The business of creative cities

Katherine Champion

is a Doctoral Research Student in the Department of Urban Studies at the University of Glasgow
Culture and creativity have been promoted as the panacea to reversing urban decline in the knowledge age. The posited benefits of becoming a 'creative city' cut across many aspects of policy, and evidence suggests that unlocking creative potential may well improve the prospects for successful urban regeneration. Such activity may be cultivated to attract economic gain in the form of investment, developing the creative industry sector, business start up locations, tourism spend and knowledge workers. Specific approaches include re-imaging through branding campaigns, flagship buildings and events programming and developing the creative industries sector. There are some caveats to this approach. The unintended consequences of policy can include gentrification, a loss of distinctiveness and the pricing out of creative sector pioneers. The benefits may be overstated and are often hard to measure. This paper presents a rationale for intervention, while cautioning against a sole focus on consumption-oriented strategies with their vulnerability to economic downturn. It is argued that policy should be sustainable and balanced, aiming to cultivate and protect indigenous production and be rooted in the local, distinctive attributes of place. Three principles are suggested to help embed the creative city: more workspace, fuller participation and better measurement.

Keywords: *Creative cities, culture-led regeneration, re-imaging cities, flagship projects, place branding, events programming, place distinctiveness*

INTRODUCTION

Katherine Champion
Urban Studies Department, 25 Bute Gardens, University of Glasgow, Glasgow, G12 8RS, UK

Tel: +44 (0)141 330 3088; e-mail: k.champion1@ research.gla.ac.uk

Cities have always had important cultural functions, with place and cultural products closely intertwined: for example, country music from Nashville and fashion from Paris. The density of interaction in urban areas is seen as the key to stimulating cultural production, and there is an increasingly symbiotic relationship between culture and place and the economy.[1,2] Contemporary urban policy has shifted to see cities more as positive assets in advanced service-oriented economies. Extensive regeneration investment in many of the traditional UK cities has aimed to improve the quality of urban life and begun to claim urban resurgence and a greater inclination towards city living. It is argued that cities offer advantages as the site of: agglomeration economies to firms, high levels of information exchange contributing to innovation, and the ability to meet a wide range of consumption preferences.[3] In the words of the 2004 ODPM report, 'cities are back' and, after several decades of decline, they 'are not economic drains upon but the dynamos of the national economy'.[4]

Structural changes in the economy have contributed to an increasing focus on creativity and innovation as central contributors to growth within urban areas. For instance, the transformation to a knowledge-based economy has resulted in greater product differentiation and thus a greater creative content to the design of a wide range of products and services. This move towards the 'information age' can be asserted to support rather than reduce the need for strong cities.[5] Innovation, exchange of information and learning can be best realised by the proximity offered by the city.

Reduced working hours and greater disposable income for many has also meant greater time to devote to leisure and an increasing demand for consumption, a broader choice of which is available in city centres. The cultural basis for success in the information age is richest in urban areas in terms of the density and range of leisure and recreational activities available. It is

suggested that cultural and leisure amenities can attract human capital, which is seen as a critical driver in creating competitive advantage for the city. The presence of such infrastructure can help attract and retain a mobile skilled workforce, and is therefore seen as a key factor in pursuing economic development and prosperity in the knowledge age.[6,7]

A raft of strategies have been adopted by UK cities aiming to engage with creative processes and capture the value that can be generated by culture, the arts and creative businesses. These processes can empower and animate, allowing participation in and ownership of regeneration and stimulating economic growth locally.[8] Successfully re-imaging and re-imagining cities as creative places may unlock possibilities for revitalisation and investment.[9] Nonetheless, the pursuit of this goal is complex, as there are a number of tensions and challenges to be understood and mediated or overcome.

The purpose of this paper is to review some of the contemporary approaches being used to foster creative cities in the UK. The first section provides a rationale for intervention and explores the expected economic benefits associated with securing a creative city. The following section looks at a variety of mechanisms used to re-image cities, including the development of flagship infrastructure, events and branding alongside attempts to grow the creative industries sector. It is argued that a simplistic policy approach focused entirely on flagship consumption-oriented strategies will fail to develop the distinctiveness and committed local ownership necessary for successful city revitalisation. Concerns are raised around the limited trickledown to all residents, the displacement effects, the focus on costly expansions in infrastructure, the difficulties of sustaining distinctiveness

and the lack of clear measurement systems. The paper concludes by suggesting several principles important in mediating these challenges. It is recommended that cultural production should be aided by the provision and protection of suitable workspaces and good quality public space. Increased funding for education and participatory arts programmes are also crucial in stimulating indigenous cultural production as well as improving ownership of high-profile schemes. Finally, instituting robust measurement will, it is argued, increase transparency and aid future planning.

THE RATIONALE FOR INTERVENTION THROUGH CULTURE

Although attention is drawn to the current potential of using culture to achieve instrumental aims, there have also been historical precedents for this activity. For instance, there has been a long tradition of attempting to widen access to the arts (specifically high art) as a vehicle for social improvement or integration, based upon the idea of their ennobling value.[10] In the UK, the focus changed during the 1960s when the Arts Council broadened funding guidelines to include more varied contributions, challenging the traditional distinction between high and low art and encouraging participation.

During the 1970s and 1980s, there was an increasing concentration on cultural policy's influence on and support for economic development. In order to compete in the global economic system, cities have looked to culture as an asset to be exploited for economic regeneration. As Charles Landry notes, 'cultural resources are the raw materials of the city and its value base; its assets replacing coal, steel or gold'.[8] The economic rationale for instrumentalising

culture is based around a varied set of contributions, including increased visitor and resident spend, job creation, creative industry firm start-ups, the location and retention of firms, graduates and skilled workers and increased property prices.[11]

A broad definition of culture is employed in this paper to move away from traditional conceptions of solely high art. While opera, literature, fine art and drama are included in this definition, so too are festivals, story telling and graphic design. Sporting events are also incorporated as, while some are critical of this, it is suggested that sport may possess symbolic value and involve creativity, and its output may have some intellectual property, factors which Throsby sees as the basis of a definition of cultural production. As he notes, sport certainly embodies the basic aspect of culture 'as a ritual or custom expressing shared values and as a means of affirming and consolidating group identity'.[12] The arts and sport also share similarities in the process of their production in relation to team production, monopsony power and joint production.[13] In terms of cultural production, the sectors and activities included in the creative economy tend to meet three common features. First, products possess symbolic or aesthetic content. Secondly, their consumption grows with increases in disposable income. Finally, there is a spatial rationale for production which encourages clustering, while products compete in global markets.[14]

Re-imaging cities

The means employed to re-image cities have connected the less tangible notions of a creative city with the more overtly physical process of place making. Many of the mechanisms of culture-led regeneration are based on the premise that a strategic inspiration of new

attitudes to the place will encourage the attraction and retention of skilled workers, graduates, tourists and business investors. The aim is to aid the transition from economic 'black hole' to a vibrant, thriving, post-industrial centre where people want to live, work and play.

It is suggested that urban cultural centres, as well as generating income and jobs directly, act as poles of attraction for tourism, visitors and skilled workers. This is related to the rising significance of quality of life in the location decisions of people and businesses. This was recognised in the influential study conducted by John Myerscough in the late 1980s, which tried to identify the economic importance of the arts to Britain and found that quality of life was identified by businesses as a consideration in their location.[6,15] More recently, Richard Florida has argued that, in order to develop and compete in a knowledge driven economy, it is essential to attract and retain creative, innovative and entrepreneurial individuals. He asserted that high concentrations of creative or 'bohemian' people, classified as artists, writers, musicians and actors, are an indicator of an area's success in high technology industries. By offering a 'people climate', it is asserted that the creative class can be attracted and retained.[7,16] These ideas are not without their critics, even if it is accepted that human capital is an important determinant of economic success, and these will be addressed later in the paper. A related issue for cities and their regions in the UK is the retention of graduates who have attended their universities but are lost to London when they begin the search for employment. The retention and attraction of skilled workers remains a key problem for many UK regions.[17]

Re-imaging is also asserted to benefit internal perceptions of the city in terms of civic pride. Cultural developments can

act as symbols for rebirth, renewed confidence and dynamism. If employed with care, cultural projects 'can be among the most powerful means of reinforcing local and regional identity, and [that] it is the degree to which such projects can help build the sense of place that will ultimately determine the breadth and depth of their contribution to a local or regional economy'.[18]

Mechanisms for re-imaging cities

To capitalise on these possible outcomes, a number of mechanisms have been taken up in cities across the UK and the world. The dominant form of using culture for economic renewal has focused on the re-imaging of the declining industrial city with the aim of shifting it into a post–industrial phase. By employing spectacular events, flagship projects and advertising campaigns, often in tandem, a positive image change has been sought by many cities, especially those with an industrial past.[19–21]

The important role of the '*grands projets*'[10] has been well recorded, and cities pursuing large events such as the European City of Culture or the Olympic Games explicitly set out an aspired legacy of economic and social, as well as cultural, goals. Economically, it is hoped that an event of this scale will create significant employment opportunities and revenue from visitor spend. It is also anticipated that the event will contribute to the identity and social cohesion of the city through inspiration of self-confidence and civic pride.[20–21] In some circumstances, investment in events which raise the status of a city can lever enormous additional value.

For example, in the case of Glasgow, images of deprivation and decline were transformed, culminating in accession to the title of European Capital of Culture in 1990. Glasgow had suffered greatly from industrial decline owing to its reliance on shipbuilding and heavy engineering. The decline in jobs in manufacturing in Clydeside was huge, down from 306,000 in 1971 to 121,000 in 1991.[22] Glasgow became a quick convert to place marketing in an attempt to reverse economic decline.[23] Positive attention was drawn to the city through the medium of advertising campaigns. The 'Glasgow's Miles Better' 1983 slogan was widely regarded as a successful attempt at promoting post–industrial Glasgow. This was accompanied by vast improvements to the physical fabric of the city, ranging from new retail centres to luxury apartments and the opening of cultural resources such as the Burrell art collection and the Scottish Exhibition and Conference Centre. In 1985, the McKinsey and Company report, which had been commissioned by the Scottish Development Agency, recommended more active engagement with the private sector participation and further aggressive place marketing. These helped to secure hallmark events, including the 1988 Garden Festival, 1990 City of Culture, 1999 British City of Architecture and, most recently, the city has won the bidding process to become host for the Commonwealth Games in 2014. As Garcia notes, 'a key legacy is the radical transformation of the city's image from old stereotypes such as razor gangs, unemployment and alcoholism to the celebration of Glasgow as a shopping destination, city of design and architecture, an attractive placement for business activity and conferences, and a cultural centre in the widest sense'.[21]

As in the Glasgow case, prestige cultural facilities, such as concert halls, art galleries and museums, alongside public art often form the keystone of culture-led regeneration projects with the aim of catalysing a 'Guggenheim effect'.

Public art, simply defined as art in an open public space, has been a relatively longstanding component of regeneration strategies, notably in Birmingham, Gateshead, Glasgow, parts of London and some new towns.[24] Over the last decade or so, many projects have also benefited from National Lottery and Arts Council funding, sometimes partnered by private sources, and leading to more potentially transformational projects. Perhaps one of the most prominent examples of the power of public art is the Angel of the North in Gateshead. The local council had been involved in environmental and public art from the 1980s, but it was the building of the Angel of the North, commissioned as a pre-millennial image, which brought intense public and media interest. The decision to build Antony Gormley's 65-feet-high sculpture was initially met with a furore by the public and generated intense media scrutiny. However, its popularity and symbolic presence ultimately allayed any fears for its success. This success was forged by a strong sense of ownership by local people, exemplified by the draping of the Angel in a Newcastle United football shirt not long after its erection. The art captured the imagination not only of local people but of many across the country, where it has been seen as an optimistic symbol of city–regional renewal, a regeneration that has moved beyond the nature of the art itself.[9]

Developing strategies to foster creative production can create employment and also, it is maintained, inspire identity and self-confidence. In terms of job creation, growth may be provided in other sectors apart from the service sector, and it is important to explore these opportunities to envisage whether there are prospects for the creation of more sustainable, varied and interesting employment. One area of focus is the growth in the creative industries. Britain's Creative Task

Force defined the creative industries as 'those activities which have their origin in individual creativity, skill and talent and which have a potential for wealth and job creation through the generation and exploitation of intellectual property'.[25] This definition, though not universally accepted, is now commonly used in UK policy and academic discussion and includes the following: advertising, architecture, arts and antiques markets, computer and video games, crafts, design, designer fashion, film and video, performing arts, publishing, software, and television and radio.[25] The sector is thought to be high value-added owing to the extent of specialisation and creative content.[26] There is increasing evidence of the rising public profile of this sector, constituting 8 per cent of the UK's GVA in 2003 and growing at a faster rate between 1997 and 2003 than GDP as a whole.[27]

As well as a belief that the creative industries as a sector can provide direct benefits to the UK economy, it is suggested that they also provide advantages to the rest of the economy through a multiplier effect, as in the case of Manchester.[28] Formerly the world's first industrial city, Manchester is considered to have led the way in regeneration, developing a more progressive form of urbanism than had been seen before in many UK cities. Like Glasgow, Manchester suffered serious economic decline and, during the late 1980s, Manchester City Council distanced itself from its socialist background and took a more entrepreneurial turn, reinventing itself politically as the friend of central government and local business.[29] At the same time, local entrepreneurs were emerging and contributing to a vibrant cultural scene with a particular strength in music. Manchester now has the largest concentration of creative industries

outside London, and one of the key strengths of the region is as a media centre with just under 5 per cent of UK employment in radio and film industries.[30] The BBC and Granada form the hub of an expanding media sector in the conurbation, with the BBC's planned investment in Salford including the relocation of some 1,800 jobs. Thriving strength in creative industries has been augmented by events such as the 2000 Commonwealth Games, flagship projects and massive physical regeneration in the city.

The global market for creative and cultural products is expanding as communications technologies and tourism grow. Much research has been undertaken to determine different mechanisms for developing the sector, with considerable emphasis placed on the potential gains to be derived from clustering investment in and around neighbourhoods termed cultural quarters.[31–33] Distinctiveness may be generated from a local strength in a sector. For example, by embedding the development of the computer games industry cluster within the education institutions, Dundee has managed to forge a competitive niche within that sector. The University of Abertay was the first UK University to set up a BSc and MSc in Computer Games Technology and now, alongside London, has the largest number of games–development employees in the UK.[34]

CHALLENGES OF HARNESSING CULTURE AS A TOOL FOR REGENERATION

Despite the potential benefits, there are significant challenges to be overcome when using culture as a tool for economic regeneration. Three main areas will be discussed. First, it is argued that, in efforts to make cities appealing to a footloose creative class, polarisation is likely to be caused between rich and poor. Secondly, a focus on consumption-oriented strategies, necessitating hallmark events and flagship infrastructure, cannot be instituted in every city with the same level of success and may cause displacement. Finally, weaknesses in measurement systems, often leading to overstating the weight of the production side of the sector, may obscure the best policy routes.

Polarisation of rich and poor

Attempts to 'rebrand' cities to render them more attractive to investors and tourists have undoubtedly helped to transform former industrial centres. Yet there are concerns that such strategies prioritise tourists over residents, redefining local identity and causing significant tensions between the new elites and the mainstream residents.[35] Capturing identity is a selective process and, as such, can act as a 'carnival mask' rather than a catalyst for regeneration. There can sometimes be an inherent mismatch in the aims of the place promoters and those trying to reflect an authentic local identity. 'Culture has a wide variety of meanings and values. To invoke culture is to open up a Pandora's Box of different symbolic representations and complex personal, national and group identities.[19] Imitation without real grounding in local history, needs and identity is bound to fail.

There are problematic aspects to the widespread provision of the type of lifestyle and amenities that the 'creative class' demands. The culture-related expansion of the service sector may create employment in low-wage, exploitative roles and thus create a greater polarisation in these cities between rich and poor, serving to

alienate the indigenous population. Wilks-Heeg and North describe Florida's approach to local economic development as 'highly elitist … premised on attracting a new class of highly educated foot-loose professionals rather than dealing with socio-economic inequalities'.[35] The concentration on creating the desirable quality of life for wealthier residents and tourists can obscure, they suggest, the real and most acute problems. This aspect is drawn upon by many of Florida's critics, and it must be recognised that there are 'serious downsides to unrestrained workforce and flexibilization strategies'.[36]

Many cities focus their attention on the core central business district area and thus deepen the gulf between the commercial centre and more peripheral, disenfranchised areas. Furthermore, few well-paid jobs may be provided for the city's residents. The example of Glasgow is a useful case in point, as the approach taken there is not without its critics. The employment created on the back of City of Culture 1990 swelled Clydeside's service sector from 405,000 jobs in 1971 to 452,000 in 1991.[38] Many of these jobs did not suit the skills of redundant manufacturing workers, and the jobs were characterised by low pay and instability. Further contention can be caused when the costs of public investment in arts and culture, especially in flagship projects, are weighed against minor increases in low-level employment.

Even if it is accepted that human capital is a key determinant of urban futures, a richness and diversity of culture and city-centre living is not necessarily the priority among the skilled individuals whom the city most wants to attract. Glaeser and Kahn argue that amenities associated with quality of life such as 'big suburban lots with easy commutes by automobile and safe streets and good schools and low taxes' are more

important in determining the location of creative, skilled individuals.[37] The findings are echoed by UK studies, and it is likely that the provision of city-centre luxury apartments is likely to be insufficient in trying to create the residential amenity demanded by the creative class.[38–39] Furthermore, one person's amenity is another person's inconvenience, for example through the noise or congestion generated in a city.[40] City living has not enjoyed a massive upturn and, in fact, city centres in northern UK cities are now having to deal with the problem of the chronic oversupply of high-end residential developments. It has been claimed that 87 per cent of new homes in central Leeds are one- and two-bed flats aimed at investors, and that 70 per cent of flats in central Manchester and 65 per cent in Sheffield have been sold to private landlords, who have now begun to resort to sale with up to 40 per cent losses.[41] Similarly, concerns can be raised about basing regeneration on a consumption-oriented strategy, focused on leisure and recreational spending that is likely to be hit first and worst by the current 'credit crunch'.

Lack of distinctiveness

One of the most important challenges is for cities to forge a distinctive identity, which is asserted to give competitive advantage. Attempts to replicate successful approaches from elsewhere often lead to generic and homogenised results, which are unsustainable in the long term. The pursuit of distinctiveness may result in a recipe with ingredients that are very similar to those used everywhere.[42] The widespread use of advertising campaigns, flagship projects and spectacular events has a danger of becoming generic from place to place. Few cities achieve international

recognition as major cultural centres because continued success depends on high attendance figures, public sector investment and constant reinvention. Flagship cultural infrastructures and high-profile events are costly to plan and host, and there are high-profile examples of failures such as the Royal Armouries in Leeds and the National Centre for Popular Music in Sheffield.[43] The latter, which opened in 1999 at a cost of around £15m including £11m in lottery funding, greatly overestimated its visitor numbers at 400,000 a year when it actually only attracted 80,000 visitors, leading to its closure in 2000.[44] The competition is fierce, with 63 per cent of the UK's museum visitors being accounted for by only six institutions, all London-based including the British Museum, the National History Museum and the V&A. This concentration rose to 82 per cent for overseas visitors.[45]

Recent investments in Abu Dhabi's cultural district demonstrate the scale of capital outlay places are willing to part with to try and achieve competitive advantage as a destination for leisure and tourism. The $27bn Saadiyat (Happiness) Island will feature cultural infrastructure such as branches of the Louvre and Guggenheim and buildings designed by celebrity architects such as Frank Gehry, Zaha Hadid and Jean Nouvel. Merely for the use of the Louvre brand, including help with selecting collections, an accord was struck of $1bn.[46] It is unrealistic to expect all places to be able to compete with this level of investment in infrastructure and, indeed, it remains to be seen whether this turns out to be a wise choice for Abu Dhabi.

There is also a concern that the instrumentalisation or functionalisation of art will be of detriment to the quality of the art produced. By qualifying and quantifying the outputs of artistic and cultural producers in social and economic terms, it is felt that there is a risk to the traditionally radical voice of the creative world.[47] There is an uneasy relationship between the art world and urban planners, as it is considered to be 'safe' art that attracts the commercial sponsors and large audiences.[48] This situation has been repeated in many places, especially when consumption-oriented strategies are put into place. At its extreme, the danger is that 'this is a strategy which will make the arts fall prostrate before commerce, the market and vested political interests, turning the arts and culture into a commodity, only to be appreciated in terms of its "experience value"'.[31]

Questions can therefore be raised as to the level of access to the benefits brought by culture-led regeneration. Expansions in this sector are explicitly aimed at improving the lives of indigenous residents. However, gentrification — 'a shift from multiple to single occupancy and from rent to owner-occupation of housing' — brings hardships in terms of heightened land, house and office prices, which may displace original inhabitants.[47] This is exemplified by difficulties encountered by artists and other creatives living or working in cultural quarters. Developers, landlords and gentrifiers themselves may see this as a virtuous cycle, as artists and creative types colonise run down areas, taking advantage of their cheap rents, and then increase the popularity, encouraging a rise of property prices. Aside from the marginalisation of groups displaced from these areas, the colonisers may also become victims of their own success. As office and luxury residential properties invade, distinctive flavour and appeal are likely to be lost.

Definition and measurement

Assessing the benefits of culture-led regeneration is complex. The key

problem is establishing causal attribution between cultural projects and the range of outcomes, with the result that impacts that are difficult to measure may be downplayed or ignored.[49] Inputs are not commonly measured, which creates further questions surrounding additionality and substitution. Evidence is normally limited to surveys of visitor numbers and direct employment, which may obscure problems of displacement and the leakage.[11] Largely, there has been an acceptance of an essentially commercial framework for understanding this field.[50]

While stimulating creative and cultural production might offer a more economically sustainable basis for regeneration, there is significant confusion surrounding definition and measurement, which is likely to have a negative impact on devising suitable interventions. Definitional and terminological clarity are of the utmost importance in designing policy. Unfortunately, there is a significant level of disagreement over the breadth and depth of inclusion in the creative industries and problems with 'terminological clutter'.[51] Problematically there are different histories of data collecting, gaps in reporting, no coherent national framework and a lack of shared mechanisms for data collection. Definitions tend to aggregate a wide range of activities, which do more to obscure than reveal generalisable trends.[52] The rationale behind a broad definition tends to be politically motivated, designed to serve the purposes of advocacy by proving the economic weight of the sector.[53]

The measurement of the economic weight of the creative industries sector is indeed complex. Employment data from the Annual Business Inquiry (ABI) can be used to calculate the concentration of creative industry employment by sub-sector. Problematically, however, almost all the sub-sector codes combine creative and 'non-creative' activities. For example, architecture is included in the Standard Industrial Classifications (SICs) code 7420, but this code also includes quantity surveying and a wide range of engineering activities. Secondly, the SICs are outdated, rooted in the industrial structure of the immediate post-war period. Also, the ABI is based upon data collected from employers and thus does not include data on self-employment. This is an important category in the creative industries.[54]

THREE PRINCIPLES FOR EMBEDDING THE CREATIVE CITY

As has been demonstrated by the exploration of the challenges of instituting policy in this area, there is clearly a role for intervention at the broadest level. The value of these activities is unlikely to be sustained if left to the market, and joined-up thinking and working are essential in achieving success. A combination of consumption and production is also recommended to ensure dynamism. Particular principles are advocated to help ensure sustainable creative projects. First, the provision and protection of suitable workspace can help ensure the development and sustainability of cultural production. Second, by encouraging participation and valuing more varied creative contributions, ownership of flagship schemes can be engendered and cultural diversity maintained. Finally, it is proposed that greater definitional clarity and improved data collection will contribute to the effectiveness of policy in this area.

More workspace

It is clear that space and place matter in the development of creative cities.

Locality-based distinctiveness is often at the heart of the success of these activities.[55] Affordable space for creative businesses is thought to be a vital ingredient for developing creative cities, and thus cultural entrepreneurs will often work in run-down areas where more traditional businesses 'fear to tread'.[56] It is suggested that creative workers will tend to congregate in mixed-use neighbourhoods with opportunities to work, live and socialise in one environment. The density of communication and interaction in this environment allows people to learn rapidly and share ideas.[57] The built environment plays a key role by providing suitable workspace, adaptable buildings and inspiring space, as well as contributing to distinctiveness and ambience. The diversity engendered by planning policy, through mixed communities, can provide the level of tolerance and diversity necessary for a strong creative milieu. Good quality public space is also useful for providing places to mix and meet and as a way of developing strong place identity. Creative places are rarely settled and cosy: they are usually in the midst of battles between 'old' and 'new' sources of wealth, income and identity.[56] Leadbeater and Oakley suggest that it is through deregulation and experimentation that the creative atmosphere of downtown city areas is allowed to emerge. By avoiding displacement and the dilution of the production of art and culture, a more sustainable brand of culture-led regeneration can be developed.

The danger of not instituting robust policies in this area and leaving activities to the market is that gentrification is likely to become a problem, with the associated disadvantages of displacement, loss of identity and distinctiveness and the loss of ancillary services important for networking. The use classification encompassing most creative industry activities in the current Town and Country Planning Act is arguably too broad, as it includes all offices and studios under the B1 use class. It has been suggested that this 'fails to safeguard the physical and economic conditions necessary for SMEs working in the creative industries to flourish'.[58]

Fuller participation

In order to make culture-led regeneration sustainable and successful, it is necessary to try and embed it within longer-term goals and processes. Holistic perspectives of cities focus not just on economic competitiveness, but also social cohesion and environmental sustainability.[43] It is this balance that can provide the basis for exploring ideas of sustainable policy in promoting a creative city. Grand flagship cultural projects may bring benefits for the local middle class and cultural tourists, but may have little relevance to many of a city's inhabitants, especially those who have suffered the most through the economic restructuring. Rather than imitating other examples, the positive historical features of identity can be drawn on. Unless undertaken alongside educational and participation programmes, events may serve to alienate the indigenous residents and increase polarisation between rich and poor.

There is potential for addressing issues of social exclusion by strengthening identity, civic pride and accommodating cultural diversity. It is asserted that, if all aspects are working well, virtuous cycles can be developed, thereby promoting social inclusion as well as productivity and competitiveness. During the Manchester Commonwealth Games in 2000, an initiative was put into place to ensure that members of hard-to-reach and disadvantaged groups were given the opportunity to participate and gain

accredited training and experience. This was widely regarded as successful at both training previously hard-to-reach groups and encouraging some into employment after the games.[59] The evidence demonstrates that it is possible to apply principles of participation and ownership, even to the hallmark events, if tackled with care.

Better measurement

As suggested earlier, there is a tendency to measure culture for its economic impact rather than intrinsic value. Any measure of intrinsic value is complicated and often met with criticism due to associations with a paternalistic 'bestowing' of culture. This is a drawback, but does not detract from the importance of widening the conception of impact and value to include ideas of institutional and public value. This would include the ways of doing things, which might inspire and achieve trust, equity and conviviality capturing processes as well as impacts.[49] Attempts to assess cultural production through solely quantitative measures are not likely to be very illuminating. Basic economic impact studies are often flawed and difficult to conduct accurately. Methods which reveal and capture more intangible features relating to the processes of production and nature of employment are likely to be more revealing of the best routes to nurturing the sector, despite being less glamorous politically.

It would be beneficial to evaluate over the longer term and employ more diverse methods including longitudinal studies.[11] Longitudinal studies are particularly illuminating in helping to review the success or failure of high-profile events, as in Garcia's study of the impact of European City of Culture on Glasgow.[20,21] In terms of other types of data collection, increased emphasis on participation and non-participation is needed, as well as data exploring people's attitudes to cultural projects. This would contribute to evidence-based policy regarding encouraging inclusion and mediate some of the problems of polarisation. Measurement should not be thought about solely in monetary terms, but in alternative conceptions of value. As discussed earlier a vibrant cultural scene may positively contribute to the quality of life people experience and to the image of a city. These largely intangible features may greatly affect the economic future of a place, but are difficult to measure using conventional methods.

References

1. Scott, A.J. (ed) (2001), 'Global city-regions: Trends, theory, policy', Oxford University Press, Oxford.
2. Scott, A.J. (2006), 'Creative cities: Conceptual issues and policy questions', *Journal of Urban Affairs*, Vol. 28, No. 1, pp. 1–17.
3. Turok, I. and Mykhnenko, V. (2008), 'Resurgent European cities?' *Urban Research & Practice*, Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 54–77.
4. Parkinson, M., Hutchins. M., Simmie, J., Clark, G. and Verdonk, H. (2004), 'Competitive European Cities: Where do the core cities stand?' ODPM, London p. 5.
5. Amin, A., Massey, D. and Thrift, N. (2000), 'Cities for the many, not for the few', Policy Press, Bristol, p. 118.
6. Myerscough, J. (1988), 'Economic importance of the arts in Britain', Policy Studies Institute, London.
7. Florida, R. (2002), 'The rise of the creative class', Basic Books, New York.
8. Landry, C. (2000), 'The creative city: A toolkit for urban innovators', Earthscan Publications, London.
9. Bailey, C., Miles, S. and Stark, P. (2004), 'Culture-led urban regeneration and the revitalisation of identities in Newcastle, Gateshead and the North East of England', *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, Vol. 10, No. 4, pp. 47–65.
10. Matarasso, F. and Landry, C. (1999), 'Balancing Act; 21 strategic dilemmas in cultural policy', Council of Europe Publishing, Strasbourg.
11. Evans, G. and Shaw, P. (2004), 'The contribution of culture to regeneration in the UK: A review of the evidence', London Metropolitan University, London.

12. Throsby, D. (2001), 'Economics and culture', Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, p. 5.

13. Seaman, B. (2003), 'Cultural and sport economics: Conceptual twins', *Journal of Urban Economics*, Vol. 27, pp. 81–126 at p. 87.

14. Scott, A.J. (2004), 'Cultural products industries and urban economic development: Prospects for growth and market contestation in global context', *Urban Affairs Review*, Vol. 39, No. 4, pp. 461–90.

15. Rodgers, P. (1989), 'The work of art', Policy Studies Institute, London, p. 63.

16. Florida, R. and Gates, G. (2001), 'Technology and tolerance: The importance of diversity to high-technology growth', The Brookings Institute, Wasington, DC.

17. CURDS and NERU (2003), 'Evaluation of graduate retention programmes in the North East of England', University of Newcastle upon Tyne, Newcastle upon Tyne.

18. Anderson, D. and Nurick, J. (2002), 'Cultural impact: Measuring the economic effects of culture', *Locum Destination Review*, Winter, pp. 15–17 at p. 17.

19. Evans, G. and Foord, J. (2003), 'Shaping the cultural landscape: Local regeneration effects', in Miles, M. & Hall, T. (eds) 'Urban futures: Critical commentaries on shaping the city', Routledge, London.

20. Garcia, B. (2004), 'Cultural policy and urban regeneration in Western European Cities: Lessons from experience, prospects for the future', *Local Economy*, Vol. 19, No. 4, pp. 312–16.

21. Garcia, B. (2004), 'Urban regeneration, arts programming and major events', *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, Vol. 10, No. 1, pp. 103–18 at p. 107.

22. Gomez, M. (1998), 'Reflective images: The case of urban regeneration in Glasgow and Bilbao', Blackwell, Oxford.

23. Macleod, G. (2002), 'From urban entrepreneurialism to a "revanchist city"? On the spatial injustices of Glasgow's Renaissance', *Antipode*, Vol. 34, No. 3, pp. 602–24.

24. Miles, M. (1997), 'Art, space and the city: Public art and urban features', Routledge, London.

25. DCMS (2001), 'Creative industries mapping document 2001', DCMS, London, p. 3.

26. Pratt, A. (2000), 'New media, the new economy and new spaces', *Geoforum*, Vol. 31, pp. 425–36.

27. Frontier Economics (2006), 'Comparative analysis of the UK's creative industries: Report to the DCMS', 3rd August, Frontier Economics, London, p. 6.

28. Scott, A.J. (2000), 'The cultural economy of cities: Essays on the geography of image-producing industries', Sage, London.

29. Peck, J. and Ward, K. (Eds) (2002), 'City of revolution: Restructuring Manchester', Manchester University Press, Manchester, p. 12.

30. DTI (Feb 2001), 'Business clusters in the UK: A first assessment', DTI, London.

31. Mommaas, H. (2004), 'Cultural clusters and the post–industrial city: Towards the remapping of urban cultural policy', *Urban Studies*, Vol. 41, No. 3, pp. 507–32.

32. Montgomery, J. (2003), 'Cultural quarters as mechanisms for urban regeneration. Part 1: Conceptualising cultural quarters', *Planning, Practice and Research*, Vol. 18, No. 4, pp. 293–306.

33. Montgomery, J. (2004), 'Cultural quarters as mechanisms for urban regeneration. Part 2: A review of four cultural quarters in the UK, Ireland and Australia, *Planning, Practice and Research*, Vol. 19, No. 1, pp. 3–31.

34. Skillset Audio Visual Training Group/DCMS (2001), 'Skills for tomorrow's media', Skillset, London, p. 114.

35. Jones, P. and Wilks-Heeg, S. (2004), 'Capitalising culture: Liverpool 2008', *Local Economy*, Vol. 19, No. 4, p. 343.

36. Peck, J. (2005), 'Struggling with the creative class', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, Vol. 29, No. 4, pp. 740–70 at p. 756.

37. Glaeser, E. and Kahn, M. (2004), 'Sprawl and urban growth', in Henderson, V. & Thisse, J. F. (eds) 'Handbook of regional and urban economics', Vol. 4, North-Holland, Amsterdam, p. 2.

38. Lee, P. and Murie, A. (2004), 'The role of housing in delivering a knowledge economy', *Built Environment*, Vol. 30, No. 3, pp. 235–45.

39. Tomaney, J and Bradley, D. (2007), 'The economic role of mobile professional and creative workers and their housing and residential preferences: Evidence from the North East of England', *Town Planning Review*, Vol. 78, No. 4, pp. 511–30.

40. Storper, M. and Manville, M. (2006), 'Behaviour, preferences and cities: Urban theory and urban resurgence', *Urban Studies*, Vol. 43, No. 8, pp. 1247–74 at p. 1252.

41. Northwood, G. (2008), 'Northern lights fade out', *Estates Gazette*, 19 April, pp. 132–33 at p. 133.

42. Turok, I. (forthcoming), 'The distinctive city: Pitfalls in the pursuit of differential advantage', *Environment and Planning A*, available at http://www.gla.ac.uk/media/media_77892_en.pdf

43. Buck, N., Gordon, I., Harding, A. and Turok, I. (eds) (2005), 'Changing cities', Palgrave, London.

44. Strange, I. (2006), 'The ups and downs of developing regional cultural attractions', *Yorkshire and Humber Regional Review*, Vol. 16, No. 3, pp 24–25 at p. 24.

45. Travers, T. (2006), 'Museums and galleries in Britain: Economics, social and creative impacts', LSE, London.

46. Fattah, H. (2007), 'Celebrity architects reveal a daring cultural Xanadu for the Arab world', *New York Times*, 1st February, available at http://www.nytimes.com/2007/02/01/arts/

design/01isla.html?_r=1&oref=slogin&pagew
anted=print

47. Miles, M. (2005), 'Interruptions: Testing the
rhetoric of culturally led urban development',
Urban Studies, Vol. 42, No. 5/6, pp. 889–912 at
p. 891.

48. Basset, K. (1993), 'Urban cultural strategies and
urban regeneration: A case study and critique',
Environment and Planning, Vol. 25, pp. 1773–88
at p. 1784.

49. Holden, J. (2004), 'Capturing cultural value:
How culture became the tool of government
policy', DEMOS, London.

50. Shorthose, J. (2004), 'A more critical view of
the creative industries: Production, consumption
and resistance', *Capital and Class*, Vol. 84,
pp. 1–10.

51. Galloway, S. and Dunlop, S. (2007), 'A critique
of definitions of the cultural and creative
industries in public policy', *International Journal of
Cultural Policy*, Vol. 13, No. 1, pp. 17–31.

52. Tepper, S. (2002), 'Creative assets and the
changing economy', *Journal of Arts Management,
Law and Society*, Vol. 32, No. 1, pp. 159–68.

53. Selwood, S. (2002), 'Measuring culture', *Spiked
Online*, 30th December, available at
http://www.spiked-online.com/Articles/
00000006DBAF.htm

54. DCMS (2004), 'DCMS evidence toolkit, DET
Technical Report', DCMS, London.

55. Oakley, K. (2004), 'Not so cool Britannia: The
role of the creative industries in economic
development', *International Journal of Cultural
Studies*, Vol. 7, No. 1, pp. 67–87.

56. Leadbeater, C. and Oakley, K. (1999), 'The
independents: Britain's new cultural
entrepreneur', DEMOS, London.

57. Banks, M., Lovatt, A., O'Connor, J. and
Raffo, C. (2000), 'Risk and trust in the
cultural industries', *Geoforum*, Vol. 31,
pp. 453–64.

58. Fischer, S. (2007), 'Planning and creativity: The
case for reviewing use classes to enable creative
industries to flourish', in Chevin, D. (ed),
'Planning for the future', The Smith Institute,
London, p. 83.

59. Smith, A. and Fox, T. (2007), 'From "event-led"
to "event-themed" regeneration: The 2002
Commonwealth Games Legacy Programme',
Urban Studies, Vol. 44, pp. 1125–43.