The Ettrick Shepherd and Other Scotch Poets', p. 528.

<sup>38</sup> *Select Reviews, and Spirit of the Foreign Magazines* 2 (1809) pp. 17-18, quoted in Sood, p. 83.

by Hogg within his texts, despite the limited role that Hogg played in the dissemination of reprints of his short stories in American magazines.

In a different version of ‘A Visit to the Ettrick Shepherd’, published posthumously in *The Military and Naval Magazine of the United States* in 1836, an American visitor suggests the extent to which Hogg was read and appreciated by American readers:

Besides persons of accomplishment and refined taste, to be found in our cities, who were charmed with his writings, and who sung his songs, the inmates of many a log cabin, in the western wilds of America, had never seen a city, could quote more readily from them than I could, of which I had witnessed numerous demonstrations.<sup>39</sup>

This report is anonymous, and the extent of its stylisation questionable as a documentary source. Nevertheless, it foregrounds Hogg’s authentic qualities of between-ness in relation to the rural margins and the metropolis, a quality, as I have argued throughout this thesis, staged within his short stories. This margins-metropolis dialogic is ‘translated’ from Ettrick-Edinburgh, or Ettrick-London, to a new American context, between ‘our cities’ and the log cabins of ‘the western wilds’. Another American magazine, the *Knickerbocker; or New York Monthly Magazine*, echoed the translation of Hogg’s straddling of the margins-metropolis into a new American context in a celebration of promised future submissions from Hogg:

Our kind friend, the ETTRICK SHEPHERD is informed that his ‘Noctes’ will be highly acceptable; and we trust that ere this they are on their way. ‘The Wife of Traquair’, though conceived at St Ronan’s, among such genial spirits of Professor Wilson, and his boon fellows of the Border Games, will tell as well in the West, as in Auld Reekie. ... The music of the artless harp, - naturae donum – will ring among the green savannahs of America, as by the lake of

---

<sup>39</sup> ‘A Visit to the Ettrick Shepherd’, *The Military and Naval Magazine of the United States* 6 (1836), pp. 329-334 <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=hbXLAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA332>> [accessed 8/7/2019] p. 332

Altrive. We bid the Shepherd welcome; and we hope soon to announce the promised firstlings of his heart and hand.<sup>40</sup>

‘The lake of Altrive’ is transported and translated to an American context of marginality, the ‘green savannahs’. While reprints of his texts functioned mostly without any direct involvement from Hogg, he did have some personal involvement in American publishing in the 1830s as the excerpt from the *Knickerbocker* suggests. His *Familiar Anecdotes of Sir Walter Scott* was published by Harper and Bros of New York in 1834, Hogg’s sole authorised book published in America. The publisher, writer, diplomat and merchant Simeon De Witt Bloodgood (1799-1844) of Albany, New York, was an important point of contact for Hogg’s transatlantic publishing. Hogg submitted original stories to the New York magazine *The Zodiac*, though only one was published. ‘Tales of Fathers and Daughters’ appeared across three instalments of *The Zodiac* in July (pp. 2-4), August (pp. 25-6), and September (pp. 39-41) 1835. Iteration rather than origination is the dominant narrative of Hogg’s short stories in America.

#### *American reprints from Blackwood’s and books*

Hogg’s story ‘The Brownie of the Black Haggs’ was originally published in *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine* in October 1828 and was reprinted from *Blackwood’s* just two months later in the Philadelphia periodical the *Casket, or Flowers of Literature, Wit and Sentiment*, in December 1828. Philadelphia was an important place in the history of American periodical publishing, as it was in the development of the annual and gift book.<sup>41</sup> The *Casket* would later become absorbed into the much more ambitious *Graham’s Magazine*, ‘one of the most important American periodicals of the forties’.<sup>42</sup> Sometimes called *Atkinson’s Casket*, the widely circulated monthly miscellany contained mostly reprinted material, including British literary fiction as well as material from other US publications.<sup>43</sup> ‘A typical number’

---

<sup>40</sup> ‘Editor’s Table’, *Knickerbocker; or New York Monthly Magazine* 5 (June 1834)

<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=WsROAQAAMAAJ&pg=PA558>> [accessed 5/6/2019] p. 558

<sup>41</sup> Fred Lewis Pattee, *The Development of the American Short Story: An historical perspective* (New York: Biblio and Tannen, 1923), p. 69.

<sup>42</sup> Frank Luther Mott, ‘A Brief History of ‘Graham’s Magazine’’, *Studies in Philology*, 25.3 (1928), 362-374 (p. 363). See also Mott, *A History of American Magazines: 1741-1850*, pp. 544-555.

<sup>43</sup> Mott, *A History*, pp. 361-362.

of *Graham's* in the 1840s contained 3-4 short stories, including contributions from Edgar Allan Poe, Nathaniel Parker Willis, Seba Smith, Frances Sargent Osgood, Elizabeth Oakes Smith, and Caroline Kirkland.<sup>44</sup> *Graham's Magazine* would become not only:

one of the three or four most important magazines in the United States but, in the five years 1841-45, displayed a brilliance which has seldom been matched in American magazine history.<sup>45</sup>

Poe, who lived in the city between 1838 and 1844, was literary editor of the Philadelphia magazine for 15 months between 1841-42.<sup>46</sup> Indeed, an early piece of Poe's published writing, the 1830 'Sonnet – to Science', appeared in the same Philadelphia periodical, the *Casket*, as Hogg's 1828 reprint had. If American magazines initially included lots of reprints from UK publications, 'native' short stories soon started to come to the fore:

more and more as the [Philadelphia periodical the *Lady's Book*] prospered, native material began to dominate, until in the January number, 1834, the entire seven tales, one of them as we know now, written by Poe, were marked 'Original'<sup>47</sup>

The explicit demarcation of stories within the magazine as 'original' is notable in that it shows an awareness of the dominance of the iterative function of American periodicals in the production and dissemination of, particularly Scottish and British, short stories in the literary marketplace.

Hogg's short story reprints can go some way to substantiating studies of British fiction in American periodicals. It was in the 1830s, the final stage of Hogg's writing career, that reprints of Hogg's work across genres in the US and Canada really took off. As research currently stands, forty-three reprinted items (including short stories, songs, and poems) have been located in American and Canadian periodicals for the year

---

<sup>44</sup> Mott, *A History*, p. 366.

<sup>45</sup> Mott, *A History*, p. 344.

<sup>46</sup> Barbara Cantalupo, *Poe and the Visual Arts* (Pennsylvania: Penn. State University Press, 2014), p. 19.

<sup>47</sup> Pattee, p. 71.

1831, compared to just 8 in 1826.<sup>48</sup> While the broad chronological story is one of increased transatlantic reprints from the late 1820s to Hogg's death in 1835, American reprints of Hogg's short stories were circulating in the early stages of his career, some even pre-dating Hogg's 1810-11 periodical venture *The Spy*. 'The Long Pack', sometimes given the title 'The Dead Shot' or 'The Mysterious Pack', circulated extensively throughout Hogg's career, before, and after, its collection into book form in *Winter Evening Tales* in 1820. It appeared across two parts as 'The Dead Shot; or, The Long Pack. A Tale by the Ettrick Shepherd' in New York's *Lady's Weekly Miscellany*, beginning Saturday 10 February 1810, and concluding one week later. The *Lady's* version made it clear that it had been reprinted from Britain, containing the note that the story was 'From the *London Sporting Magazine*', which had published the story as 'The Dead Shot' in September 1809.<sup>49</sup> As well as appearing in the *Lady's Weekly Miscellany*, 'The Long Pack' was published across four installments of *The Visitor* in March 1810. While very few original pieces of short fiction were published in America, Hogg's reprints were more abundant.

The appearance of 'The Brownie of the Black Hags. by the Ettrick Shepherd' in *The Casket* was explicitly framed within the magazine as 'From Blackwood's Magazine for October'.<sup>50</sup> The 'roots' of the story are thus displayed – both the author of the text, the Ettrick Shepherd, and the original site of publication, *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*. The narrating 'I', which compares the reaction of laird Sprot of Wheelhouse to the news of the servant girl Jessy's apparent poisoning at the hands of his wife to the reaction of a 'colley that I once had', is Hogg's author function, the

---

<sup>48</sup> See the forthcoming Stirling/South Carolina research edition on Hogg's contributions to periodicals outside of Scotland, *Contributions to International Periodicals* ed by Adrian Hunter (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2019). See also Duncan, 'Appendix: Hogg's manuscript of 'The Long Pack'', in *Winter Evening Tales* 2<sup>nd</sup> edn., ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004), pp. 509-513.

<sup>49</sup> Currie, 'American Periodical Press', James Hogg: Research, <[www.jameshogg.stir.ac.uk/showbib.php?id=1](http://www.jameshogg.stir.ac.uk/showbib.php?id=1)> [accessed 3/5/2017]; Duncan, 'Appendix: Hogg's manuscript of 'The Long Pack'', p. 510.

<sup>50</sup> Hogg, 'The Brownie of the Black Hags', *The Casket, or Flowers of Literature, Wit & Sentiment* 3 (1828), 558-564 <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=2EcZAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA558#>> [accessed 8/7/2019] p. 558.

Ettrick Shepherd.<sup>51</sup> At the end of the narrative, in typically Hoggian style, the narrator turns the reader towards the issue of narrative truth and oral testimony in print:

This story was told to me by an old man, named Adam Halliday, whose great grandfather, Thomas Halliday, was one of those that found the body and buried it. ... But upon the whole, I scarcely believe the tale can be true.<sup>52</sup>

From this display of the experiential levels of storytelling, which positions itself as a narrative taken from orality and put into print, the author function and narrator emphasise their own authenticity as a storyteller connected to the events, people and places within the narrative. This is a particularly acute effect of authenticity given the content of the narrative, which at its core deals with class tensions played-out through language. The Scots-speaking lower classes are distrustful of Lady Wheelhope, who is regarded as an ‘inexorable tyrant’, ‘a very bad woman’, and popularly believed to be a witch, from the outset.<sup>53</sup> Indeed, a 2003 radio dramatisation of ‘The Brownie of the Black Hags’ for the BBC by Marty Ross mimicked the text’s narrative layering of class, voice and authenticity by deploying sections in between the main body of the narrative which contained Scots-speaking ‘common’ folk, complete with diegetic sounds of work, who spoke to one another of their dislike of Lady Wheelhope and their supernatural theories of the events.<sup>54</sup> The narrator in Hogg’s text is able to move between, and speak as and from, both the Scots-speaking people and the laird and lady to tell the story of the uncanny servant Merodach and the all-consuming obsession of Lady Wheelhope which straddles the extremities of hate, love, sex, and violence. At the same time, authenticity at the level of narrative authority is undermined by the teller who questions whether any of it is true at all.

Murray Pittock reads the story as an expression of ‘the hidden and repressed identity of the Scottish Covenanters’, within which the narrator is unable to discern between ‘the historicised romance and the dehistoricised tradition, which, as it turns out, may

---

<sup>51</sup> Hogg, ‘Black Hags’, p. 559.

<sup>52</sup> Hogg, ‘Black Hags’, p. 564.

<sup>53</sup> Hogg, ‘Black Hags’, p. 558.

<sup>54</sup> *BBC Radio 4 Extra*, ‘The Brownie of the Black Hags’.

<<https://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b00ck4fs>> [accessed 12/11/2018]

actually reveal the historical truth'.<sup>55</sup> While removed from the 'Scottish' surroundings of its original site of publication in *Blackwood's*, *The Casket's* miscellaneous collection of fragments of poetry, song, anecdotes, sketches, essays and stories in its 1828 magazines contained numerous examples of Scottish and Scottish-themed content, and much of that concerned the historical. For example, the periodical contained a short excerpt from Scott's *Tales of a Grandfather*, 'James V. Of Scotland'.<sup>56</sup> The concept of Scott's series of four books, published from 1828 to 1831, was to tell Scottish history in a style 'between what a child can comprehend and what shall not yet be absolutely uninteresting to the grown reader'.<sup>57</sup> Other Scottish-themed content included anecdotes of a paragraph long, such as on Scott and Abbotsford reprinted from the '*Lit. Gaz.*', and another short Scott excerpt provided without a source titled 'Human Life'.<sup>58</sup> Hook's research on cultural relations between Scotland and America 1750 -1835 suggested the extent to which material based upon Scottish, and Scottish-historical, themes appeared in American magazines, particularly into the early decades of the nineteenth century.<sup>59</sup> Scott's novels were crucial in triggering a burgeoning American interest in the Scottish past, with the romanticised narratives of famous historical figures such as William Wallace, Robert the Bruce, Mary Queen of Scots and Rob Roy appearing in magazines such as the *Literary Gazette*, the *North American Review* (Philadelphia) and the *American Monthly Magazine* (Philadelphia).<sup>60</sup> The heroic narratives of liberty derived from a mythologised Scottish past found popular appeal among American publishers and readers, as evidenced by the extent of their coverage in US magazines. Pittock's reading of Hogg's 'Brownie of the Black Hags' as an interrogation of Scottish history which subverts hegemonic historicist narratives by providing a subaltern vision of Covenanting history told through the 'everyman' voices of the Scots-speaking folk can, therefore, be carried over to the American publication of the story.

---

<sup>55</sup> Pittock, *Scottish and Irish Romanticism*, p. 225.

<sup>56</sup> Walter Scott, 'James V. of Scotland', in *The Casket* 3, pp. 175-176.

<sup>57</sup> Walter Scott, *Journal*, July 8, 1827. Quoted in

<<http://www.walterscott.lib.ed.ac.uk/works/prose/grandfather.html>> [accessed 11/10/2018]

<sup>58</sup> *The Casket* 3, p. 183, p. 167.

<sup>59</sup> Andrew Hook, *Scotland and America: A Study of Cultural Relations, 1750 – 1835* (Second ed.) (Glasgow: Humming Earth, 2008), pp. 153-155.

<sup>60</sup> Hook, *Scotland and America*, p. 157.

Hogg's stories, like 'Brownie of the Black Haggs', are not merely reprints of secondary importance to the 'original'. Rather, the function of reprinting is to reshape how a story operates in relation to its specific historical-cultural contexts of publication. The foregrounded role of the teller in the story, which itself points to the troubling of historical truth in the narrative, meant that Hogg's author function continued to operate in those new contexts, in spite of Hogg's lack of tangible agency in the processes of reprinting and American publishing. Collins, in a reading of Hogg's 'The Story of Two Highlanders', which first appeared in *The Spy* (1810) as 'Amusing Story of Two Highlanders', traces its mutable meanings in the process of the form's transatlantic portability. The story

dramatises in physical space the cosmopolitan and imperial thematics of the tale. Its transmission around the Atlantic is made possible by its form, which, in turn, assists in the expression of its literary and thematic concerns.<sup>61</sup>

In this synthesis of narrative aesthetics with literary form and material circulation, Hogg's story's seemingly local and regional concerns (the differences between Highlanders and lowlanders, including Hogg's pejorative characterisation of English spoken by Gaels) takes on new meanings, especially so given the story's setting in the Hudson valley. In typically portable fashion, the story appeared in American magazines, including in *The Emerald* and *Baltimore Literary Gazette*, and also appeared in book format in two New York editions of *Winter Evening Tales*. Like the Highlanders portrayed within its narrative, the story migrated across mediums, places, and contexts of reception.

#### *'Emigration' and portability*

Returning to Hogg's letter published by Waldie in *The Select Circulating Library* in 1836, it introduces an important theme in cultural connections between Scotland and America: diaspora and migration. Various members of Hogg's family had emigrated from Scotland across the Atlantic, including his cousin James Laidlaw and his family,

---

<sup>61</sup> Collins, 'Transnationalism', p. 20.

who left Hopehouse in Selkirkshire for Canada in 1817.<sup>62</sup> Two of Hogg's nephews emigrated to America in 1830 and worked as shepherds for the landowner Robert Rose, another emigrated in 1831, followed by Hogg's brother Robert Hogg and the rest of his family in 1832, who settled in Silver Lake, Pennsylvania. Robert died during the passage west.<sup>63</sup> 'I wad like to gang and see [the United States], but I darna', suggested Hogg in the 1834 report by an American visitor, 'I asked him why? – he replied, with much naivete, 'I am Scotland's and she wadna let me gang. I hae a brither there, his name is Robert, I like him weel, but hinna heard frae him for a lang time'.<sup>64</sup> The publisher, writer, diplomat and merchant Simeon De Witt Bloodgood of Albany, New York, was an important point of contact for Hogg's transatlantic connections not just in terms of publishing (as detailed above), but in terms of family.<sup>65</sup> Hogg wrote to Bloodgood on numerous occasions to ask questions about America on behalf of his family:

Pray is there such a place in the state of New York as Pensylvania? Not the province but a township. My brother Robert has gone there to settle this year. I only saw only my nieces a young once before they went away as they emigrated from the Highlands and she said they were going to the township or parish of Pensylvania in the state of New York and that the name of the farm was 'Silver Lake' Pray dear [*sic*] if you can hear of such a man or such a place if it can be reached either by post steam or carrier let him know that you have heard from me that we are all well and that I will long with the most ardent impatience to hear from ... Perhaps you could find means of forwarding his letters to me.<sup>66</sup>

The historian Edward J. Cowan termed the emigration of Borderers in the early nineteenth century 'the lowland clearances', arguing that 'the landlords created the

---

<sup>62</sup> James Laidlaw is the Canadian short story writer Alice Munro's great-great-great-grandfather. See Patricia Craig, 'The eccentric emigrants: The View from Castle Rock by Alice Munro', *The Independent* 3<sup>rd</sup> November 2006, <https://www.independent.co.uk/arts-entertainment/books/reviews/the-view-from-castle-rock-by-alice-munro-422640.html> [accessed 12/11/2018]

<sup>63</sup> Currie, 'Hogg in the Zodiac'.

<sup>64</sup> 'Visit', *American Monthly Magazine*, p. 88.

<sup>65</sup> See *Letters Vol. 3*, p. 199 and p. 207.

<sup>66</sup> Hogg's letter to Simeon De Witt Bloodgood, 22 June 1833, *Letters Vol. 3*, p. 162. See also p. 175, p. 180, and p. 184.

preconditions for migration. Market forces did the rest'.<sup>67</sup> Hogg's story 'Emigration', discussed in more detail below, deals with the migration of Border Scots west to the 'New World', and situates Hogg's own experiences of and reflections on Scots leaving Scotland.

'Emigration' was originally published in the recently established *Chambers's Edinburgh Journal* on 18 May 1833 and was reprinted in various US periodicals in 1835. Robert Chambers, who had founded *Chambers's* along with his brother William in 1832, invited Hogg to submit 'a rural tale or so, constructed as much as possible with a moral or useful object, and chiming in with the tone of our work'.<sup>68</sup> The 'tone' of their project was, as Robert Scholnick explains in his study of the W. & R. Chambers publishing house, 'to bring high-quality, low-cost and useful reading material to the great body of aspiring readers hitherto excluded from print culture'.<sup>69</sup> Their journal was part of their project to aid and spread working class literacy, and it published articles that addressed the socio-economic inequalities endured by the working and labouring-classes, and the poor, in Scottish and British society. Indeed, Scholnick argued that the Chambers brothers were proponents of emigration to the United States, the only feasible option to bring 'immediate relief to the millions of Britons living in poverty'.<sup>70</sup> Hogg's story 'chimed' with the 'tone' desired by Chambers, not least by being on the subject of labouring-class Scottish emigration to the new world, but also by situating that experience within their socio-economic lived experiences. So, while it is a 'rural tale', in the sense that it tells of the rural lowland Scotland experience of emigration, it is not a story in a depoliticised pastoral mode. It is a story about the economic need to migrate, and the challenging emotions associated with reluctantly leaving a place of a home that holds 'the prospect of helpless desolation'.<sup>71</sup>

---

<sup>67</sup> Quoted in Currie, 'Hogg in the Zodiac'. See also Edward J. Cowan, 'From the Southern Uplands to Southern Ontario: Nineteenth-Century Emigration from the Scottish Borders', in *Scottish Emigration and Scottish Society. Proceedings of the Scottish Historical Studies Seminar University of Strathclyde, 1990-91* ed. By T. M. Devine (Edinburgh: John Donald, 1992), pp. 61-83 (p. 67; p. 76).

<sup>68</sup> Currie, 'Hogg in the Zodiac'.

<sup>69</sup> Currie, 'Hogg in the Zodiac'.

<sup>70</sup> Currie, 'Hogg in the Zodiac'.

<sup>71</sup> Hogg, 'Emigration. By the Ettrick Shepherd', *Chambers's Edinburgh Journal*, 2 (1834) <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=bVkyAQAAMAAJ&pg=PA124#>> [accessed 8/7/2019] pp. 124-125 (p. 124).

The story tells of a family who are set to board a boat which sails from Scotland to Montreal. The patriarch of the Haliday family, Adam, ‘who had lost his farm’ and whom ‘I’ – the narrating ‘I’ of the Ettrick Shepherd - ‘had known intimately in my young days’, was ‘obliged to leave his two oldest sons behind until they themselves could procure the means of following him’. Whether the Adam Haliday of ‘Emigration’ is the same Adam Halliday as appeared in the experiential layers of storytelling in ‘Brownie of the Black Hags’ is unclear, though is certainly possible given Hogg’s ‘idiosyncratic’ spelling practices and the editorial functions which shaped it.<sup>72</sup> Adam’s grandfather Thomas had found Lady Wheelhope’s body and buried it, and the ‘old man’ Adam, according to the narrator, had told the story orally to Hogg. In ‘Emigration’, the decision by the Scots-speaking Adam Haliday to leave his eldest sons is reversed at the last minute thanks to a charitable intervention by a pedlar ‘whom I think they named Simon Ainslie’, explains the narrator. The ‘old packman with the ragged coat’ had approached the captain of the ship the previous night and paid the fares for the two sons, allowing the whole Haliday family to travel to the New World. After hearing from the captain that the fares have been paid, Adam asks:

‘An’ wha is the generous friend that has done this?’ cried Haliday, in raptures, the tears streaming from his eyes. ‘He has strengthened my arms, and encouraged my heart, and rendered me an independent man – at aince, tell me wha is the kind good man? – was it Mr Hogg?’<sup>73</sup>

The narrator’s connection to the story is situated within the text, interacting with the events of the story though not shaping the action. This situated-ness of Hogg and his associated author function within the text means that when the story is reprinted in American magazines, that author function is transported with it. While Hogg was in contact with Robert Chambers about the publication of the story, no documentary evidence currently exists to suggest that Hogg had any tangible agency in its reprinted

---

<sup>72</sup> See Mack, *Editing Hogg*, p.7, and pp. 30-32. Mack’s work shows the challenge presented by Hogg’s approach to spelling, and the issues concerning authorial intentionality in textual editing.

<sup>73</sup> Hogg, ‘Emigration’, p. 124. The story also appears in *Supplement to the Connecticut Courant*, 3.14 (August 1835), 109-111, where the ‘aince’ in this excerpt is changed from Scots to the English ‘once’. See <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=hywTAAAYAAJ&pg=PA109>> [accessed 12/11/2018]

contexts such as in Boston's *The Liberator*. The presence of the author in the text made Hogg's author function as portable as the story itself was, as it physically migrated across the Atlantic in the process of its reprinting. The story's subject-content, emigration, therefore reflect its formal portability as a transatlantic reprinted magazine short story.

The reprinted version of the story provides a good example of how new contexts of publication can shape how a story is read, and how these new contexts allow a story to engage in different cultural, social and political conversations to those with which an original 'home' publication engaged with. As Currie explains of Boston's *The Liberator*:

William Lloyd Garrison, a philanthropic humanitarian reformer from the North American State of New Brunswick, conceived and edited *The Liberator*, a weekly antislavery newspaper first published in Boston on the first of January 1831. Garrison was idealistically committed to the immediate abolition of the slave trade by pacific means and through *The Liberator* he continuously promoted his non-violent ideals for almost thirty-five years. Critics have shown how Garrison utilised a variety of modes to promote the aims of antislavery. For example, Phillip Lapsansky highlights Garrison's propagandist abolitionist imagery in the extensive use of graphic illustrations.<sup>74</sup>

Just as Hogg's 'Emigration' as it appeared in *Chambers's Edinburgh Journal* keyed-in to the broader political and social function of the Chambers brothers project, Currie argues that the story's inclusion in an anti-slavery American magazine allows it to function in part as an anti-slavery narrative itself, despite not being expressly about slavery. Currie reads 'Emigration' as 'Hogg's humanitarian narrative of the Scottish diaspora that found its natural expression in the philanthropic enterprise of both *Chambers's Edinburgh Journal* and *The Liberator* of Boston':<sup>75</sup>

---

<sup>74</sup> Janette Currie, 'James Hogg in the Liberator', *University of Stirling, James Hogg: Research* <http://www.jameshoggoriginal.stir.ac.uk/showrecord.php?id=62&fulltext=1> [accessed 3/6/2018]

<sup>75</sup> Currie, 'James Hogg in the Liberator'.

The metaphoric association of slaves and emigrants [in Hogg's story] as cattle/chattels or beasts of burden, inhuman commodities to be bought and sold, reinforced the idea of shared [in]human experiences of slavery and emigration.<sup>76</sup>

The comparison of white European emigrants with chattel slavery is, of course, a problematic one, which threatens to downplay the racialised and systemic processes of mass state-sanctioned dehumanisation involved in the latter. Particularly in an age of renewed scholarly and popular awareness of the extent of active Scottish participation in the chattel system,<sup>77</sup> these points are worth making when considering Scottish texts as bearing parallels with the experience of enslaved people from Africa. Nevertheless, Currie's reading is suggestive of how contexts – including reprinted publications - shape the possibilities of how a story functions, and what conversations it engages with.

'Emigration' was widely reprinted in US magazines across the space of just a few months in 1835, showing the speed with which reprinting could take place and the wide geographic spread covered by cultures of reprinting in American magazines and newspapers. Hogg's short story was published in the *New-England Galaxy* in Boston, Massachusetts (June 1835), the *Greenville Mountaineer* of Greenville, South Carolina (July 1835), Boston's *The Liberator* (July 1835), the *Vermont State Paper* in St Albans, Vermont (July 1835), the *Episcopal Recorder* in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania (August 1835), *The Friend: A Religious and Literary Journal* in Philadelphia (August 1835), the *Christian Register* in Boston (October 1835), the *Western Christian Advocate* in Cincinnati, Ohio (October 1835), the *Vermont Chronicle* in Bellows Falls, Vermont (October 1835), and in Boston's *Youth's Companion* where it appeared as 'Narrative: The Emigrants and the Scottish Tract Peddler' (December 1835). The story was also reprinted in the *Supplement to the Connecticut Courant* in Hartford in August 1835, where the opening paragraph, as it did in the *Chambers* and *Liberator* versions in Edinburgh and Boston, foregrounds the function of the storyteller in the

---

<sup>76</sup> Currie, 'James Hogg in the Liberator'.

<sup>77</sup> See Tom Devine, *Recovering Scotland's Slavery Past: The Caribbean Connection* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015).

text.<sup>78</sup> The reprint trail amplifies the reading of ‘Emigration’ as a portable short story, its thematic concerns aligning with its material condition of circulation across the Atlantic.

The opening paragraph of ‘Emigration’ is key to our understanding how the story carries with it the author function and its performance of authenticity in the text into new contexts. It begins with repeated use of the narrating ‘I’ of the storyteller, emphasising the experiential level of the telling. The narrative stresses that this is not information being relayed, but stories that have been experienced:

I know of nothing in the world so distressing as the last sight of a fine industrious independent peasantry taking the last look of their native country, never to behold it more. I have witnessed several of these scenes now, and I wish I may never witness another; for each of them has made tears burst every now and then into my eyes for days and nights, and all the while in that mood of mind that I could think about nothing else. I saw the children all in high spirits, playing together and amusing themselves with trifles, and I wondered if those dear innocents, in after life, would remember anything at all of the land of their nativity. They felt no regret, for they knew that they had no home but where their parents were, no staff or stay but on them. They were beside them, and at tending to all their little wants, and they were happy. How different the looks of the parents!<sup>79</sup>

This repetition of the storytelling ‘I’ of the Ettrick Shepherd displays the narrator’s connection to the experience of ‘the peasantry’ in periods of historical and social upheaval. Echoing the article on Hogg and ‘other Scotch poets’ in the *American Monthly Magazine* of 1829 discussed above, Hogg’s Scottish lowland peasantry is characterised by its ‘independence’ and industriousness. The care-free innocence of emigrant children is contrasted with the challenging emotions felt by adult emigrants leaving ‘the land of their nativity’:

---

<sup>78</sup> Hogg, ‘Emigration’, *Supplement to the Connecticut Courant*.

<sup>79</sup> Hogg, ‘Emigration’, *Supplement to the Connecticut Courant*, p.109.

They looked backward toward their native mountains and glades with the most rueful expression of countenance. These looks never can be cancelled from my heart; and I noted always, that the older the men were, their looks were the more regretful and desolate. They thought, without doubt, of the tombs of their parents and friends whose heads they had lain in an honoured grave, and that, after a few years of the toil and weariness collateral with old age, they were going to lay down their bones in a new world, a far distant clime, never to mix their ashes with those that were dearest to them. Alas! the days are gone that I have seen!<sup>80</sup>

The storytelling 'I' 'noted always' the sadness of scenes of emigration from Scotland. In the final sentence, 'the days are gone that I have seen', the narrator merges the voices of the older emigrants who face the prospect of laying 'down their bones in a new world' with his own 'I'. Hogg did not emigrate, though the function of the narrator in the text aligns the experiences of Scottish 'peasant' emigrants with his own.

The opening paragraph of 'Emigration' goes on to discuss the differences between emigration from the Highlands and the Borders:

It is long since emigration from the Highlands commenced; for, when clanship was abolished, as far as government edicts could abolish it, the poor Highlanders were obliged to emigrate. But never till now did the brave and intelligent Borderers rush from their native country, all with symptoms of reckless despair. It is most deplorable. The whole of our most valuable peasantry and operative manufacturers are leaving us. All who have made a little money to freight them over the Atlantic, and procure them a settlement in America, Van Dieman's Land, or New South Wales, are hurrying from us as from a place infected with the plague. Every day the desire to emigrate increases, both in amount and intensity: in some parts of the country the movement is taking place to an immense extent. In the industrious village of

---

<sup>80</sup> Hogg, 'Emigration', *Supplement to the Connecticut Courant*, p. 109.

Galashiels, fifty-two are already booked for transportation. In the town of Hawick, and its subordinate villages, are double that number.<sup>81</sup>

The Ettrick Shepherd's quick summary of Highland emigration overlooks some important elements of the Clearances, which were well underway by the 1830s, particularly the role of people being removed by landlords in favour of the more profitable sheep.<sup>82</sup> Hogg's journeys to the Highlands and islands in 1802, 1803, and 1804 were in large part driven by labour interests, as he looked north for sheep farming opportunities after repeated misfortune in his native Borders. The Clearances presented openings for southern sheep workers like Hogg, an uncomfortable and often overlooked element of Hogg's biography.<sup>83</sup> The 'poor Highlanders' are set apart as different to the 'brave and intelligent Borderers' who are 'the most valuable peasantry'. Hogg's writing is intimately bound to Border life, and for the most part Border life and customs are used to explore the supernatural, the concept of the oral tradition, and the politics of speech and language addressed in stories like 'The Brownie of the Black Hags'. Here, however, the Borders is characterised by its industrial nature, an area and people being shaped by forces of capital and modernity. The industrial revolution, particularly in the spread of the textile mills and in growing urban populations, shaped the Borders arguably more than any other event in modern history.<sup>84</sup> Hogg's story therefore frames the personal discussion of migration in terms of much broader historical, economic and social forces of change.

---

<sup>81</sup> Hogg, 'Emigration', *Supplement to the Connecticut Courant*, p. 109.

<sup>82</sup> There is a large body of literature on the Highland Clearances, and for the most recent historical analysis see Tom Devine, *The Scottish Clearance: A History of the Dispossessed 1600-1900* (London: Penguin, 2018). Devine suggests that clearances did happen in the Borders too, and that, while different in the specifics, the removal of Scotland's indigenous peasant or 'cottar' class as landlords moved towards large sheep holdings was a nation-wide phenomenon.

<sup>83</sup> Bruce Gilkison addresses Hogg's role in the Clearances. See *Walking with James Hogg: The Ettrick Shepherd's Journeys through Scotland* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2016) p. 37. For a more detailed survey of Hogg's travel to the Highlands, and his written accounts of it, see James Hogg, *Highland Journeys*, ed. by Hans de Groot (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2010).

<sup>84</sup> 'Industrial, Protestantized Selkirk was born out of the textile mills', argued Gwen Kennedy Neville in *The Mother Town: Civic Ritual, Symbol, and Experience in the Borders of Scotland* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994) p. 117. Selkirk's population doubled and tripled from 1830 to the 1880s (p. 116). The population of Galashiels grew 159% between the 1851 and 1881 census. There were four textile mills in the town in 1800, increasing to twenty by 1881. See M. Flinn, *Scottish Population History from the 17<sup>th</sup> century to the 1930s* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977), p. 311. A fully referenced overview and analysis of 1851 and 1881 census data in Galashiels can be found at <http://galashielshistory.com/index.html> [accessed 23/11/2018].

Before the story relating to the Haliday family is recounted, Hogg situates the story in relation to the experiences of those in his own family who plan to migrate, and have already migrated, to North America:

My own brothers, sisters, nephews, and nieces, are all going away; and if I were not the very individual that I am, I should be the first to depart. But my name is now so much identified with Scotland and Ettrick Forest, that though I must die as I have lived, I cannot leave them. But the little affecting story I set out with the purpose of telling is not begun yet. I went the other year to see some particular friends on board the gallant ship, Helen Douglas, for the British settlements of America.<sup>85</sup>

Hogg foregrounds his attachment to region and to nation in the above. The textual performance of authorial-ethnographic closeness which marshalled discourses of authenticity in labouring-class experience within a particular place is by this stage of his career a well-rehearsed trope within Hogg's short stories.<sup>86</sup> Collins argues in relation to 'Story of Two Highlanders' that the formal qualities of the short story enabled its transatlantic diffusion, and that that process of diffusion shaped in turn the story's literary themes and subjects.<sup>87</sup> Hogg's story 'Emigration' does something similar in its dramatisation of portability (or what David Stewart called the 'inherent mobility' within Hogg's stories) through the subject-theme of emigration.<sup>88</sup> This subject-theme is reflected in its material existence, as the story itself moves around various US magazines. Hogg's authenticating narratological strategies carry within the story the authorial identity of Hogg and the Ettrick Shepherd, repurposing the performance of authenticity and marginality into new cultural contexts. The paradox is that as well as dramatising portability, it also performs Hogg's situated-ness in Ettrick and in Scotland ('I cannot leave'), both the regional and the national – the 'aesthetics of provincialism' engaged in transatlantic themes. It is this foregrounded story-ness, the teller's key role in the narrative, which allows Hogg (or, more accurately, his associated author functions) to migrate via the 'cultures of reprinting'

---

<sup>85</sup> Hogg, 'Emigration', *Supplement to the Connecticut Courant*, p.109.

<sup>86</sup> See, for example, 'Description of a Peasant's Funeral' (1810), discussed in chapter one.

<sup>87</sup> Collins, 'Transnationalism', p. 20.

<sup>88</sup> Stewart, 'Genuine Border Stories', p. 92.

and the portability of the short story, repurposing the performance of authenticity to different contexts of reception.

*Original works: 'Tales of Fathers and Daughters'*

While most of the short stories which appeared in America were reprinted from original sites of publication in the UK, Hogg did contribute some original material to American magazines through his connection with De Witt Bloodgood in Albany:

I shall enclose you a tale and one or two ballads for your periodical and I think you may depend on the one or the other every month [...] I have just finished No I of 'Tales of father's and daughters' which I think I shall send you. No 2 you may expect the following week at which time I shall write again.<sup>89</sup>

Two months later, Hogg again wrote to De Witt Bloodgood suggesting an arrangement involving the supply of original materials:

This will likely be handed to you by Mr James Gray the nephew whom I wrote so earnestly to you about lately. His friend Mr Boyd will deliver something for your miscellany and I mean to be your correspondent every month.<sup>90</sup>

In both of these letters to the American publisher Hogg asks about his own family and friends who have, or are considering, migrating. 'I am thinking of sending out a great colony of friends and acquaintances' to a settlement in Susquehanna wrote Hogg in a letter of January 1834, and 'by the bye dear Bloodgood I have a nephew who is exceedingly bent on coming to America'.<sup>91</sup> That nephew, James Gray, is mentioned in the excerpt above from a March 1834 letter. 'You will remember', wrote Hogg, 'that I told you his talents for business'.<sup>92</sup> As in 'Emigration', the personal and the textual were closely tied in Hogg's relationship with America.

---

<sup>89</sup> Hogg's letter to De Witt Bloodgood, 25 January 1834, *Letters Vol. 3*, p. 199.

<sup>90</sup> Hogg's letter to De Witt Bloodgood, 24 March 1834, *Letters Vol. 3*, p. 207.

<sup>91</sup> Hogg's letter to De Witt Bloodgood, 25 January 1834, *Letters Vol. 3*, p. 200.

<sup>92</sup> Hogg's letter to De Witt Bloodgood, 24 March 1834, *Letters Vol. 3*, p. 207.

Hogg's original contribution to *Bloodgood* mentioned in the January letter was 'Tales of Fathers and Daughters', published across three monthly instalments of *The Zodiac* in Albany in July, August, and September 1835. The story tells of tensions between Highland Scotland and lowland Scotland, and between city and countryside, as Mary McFarlane considers a move to 'tat creat sinful phlace' Edinburgh.<sup>93</sup> The title of the story proclaims its authorship 'BY THE ETTRICK SHEPHERD', and, before that, declares its originality '[For the Zodiac]'.<sup>94</sup> The story is relatively short on the experiential level of storytelling that is distinctive of Hogg's short stories, such as that discussed above in 'Emigration', and only twice does the narrating 'I' interrupt the story, both in the third and final instalment of the story. 'The old man's name I think was Wilkie',<sup>95</sup> explains the Ettrick Shepherd in a typically ambiguous narrative authority strategy – he 'thinks' rather than knows for certain. In a more assured display of authorial presence in the telling, the narrator explains that 'I have seen those who remember him posting through the streets of Edinburgh with his staff in his hands, and his tartan plaid about him'.<sup>96</sup> There is still a narrative distancing between the storytelling and the events being told here - it has been passed on by those who had witnessed it, rather than witnessed by the storyteller himself. Nevertheless, the Ettrick Shepherd is within the story and its 'thin layers' of telling, as well as being named in the titling. This is the same process that carries the author function within reprinted stories, though the difference with 'Tales of Fathers and Daughters' is that Hogg had personal agency in its publication.

Douglas and Wilma Mack edited the story for *Studies in Hogg and his World* in 2004.<sup>97</sup> They argue that the story, submitted to the American periodical press, is

forceful in its implied criticisms of the Scottish aspect of the British class system, and it may be that writing for an overtly democratic American

---

<sup>93</sup> Hogg, 'Tales of Fathers and Daughters. BY THE ETTRICK SHEPHERD', *The Zodiac, a Monthly Periodical, Devoted to Science, Literature, and the Arts* 1.1 (July 1835), 2- 4  
<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=h0RFAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA2>> [accessed 8/7/2019] (p. 3)

<sup>94</sup> Hogg, 'Tales of Fathers and Daughters', p. 2.

<sup>95</sup> Hogg, 'Tales of Fathers and Daughters', *The Zodiac* 1.3 (September, 1835), 39-41 (p. 40).

<sup>96</sup> Hogg, 'Tales of Fathers and Daughters', *The Zodiac* 1.3 (September, 1835), p. 40.

<sup>97</sup> Hogg, 'Tales of Fathers and Daughters No.2', edited and introduced by Douglas and Wilma Mack', *Studies in Hogg and his World* 15 (2004), 126-162.

audience helped Hogg to feel free to explore this topic with especial vigour in this particular story.<sup>98</sup>

As well as the contexts of reception shaping the cultural translation of the story, the process of textual editing between Hogg's manuscript (at Yale University's Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library) and *The Zodiac* story is notable in how it alters key elements of Hogg's story. Hogg's idiosyncratic spelling in the manuscript is evened-out, 'adopting American spellings as it does so'.<sup>99</sup> The magazine editors are also guilty of 'misreading or misunderstanding' Hogg's manuscript, particularly in the sections of Hogg's depiction of the Highland-English speech of Gaelic speakers. There are also some instances of 'mild bowdlerisation' in *The Zodiac* story, which alters the word 'mistress' to 'chereamie'.<sup>100</sup> Individually, these changes are small, but they do illustrate what is lost – and what is gained – in the actual and cultural translation of the story from Ettrick to America.

'Let only one thing of mine appear in your periodical at once and if I am in health I shall try to keep going', wrote Hogg to Bloodgood in 1834. Hogg died in November 1835. As Janette Currie explains, Hogg's death:

came as a blow for *The Zodiac's* then-editor, Mathew Henry Webster [...] It is not known whether Hogg was aware of the publication of his tale in *The Zodiac*, or whether he received any payment.<sup>101</sup>

Hogg's death signalled the end of his original short story contributions to American magazines. Bloodgood's *The Zodiac* reported that 'the death of James Hogg, the Ettrick shepherd, is an event which the readers of the *Zodiac* have reason to deplore' because:

original articles from his pen were confidently expected in addition to those which had already appeared in our columns, and such arrangements were made

---

<sup>98</sup> "'Tales of Fathers and Daughters No.2', edited and introduced by Douglas and Wilma Mack', p. 126.

<sup>99</sup> "'Tales of Fathers and Daughters No.2', edited and introduced by Douglas and Wilma Mack', p. 146.

<sup>100</sup> "'Tales of Fathers and Daughters No.2', edited and introduced by Douglas and Wilma Mack', p. 149.

<sup>101</sup> Currie, 'Hogg in the Zodiac'.

that we felt no hesitation in promising to the public a continuation of his contributions.<sup>102</sup>

The magazine printed an account of Hogg's death from an unnamed 'friend and correspondent' who had visited Hogg from America:

The lyre of Ettrick is broken, the harp unstrung, which for so long a period gave interest to the green hills of his own beloved Yarrow. No more in the glens, no more on the banks of their romantic streams, nor in the bosom of his own St. Mary's, where he spent so many happy hours, will his cheerful voice again be heard.<sup>103</sup>

In death as in life, Hogg is situated firmly within the geographic locale associated with his author function(s) and authorial identities. In this depiction of 'romantic streams' and 'cheerful voices', Hogg is placed within a peasant-poet paradigm, an early indication of what would become an enduring legacy and cultural memory of Hogg as heaven-taught Romantic tradition-bearer into the mid- and later nineteenth century.

#### *The migration of the Author?*

In many ways, *The Zodiac's* reaction to Hogg's death shows the forces which shaped the contest over Hogg's author function(s). One might assume that Hogg's death signalled the end of his agency in that contest over authorial control rooted in the identities and discourses of class, region and nation, his 'harp unstrung'. He could no longer submit new works, to the chagrin of the magazine's publishers. Yet, as we have seen above, it was reprinting rather than original contributions that characterised most of Hogg's short stories in America during his lifetime. The form's characteristic portability aided its circulation and diffusion in American magazines, and in the case of 'Emigration', the formal portability of the story was reflected in thematic concerns within the narrative itself. Hogg's short story aesthetic, which foregrounds the acts of storytelling and the function of the teller in shaping the narrative, meant that Hogg's

---

<sup>102</sup> 'The Ettrick Shepherd', *The Zodiac* 1.11 (May, 1836)  
<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=AUtAAQAAMAAJ&pg=RA1-PA120>> [accessed 04/03/2019]  
p.120

<sup>103</sup> 'The Ettrick Shepherd', *The Zodiac*, p. 120.

author function(s) migrated to America and operated in new contexts of publication and reception through those processes of reprinting in the periodical press. If the Hoggian short story form can be characterised by its portability, then Hogg's claim in his short story 'Emigration' that he cannot leave for America seems without justification – as both James Hogg and as the Ettrick Shepherd, he had already emigrated within the narratives he had written.

Hogg had claimed in 'Emigration' that 'my name is now so much identified with Scotland and Ettrick Forest, that though I must die as I have lived, I cannot leave them.'<sup>104</sup> On the other hand, if we conceive of authenticity as a concept constructed in and through literary-formal modes of representation, rather than a natural essence of authorship tied to associations with place or class, authors and narratives can leave their places of situated-ness and see their performance of authenticity continue to function in new contexts. How this looks in the case of Hogg and his mostly reprinted short stories in America is that, for example, the margins-metropolis dialectic of authenticity staged within Hogg's texts is translated into American cultural contexts of the 'green savannahs' and the 'western wilds of America' defined against those 'of accomplishment and refined taste, to be found in our cities'. Joseph Rezek's study of early nineteenth-century transatlantic print culture stresses the interconnectivity of Britain and American literature during the period, and argues that London was the driving force in shaping the centre-periphery relations which underpinned both the circulation of books and shaped literary aesthetics, joining 'a growing scholarship devoted to connecting the history of material texts with a concern for aesthetics and literary form'.<sup>105</sup> This centre-periphery dynamic shaped literary strategies and aesthetics, particularly through what Rezek terms 'an aesthetics of provinciality', which is an appeal to 'to readers' sympathy, aestheticised displays of national character, figurations of cross-cultural communion'.<sup>106</sup> Representing local regions to an audience outside of the particularities of the region being represented at once

---

<sup>104</sup> Hogg, 'Emigration', *Supplement to the Connecticut Courant*, p. 109.

<sup>105</sup> Rezek, p. 7.

<sup>106</sup> Rezek, p. 18.

confirmed the peripheral character of these texts while ‘projecting literary exchange into an exalted realm’.<sup>107</sup>

In the case of Hogg, his transatlantic American magazine short stories staged within their narratives national and regional tropes in their representation of Scottish and Border culture and traditions, a performance achieved through highly literary modes of representation in the reprint culture of the periodical press. These seemingly ‘provincial’ aesthetics, however, operated in dialogue with their contexts of reception to produce new meanings and associations, including through the American interest in Scottish themes such as that of national liberty narratives and the uses of the past, to diasporic interests, or, as Currie argued with regards to ‘Emigration’, ‘Scottish’ stories could function in relation to distinctively *American* political contexts. ‘Texts often served utterly different purposes in Massachusetts’, argues Collins, ‘than in Edinburgh or London’.<sup>108</sup> Those purposes in the case of Hogg’s stories were more closely aligned than Collins suggests – in the performance of authenticity, the ‘aesthetics of provincialism’ functioned in different contexts (Scotland, London, and America) while operating through similar discourses of marginality and the metropolis. Hogg’s strategies of authentication in relation to place and class and his foregrounding of peripherality come at a formative point in histories of the short story form in America, although more work remains to be done to substantiate the suggestive claims made by Lyall about Hogg’s role in shaping a form that would later gain an association with being distinctively American.<sup>109</sup> This complex picture of continually reshaped relationships between texts and contexts reaffirms the need to consider reprints not as a secondary mode to notions of ‘the original’, but as texts which point to their socialised and networked fields of production, negotiated between author, editors, publishers, printers, and readers. American reprints of Hogg’s short stories carry within them the author function and its complex and continually renegotiated performance of authenticity, therefore Hogg’s death in 1835 could not signal the death of this author.

---

<sup>107</sup> Rezek, p. 64.

<sup>108</sup> Collins, ‘Transnationalism’, p. 12.

<sup>109</sup> Lyall, pp. 314-315.

## CONCLUSION: The power of authenticity in the ‘lonely voice’, and futures

This thesis has argued that the representation of authenticity is important, and that form shapes how authenticity is represented and how it can be performed in texts. The short story in the early nineteenth century did not have a theoretical self-consciousness as a form, and Hogg never described himself (in any existing evidence) as a ‘short story writer’. Indeed, as discussed in the introduction, the term ‘short story’ emerged much later in the century in English-language literary criticism. Yet this formal slipperiness and diffuseness presented conditions through which Hogg fashioned the form’s portability. As David Stewart argues, the form’s lack of fixity in the Romantic-era is what makes it so interesting and valuable to scholars thinking about historicising literary forms.<sup>1</sup> Textual portability within Hogg’s short stories involved an interrogative narrative aesthetic, characterised by self-referential textuality and elliptical storytelling. His short stories draw the readers’ attention to contradictory sources of authority, involving ‘I was told’ (as in ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream’), ‘I saw’ (in the opening of ‘Emigration’), and ‘I read from’ (in ‘Wat Pringle o’ the Yair’). ‘My narrative must grow confused’, wrote Hogg in his 1830 short story ‘The Unearthly Witness’ in typical Hoggian diffusion of singular narrative authority, ‘because the real events are not known to me, nor, as far as I can gather, to mortal man.’<sup>2</sup> Furthermore, Hogg’s stories often draw attention to their own formal brevity, to their own incompleteness and indeterminacy (as in ‘Story of the Ghost of Lochmaben, by John Miller’). Orality, memory, and the printed word are drawn-up as sources for narrative authority, and rarely do any one of these hold the final say in a narrative. In ‘Brownie of the Black Hags’, for example, the oral tradition of the local peasant and labouring-classes have their own explanation for events, beyond those which are explained in print in Hogg’s telling of the story. In ‘A Scots Mummy’ and ‘Singular Letter from Southern Africa’, the epistolary trope plays an authenticating function – yet in neither story does the letter itself hold an authoritative explanation of events being narrativised through it.

---

<sup>1</sup> Stewart, ‘Romantic Short Fiction’, p. 82.

<sup>2</sup> Hogg, ‘The Unearthly Witness’, p. 178.

Within this unfixed, portable narrative praxis, Hogg's interrogative narrative aesthetic engages signifiers of authenticity through place, class, and language. In the grounding of layers of storytelling at the level of 'I was told' and 'I heard', Hogg's stories locate the storytelling 'I' within the community from which the narrative emerges, which is usually that of southern Scotland, particularly Selkirkshire. These communities are generally depicted as being labouring-class, and are Scots speaking. Both class and vernacularity are staged within the narrative, in which the storyteller can switch register between Scots and English (such as in 'Description of a Peasant's Funeral') and can also function as a 'translator' for the reader ('Danger of Changing Occupations'). While these features share similarities with Hogg's writing across other forms, the early nineteenth-century short story provided specific formal contexts which shaped Hogg's narrative praxis within the form and shaped its ideological function. Significant among those formal contexts is the medium of publication within which short stories appeared. Throughout this thesis, the discussion has shown how contexts shape the function stories at the level of both narrative and ideology. Hogg's short stories in magazines were embedded in periodical print culture. Some of those periodical cultures were very specific, such as explored in chapter two in the study of *Blackwood's* and Hogg's contest of the 'Ettrick Shepherd' moniker. Indeed, the analysis in chapter one of Hogg's own periodical experiment *The Spy* has shown how short stories within magazines operated in dialogue with the magazine as a broader textual entity, particularly in the dialogue with the editorial notes and framings which blurred any neat division between a story and its context of publication. As argued in chapter three, books also shaped how stories functioned at the levels of both narrative and ideologies of authenticity of class, place, and language. In the short story collections of Hogg's work, the book format does not represent a foil to the magazine short story by means of tangibility versus ephemerality. Rather, it entails its own dialogism of 'variegation' and 'unity and variety'.

The short story in the case of Hogg is a form that physically moved between magazine, chapbook, and book during his career. Stories like 'The Long Pack' appeared in *The Spy* after having once appeared in various chapbook forms. Some stories from *The Spy* moved to *Blackwood's*, before then moving to book format in *Winter Evening Tales* (1820), and many of Hogg's other *Blackwood's* short story contributions

moving to book format in *The Shepherd's Calendar* (1829). As argued in chapter three, this was not a straightforward narrative of progression from 'lower' to 'higher' literary mediums, as some stories would migrate from genteel American magazines to cheap Northumberland chapbooks (like 'The Long Pack'). As shown in chapters four and five, the physical portability of the form facilitated its dispersal across magazines beyond Scotland, catalysed by 'cultures of reprinting' in the US and by established networks of literary London-Scots in the English capital particularly following Hogg's visit in 1832. David Stewart has written on Hogg's troubling of fixity in relation to place, and used the 'resources of 1830s print culture' to reflect the inherent mobility of place:

His method of writing is far from linear or smooth, never an affectless passage from beginning to resolution. The messy details, the interruptions, the wanderings off the path, that take place in the midst of his stories are where he presents to his readers his mobile Borders.<sup>3</sup>

The Borders, suggests Stewart, 'emerge from his work as a place of constant movement and change, not a safely historicised past or a pleasingly picturesque setting'.<sup>4</sup> Stewart's focus on geographic mobility echoes that of Fielding who argued that 'Hogg is not so much a local writer as a writer about locality and about the impossibility of fixing it'.<sup>5</sup> Stewart's reading of the inherent mobility of geographies in Hogg's fiction is important in divesting Hogg of his specific located-ness in Ettrick. Indeed, Stewart's 'mobility' complements my theory of portability by sharing some of the characteristics of physical movement and an unfixed narrative aesthetic. Where Stewart's reading of these features iterates the mobility of a place (the Borders), my thesis argues that portability or 'mobility' can be ascribed to the form itself as both a material 'thing' and as a narrative praxis. Place and geography are an important part of portability, particularly in the reprinting of stories across different magazines in London and in America, and also in their authenticating function in the margins-metropolis dialectic inherent in Hogg's portable narrative aesthetic.

---

<sup>3</sup> Stewart, 'Genuine Border Stories: James Hogg, Fiction and Mobility in the 1830s', *The Yearbook of English Studies* 48 (2018), 82-100 (p. 88).

<sup>4</sup> Stewart, 'Genuine Border Stories', p. 92.

<sup>5</sup> Fielding, *Scotland and the Fictions of Geography: North Britain, 1760-1830* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), p. 161.

Following his death, that process of the material portability of the short story form did not stop. The Blackie's edition of collected fictions – long and short – in 1836-37, 1865, and the centenary editions in the 1870s (discrepancies over the actual date of Hogg's birthday meant that there were numerous centenary editions), each contained versions of Hogg's short stories. Into the twentieth century, Hogg's stories have been collected from their diffuse nineteenth-century roots and placed in collections such as Douglas Mack's *Selected Stories and Sketches* (1982), David Groves's *Tales of Love and Romance* (1985), and, more recently, *The Devil I am Sure: Three Short Stories by James Hogg* (2019).<sup>6</sup> The ongoing Stirling/South Carolina research edition also reflects the form's portable nature, particularly in their notes on the textual histories of editions which show the diffuse roots of narratives between manuscript versions, editorial revisions, and multiple, at times contradictory, published versions.<sup>7</sup> In this way, the Stirling/South Carolina edition opens-up the Hoggian short story, showing its elision of fixity, the multiplicity of contexts shaping how a story functioned, and the futility of attempting to locate a singular definitive version of a short story by Hogg.

Hughes argues that S/SC project is moving towards the fulfilment of Hogg's ambitions:

Fortunately Hogg's ambitions for a collected edition of his prose work are now being gradually fulfilled with the publication of the successive volumes of the

---

<sup>6</sup> 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic', published in London in *Fraser's Magazine* in 1830 and discussed in chapter four of this thesis, did not appear in print again until 1982 when it was included in Douglas Mack (ed.) *Selected Stories and Sketches* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1982). See Mack, *Editing James Hogg* (unpublished Ph.D thesis, University of Stirling, 1984) p. 142 for a detailed discussion of the differences between MS and print versions of the story in the context of Hogg's relationship with *Blackwood's* and *Fraser's*. More recently, 'Singular Letter' was published in short collection of Hogg's short stories, *The Devil I am Sure* (Glasgow: ASLS, 2019).

<sup>7</sup> See, for example, the background notes on 'The Long Pack' in Ian Duncan (ed.), *Winter Evening Tales* (2002) p. 562. This gives an overview of the chapbook history, a posthumous circulation history, of the story. The appendix (pp. 509-526) provides the MS version of the story, alongside the 1817 chapbook version of the story, detailing textual differences between the two. The 2004 revised edition of *Winter Evening Tales* includes an additional chapbook version from 1809.

Stirling/South Carolina Research Edition of the Collected Works of James Hogg.<sup>8</sup>

The S/SC *Collected Works of James Hogg* has played an essential role in advancing Hogg scholarship since the 1990s, and this thesis owes a huge amount to that scholarly inheritance. However, with large textual editing projects of this nature there is a risk of moving towards a notion of the definitive edition of a text or texts, and with that, a sense of closure. Douglas Mack's introduction to S/SC *The Shepherd's Calendar* is suggestive of the editorial challenges posed by the complex web of transmission between magazine and book formats of Hogg's short stories, with Mack outlining the reasoning for the S/SC book version of *The Shepherd's Calendar* containing the 'original' magazine versions of the stories as opposed to the bowdlerised 1829 book versions:

Seen as a group and read in the original versions, they combine, like the stories of Joyce's *Dubliners*, into a resonant and convincing portrait of the life and spirit of a particular society.<sup>9</sup>

What role does the book as a medium (the S/SC edition is, after all, a series of books rather than magazines) play in the curation of this resonance between the stories? What is lost or gained in the transmission of stories from one medium (the magazine) to another (the book), and how far can we ascribe 'originality' to these retellings? Joyce's *Dubliners* is one of the best-known English-language short story collections – yet it too has its roots (partly) in magazines.<sup>10</sup> I am not suggesting that Mack is wrong here, rather I am suggesting that these questions lead us toward an understanding of the S/SC collected works of Hogg's short stories as process of opening-up complexity and connections, rather than offering definitive conclusions. New research continues to add nuance to this ongoing process, such as Janette Currie's 'discovery' (from a Hogg studies perspective – those who work in archives and libraries do much of the labour of 'discovery') of an earlier American magazine

---

<sup>8</sup> Hughes, 'Introduction', *Altrive Tales*, p. xxxiv.

<sup>9</sup> Douglas Mack, 'Introduction', *The Shepherd's Calendar*, p. xix.

<sup>10</sup> Florence L. Walzl, 'Joyce's 'The Sisters': A Development', *James Joyce Quarterly*, 50.1/2 (Autumn 2012-Winter 2013), 73-117; Dathalinn O'Dea, 'James Joyce the Regionalist: The *Irish Homestead*, *Dubliners*, and Modernism's Regional Affect', *Modern Fiction Studies*, 63.3 (2017), 475-501.

edition of 'The Long Pack', complicating the transmission trail as told between the 2002 and 2004 S/SC editions of *Winter Evening Tales*.<sup>11</sup>

Portability, then, provides a means through which to conceive of the short story as both a material and a narrative entity. It also provides a framework for understanding authenticity as a performative function of text and form constructed within stories and transported by them. In the case of Hogg, the performance of authenticity as a labouring-class Scots-speaking rural writer was built into what Benjamin described as the 'thin layers' of storytelling through the narrative praxis outlined above.<sup>12</sup> This performance of authenticity was then carried across mediums of publication and into 'new' contexts which reshaped and repurposed how that authenticity functioned. In the case of Hogg's London stories, discussed in chapter four, Hogg's authenticity is amplified as the authoritative voice of the margins in the metropolis, albeit the 'margins' taking on more a national (Scottish) dimension in this context than the regional (Selkirkshire) dimension Hogg's Scottish-based publications, such as *The Spy* and his *Blackwood's* contributions, played to. In Hogg's stories which appeared in American periodicals, the specific signifiers of national authenticity found audiences receptive to those 'Old World' themes and interests (some perhaps diasporic), while the more general themes of countryside-city and margins-metropolis could be reapplied to the context of American westward expansion and the growth of the great American cities. Each of these print media and reception contexts reshape the specific meanings of authenticity, on the common theme of the marginal outsider speaking to the centre.

Frank O'Connor argued that the short story is a form that has never had a hero. 'What it has instead', suggested O'Connor, 'is a submerged population group — a bad phrase which I have had to use for want of a better... a sense of outlawed figures wandering about the fringes of society'.<sup>13</sup> O'Connor's thesis includes 'Gogol's officials,

---

<sup>11</sup> See Duncan, 'Appendix: Hogg's manuscript of "The Long Pack"', pp. 509-513.

<sup>12</sup> Benjamin, 'The Storyteller', p. 6.

<sup>13</sup> Frank O'Connor, *The Lonely Voice: A Study of the Short Story* (New York: Melville House, 2004), pp. 16-17.

Turgenev's serfs, Maupassant's prostitutes, Chekhov's doctors and teachers, Sherwood Anderson's provincials, always dreaming of escape.<sup>14</sup> He might add to this list Hogg's destitute new mothers (in 'Maria's Tale'), Hogg's characters with experience of psychological trauma ('Strange Letter of a Lunatic'), or Hogg's labouring-class Scots-speaking aspiring writers in the metropolis (*The Spy's* John Miller). These multiple perspectives of 'lonely voices' in Hogg's short stories undoubtedly draw upon Hogg's biography as a labouring-class writer, though this thesis contends that it is not Hogg's background that determines his authority to speak as those 'wandering about the fringes of society'. It is, rather, his ability to stage authenticity within texts which allow that authenticity to function. In other words, it is not just that Hogg writes marginal characters into his short stories, it is that authenticity functions through the form in which those characters, voices, and perspectives are constructed. The performance of authenticity is located in the act of the telling, as much as that which is being told.

While this thesis is grounded in studies of James Hogg, short story theory, and histories of print culture, its argument about the performance of authenticity in culture holds implications beyond those specific fields. Joe Kennedy argues that authenticity in post-Tony Blair Britain has taken on a renewed role in both cultural and political discourse in what he terms 'the authentocratic turn'.<sup>15</sup> In almost an inverse of Raymond Williams' theory of the cultural idea of an untouched pastoral countryside which is perennially 'over the next hill',<sup>16</sup> 'authentocracy' is the search for a 'real' grittiness routinely functioning through a set of signifiers associated with the cultural identities of class: vernacularity and accent, consumption habits (Kennedy cites Owen Smith, the 2016 contender for the leader of the Labour Party, who in an interview explained his discomfort at being served cappuccino 'in a posh cup'), cultural activities such as proclaiming a loyalty to a football club. While Kennedy writes about this as a UK-wide phenomenon and gives some particular focus to English political and literary realism, one need not look far to see how those signifiers of authenticity

---

<sup>14</sup> O'Connor, p.17.

<sup>15</sup> Joe Kennedy, *Authentocrats: Culture, Politics and the New Seriousness* (London: Repeater Books, 2018), pp. 6-9 (p. 8).

<sup>16</sup> Raymond Williams, *The Country and The City* (London: Chatto and Windus, 1973), p. 10.

can have a particular Scottish dimension, especially so given the associations of Scots vernacularity with ‘real’ working class culture. Darren ‘Loki’ McGarvey, the author, social commentator, and self-titled ‘Scottish rapper’, won the Orwell Prize for his 2017 book *Poverty Safari*. Reviewers and commentators focused attention upon McGarvey’s connection to a realist, gritty Scotland:

It is *Trainspotting* – a film he can’t bear to watch because, for him, it feels like a documentary – and then some.<sup>17</sup>

The reviewer links McGarvey’s authenticity to a ‘realist’ depiction of Scotland in the film version of Irvine Welsh’s 1993 novel *Trainspotting*, a narrative about 1980s working-class Edinburgh and now a central part of the working-class Scottish literary canon to which, as discussed in the introduction to this thesis, Hogg himself has been attached. Kennedy invokes Roland Barthes’s 1968 essay ‘The Reality Effect’, in which realism is portrayed as, in Kennedy’s words, ‘a form of idealism, an *idea* about reality which is accepted in place of the thing itself’.<sup>18</sup> McGarvey’s writing itself deploys signifiers of class and consumption habits in its analysis of inequality and culture, signifying realism:

When you're sitting in an artisan cafe called Soy Division, in the middle of a slum, and there's a toddler named Wagner eating tofu off the floor, that's gentrification.

Here, McGarvey points to consumption habits (soy, tofu) and cultural tastes (Wagner) as the vanguard of gentrification, as opposed to, for example, housing policy in the UK. That is not to divorce cultural signifiers from the ‘real’ material conditions of society, nor do I wish to invoke an analysis rooted in base-superstructure.<sup>19</sup> Rather, foregrounding the power of ideologies, and identities, of authenticity in discourse and

---

<sup>17</sup> Stephen Moss, ‘Interview: ‘Not every day was like *Trainspotting*’: Orwell prize winner Darren McGarvey on class, addiction and redemption’, *The Guardian* Tuesday 26 June 2018

<sup>18</sup> ‘Authenticity is a Disciplining Tool’—An Interview With Joe Kennedy, by Thom Cuell’, in *Minor Literatures* 1/8/2018 <https://minorliteratures.com/2018/08/01/authenticity-is-a-disciplining-tool-an-interview-with-joe-kennedy-by-thom-cuell/> [accessed 11/06/2019]

<sup>19</sup> Ewan Gibbs has written on the rise of class as a cultural identity in political discourse, arguing that ‘class has been repositioned as an essentially cultural historical phenomenon rather than a dynamic, lived reality connected to the changing temporalities of British capitalism.’ See Ewan Gibbs, ‘Who’s ‘Normal’? Class, Culture and Labour Politics in a Fragmented Britain’, in *Renewal: A Journal of Social Democracy* Vol. 25 No. 7 (2017) <[http://www.renewal.org.uk/articles/whos-normal-class-culture-and-labour-politics-in-a-fragmented-britain?fbclid=IwAR1WWW\\_Ax6TJ-D4QpAbm4FOawJTdx4ByB\\_2970CceUX-G3IskrPh2V7gg8](http://www.renewal.org.uk/articles/whos-normal-class-culture-and-labour-politics-in-a-fragmented-britain?fbclid=IwAR1WWW_Ax6TJ-D4QpAbm4FOawJTdx4ByB_2970CceUX-G3IskrPh2V7gg8)> [accessed 11/06/2019]

in society allows for an analysis of how that authenticity is staged and performed across different mediums and forms, and how it can operate in different historical contexts. The differences between the reception of McGarvey and Hogg are clear, in that Hogg's authenticity is rooted in the peripheral countryside labouring-class of the early nineteenth century as opposed to the urban working-class of contemporary Scotland. Both perspectives, however, employ a narrative of dissidence and subalternity, grounded in class, region, and nation, and set against a hegemonic metropolitan elite 'other' in their foregrounding of authentication. Both McGarvey and Hogg use monikers which position themselves in terms of vocation, class and place, in the 'Scottish rapper' and the 'Ettrick Shepherd' respectively.<sup>20</sup>

This thesis began by sketching-out representations of Hogg's place in Scotland's working-class literary canon, alongside later twentieth-century urban working-class writers such as Kelman and Welsh. It has argued that Hogg's associations with marginality and with outsider, non-hegemonic identities are not one of essence but of performance, through which Hogg exercised agency. The emphasis on performativity of text and form and the representative function of language and style is not to fully depart from the role of biography in Hogg criticism, or to erase the importance of his material class position, vocational background and relationship to place in terms of both region and nation. Rather, it is to restore the role of agency through an analysis of form and contexts of publication, an approach that takes into account authorial intentionality (drawing, for example, upon evidence from Hogg's letters and his autobiographical texts) while exploring the power relationships that shaped the author function(s) associated with Hogg and the forms he wrote in. In doing so, the unifying concept of portability can liberate the 'Ettrick Shepherd' from a limiting paradigm of pastoral-traditionalism associated with the figure of the 'peasant-poet', replacing the figure of *naturae donum* with a writer deeply engaged with emergent forms of writing and networks of production, and engaged in debate with, rather than merely subject

---

<sup>20</sup> The use of 'the Scottish Rapper' is used regularly in relation to McGarvey. McGarvey's official Facebook.com site page uses the moniker 'Loki the Scottish Rapper' <<https://www.facebook.com/MistaLoki/>> [accessed 3/7/2019], as does his YouTube.com channel <<https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCSFe-85V4daP-OqCSVEo-IA>> [accessed 3/7/2019]. Press articles also refer to McGarvey by the moniker. See David Pollock, 'Loki the Scottish Rapper', *The List* 18 August 2018 <<https://edinburghfestival.list.co.uk/article/102508-loki-the-scottish-rapper-poverty-safari-live/>> [accessed 3/7/2019]

to, ideological forces through the performance of authenticity and its dialectic of between-ness: between speech and writing, between tradition and modernity, between the countryside and the city, between the labouring-class and the literary elite, and between author, form, and reader. The notion of performative authenticity in texts does not redirect us toward the lichen-covered grave of the author in Ettrick kirkyard. Instead, it provides a model for understanding how the concept of the authorship and authorial identity functions in relation to socialised, historically locatable, and deeply contested ideologies of authenticity.

As well as the implications for thinking about authenticity in relation to class, vernacularity, region and nation in Scottish cultural production, there are several other potential futures for the conclusions offered by this research. One of those relates to the substantiation within this thesis of Andrew Levy's claim that the short story is a form with a heritage. This thesis has shown how that heritage is intimately bound to histories of periodical magazine print cultures, to emergent book mediums such as the short story collection, and to ideas of authorship in the cultural field of production. The claims made hitherto are made with reference to the work of James Hogg. The most obvious next steps would be to broaden the scope of short story writers in the early nineteenth century, to include, and perhaps discover, others who were using the form in Scotland, Britain, and further afield. Building upon chapter five's analysis of American magazine reprints of Hogg's stories, a more extensive study of US reprints of Scottish short stories at an important, and formative, moment in the development of the form towards the 'American short story', could be developed and help to interrogate the suggestive claims by R.J. Lyall about the influential role of Scottish fiction, particular its use of orality, in shaping the American short story. Such a project could interrogate Andrew Hook's claim that Hogg was one the most widely read Scot in America in the early nineteenth century. Another limitation of this thesis is that it is grounded in English-language short story writing. What of the form across different European nations in the early nineteenth century? What about the non- 'Western' short story in the early nineteenth century? Were there transnational, trans-cultural and trans-linguistic points of connection between the short story in Britain and America and the short story in other parts of the globe? The short story remains an under theorised, and under historicised, form. Reconstructing specific print and publishing

histories and tracing points of portability and connection, as this thesis has done in the case of Hogg, can provide a model for a much more ambitious research project. The analysis of Hogg in London, in chapter four of this thesis, could also form part of a broader study of the cultural history of Scots in London, from James Boswell, Scott, and Hogg, to the Tennent's Lager advert of the 1990s which played upon the trope of the Scot moving to London for opportunity and feeling alienated by its other-ness, and, in that process, helping to represent an authentic and distinctive imagined community in Scotland. These are potential futures for the research offered by this thesis. It is enough to say for now that James Hogg, like his portable short stories, will continue to 'confound the bodies' of fixity and closure.<sup>21</sup>

---

<sup>21</sup> Hogg, 'The Spy's encounter with John Miller', p. 121.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

### *Primary sources*

- [Anon] 'Familiar Epistles to Christopher North, from an Old Friend with a New Face.', *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, 10 (August, 1821)  
<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=eWsHAQAIAAJ&pg=PA43#>>  
[accessed 14/7/2019] pp. 43-52
- [Anon] 'The Ettrick Shepherd and Other Scotch Poets', *American Monthly Magazine*, 1 (November, 1829) <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=-3FBAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA522>> [accessed 8/7/2019] pp. 522-530
- [Anon] 'Review of *The Club Book*', *The Metropolitan*, 1 (August, 1831), pp. 146-148
- [Anon] *Verses on the Report of the Morbus entering Glasgow* (1831) National Library of Scotland, shelf mark: APS.3.96.5
- [Anon] 'Notices of new works: the history of the contagious cholera', *The Metropolitan*, 2 (November, 1831), p. 73
- [Anon] 'Of our present state and future prospects on the cholera question', *The Metropolitan*, 2 (November, 1831), pp. 332-337
- [Anon] [James Hogg], Review of *Original Songs by Robert Gilfillan*, *The Metropolitan*, 3 (March, 1832), pp. 65-68
- [Anon] 'Remarkable points connected with the epidemic cholera', *The Metropolitan*, 3 (March, 1832), pp. 328-448
- [Anon] 'A Visit to the Ettrick Shepherd by an American Tourist', *American Monthly Magazine*, 3 (1834) <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=3GzXAAAAMAAJ>>  
[Accessed 12/01/2019] pp. 85-91
- [Anon] *Catalogue of the Parthenon Circulating Library and Reading Rooms, Charles S Francis 252 Broadway* (New York: C. S. Francis, 1834)  
<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=Uz4RAAAAIAAJ>> [accessed 19/11/2017]
- [Anon] 'The Ettrick Shepherd', *The Zodiac*, 1:11 (May, 1836)  
<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=AUtAAQAAMAAJ&pg=RA1-PA120>>  
[accessed 04/03/2019]
- [Anon] 'A Visit to the Ettrick Shepherd by an American Tourist', *The Military and Naval Magazine of the United States*, 6 (1836)

- <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=hbxLAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA329>>  
[accessed 12/01/2019] pp. 329 – 334
- [Anon] ‘Original Letter of the Ettrick Shepherd’, *Waldie’s Select Circulating Library: Journal of Belles Lettres*, 7 (Philadelphia, 1836)  
<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=-rM-AAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA447&lpg=PA447>> [accessed 8/7/2019]
- [Anon] *Catalogue of the Irving Circulating Library, 120 Nassau Street, Conducted by William H. Attree* (New York, 1842)  
<[https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=K1w\\_AQAAMAAJ](https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=K1w_AQAAMAAJ)> [accessed 20/11/2017]
- [Anon] *A catalogue of books of the Boston Literary Society* (TR Marvin, Boston, 1844) <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=orFfAAAACAAJ>> [accessed 21/11/2017]
- Hogg, James, ‘The Brownie of the Black Haggs’, *The Casket, or Flowers of Literature, Wit & Sentiment*, 3 (November, 1828)  
<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=2EcZAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA558#>>  
[accessed 8/7/2019] pp. 558-564
- ‘The Barber of Duncow. – A Real Ghost Story by the Ettrick Shepherd’, *Fraser’s Magazine*, 3 (March, 1831) <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=B3A-AQAAMAAJ&pg=PA174>> [Accessed 27/03/2019] pp. 174-180
- ‘The Barber of Duncow’, *The New Casket*, 14 (April, 1831); 15 (April, 1831)  
<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=qs88G62QO4MC&pg=PA105> [Accessed 27/03/2019] pp. 104-109; pp. 114-117
- ‘Some Terrible Letters from Scotland, communicated by the Ettrick Shepherd’, *The Metropolitan*, 3 (April, 1832)  
<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=GyMAAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA422&lpg>>  
[Accessed 21/02/2019] pp. 422-431
- ‘Emigration. By the Ettrick Shepherd’, *Chambers’s Edinburgh Journal*, 2 (April, 1834) <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=bVkyAQAAMAAJ&pg=PA124#>>  
[accessed 8/7/2019] pp. 124-125
- ‘Emigration’, *Supplement to the Connecticut Courant*, 3.14 (August, 1835)  
<<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=hywTAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA109>>  
[accessed 12/11/2018] pp. 109-111

- ‘Tales of Fathers and Daughters. BY THE ETTRICK SHEPHERD’, *The Zodiac, a Monthly Periodical, Devoted to Science, Literature, and the Arts*, 1.1 (July, 1835) <<https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=h0RFAAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA2>> [accessed 8/7/2019] pp. 2- 4; 1.2 (August, 1835) pp. 25-6; 1.3 (September, 1835), pp. 39-41
- *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1976)
- *Selected Stories and Sketches*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1982)
- *Tales of Love and Mystery*, ed. by David Groves (Edinburgh: Canongate, 1985)
- *Tales of the Wars of Montrose*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1996)
- *Anecdotes of Scott*, ed. by Jill Rubenstein (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1999)
- *The Private Memoirs of and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*, ed. by P. D. Garside (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2000)
- *The Spy: A Periodical Paper of Literary Amusement and Instruction Published Weekly in 1810 and 1811*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2000)
- *The Shepherd’s Calendar*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002)
- *The Three Perils of Woman*, ed. by Anthony S. Hasler and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002)
- *Winter Evening Tales*, ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002)
- *Winter Evening Tales*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn, ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004)
- *The Collected Letters of James Hogg: Volume One (1800-1819)*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004)
- *Altrive Tales Collected among the Peasantry of Scotland and from Foreign Adventurers*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2005)
- *The Collected Letters of James Hogg: Volume Two (1820-1831)*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2006)

- *The Mountain Bard*, ed. by Suzanne Gilbert (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007)
- *The Collected Letters of James Hogg: Volume Three (1832-1835)*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008)
- *Contributions to Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine: Volume One (1817-1828)*, ed. by Thomas C. Richardson (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008)
- *Highland Journeys*, ed. by H. B. de Groot (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2010)
- *The Three Perils of Man*, ed. by Judy King and Graham Tulloch (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012)
- *Contributions to Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine: Volume Two (1829-1835)*, ed. by Thomas C. Richardson (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012)
- *The Devil I am Sure: Three Short Stories by James Hogg* (Glasgow: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2017)
- ‘The Brownie of the Black Hags’, *BBC Radio 4 Extra*, last aired 13 October 2017 <<https://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b00ck4fs>> [accessed 12/11/2018]
- Scott, Walter and Thomas Pringle, ‘Notices Concerning the Scottish Gypsies’, *Edinburgh Monthly Magazine*, 1.1 (April, 1817), p. 50
- Wordsworth, William, ‘Extemporary Effusion upon the Death of James Hogg’, in *Last Poems, 1821-1850*, ed. by Jared Curtis (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1999), pp. 1-4

#### *Secondary sources*

- Adichie, Chimamanda Ngozi, ‘The Danger of a Single Story’, *TED Talk* (July, 2009)  
<[https://www.ted.com/talks/chimamanda\\_adichie\\_the\\_danger\\_of\\_a\\_single\\_story/transcript?language=en](https://www.ted.com/talks/chimamanda_adichie_the_danger_of_a_single_story/transcript?language=en)> [accessed 22/04/2019]
- Alker, Sharon and Holly Faith Nelson, ‘Marginal Voices and Transgressive Borders in Hogg’s Epic *Queen Hynde*’, *SHW*, 12 (2001), 25-39
- eds, *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009)
- ‘Empire and the ‘Brute Creation’: the limits of language in Hogg’s ‘the Pongos’, in *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the*

- Working-Class Author*, ed. by Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009), pp. 201-217
- ‘Hogg and Working-Class Writing’, in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012), pp. 55-63
- Altick, Richard, *The English Common Reader: A social history of the mass reading public* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1957)
- Altman, Janet G., *Epistolarity: Approaches to a Form* (Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 1982)
- Anderson, Benedict, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London: Verso, 1983)
- Anderson, Perry, ‘From Progress to Catastrophe’, *London Review of Books*, 33:15 (July, 2011), 24-28
- Andrews, Corey E., *The Genius of Scotland: The Cultural Production of Robert Burns, 1785-1834* (Eiden: Brill Rodopi, 2015)
- Awadalla, Maggie and Paul March-Russell, ‘Introduction: the short story and the postcolonial’, in *The Postcolonial Short Story: Contemporary Essays*, ed. by Awadella and March-Russell (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillian, 2013), pp. 1-14
- Baker, Timothy C., ‘The Short Story in Scotland: From Oral Tale to Dialectal Style’, in *The Cambridge History of the English Short Story*, ed. By Dominic Head (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 202-218
- Bakhtin, Mikhail, *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays* (Austin: University of Text Press, 1992)
- *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2010)
- Baldwin, Dean, ‘The Tardy Evolution of the British Short Story’, *Studies in Short Fiction*, 30:1 (1993), 1-10
- Bann, Jennifer and John Corbett, *Spelling Scots: the orthography of literary Scots, 1700-2000* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015)
- Barthes, Roland, *S/Z* (London: Blackwell, 1974)
- Belsey, Catherine, *Critical Practice*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn (London: Routledge, 2002)
- *A Future for Criticism* (Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011)
- Benjamin, Walter, ‘The Storyteller: Reflections on the Works of Nikolai Leskov’ (1936). <<http://ada.evergreen.edu/~arunc/texts/frankfurt/storyteller.pdf>> [accessed 10 August 2017]

- ‘The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction’ (1936),  
 <<http://Marxists.org/reference/subject/philosophy/works/ge/Benjamin.htm>>  
 [Accessed 21/02/2019]
- Boddy, Kasia, ‘Variety in Unity, Unity in Variety: the liminal space of the American short story anthology’, in *Liminality and the Short Story: boundary crossings in American, Canadian and British writing*, ed. by J. Achilles & I. Bergmann (Abingdon: Routledge, 2015)
- Bold, Valentina, ‘The Mountain Bard: James Hogg and Macpherson’s Ossian’, *SHW*, 7 (1996), pp. 5-17
- ‘*Nature’s Making: James Hogg and the Autodidact Tradition in Scottish Poetry*’ (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Glasgow, 1997)
- *James Hogg: A Bard of Nature’s Making* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2007)
- Bourdieu, Pierre, ‘The Field of Cultural Production, or: The Economic World Reversed’, in *The Field of Cultural Production: Essays on Art and Literature*, ed. by Randal Johnson (New York: Columbia University Press, 1993), pp. 29 -73
- Brodzki, Bella, *Can These Bones Live? Translation, Survival, and Cultural Memory* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2007)
- Brown, Rhona, ‘“Guid black prent’: Robert Burns and the Contemporary Scottish and American Periodical Press’, in *Robert Burns and Transatlantic Culture*, ed. by Sharon Alker, Leith Davis and Holly Faith Nelson (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 71-83
- Cantalupo, Barbara, *Poe and the Visual Arts* (Pennsylvania: Penn. State University Press, 2014)
- Carruthers, Gerard and Alan Rawes, eds, *English Romanticism and the Celtic World* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003)
- Carruthers, Gerard, ‘Gender and the Short Story in the Twilight Years’, in *International Companion to John Galt*, ed. by G. Carruthers and C. Kidd (Glasgow: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2017), pp. 125 -136
- Causland, Joan, ‘James Hogg and the 1831-32 Cholera Epidemic’, *SHW*, 10 (1999), 40-47
- Clark, Timothy, ‘Not seeing the Short Story: a Blind Phenomenology of Reading’, *Oxford Literary Review*, 26:1 (2004), 5-30
- Colley, Linda, *Britons: Forging the Nation 1707-1837* (Yale: Yale University Press, 1992)

- Collins, Michael J., *The Drama of the American Short Story, 1800-1865* (Michigan: University of Michigan Press, 2016)
- ‘Transnationalism and the Transatlantic Short Story’, in *The Edinburgh Companion to the Short Story in English*, ed. by Paul Delaney and Adrian Hunter (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2019), pp. 9-23
- Cowan, Edward J., ‘From the Southern Uplands to Southern Ontario: Nineteenth-Century Emigration from the Scottish Borders’, in *Scottish Emigration and Scottish Society: Proceedings of the Scottish Historical Studies Seminar University of Strathclyde, 1990-91* ed. by Tom Devine (Edinburgh: John Donald, 1992), pp. 61-83
- Craig, Cairns, *Out of History: Narrative Paradigms in Scottish and English Culture* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1996)
- ‘Scott’s Staging of the Nation’, *Studies in Romanticism*, 40:1 (2001), 13-28
- Crawford, Robert, ed., *Devolving English Literature* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1992)
- *The Scottish Invention of English Literature* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998)
- ‘Bad Shepherd’, *London Review of Books*, 23:7, 5 April 2001, <<https://www.lrb.co.uk/v23/n07/robert-crawford/bad-shepherd>> [accessed 10/7/2019] pp. 28-9
- *Scotland’s Books: A History of Scottish Literature* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009)
- *The Bard: Robert Burns, A Biography* (London: Pimlico, 2009)
- Croteau, Jeffrey, ‘Yet more American circulating libraries: a preliminary checklist of Brooklyn (New York) circulating libraries’, *Library History*, 22:3 (2006), 171-180
- Currie, Janette, ‘From Altrive to Albany: James Hogg’s Transatlantic Publication’ *Scotland’s Transatlantic Relations Project Archive* (November, 2003) <<http://www.star.ac.uk/archive/Papers/Currie.pdf>> [Accessed 2/8/2017]
- ‘Hogg in the Zodiac’, *James Hogg: Research, University of Stirling* <<http://www.jameshoggoriginal.stir.ac.uk/showrecord.php?id=56&fulltext=1>> [Accessed 3/6/2018]
- ‘James Hogg in the Liberator’, *University of Stirling, James Hogg: Research* <<http://www.jameshoggoriginal.stir.ac.uk/showrecord.php?id=62&fulltext=1>> [Accessed 3/6/2018]

- ‘Hogg in the American Literary Marketplace’, in *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author*, ed. by Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009), pp. 219-34
- Daiches, David, ‘Scott and Scotland’, in *Scott Bicentenary Essays*, ed. by Alan Bell (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1973), pp. 38-60
- Darnton, Robert, ‘What is the history of books?’, *Daedalus*, 111:3 (1982), 65-83
- ‘First Steps Toward a History of Reading’, *Australian Journal of French Studies*, 23:1 (1986), 5–30
- ‘“What Is the History of Books?” Revisited’, *Modern Intellectual History*, 4:3 (2007), 495–508
- Davis, Leith, *Acts of Union: Scotland and the Literary Negotiation of the British Nation, 1707-1830* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998)
- Davis, Leith, Ian Duncan and Janet Sorensen, eds, *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004)
- De Groot, Hans, ‘The Labourer and Literary Tradition: James Hogg’s Early Reading and Its Impact on Him as a Writer’, in *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author*, ed. by Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009), pp. 81-92
- Deleuze, G., and Félix Guattari, ‘Kafka: Toward a Minor Literature’, *Theory and History of Literature*, 30 (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986)
- Devine, Tom, *Recovering Scotland’s Slavery Past: The Caribbean Connection*, ed. by T. M. Devine (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015)
- *The Scottish Clearance: A History of the Dispossessed 1600-1900* (London: Penguin, 2018)
- Duff, David and Catherine Jones, eds, *Scotland, Ireland and the Romantic Aesthetic* (Lewisburg, PA: Bucknell University Press, 2007)
- Duncan, Ian, ‘Shadows of the Potentate: Scott in Hogg’s Fiction’, *SHW*, 4 (1993), 12-25
- ‘The Upright Corpse: Hogg, National Literature and the Uncanny’, *SHW*, 5 (1994), 29–55
- ‘Scott, Hogg, Orality and the Limits of Culture’, *SHW*, 8 (1997), 65-74
- ‘Hogg’s Body’, *SHW*, 9 (1998), 93-116
- ‘Authenticity Effects: The Work of Fiction in Romantic Scotland’, *The South Atlantic Quarterly*, 102:1 (2003), 93-116

- *Scott's Shadow: The Novel in Romantic Edinburgh* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2007)
- 'Altered States: Galt, Serial Fiction, and the Romantic Miscellany', in *John Galt: Observations and Conjectures in Literature, History and Society*, ed. by Regina Hewitt (Washington DC: Lexington Books, 2012), pp. 53-71
- 'Introduction: Hogg and his Worlds', in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012), pp. 1-9
- 'History and the Novel after Lukács', *Novel*, 50:3 (November, 2017), 388–396
- Duncan, Ian, and Douglas S. Mack, eds, *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012)
- Eagleton, Terry, *Marxism and Literary Criticism* (London: Routledge, 2002)
- *Literary Theory: An Introduction* (Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, 2008)
- Fielding, Penny, *Writing and Orality: Nationality, Culture and Nineteenth-Century Scottish Fiction* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1996)
- *Scotland and the Fictions of Geography: North Britain, 1760-1830* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008)
- 'Black Books: Sedition, Circulation, and *The Lay of the Last Minstrel*', *English Literary History*, 81:1 (2014), 192-22
- Finkelstein, David, and Alistair McCleery, eds, *The Book History Reader* (London: Routledge, 2006)
- Flinn, Michael, *Scottish Population History from the 17<sup>th</sup> century to the 1930s* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977)
- Forgacs, David, ed, *An Antonio Gramsci Reader: Selected Writings, 1916-1935* (New York: Schocken, 1988)
- Foucault, Michel, 'What is an author?' (1969), in *The Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism*, ed. by Vincent B. Leitch (New York and London: Norton, 2001), pp. 1622-1636
- Fraser, W. Hamish, *Conflict and Class: Scottish Workers, 1700-1838* (Edinburgh: John Donald, 1988)
- Fry, Michael, *Patronage and Principle: a Political History of Modern Scotland* (Aberdeen: Aberdeen University press, 1987)
- Frye, Northrop, *Anatomy of Criticism: Four Essays* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1957)

- Garrett, Aaran, 'Anthropology: the 'original' of human nature', in *The Cambridge Companion to the Scottish Enlightenment*, ed. by Alexander Broadie (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), pp. 79-93
- Gellner, Ernest, *Nations and Nationalism* (New York: Cornell University Press, 1983)
- Genette, Gérard, *Narrative Discourse: An Essay in Method*, trans. by Jane Lewin (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1980)
- Gibbs, Ewan, 'Who's 'Normal'? Class, Culture and Labour Politics in a Fragmented Britain', *Renewal: A Journal of Social Democracy*, 25:7 (2017)  
<[http://www.renewal.org.uk/articles/whos-normal-class-culture-and-labour-politics-in-a-fragmented-britain?fbclid=IwAR1WWW\\_Ax6TJ-D4QpAbm4FOawJTdx4ByB\\_2970CceUX-G3IskrPh2V7gg8](http://www.renewal.org.uk/articles/whos-normal-class-culture-and-labour-politics-in-a-fragmented-britain?fbclid=IwAR1WWW_Ax6TJ-D4QpAbm4FOawJTdx4ByB_2970CceUX-G3IskrPh2V7gg8)> [accessed 11/06/2019]
- Gide, André, 'Afterword' (1947), in James Hogg, *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (Edinburgh: Canongate, 2008), pp. 283-290
- Gifford, Douglas, *James Hogg* (Edinburgh: The Ramsey Head Press, 1976)
- Gilbert, Suzanne, 'Hogg's Reception and Reputation', in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012), pp. 37-45
- Gilkison, Bruce, *Walking with James Hogg: The Ettrick Shepherd's Journeys through Scotland* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2016)
- Gilroy, Amanda and W. M. Verhoeven, eds, *Epistolary Histories: Letters, Fiction, Culture* (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 2000)
- Glance, Jonathan C., 'Ambiguity and the Dreams in James Hogg's *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *Studies in Scottish Literature*, 28:1 (1993), 165-177
- Gordimer, Nadine, 'The Flash of Fireflies', in *The New Short Stories Theories*, ed by Charles E. May (Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press, 1994), pp. 263-267
- Gribben, Crawford, 'James Hogg and Mrs Calvert: Antinomianism and Print Culture in the 1640s', *SHW*, 23 (2013), 94-99
- Groves, David, 'James Hogg's 'Singular Dream' and the *Confessions*', *Scottish Literary Journal*, 10 (1983), 54-66
- *James Hogg: The Growth of a Writer* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1988)

- Hall, Stuart, Jessica Evans and Sean Nixon, eds, *Representation*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn (London: Sage, 2013)
- Hames, Scott, 'On Vernacular Scottishness and its Limits: Devolution and the Spectacle of 'Voice'', *Studies in Scottish Literature*, 39:1 (2013), 201–222
- Head, Dominic, ed., *The Cambridge History of the English Short Story* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016)
- Hewitt, Regina, ed., *John Galt: Observations and Conjectures on Literature, History, and Society* (Lewisburg, PA: Bucknall University Press, 2012)
- Hobsbawm, Eric and Ranger, Terrence, *The Invention of Tradition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992)
- Hobsbawm, Eric, *Nations and Nationalism since 1780* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990)
- Holquist, Michael, *Dialogism: Bakhtin and his World*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn (London: Routledge, 2002)
- Hook, Andrew, *Scotland and America: A Study of Cultural Relations 1750-1835* (Glasgow: Blackie, 1975)
- 'Hogg, Melville and the Scottish Enlightenment', in Hook, *From Goosecreek to Gandercleugh: Studies in Scottish-American Literary and Cultural History* (East Linton: Tuckwell, 1999), pp. 116-134
- Houston, Rab, *Scotland: A Very Short Introduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008)
- Hughes, Gillian, *James Hogg's Fiction and the Periodicals*, (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1981)
- 'The Spy and Literary Edinburgh', *Scottish Literary Journal*, 10 (1983), 46-52
- 'James Hogg and the Forum', *SHW*, 1 (1990), 57-70
- 'The Evolution of *Tales of the Wars of Montrose*', *SHW*, 2 (1991), 1-13
- "'Wat Pringle o the Yair': History or Tradition?", *SHW*, 6 (1995), 50-53
- 'Hogg's Use of History in *Tales of the Wars of Montrose*', *SHW* 8 (1997), 12-23
- 'James Hogg, *The Spy* and the Edinburgh Whigs', *SHW*, 10 (1999), 48-58
- *James Hogg: A Life* (Edinburgh 2007)
- 'Hogg's Personal Library', *SHW*, 19 (2008), 32-65
- 'Magazines, Annuals, and the Press', in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012), pp. 31-36

- ‘The Edinburgh of *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine* and James Hogg’s Fiction’, in *Romanticism and Blackwood’s Magazine: ‘An Unprecedented Phenomenon’*, ed. by Robert Morrison and Daniel S. Roberts (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2013), pp. 175-186
- Hunter, Adrian C. ‘*Complete with missing parts*’: *modernist short fiction as interrogative text* (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Glasgow, 1999)
- Hunter, Jefferson, *Edwardian Fiction* (Cambridge, MA and London: Harvard University Press, 1982)
- Hunter, Wendy, ‘The Spy; Being a Periodical Paper of Literary Amusement and Instruction’, *The Literary Encyclopaedia* (2007)  
<<http://www.litencyc.com/php/sworks.php?rec=true&UID=7814>> [accessed 10/8/2017]
- Ittensohn, Mark, ‘Fictionalising the Romantic Marketplace: Self-reflexivity in the Early-Nineteenth-Century Frame Tale’, *Victoriographies*, 7:1 (2017), 25-41
- Jameson, Frederic, *The Antinomies of Realism* (London: Verso, 2013)
- Kelly, Stuart, ‘Book review: Walking with James Hogg by Bruce Gilkison’, *The Scotsman*, 1 August 2016  
<<https://www.scotsman.com/lifestyle/culture/books/book-review-walking-with-james-hogg-by-bruce-gilkison-1-4190927>> [accessed 26/5/2018]
- Kennedy, Joe, *Authentocrats: Culture, Politics and the New Seriousness* (London: Repeater Books, 2018)
- Kidd, Colin, ‘Teutonist Ethnology and the Scottish Nationalist Inhibition, 1780-1880’, *The Scottish Historical Review*, 74:197 (1995), 45-68
- *Subverting Scotland’s Past: Scottish Whig Historians and the Creation of an Anglo-British Identity 1689-1830* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003)
- Kidd, Colin and Gerard Carruthers, eds, *The International Companion to John Galt* (Glasgow: Scottish Literature International, 2017)
- Killick, Tim, ‘Hogg and the Collection of Short Fiction in the 1820s’, *SHW*, 5 (1994), 25-36
- *British Short Fiction in the Early Nineteenth Century: The Rise of the Tale* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008)

- ‘Blackwood’s and the Boundary of the Short Story’, in *Romanticism and Blackwood’s Magazine: ‘An Unprecedented Phenomenon’*, ed. by Robert Morrison and Daniel S. Roberts (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2013), pp. 163-174
- Klancher, Jon P. *The Making of English Reading Audiences, 1790-1832* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987)
- Knox, W. W., *Industrial Nation: Work, Culture, and Society in Scotland 1900-Present* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1999)
- Kövesi, Simon, *John Clare: Nature, Criticism, History* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017)
- Leary, Patrick, ‘Fraser’s Magazine and the Literary Life, 1830-1847’, *Victorian Periodicals Review*, 27:2 (1994), 105-126
- Leitch, Roger, ‘Hogg, Scott and the Gaick catastrophe’, *SHW*, 1 (1990), 126-128
- Leonard, Tom, ed., *Radical Renfrew: Poetry in the West of Scotland from the French Revolution to the First World War* (Edinburgh: Polygon, 1990)
- Levy, Andrew, *The Culture and Commerce of the American Short Story* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993)
- Liggins, Emma, Andrew Maunder and Ruth Robbins, *The British Short Story* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011)
- Lincoln, Andrew, *Walter Scott and Modernity* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007)
- Lumsden, Alison, *Walter Scott and Limits of Language* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2010)
- Lyall, R. J., ‘Intimations of Orality: Scotland, America and the early development of the Short Story’, *Studies in Scottish Fiction*, 36:3 (1999), 311-25
- Macdonald, Kirsty, *Spectral Ambiguities: The Tradition of Psychosomatic Supernaturalism in Scottish Fiction* (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Glasgow, 2005)
- Mack, Douglas S., *Editing James Hogg* (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Stirling, 1984)
- ‘Hogg, Blackwood’s and The Shepherd’s Calendar’, in *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference, Edinburgh 1985*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Aberdeen: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1988)
- *Scottish Fiction and the British Empire* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2006)

- ‘Hogg’s Politics and the Presbyterian Tradition’, in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012), pp. 64-72
- Mack, Douglas S. and Wilma, eds, ‘‘Tales of Fathers and Daughters No.2’, edited and introduced by Douglas and Wilma Mack’, *SHW*, 15 (2004), 126-162
- Machin, G. I. T., ‘The Disruption and British Politics 1834-43’, *The Scottish Historical Review*, 51:151 (1972), 20-51
- Mahler, Robert F., ‘From Tale to Short Story: The Emergence of a New Genre in the 1850s’, *American Literature*, 46:2 (1974), 153-169
- Malcolm, David, *The British and Irish Short Story Handbook* (Chichester: Wiley, 2012)
- Manning, Susan, *The Puritan-Provincial Vision: Scottish and American Literature in the Nineteenth-Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009)
- *Fragments of Union: Making Connections in Scottish and American Writing* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2002)
- March-Russell, Paul, *The Short Story: an introduction* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2009)
- May, Charles E., ed., *The New Short Story Theories* (Ohio: Ohio University Press, 1994)
- *The Short Story: the reality of artifice* (London: Routledge, 2002)
- McCracken-Flesher, Caroline, ‘Hogg and Nationality’, in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012), pp. 73-81
- McDowell, Paula, *The Invention of the Oral: Print Commerce and Fugitive Voices in Eighteenth-Century Britain* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2017)
- McGarvey, Darren, *Poverty Safari: Understanding the anger of Britain’s Underclass* (Edinburgh: Luath Press, 2017)
- McGill, Meredith L., *American Literature and the Culture of Reprinting, 1834-1853* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003)
- McIlvanney, Liam, *Burns the Radical: Poetry and Politics in Late Eighteenth-Century Scotland* (East Linton: Tuckwell Press, 2002)
- McKeever, Gerard Lee, ‘‘All that I choose to tell you is this’: Improvement confronts the Supernatural in Hogg’s Short Fictions’, *SHW*, 25 (2015), 30-44

- McKenzie, William, *Sketches of Canada and the United States* (Carlisle, MA: Applewood Books, 1833)
- McLane, Maureen N., *Balladeering, Minstrelsy, and the Making of British Romantic Poetry* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008)
- McLean, Scott A., 'Cleansing the Hawker's Basket: Popular Literature and Cheap Periodical Press in Scotland', *Studies in Scottish Literature*, 32:1 (2001), 88-100
- McLeery, Alistair and David Finkelstein, eds, *The Book History Reader* (London: Routledge, 2001)
- Mergenthal, Silvia, '*Naturae Donum*: Comments on Hogg's Self-Image and Image', *SHW*, 1 (1990), 71-9
- 'James Hogg's *Lay Sermons* and the Essay Tradition', *SHW*, 2 (1991), 64-71
- Miller, Karl, *Electric Shepherd: A likeness of James Hogg* (London: Faber and Faber, 2003)
- 'Star of the Borders', *The Guardian Review*, 9 August 2003, pp. 4-6
- Mole, Tom, 'Blackwood's Personalities', in *Romanticism and Blackwood's Magazine: 'An Unprecedented Phenomenon'*, ed. by Robert Morrison and Daniel S. Roberts (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2013), pp. 89-99
- Morgan, Alison, 'God Save Our Queen!' Percy Bysshe Shelley and Radical Appropriations of the British National Anthem', *Romanticism*, 20:1 (2014), 60-72
- Morrison, Robert and Daniel S. Roberts, eds, *Romanticism and Blackwood's Magazine: 'An Unprecedented Phenomenon'* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013)
- Morton, Graeme, *Unionist-Nationalism: Governing Urban Scotland, 1830-1860* (East Linton: Tuckwell Press, 1999)
- Moss, Stephen, 'Interview: 'Not every day was like Trainspotting': Orwell prize winner Darren McGarvey on class, addiction and redemption', *The Guardian*, Tuesday 26 June 2018
- Mott, Frank Luther, 'A Brief History of 'Graham's Magazine'', *Studies in Philology*, 25:3 (1928), 362-374
- Munro, Alice, *The View from Castle Rock* (London: Vintage, 2007)
- Murphy, Peter T., *Poetry as an Occupation and an Art in Britain, 1760-1830* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005)
- Nairn, Tom, 'The Three Dreams of Scottish Nationalism', *New Left Review*, 1:49 (1968), 3-18

- The Break-Up of Britain* (London: New Left Books, 1977)
- Neville, Gwen Kennedy, *The Mother Town: Civic Ritual, Symbol, and Experience in the Borders of Scotland* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994)
- Newby, Andrew G., ‘The patron-client relationship in eighteenth-century Scotland’, *SHP Seminar, Volda* (2008)  
 <[http://www.hivolda.no/neted/upload/attachment/site/group12/AndrewNewby\\_Client\\_Patron\\_Scotland.pdf](http://www.hivolda.no/neted/upload/attachment/site/group12/AndrewNewby_Client_Patron_Scotland.pdf)> [accessed 20/05/2016]
- Nixon, Mark, Gordon Pentland, and Matthew Roberts, ‘The Material Culture of Scottish Reform Politics, c. 1820 –c. 1884’, *Journal of Scottish Historical Studies*, 3:1 (2012), 28-49
- O’Connor, Frank, *The Lonely Voice: A Study of the Short Story* (London: Macmillan, 1963)
- O’Dea, Dathalinn, ‘James Joyce the Regionalist: The *Irish Homestead*, *Dubliners*, and Modernism’s Regional Affect’, *Modern Fiction Studies*, 63:3 (2017), 475-501
- O’Halloran, Meiko, ‘Treading the Borders of Fiction: Veracity, Identity, and Corporeality in *The Three Perils*’, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 12 (2001), 40-55
- ‘National Discourse of Discord? Transformations of The Family Legend by Baillie, Scott, and Hogg’, in *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author*, ed. By Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009), pp. 43-56
- ‘Hogg and the Theatre’, in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012), pp. 105-112
- James Hogg and British Romanticism: A Kaleidoscopic Art* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016)
- Orel, Harold, *The Victorian Short Story: Development and Triumph of a Literary Genre* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986)
- Overton, W. J., ‘Scott, the Short Story and History: ‘The Two Drovers’’, *Studies in Scottish Literature*, 21:1 (1986), 210-225
- Pattee, Fred Lewis, *The Development of the American Short Story: An historical perspective* (New York: Biblio and Tannen, 1923)
- Pentland, Gordon, ‘Scotland and the Creation of a National Reform movement, 1830-1832’, *The Historical Journal*, 48:4 (2005), 999-1023

- ‘The debate on Scottish parliamentary reform, 1830-32’, *Scottish Historical Review*, 85:219 (2006), 102-132
- *Radicalism, Reform and National Identity in Scotland 1820-1833* (Woodbridge: Boydell, 2008)
- ‘Betrayed by Infamous Spies’? The Commemoration of Scotland’s ‘Radical War’ of 1820’, *Past and Present*, 201 (2008), 141-173
- *The Spirit of the Union: Popular Politics in Scotland, 1815-1820* (London: Pickering and Chatto, 2011)
- Pittock, Murray G.H., *The Invention of Scotland: The Stuart Myth and the Scottish Identity* (London: Routledge, 1991)
- ‘Hogg and Jacobite cause’, *SHW*, 2 (1991), 14-24
- *The Myth of the Jacobite Clans* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1995)
- *Scottish and Irish Romanticism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008)
- ed., *The Edinburgh Companion to Scottish Romanticism* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2011)
- ‘What is the place of theories of nationalism in a transnational age?’, in *Tis to Create and in Creating Live: Essays in Honour of Martin Procházka*, ed. by Pilný, O. and Horová, M. (Prague: Charles University, 2013), pp. 151-159
- Plotz, John, ‘Hogg and the short story’, in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012), pp. 113-121
- Pratt, Mary Louise, ‘The Short Story: The long and the short of it’, *Poetics*, 10 (1981), 175-194
- Price, Leah, *The Anthology and the Rise of the Novel* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000)
- ‘The Tangible Page’, *London Review of Books*, 24:21, 31 October 2002 <<http://www.lrb.co.uk/v24/n21/leah-price/the-tangible-page>> [accessed 10/7/2019] pp. 36-39
- Pritchett, V.S., *The Oxford Book of Short Stories* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981)
- Propp, Vladimir, *Morphology of the Folk Tale*, trans. by Laurence Scott and Louis A. Wagner, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Austin, Texas: University of Texas Press, 1968)
- Pyle, Hannah Maria Catherine, ‘I do not give his words but merely the sense attired in the garb that I conceive fittest’: James Hogg’s (1770-1835) influence on the

- works of the Brontës (1816-1855)* (unpublished MPhil(R) thesis, University of Glasgow, 2018)
- Reinelt, Janelle, 'A feminist reconsideration of the Brecht/ Lukács debates', *Women & Performance: A Journal of Feminist Theory*, 7:1 (1994), 122-139
- Rezek, Joseph, *London and the Making of Provincial Literature: Aesthetics and the Transatlantic Book Trade, 1800–1850* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015)
- Richardson, Thomas C., 'James Hogg and *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*: Buying and Selling the Ettrick Shepherd', in *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author*, ed. By Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009), pp. 185-200
- Russett, Margaret, *Fictions and Fakes: Forging Romantic Authenticity, 1760-1845* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006)
- 'Genuity or Ingenuity? Invented Tradition and the Scottish Talent' in *Romanticism, Sincerity and Authenticity*, ed. by Tom Milnes and Kerry Sinanan (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), pp. 31-57
- Schoenfield, Mark, 'Butchering James Hogg: Romantic Identity in the Magazine Market', in *At the Limits of Romanticism: Essays in Cultural, Feminist, and Materialist Criticism*, ed. by Mary A. Favret and Nicola J. Watson (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1994), pp. 207-24
- *British Periodicals and Romantic Identity: The 'Literary Lower Empire'* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009)
- 'The Taste for Violence in *Blackwood's Magazine*', in *Romanticism and Blackwood's Magazine: 'An Unprecedented Phenomenon'*, ed. by Robert Morrison and Daniel S. Roberts (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2013), pp. 187-202
- Sharp, Sarah, 'Hogg's Murder of Ravens: Storytelling, Community and Posthumous Mutilation in the Short Fiction of James Hogg', *SHW*, 23 (2013), 31-40
- *Digging up the kirkyard: death, readership and nation in the writings of the Blackwood's group 1817-1839* (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Edinburgh, 2016)
- Smith, Nelson C., *James Hogg, Twayne's English Authors Series* (Boston: Twayne Publishers, 1980)
- Smout, T.C., *A History of the Scottish People, 1560-1830* (London: Collins, 1969)
- *A Century of the Scottish People, 1830-1950* (London: Collins, 1986)

- Sood, Arun, *Robert Burns and the United States of America: Poetry, Print and Memory 1786 -1866* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2018)
- Sorensen, Janet, *The Grammar of Empire in Eighteenth-Century British Writing* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000)
- St Clair, William, *The Reading Nation in the Romantic Period* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004)
- Stewart, David, *Romantic Magazines and Metropolitan Literary Culture* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011)
- ‘Blackwoodian Allusion and the Culture of Miscellaneity’, in *Romanticism and Blackwood’s Magazine: ‘An Unprecedented Phenomenon’*, ed. by Robert Morrison and Daniel S. Roberts (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2013), pp. 113-123
- ‘Romantic Short Fiction’, in *The Cambridge Companion to the English short story*, ed. by Ann-Marie Einhaus (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 73-86
- ‘Genuine Border Stories: James Hogg, Fiction and Mobility in the 1830s’, *The Yearbook of English Studies*, 48 (2018), 82-100
- Strout, Alan Lang, ‘James Hogg’s ‘Chaldee Manuscript’’, *PMLA*, 65:5 (1950), 695-178
- Tambling, Jeremy, *Narrative and Ideology* (Milton Keynes: Open University Press, 1991)
- Taylor, Ronald, ed., *Aesthetics and Politics: the key texts of the classic debate within German Marxism* (London: Verso Books, 1977)
- Thompson, E. P., *The Making of the English Working Class* (New York: Vintage Books, 1963)
- *The Poverty of Theory* (London: Merlin Press, 1995)
- Trumpener, Katie, *Bardic Nationalism: The Romantic Novel and the British Empire* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997)
- Vincent, Patrick, ‘Elegiac Muses: Romantic Women Poets and the Elegy’, in *Romantic Poetry Volume 7*, ed. by Angela Esterhammer (Amsterdam: John Benjamin, 2002), pp. 197-219
- Walzl, Florence L., ‘Joyce’s ‘The Sisters’: A Development’, *James Joyce Quarterly*, 50:1/2 (Autumn 2012-Winter 2013), 73-117

- Watt, Dominic, Carmen Llamas and Daniel Ezra Johnson, 'Sociolinguistic Variation on the Anglo-Scottish Border', in *Sociolinguistics in Scotland*, ed. by R. Lawson (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), pp. 79-102
- Whatley, Christopher A., *Scottish Society 1707-1830: Beyond Jacobitism, Towards Industrialisation* (Manchester: Manchester University press, 2000)
- Williams, Raymond, *Culture and Society 1780-1950* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1958)
- *The Country and the City* (London: Hogarth Press, 1993)
- Wood, James, *How Fiction Works* (London: Vintage, 2009)
- Wood, Peter, 'The Newcastle Song Chapbooks', in *Street Ballads in Nineteenth-Century Britain, Ireland, and North America: The Interface between Print and Oral Traditions*, ed. by David Atkinson and Steven Roud (Farnham and Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2014), pp. 59-76