JESSICA LOUISE MACBETH

Department of Sports Studies
University of Stirling

Women's Football in Scotland: An Interpretive Analysis

Thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy,
University of Stirling, January 2004
DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis has been composed by myself, and that it embodies the results of my own research. Where appropriate, I have acknowledged the nature and extent of work carried out in collaboration with and by others included in the thesis.

Signed: ....................................

Date: ............................
ABSTRACT

The growing body of literature on women’s football has focused mainly on the development of the game and experiences of past and present players. Despite the emergence of research on women’s football internationally there has not yet been exclusive attention to either of these areas in the Scottish context. Using an interpretive framework this thesis is organised around four main themes: the development of women’s football in Scotland; socio-demographic characteristics of women footballers; the process of socialisation; and, the subculture of women’s football. The synthesis of elements within the interpretive framework ensures that the research offers an interpretation that is both contextualised historically and informed by an understanding of the meaning of football in the context of players’ private lives. In relation to the history of the game, the development of women’s football in Scotland has indeed been shaped by the particular Scottish context. The research concludes that the socialisation of women into football in Scotland is an interactive and often a reciprocal process. The subculture of women’s football in Scotland is characterised by three interlocking group cultures. The meaning of football in players’ lives influences the nature of their individual membership to these group cultures and the importance they attach to elements of subcultural capital. The various meanings attached to football give rise to potential sources of tension between the dominant, emergent and residual elements of culture within the subculture. This original theoretically and empirically informed study of women’s football in Scotland makes a contribution to the growing body of research on women’s football and to our understanding of the social and historical significance of sport in Scottish society.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis would not have been possible without the support and guidance of a number of people. In particular I would like to thank my supervisor Professor Grant Jarvie (University of Stirling) for, amongst other things, his continued encouragement in making the transition from economics to sociology.

My thanks also go to the women who gave up their time to participate in this study. I hope they enjoyed the chance to share their experiences as much as I enjoyed hearing about them.

I also wish to thank members of the Department of Sports Studies (University of Stirling), especially Barbara Kettlewell for her continual support and for breaking up the long days in the office by ‘doing lunch’ so often.

On a more personal level the last three years would have been so much more difficult without several very special friends. Kerry, Lisa, Weronika, Deb, Mel and Rach have always been there for me and, whenever possible, considerately led me astray to the pub.

Last, but by no means least, I have been extremely lucky to have the invaluable support of my ‘extended’ family. In particular, my mum, dad, Joanne, nana, John, and Pat, who have always believed in me and helped me believe in myself.
DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to the memory of my late Grandad

Ernest George Poole (1924 – 2000)

'For all the kick-about in the garden'
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FA</td>
<td>Football Association [English]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIFA</td>
<td>Federation Internationale de Football</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRC</td>
<td>Former Regional Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFA</td>
<td>Scottish Football Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFM</td>
<td>Scottish Football Museum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWF Ltd</td>
<td>Scottish Women’s Football Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWFA</td>
<td>Scottish Women’s Football Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWFL</td>
<td>Scottish Women’s Football League</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWPL</td>
<td>Scottish Women’s Premier League</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UEFA</td>
<td>Union of European Football Associations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WFA</td>
<td>Women’s Football Association [English]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WUSA</td>
<td>Women’s United Soccer Association</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract

Acknowledgements i

Dedication ii

Glossary of Abbreviations iii

Table of Contents iv

List of Figures vi

Introduction 1
  Organisation of the Thesis 7

Chapter One – Women, Football and Society 12
  Introduction 12
  Research on the Development of Women’s Football 13
  Research on the Experiences of Women Footballers 20
  Women, Social Class and Football 26
  Football and Work 30
  Football, Socialisation and Gender 32
  Perspectives of Women’s Football 41
  The Subculture of Women’s Football 44
  Conclusion 47

Chapter Two – An Interpretive Framework 49
  An Introduction to Interpretive Sociology 49
  Interpretive Sociology of Sport 51
  Interpretive Framework 63
  Conclusion 89

Chapter Three – The Development of Women’s Football in Scotland 94
  Introduction 94
  The Origins of Women’s Football in Scotland 96
  Growth in the Women’s Game: Late 19th and Early 20th Centuries 99
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Four – A Socio-Demographic Profile of Women Footballers in Scotland</td>
<td>135</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>135</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survey of Women Footballers</td>
<td>136</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Characteristics</td>
<td>143</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>152</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Class</td>
<td>156</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupational Status</td>
<td>161</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sporting Biography</td>
<td>165</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>174</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Five – The Socialisation of Women into Football in Scotland</td>
<td>178</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>178</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Experiences of Childhood Play</td>
<td>181</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial Involvement in and Identification with Football</td>
<td>183</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing a Commitment to Football</td>
<td>190</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changing Participation and Retirement from Football</td>
<td>200</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Influence of Socialising Agents</td>
<td>207</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experiences of General Attitudes towards Women’s Football in Scottish Society</td>
<td>216</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>222</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Six – The Subculture of Women’s Football in Scotland</td>
<td>224</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>224</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Towards a Definition</td>
<td>225</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ‘Pals’, the ‘Professionals’ and the ‘Conformers’</td>
<td>229</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Membership and Subcultural Capital</td>
<td>248</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tensions between Dominant, Emergent and Residual Aspects of Culture</td>
<td>258</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>270</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion – An Interpretation of Women’s Football in Scotland</td>
<td>273</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>291</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendices – Volume Two</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Response rates to survey by each division</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Geographical distribution of clubs and representation of sample</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Age composition of women footballers compared to national female population</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Age composition of the adult population and football participants</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Age group of survey sample</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Age group by marital status</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Country of birth</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>FRC area of secondary school by FRC area of club</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>Total number of siblings</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>Number of siblings</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.12</td>
<td>Number of children</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.13</td>
<td>FRC of secondary school</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>Qualifications held</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.15</td>
<td>Qualifications held by age</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.16</td>
<td>Further and higher education qualifications held</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.17</td>
<td>Guardian occupation as indicator of social class</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.18</td>
<td>Player occupation as indicator of social class</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.19</td>
<td>Players' view of their social class</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.20</td>
<td>Players' views of the social class of women footballers</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.21</td>
<td>View of social class by view of social class of women footballers</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.22</td>
<td>Occupational status</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.23</td>
<td>Nature of work for those who are employed</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.24</td>
<td>Salary</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.25</td>
<td>Weekly earnings of full-time employed players</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.26</td>
<td>Status for those who are students</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.27</td>
<td>Provision and participation of sports in PE</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.28</td>
<td>Provision and participation of sports in EC</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.29</td>
<td>Provision and participation of sports in school</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.30</td>
<td>Continuity in sports participation from school</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.31</td>
<td>Current sport participation</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.32</td>
<td>Main competitive sport</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.33</td>
<td>Representation of divisions in sample</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.34</td>
<td>Extent to which involved in playing matches</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.35</td>
<td>Number of clubs</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.36</td>
<td>Number of clubs by age group</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.37</td>
<td>International representation</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.38</td>
<td>International representation and current division</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.39</td>
<td>International representation and age group</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Age of introduction to football at various levels</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Nature of introduction</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Attitude of high school and PE department</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Age group by attitude of high school</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.5 Who encouraged introduction to football at various levels 209
5.6 Influence of socialising agents 211
5.7 Discouragement from being involved in football 216
5.8 General Scottish publics’ views on women’s football 217
5.9 Scottish media views on women’s football 218
6.1 Interlocking group cultures and horizontal stratification of subculture membership within women’s football in Scotland 230
6.2 View about being a member of a club by division 232
6.3 Weekly time profile: Kim (17 yrs) Premier League 241
6.4 High proportion of lesbian / bisexual women who play football in Scotland? 244
6.5 Hours of training attended each week by division 251
6.6 Weekly time profile: Fiona (21 yrs) First Division 252
6.7 ‘I only really know players in my own club’ by division 255
6.8 ‘I am friends with women who play for other clubs’ by division 255
INTRODUCTION

Football research has featured extensively within the growing field of the sociology of sport. This comes as no surprise considering the world-wide appeal of football, and the plethora of research on football in Britain signifies its status as arguably the national British sport. There are several areas of football research that are prominent within the sociology of sport such as, football hooliganism (Ingham, 1978; Melnick, 1986; Sugden and Bairner, 1988; Dunning, Murphy, and Williams, 1988 and 1990; Armstrong and Harris, 1991; Evans and Rowe, 2002), ethnic, religious, cultural and social identity through football (Bairner, 1994; Bradley, 1995; Armstrong and Giulianotti, 1999; Russell, 1999), football and national identity (Sugden and Tomlinson, 1994; Duke and Crolley, 1996; Hassan, 2002), and football fandom (Taylor, 1992; Redhead, 1997).

Historically, football has been widely recognised as a male preserve and has received substantial attention predominantly from male researchers in several fields. In particular research on football has encompassed issues of sociology, history, politics, and the media. The association of women with the sport has been a relatively under-researched area within the sociology of sport. When featured, women are cast mainly in a spectating capacity, although to a somewhat lesser extent than men are. Several pieces of research have emerged which focus exclusively on women as football fans (Harris, 1999; Crolley and Long, 2001; Elsden, 2001). The relative marginalisation of women within football research is arguably both a reflection of their presence and influence within the game in Britain, and a natural approach to researching a male-dominated
phenomenon. However, acceptance of this marginalisation is based solely on the assumption that we are referring to men's football.

Attention to the women's game presents a somewhat different problematic. Until recently there has been limited research on the women's game in relation to the men's (Lopez, 1979; Bale 1980; Williamson, 1991; Williams and Woodhouse, 1991). This literature has however given insight into the development of women's football, and exposed a relatively new and interesting avenue for further research. Since this research was conducted women's football has arguably become more incorporated into the dominant sport culture in Britain than ever before. The profile of the game world-wide has increased significantly owing to the heightened media coverage of recent international competitions, such as the 1999 and 2003 World Cups, both held in the United States of America. A fully professional league (WUSA League) has existed in the United States since April 2000 attracting the highest profile players from around the world, including Scotland striker Julie Fleeting. Although, due to sponsorship difficulties, the league suffered an untimely suspension immediately before the 2003 World Cup, progress is currently being made to secure sponsors in order to resurrect the league in 2004. In Britain, increasing participation rates and growing popularity over the last decade have culminated in women's football establishing itself as one of the fastest growing sports. In both England and Scotland, although to a greater extent in England, there are players involved in emerging professional programmes run by a number of clubs. In Scotland this is largely orchestrated through an apprentice scheme launched by the Scottish Football Association (SFA) in 2001 (Pearson, 2003).
An emerging field of literature on the game is similarly matching developments in women’s football. Research falls generally into two areas, the development of the game in various cultural contexts and the experiences of women footballers, particularly in relation to concepts of gender and sexuality. The development of women’s football in Britain, with a predominant focus on England, has been the focus of several pieces of research that have concentrated solely on the women’s game (Williamson, 1991; Newsham, 1997; Lopez, 1997; Melling, 1998 and 1999; Williams, 2003a). Collectively, this literature reflects upon the early history of the late 19th century, the popularity of the sport in the 1920s, through to the ‘new age’ of women’s football within late modernity. Research concentrating upon the experiences of women footballers has also been published more recently (Davies, 1996; Scraton, Fasting, Pfister, and Bunuel, 1999; Caudwell, 1999, 2000 and 2002; Cox and Thompson, 2000 and 2001; Ashworth, 2001; Harris, 2001; Williams, 2003a). The majority of theoretical research on women as footballers is grounded in feminist thought and focuses on experiences associated with playing a traditionally male sport in a male-defined sporting world. Issues of gender and sexuality have been prominent, as has, with the exception of Caudwell (1999, 2000 and 2002) and Williams (2003a), a focus on top-level players. Less of an attempt has been made to reveal the meaning and importance of being a member of a football club. This is yet to be researched across a more representative cross-ability sample of players, and is an area that is also ignored within the literature on men’s football.

What is particularly significant to the thesis presented here is that women’s football in Scotland is neglected at several levels. First women, in any capacity, and women’s football in particular are generally absent from research on football.
Furthermore, women footballers and other sportswomen tend to be ignored in research on women in Scotland. Research on women in Scotland has been largely co-ordinated through ‘Engender’ the then new women’s research and campaigning group which was launched in 1994. The resulting gender audit led to the production of empirical data relating to the position of women in Scottish society (Brown, Myers, and Breitenbach, 1994). Programmes of research, such as that produced by engender and Scottish women, have however failed to acknowledge the existence of women in sport in Scotland.

Second, current histories and sociological and cultural interventions on football in Scotland have, despite the particular status of the national game, failed to acknowledge the part played by Scottish women footballers, for example, in reproducing particular images of Scotland the nation. Third, it is fair to say that our knowledge of Scottish women’s sport in general, and women’s football in Scotland in particular, has been notable only by its absence from an international body of critical research which has examined various aspects of women’s sport, including women’s football. Finally, within existing research on women’s football, particularly that focusing on the development of the game, a number of authors claim to address women’s football in Britain. In reality Scotland generally receives a token mention, and usually only in relation to connections with the development of women’s football in England, rather than exclusive attention.

An inspiration to this research has been Davies’ (1996) work revealing the significance of football in the lives of members of the Doncaster Belles. His work has set the foundations for research into the sport subculture of women’s football that focuses primarily on the meanings that players attach to playing the sport and the place of football in the context of the players’ everyday lives. The thesis is driven
fundamentally by my own interest in football, and experiences of playing the sport from an early age. As a member of the Stirling University Ladies Football Club (SULFC) for over six years and having played for clubs in the Scottish Women's Football League (SWFL) I came to realise that my experiences of playing football and being a member of a club are shared by many other women and girls, and no doubt men and boys. The research is therefore grounded in lived experience since my past experiences of being a member of the subculture raised an interest in the shared and/or different meanings people attach to their own involvement and commitment to the sport.

It is useful to explain the position of myself in the research. Apart from a brief spell with Giuliano’s FC in 2002, I was not a registered member of any SWFL club during the research. My spell with Giuliano’s was extremely brief due to transport problems and other commitments and as a result I was unable to become socialised from a relative outsider to an established club member in this particular club context. As far as my experience of being a member of the subculture of women’s football is concerned then, it is based on my immersion in the women’s university football scene in Scotland over six years (including two years whilst conducting this research) and a somewhat partial immersion competing in the SWFL for Falkirk LFC during 2000 and for Giuliano’s FC in 2002.

Although university teams do not compete in the SWFL there are several ways in which they form part of the wider network of women’s football in Scotland. In my experience, a substantial number of players of university teams are also registered members of SWFL clubs and, as Chapter Four will show, students make up a relatively significant proportion (25%) of the sample of SWFL players in this study. My
experiences with Falkirk and Giuliano’s came about through contacts between university
team members who were also members of these particular clubs. It is logical to suggest
therefore that there will be common experiences and meanings attached to football at
both the university and SWFL levels. Indeed, during my involvement in these SWFL
clubs I developed an awareness of various meanings and group cultures that seemed to
transcend both university and SWFL football. I was, however, less aware of the extent of
tensions between various group cultures, as discussed in Chapter Six. As I embarked on
the study I could firmly locate myself within the subculture as one of the ‘pals’. In fact,
within the university football scene, primarily because of the extent of my commitment
to SULFC over six years, I would suggest that my identity was as one of the core ‘pals’.
Due to the brief nature of my involvement, I experienced a relatively partially
immersion in the SWFL and, although the meanings I attached to football in this context
remained typical of being a ‘pal’, I was more of an ‘outsider’ than a ‘core’ member in
these particular club contexts. Most importantly, the nature of my experiences in both
university and SWFL football gave me an important element of insider knowledge into
the subculture, enabled me to become accepted as ‘one of us’ by interviewees, whilst
also allowing me to retain a degree of objectivity throughout the research process.

In light of this introductory discussion, a description of women’s football in
Scotland alone would be unsatisfactory and somewhat limited without further analysis.
This has been evident in some of the existing research on women’s football that, despite
describing the development of women’s football, has generally struggled to adopt a
sufficiently critical gaze. For this and other reasons, this research draws upon an
interpretive approach in order to make sense of women’s football in Scotland. In
explaining the phenomenon of women’s football in Scotland an interpretive approach highlights the following key questions: how has women’s football developed within the wider context of Scottish society? Who are Scottish women football players? How do women in Scotland experience the process of socialisation into football? How can the subculture of women’s football in Scotland be defined? And ultimately, what are the meanings of football in the lives of women football players in Scotland?

The strength of this research does not relate to one particular chapter or theme. Rather its' strength lies in the synthesis of several overlapping elements of the interpretive approach used to explain the interplay between evidence, theory and the particular area of investigation, women’s football in Scotland. The research is of a multi-methodological nature in order to uncover the experiences of a cross-ability sample of women footballers, concentrating on several main themes. These themes individually represent the focus of several chapters: the development of women’s football in Scotland; socio-demographic characteristics; socialisation into football; and the subculture of women’s football. By concentrating on these themes, an understanding of the subculture of women’s football and an interpretation of the meanings attached to playing football in the lives of women in Scotland will be produced.

**Organisation of the Thesis**

The thesis is organised around the following chapters. Chapter One sets the scene in terms of reviewing the existing literature on women’s football. It essentially asks: what do we know about women’s football in British society? And what do we not know about women’s football in Scotland? In order to answer this the chapter explores
existing literature to uncover what is known about the development of women's football in Britain. This is related to the broader social, economic, and political contexts within which football is located. By setting the scene the existing literature can be used to locate the experiences of women footballers throughout the existence of the game, in relation to the themes identified above. Existing research concentrating on women's experiences of playing football is the main focus of the chapter. Several pieces of research are analysed in terms of their approach, methods, conclusions, and relevance to this thesis. Gaps in the existing literature are identified and how this thesis will address these areas of neglect and ultimately take the literature forward, are detailed.

Chapter Two sets out the theoretical framework for the thesis. The research adopts an interpretive critical approach which is considered to be the most suitable in order to make sense of the subculture of women's football in Scotland. Interpretive sociology is about 'meaning' and within the sociology of sport it is a useful approach to explain the meanings attached to the actions of individuals within society and their involvement in sport. In particular, it has been an acclaimed approach to researching the two distinct but overlapping themes of sport subcultures and the process of socialisation. Sugden and Tomlinson (1999) identify six overlapping elements of an interpretive critical framework, of which five (historiographic, comparative, critical, investigative and multi-methodological) are adapted to form the framework of this thesis. As identified in Chapter One, the majority of recent research on the experiences of women who play football has engaged in feminist thought. Although this seems a natural approach to exploring the subculture of women's football in Scotland, there are several
limitations. This chapter explains the reasons for rejecting a feminist approach in favour of adopting an interpretive framework.

Chapter Three investigates the development of women's football in Scotland. The fundamental questions of when, who, where, why, and how are answered in relation to the wider social, economic, and political environment in Scotland and the rest of Britain from the late 19th century to the present day. The chapter essentially provides the historiographic element of the interpretive framework. In order to accomplish this various primary sources, including archive material, and more recent sources are consulted and used to produce an account of the development of women's football in Scotland. The present organisation of women's football is also explored in order to answer basic empirical questions and outline the structures and environment within which today's players participate.

The aim of Chapter Four is to answer the key question: who are the women footballers in Scotland? In order to compile a socio-demographic profile of women who play football in Scotland questionnaires were administered during the 2001/2002 season to all 41 clubs registered with the Scottish Women's Football Association (SWFA) and playing in the SWFL at senior level. The chapter ultimately reveals the age, socio-economic and family backgrounds, marital status, occupations, educational qualifications, and sporting biography of players currently participating from this range of ability levels. Such information provides an element of biography, a backcloth against which the concepts and findings of the following chapters can be analysed. Without this background material a valid interpretation of the meaning of football in the lives of women in Scotland would not be achievable.
The key question at the centre of Chapter Five is: how do women in Scotland experience the process of socialisation into football? This is answered primarily by referring to qualitative research material obtained from a number of semi-structured interviews with a sample of players from cross-ability case studies, and secondly, with reference to quantitative data obtained from the survey. This analysis treats players' participation in football as a journey, considering their experiences in football as descriptions of careers with identifiable beginnings, a process of developing a commitment, and an inevitable end. The chapter is organised around several fundamental stages of a player's career: early experiences of childhood play; initial involvement in and identification with football; developing a commitment to football; and changing participation and retirement from football. The chapter also pays close attention to two underlying themes. Although socialisation is treated as an interactive process, the influence of socialising agents and agencies is considered throughout the analysis. Similarly, players' experiences of the general Scottish public's and media attitudes towards women's football are explored.

Chapter Six offers an interpretation of the subculture of women's football in Scotland. This chapter draws further from the qualitative research material accrued from the semi-structured in-depth interviews and quantitative data obtained from the survey. The interpretation is organised around several main sections based on the following core questions: how might the subculture of women's football be defined? To what extent do identities and meanings that players attach to football vary across interlocking group cultures? What elements of subcultural capital determine the extent to which players are 'core' members or 'outsiders', and do these elements differ across group cultures? What
power struggles and tensions exist between dominant, emergent and residual elements of culture within the subculture of women's football in Scotland? The research is comparative on three levels. The cross-ability sample ensures sensitivity to differences in identities and meanings across ability levels. The identification of interlocking group cultures allows a comparison of cultural characteristics and meanings within and across these groups. Combined, the interlocking group cultures represent the subculture of women's football in the context of wider Scottish society.

In light of the above chapters conclusions from the research are offered. The conclusion combines the findings and key issues that emerge from individual chapters. The interpretive approach ensures the analysis is informed on several levels. An understanding of women's football in Scottish society is informed by sensitivity to relations of power that have shaped, and to some extent continue to shape, the game today. The meaning of football to players is understood within the context of the player's lives, and their experiences are understood in the context of Scottish society. The synthesis of overlapping elements in the interpretive framework enables a fully informed interpretation of the subculture of women's football in the particular Scottish context.
CHAPTER ONE - WOMEN, FOOTBALL AND SOCIETY

Introduction

The current research into women’s football in Britain is somewhat limited, both within wider research in the general field of women’s sport, and in comparison to research on football in general. The literature that does exist has tended to display an overwhelming emphasis on the history, development, and structure of women’s football. The focus of this thesis is the meaning of football in the lives of women football players in Scotland. By reviewing the literature on the history, development, and present structure of women’s football we are able to gain an understanding of how the wider social, economic, and political environment, has shaped and moulded the game. In doing so it is possible to locate the current experiences of women involved in the game today within a wider historical context. Women’s experiences of playing football have been the focus of some research. It is this literature which is of primary concern to this thesis and receives most of the attention in this chapter.

The review of existing research is organised around the following sections: the development of women’s football, and the experiences of women footballers. Although reviewed independently of each other these two themes should generally be considered as interdependent, particularly since dual causality exists between the two. For example, the development of women’s football and the wider social context will influence the experiences of women footballers, similarly the experiences women footballers have may well lead to changes in the development of the game. These sections have been chosen in order to firstly set the scene in terms of research on the history of women’s
football, particularly within British society and secondly, to facilitate an exploration of what we currently know about the experiences of women footballers. The literature on the experiences of women footballers is reviewed in relation to several common themes identified as both representing the focus of existing research, and also having the most relevance to this thesis. The chapter also encapsulates the issue of methodology within existing studies. Throughout the review approaches and methodologies adopted in research are assessed critically in order to provide a rationale for the methodology adopted within this study.

**Research on the Development of Women’s Football**

The most relevant findings regarding the development of women’s football in Britain are more thoroughly considered in Chapter Three to inform the historiography of women’s football in Scotland. It is important at this point to identify the general themes that emerge from this literature and the implications for this research on women’s football in Scotland. Williamson (1991) offered the first book devoted solely to women’s football in Britain. The author’s use of archive material and interviews enables him to trace the early history of women’s football in Britain from the early 18th century, with a particular focus on the late 20th century through to the early 1920s. The work of Williamson (1991) warrants some attention as it emerged as the first fundamental examination of the history of women’s football in Britain, and has subsequently informed much of the recent research into the origins of women’s football. In general, Williamson’s (1991) account concentrates on the emergence of women participating in football during the late 19th and early 20th centuries, and the reaction to the growth in the
game, particularly during and after the First World War. Parts of Williamson's (1991) account rely on evidence regarding the Dick, Kerr Ladies who remain the most celebrated team to emerge from this period of growth.

Throughout the account there is an effort to relate developments in the game to the wider context, often referring to press reports in an attempt to do so. The book introduces one of the most defining themes in the development of women's football in Britain, namely the criticisms aimed at the mere association of women with the traditionally male sport of football. Williamson (1991) provides contrasting media opinion of the participation of women in football and uses this to develop an understanding of some of the underlying beliefs that existed in the wider society. Such beliefs were finally 'substantiated' in 1921 with the FA ban on women teams playing on FA affiliated grounds. Williamson (1991) devotes much of his account to the lead up to the FA resolution and the consequences for women's football. His discussion of the consequences is limited to the years immediately following the ban and little is offered by way of the long-term effects. Although the account attempts to compensate for a previous lack of knowledge regarding the history of women's football, it is limited to a relatively short, but nonetheless significant, stage in the development of the game. Despite the relatively narrow scope of the account, the research reveals the experiences of women who participated in football in Britain during the early 20th century. In doing so he provides an understanding of the wider social and cultural climate in which women's football developed in Britain. These findings have provided the initial historical background for much of the subsequent research on women's football that has
collectively begun to redress the neglect of other stages of development in women’s football.

In a similar style to Williamson (1991), a specific case study is provided in Newsham’s (1997) celebration of the exploits of Dick, Kerr Ladies. Playing on after the FA ban of 1921, the team played an extremely active role in helping to lay the foundations for today’s game. The book acknowledges the wider social climate within which the progress of Dick, Kerr Ladies occurred, which understandably mirrors the scene set by Williamson (1991). Although the book provides a valuable insight into the history and controlled development of women’s football, the ultimate emphasis is on England with other parts of Britain referred to only sporadically. Similarly Melling (1999) offers a historical case study focusing on the role of ladies’ football during the 1921 Miners’ Lock-Out in Wigan and Leigh. The role of women’s football is examined within the context of women’s role in the local working class community and in wider society. Strong emphasis is placed on the novelty and charitable nature of women’s football at this time, resulting in the women forging a particular identity for themselves. Women’s football matches are identified as the most significant contribution to the local relief fund during the 1921 lock-out, and their activities placed women ‘at the forefront of the community as protectors, raising money to fund the ‘pea soup’ kitchens which fed the miners’ children’ (Melling, 1999: 45). Other issues that are discussed include the local media reaction to the women who played football, and the construction of the ‘plucky heroine’ ideology contrived during the war effort (Ouditt, 1993: 73, cited in Melling, 1999: 38). The main finding of the study is that the considerable moves made to marginalise the sport after 1921, due to changes in attitude towards women playing
football, was responsible for the absence of 'pea soup' matches during the subsequent 1926 Strike in the mining communities of Wigan and Leigh (Melling, 1999: 60).

Encompassing both the history and the recent development of women's football in Britain, and referred to by almost all literature in the field since, is Williams and Woodhouse's (1991) work. Introducing the key aspects of contemporary ideological relations between women and football in Britain, this research represents one of the first academic contributions to the history of the links between women and football. The development of women's football in Britain is traced from the first match between the North and South of England in 1895 to the new age of women's football brought on by England's World Cup victory in 1966, through to the early 1990s. The development of women's football since the 1920s has been documented in several publications. Williams and Woodhouse (1991) acknowledge the lack of awareness of events since the early 1920s, suggesting that until the 1960s women's football continued in a more or less 'underground' fashion. The research goes on to outline the development in the women's game from, what they refer to as, the 'new age' of women's football that emerged during the late 1960s, until the 1990s. The authors make particular reference to factors that have hindered the development of the women's game, in particular the influence of the FA, relations between the (English) Women's Football Association (WFA) and the FA, and the implications of the 1975 Sex Discrimination Act. The account focuses almost exclusively of women's football in England and Wales.

Research focusing on the development of women's football in a range of countries has also emerged. This literature is useful in offering the potential for international comparison. Research on the development of women's football in a wide
range of countries has been published collectively in a special issue of *Soccer and Society*. Individual contributions focus on women’s football in the United States (Markovits and Hellerman, 2003), Canada (Hall, 2003), China (Hong and Mangan, 2003), Korea (Koh, 2003), India (Majumdar, 2003), Denmark (Brus and Trangbaek, 2003), England (Williams, 2003b), Germany (Pfister, 2003), Norway (Fasting, 2003), Republic of Ireland (Bourke, 2003), Sweden (Hjelm and Olofsson, 2003), New Zealand (Cox and Thompson, 2003), Senegal, Nigeria and South Africa (Saavedra, 2003) and Brazil (Votre and Mourao, 2003).

There are several other relevant pieces of research. Bale (1980) considers the spatial pattern of football adoption and offers an explanation of regional differences in participation. Using the combination of a secondary analysis of WFA publications and original survey data conducted in 1978, the research identifies marked geographical differences in the adoption of women’s football, with small towns in the south of England suggested as the typical location. Ashworth (2001) offers a journalistic account documenting how girls from local Youth Projects and Community Centres in the north-east of England founded the Kestrels Women’s Football Club in 1989 and the subsequent experiences of players from the club. In describing the progression of the club into the top flight of English women’s football, it reflects on the wider political environment of 1990s north-east England, and the impact this has on players’ lives, the football club, and the local community as a whole. Essentially, the account offers a specific case study of the development of women’s football in a particular context, and the subsequent role of the club in the local community.
More recent developments in the women’s game between 1990 and 1996 have been described in a comprehensive account of women’s football by Lopez (1997). Based on her own experiences of playing top level football in Britain (from 1966 to 1986), Lopez (1997) explains how developments in the women’s game have reflected both sporting culture and broader social and cultural practices in Britain. Despite references to Hargreaves (1994) and to other academics in the field of sport, the book does not embrace a particular theoretical perspective, it more generally fills ‘some of the gaps in information about English women’s football’ (Lopez, 1997: xv). The research also informatively covers areas such as refereeing, support and spectators, the English media, socialising agents and their influences on women footballers, and finally implications for the future of women’s football in England. One of the themes running through Lopez’s work is the relationship of the women’s game to the male football administration, reflecting on how control and definition of the women’s game have been founded on ideological beliefs and ideas running through the male Football Association.

Showing parallels with the themes in Lopez (1997), Woodhouse and Williams (1999) have also published a short history of the women’s game. Their work sets the scene for the organisation of women’s football in England, at the time of publication, and also covers areas such as alternative roles occupied by women in football, the role of the media, women as fans, and international comparisons in the structure and organisation of women’s football. A recent publication that offers one of the most comprehensive academic histories of women’s football in Britain to date is provided by Williams (2003a). With particular reliance on the oral histories of past and present players Williams (2003a) places women’s experiences of football within the wider
cultural and social context. A significant amount of the research focuses on more contemporary issues relating to women's football, in particular, the development of the game in a global and professional era, the influence of legislation, international comparisons, and the future of women's football.

In terms of existing literature it is clear that the development of women's football in Scotland has been somewhat neglected. Although much of the research reviewed boasts a focus on the history of women's football in 'Britain' there is generally little attention to nations other than England. Knowledge provided on the development of the women's game in Scotland tends to be done so within the context of what we know about the women's game in Britain (predominantly England). Women's football in Scotland tends to be referred to only intermittently, usually in relation to tours made by English clubs that played Scottish teams. The most accessible information regarding the history of women's football in Scotland is available on the Internet. In association with the Scottish Football Museum (SFM), McCuaig (2000a) provides a brief history of women's football, which concentrates on the most publicised events in the 1920s, namely the visit of Dick, Kerr Ladies to Scotland, and the implementation of the FA ban. The summary however, provides little in terms of additional information. Lopez (1997) devotes a chapter to the development of women's football across the world, reporting on the various ways the game has developed in different countries. The developments are identified as reflecting the football culture of various nations, and their broader social and cultural differences. Within this chapter Lopez documents the development of women's football in Scotland with reference to the national team, players and coaches, and media attention. This provides one of the most comprehensive
documentation's of empirical facts regarding developments in women's football in Scotland.

Begbie (1996) has provided a brief summary of the developments of women's football in Scotland outlining the developments from 1991 to 1996 under the categories of senior clubs, the junior performance plan, camps programme, international developments, coach education, and links with local authorities. The information is useful in terms of setting the scene for women's football in Scotland however, it is merely a starting point that stands very much unaccompanied. Consequently, the entirety of women's football in Scotland remains overwhelmingly in need of research. Working from the initial clues presented in existing research on the development of women's football, further historical research is needed to inform an understanding of the game in the particular Scottish context. Chapter Three of this thesis is devoted to redressing this neglect by offering an exploration of the development of women's football in Scotland.

Research on the Experiences of Women Footballers

It is clear that most literature on women's football in Britain has concentrated on tracing the development of the game. Such work provides an initial understanding of the broad social, economic, and political climate in which the sport has developed, and how this changing climate has influenced women's football. The meaning of football in the lives of women is the theme at the heart of this thesis, and it is the existing research relating to this area which is now reviewed. Several studies and pieces of literature based exclusively on revealing the experiences of women footballers offer this focus. These are the work of Lopez (1979), Davies (1996), Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel
(1999), Caudwell (1999, 2000 and 2002), Cox and Thompson (2000 and 2001), Harris (2001), and Williams (2003a). Although all of these works focus on experiences of footballers and several on their reasons for participation, they take very contrasting approaches, some of which are theoretically framed and others that are not.

An introspective account of women's football is offered by Davies (1996). He provides a thorough insight into the lives and experiences of players from the Doncaster Belles. Having spent a season extensively researching the team's activities, he reveals the importance of, and meanings attached to, football in the lives of women. Although Davies' research is not theoretically framed, it is an invaluable addition to the literature on women's football and can by no means be ignored. His use of investigative journalism allows him to delve deeper than general football experiences. Attention is paid to social and family background, occupations and personalities in order to describe profiles of players. The influence of players within the club itself, both on and off the pitch, and the relations between players and other club staff are also covered. By investigating to such an extent Davies is able to offer an interpretation of what meanings are attached to football in the lives of different players. The investigative element of Davies' work has particular relevance to the theoretical framework adopted in this research presented in the following chapter.

More recent theoretical research on women's football has also tended to adopt similar qualitative approaches. In their investigation of the experiences of top-level European women footballers, Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel (1999) recognise the importance of qualitative accounts that allow sportswomen to articulate their own feelings about being women who play and enjoy sport. There are six key themes around
which interviews are structured: sporting biography; social networks; daily life; gendered identities; the body; sport and life plans. The article focuses on data relating to how players entered football and their experiences in a male-defined sporting world. The study offers an insight into cross-national experiences and, grounded in feminist thought, it explores the theoretical debates on universal structures of power, differences between women, and the significance of the ‘contextuality of meaning’ (Bordo, 1993: 24).

Concentrating exclusively on women’s football in the United Kingdom Caudwell’s (1999, 2000 and 2002) collection of research relies on quantitative and qualitative research methods to show how gender and sexuality functions within this cultural arena. The main focus of her research is a post-structuralist interpretation of gender and sexuality, engaging in feminist thought to explore the experiences of women’s experiences of gender and sexuality in a football context. In particular it offers an analysis of the ‘butch lesbian’ identity which features within women’s football in the UK. Reference is made to quantitative methods used to form a socio-demographic profile of women who play football, however the findings are not revealed. The articles concentrate essentially on displaying the functioning of lesbian sexuality within women’s football culture through qualitative interview research. Although the focus on gender and sexuality strays somewhat from the primary focus of this thesis, it does offer a useful perspective on the related experiences of women footballers and has particular relevance to the analysis of the meaning of football in some women’s lives. Research by Cox and Thompson (2000 and 2001) provides a similar emphasis whilst also using qualitative methods. The study uses in-depth interviews and participant observation in focusing on a women’s premier league team in New Zealand, to explore how female
soccer players experience their bodies within the discourses of sport, gender and heterosexuality and the extent to which homophobia is associated with women's experiences of football. The framework used is recognised as relying heavily on feminist post-structuralism and is useful for examining the conflicts and tensions that women soccer players encounter.

In terms of its attention to the concept of subcultures, research by Harris (2001) is relevant to this thesis. The paper offers an interpretive ethnographic study of a women's university football team in the South of England, examining the 'gendered dynamics of football...focusing upon particular sites of resistance and incorporation' (Harris, 2001: 23). Struggles that players have encountered in their participation in football are highlighted, and it is suggested that, within the university environment, players actively collude in, and visibly challenge, male hegemony in football (Harris, 2001: 28). A number of perspectives are drawn on to frame the work including those of the phenomenological, feminist, and cultural studies 'schools'. As a result there is an emphasis on certain issues, such as hegemonic masculinity, subordination, discrimination, resistance, femininity, sexuality, and the construction of identities. Exploration of these issues offers a specific case study, in the context of university sport.

One particular study, although somewhat limited in methodology and relatively dated, offers a relevant attempt to explore the meaning of football in the lives of women players. Drawing on previous literature on sportswomen in general, and several studies concerning the social aspects of sport and physical activity, Lopez (1979) sets out to identify the 'areas of influence' on women footballers in England. Seven such 'areas of influence' are hypothesised, and examined in light of information obtained from a
questionnaire answered by the 1976/77 season England Squad and Southampton Women’s Football Club. It is acknowledged that one of the initial problems of the investigation was the virtual non-existence of literature on the subject of women’s football. The exception referred to is Anthony’s (1970) article, which reflects an attempt by FIFA to establish some facts regarding women’s football through affiliated national associations, subsequently addressing various cross-national attitudes to women’s football. The author generally recognises cultural taboos that exist in reference to women in sport, and in football in particular. He ultimately questions whether ‘in the absence of objective facts, decisions by affiliated national associations regarding the recognition and development of women’s football are being based on emotion and prejudice’ (Anthony, 1970: 13). The article uncovers several features of women’s football that are, to a large extent, still relevant today.

As a result of this gap in sports literature, Lopez (1979) admits that most of the literature reviewed in connection with her investigation centres on the broader sphere of the place of women in sport. Limitations of the research are identified, namely that the sample used was not random, and generalisations should therefore be treated with caution. It is further conceded that the findings from the questionnaire are in places too superficial to disprove or support the hypotheses. In relation to the ‘areas of influence’, the following seven hypotheses are set out (Lopez, 1979: 40):

1. Women’s football is mainly played by working class girls.
2. Low level job satisfaction acts as motivation to seek high stimulus leisure time pursuits and football provides greater stimulation than traditional girls’ games.
3. Women footballers have good all-round ability in physical recreation and sporting activities and especially in netball and hockey.

4. 'Significant others' such as parents, brothers, sisters and peers have played an important part in encouraging participation in women's football and have helped offset possible 'dissonance' caused by playing what has tended to be considered an inappropriate game for females.

5. Physical education teachers have been largely uninterested or have generally discouraged girls' participation in women's football.

6. Extrinsic motivation in the form of rewards, honours, travel, publicity has encouraged participation in women's football.

7. Mass media coverage of the men's professional game and attendance at men's games has encouraged identification and interest in football which in turn has influenced participation in women's football.

Despite the study being limited in certain areas it has the potential to provide an informed basis for some of the chapters in this thesis, particularly in relation to socio-demographic characteristics, the process of socialisation, and the meaning of football in players' lives. The remainder of this chapter examines the core themes that emerge within the literature on the experiences of women who play football, and/or are relevant to this thesis but overlooked in the literature. Research on women's football and key work on women in sport are drawn on in order to provide a fuller understanding of the themes in the context of this thesis. Subsequently it will be possible to recognise the
main gaps in the literature. In doing so, and in light of what is revealed, the thesis will be sufficiently informed to take the literature forward.

**Women, Social Class and Football**

The significance of social class with regard to sports participation is considered in greater depth in Chapter Four. It is a theme that receives attention in most of the literature on women's football. It has been hypothesised by Lopez (1979) that football is played mainly by working class girls, and this is substantiated in her findings. This implies that sex barriers relating to male and female appropriate sports in working class culture may have been, to some extent, broken down. On the whole, the vast majority of related literature also supports this conclusion. Williamson (1991) in his account of the early history of women's football in Britain writes that women who played football, particularly in the early nineteenth century, were predominantly working class. This is a result of most teams being established around the workplace, and tending to include factory workers. It is also suggested that a number of middle class women were also recruited into the workplaces during the Great War and therefore also played in women's football teams, although in somewhat smaller numbers than their working class colleagues. Rather than playing football, middle class women tended to become involved in fund-raising for women's teams. In support of these points, Williams and Woodhouse (1991) recognise that women's football teams during the Great War boasted women from both working and middle class backgrounds. Similarly, Newsham (1997) in her historical case study of Dick, Kerr Ladies acknowledges that the women who played for the team throughout the early 20th century were all working class factory
workers. Melling (1999) also acknowledges the prominence of working class women, albeit in the context of working class communities. Finally, Hargreaves (1994: 141) asserts that most women footballers during the 1920s were working class as ‘football was considered as an unsuitably rough sport for middle class girls’.

At this point it is also interesting to acknowledge other research by Melling (1998) who explores the working class heroine in popular football fiction from 1915 to 1925. Melling (1998: 98) indicates that ‘during the early post-First World War period there developed a form of popular fiction that...manifested itself in the form of the football heroine, who was essentially working class, in contrast to the usual middle-class role model, feminist and socialist’. The article goes on to offer an analysis of football fiction, and the portrayal of the working class football heroine within it. Melling (1998) acknowledges that there was an agenda attached to these football stories. They tended to prioritise issues that emerged from workplace politics and mill-culture, ‘such as coercive sexual harassment, gender, the redefinition of roles, and the dynamics of workplace hierarchies’, areas which questioned the status of women (Melling, 1998: 117). Such issues were prioritised at the expense of issues that are necessary to the understanding of women’s football. Due to the agenda of the stories, it was almost exclusively working class players who were considered. Melling (1998: 118) identifies that ‘the only middle-class participants involved are metaphorical of contemporary ladies of leisure, who are only participating for the purposes of self-glorification and do nothing to serve the feminist cause’. A note of caution is necessary when interpreting the content of these football stories, since a valid representation may have been sacrificed at the expense of a wider agenda. Despite this, the participation in football by working women from
working class communities presented in the football stories seems to be consistent with historical research findings.

Another important consideration relating to social class emerges in several pieces of literature. Lopez (1997) recognises the dominance and success of not simply working class teams but regional aspects of women's football. After the Second World War, teams from the north-west and the south, namely Manchester Corinthians, Fodens (of Sandbach), Southampton and Warminster, dominated women's football in England. The existence of regional differences and associated class differences of women's football teams are explored by Bale (1980) in a socio-geographical study of the spatial adoption of women's football. It is concluded that small towns in the south of England were the typical location for adoption of the game. Furthermore, the growth of the game in the working class north may have been retarded because of economic and cultural barriers. This proposition should be treated with caution as it refers only to the adoption of women's football, this should not be interpreted as the existence of established teams, or reflect regional dominance in terms of success. Nevertheless, the study does contribute to an understanding of the development and growth of women's football teams in England and Wales during the 1970s.

Both Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel (1999) and Henry and Comeaux (1999) offer insight into cross-national differences in women's football. Although not strictly relevant to this thesis, the latter is an ethnographic case study focusing on coeducational soccer in the United States. It provides an interesting example revealing how coeducational soccer is associated with the middle class in the US, possibly in opposition to the predominantly working class sports of American football and
basketball. Similarly, Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel (1999) uncover cross-national differences in the social class backgrounds of women footballers. Using indicators such as occupation, educational qualifications, housing or parental background, they say, in accordance with most of the literature reviewed in this area, that the majority of English players they interviewed came from working class backgrounds. Furthermore the players in Spain identified themselves as middle class, the Norwegian players came from a range of backgrounds, and the German women’s backgrounds also varied. Finally, the work of Davies (1996) uncovers the social and economic backgrounds of many of the Doncaster Belles team members. It is shown that the women who play in the team and are part of the wider club scene are predominantly of a working class background. More apparent in his account is the place that playing football has in the lives of these women, which ultimately varies but in some cases is largely determined by factors such as social class and occupation, and this is the focus of the next section.

It is evident that the historical texts agree that it was traditionally working class and some middle class women who played women’s football, with the majority being working class. It is also widely suggested that working class girls and women have made up the majority of players in the ‘new age’ of women’s football in Britain. In addition, there exists a regional perspective suggesting that there has been an adoption of the sport particularly in small towns in the south of England throughout the 1970s however, regional location does not strictly reflect the social class of team members. There are obvious gaps in the literature relating to the theme of social class. Primarily there is absolutely no indication of the social class or backgrounds of women football players in Scotland. Having said that, similar research on England and the rest of the UK is also
somewhat limited. There is a need for up-to-date empirical studies related to this theme throughout Britain. It would be useful for such work to explore not only social class, but other factors such as age, occupation, educational qualifications, family background and marital status so as to provide a socio-demographic profile in order to underpin a fuller understanding of the women who play football in Britain. Secondly, although social class has been reported on in most of the research, there is little explanation of why football is generally played by women of a certain social class. The implication relevant to this thesis is the need to reveal such characteristics of women footballers in Scotland from a cross-ability sample. By exploring the lives of women who play football we can attempt to make a more informed interpretation of the different meanings of the sport in the lives of a representative sample of women.

Football and Work

Lopez (1979) refers to the low-level job satisfaction of women footballers acting as intrinsic motivation to play the sport, but concludes that this area could not be examined satisfactorily in view of insufficient data. Although her questionnaire revealed the occupations of the women, it did not probe sufficiently to consider levels of job satisfaction and the subsequent role of football during the women’s leisure time. The literature on women’s football tends to overlook this area, even though there are several references. Williamson (1991) reflects on how women workers were desperately in need of a distraction from the Great War, their work, and the hardship brought about by the overall social, economic and political climate. Although this reference suggests that playing football provided the women with a form of escape under extreme
circumstances, Davies (1996) identifies similar motivations for players in a different setting. He refers to playing football as an escape from work for some of the team members, but to varying degrees. Several team members are identified as factory workers for whom the chance to play football at the weekend gives them something to look forward to in contrast to their monotonous work. Similarly, regardless of the level of job satisfaction, the opportunity to play football and be a club member offers most of the women a relative escape from everyday life.

Despite these findings, it is important to highlight a number of concerns. It is arguable that participating in any sport or other forms of leisure could provide complete release from everyday life. We could therefore expect to uncover similar findings, suggesting that such intrinsic motivation is not exclusive to the sport of football, or to women for that matter. Moreover, it is important to understand why it is football and not other sports, such as traditional girls’ games, that are chosen by many women as a means of release from everyday life. In addition, Lopez’s (1979) original hypothesis overlooks other sources of intrinsic motivation that may be significant regardless of the level of job satisfaction in women’s lives. There are further implications for this thesis in compensating for the lack of attention in the literature. As mentioned in the previous section, there needs to be a deeper exploration of the occupations and general background of a representative sample of women players. Such a thorough exploration could facilitate a deeper understanding of the importance of playing football in the lives of these women. It is apparent that Davies’ (1996) work is the most revealing in this area, and this has been achieved by delving deeper into the lives of the players in order to assess why football is important to them, and the priority different players give to
playing the sport. There is also a need to devote attention to other sources of intrinsic motivation, and not be limited to the motivation derived from job dissatisfaction. It is important not to make generalisations about the occupations and levels of job satisfaction of women footballers, but fully expect to reveal a number of sources of intrinsic motivation that are not directly job related.

**Football, Socialisation and Gender**

Research that has focused on the process of socialisation into football has tended to concentrate on the influence of socialising agents. Throughout this research it is acknowledged that key influences exist in the socialisation process. A general limitation of the majority of research is the failure to approach explicitly the process of socialisation into football as an interactive one. It is therefore logical to review research findings in relation to the influence of socialising agents and agencies before considering a more interactionist consideration of the process of socialisation taken in this thesis and analysed specifically in Chapter Five.

**Socialising Agents**

The influence of socialising agents is addressed by much of the literature on women’s football, and women in sport in general. The term ‘socialising agents’ refers to parents, other family members, partners, friends, coaches, who have a role in the socialisation process of individuals. We can begin with the broad view that women’s understanding of leisure and sports, within the wider understanding of the meaning of their lives, is derived from the males in their lives (Hargreaves, 1994). Lopez (1979; 1997) acknowledges the influence of certain key players (of which at least one tended to
be male) in the learning of the game and approval of participation, further reflecting on the encouragement of parents, particularly fathers, in interviews with post-war players. Similarly, the work of Cox and Thompson (2000), and Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel (1999) recognises that access to football is relatively determined via male contacts and support. The influences of significant others are not exclusive to football, as Theberge’s (1995) fieldwork and interviews with an elite Canadian women’s ice-hockey team reveals. The ice-hockey players generally receive the support of significant others, which are predominantly male or female partners. The work of Davies (1996) reveals that in many cases it was male contacts, particularly fathers, who introduce daughters to football. The majority of the players were involved in watching both men’s league and non-league matches at weekends and ‘kicking about’ with lads in the streets where they lived during childhood and adolescence. The work is useful in the way it pays close attention to the wider context of family life and background of the players.

In light of the literature relating to this particular area, there is at least one significant shortcoming. The majority of findings tend to concentrate on how players are initially introduced to football. Although the introductory stages are a significant part of the process, what is lacking is the acceptance that socialisation is on-going; there is a need to examine the influences of ‘significant others’ not just in the initial stages of involvement, generally during childhood or adolescence, but their ongoing influence. Players are likely to have been encouraged to different extents at various stages of their lives. It would also be useful to relate the influences of socialising agents to other factors, such as social background, in order to identify their actions and underlying attitudes in a wider context. It is possible that certain attitudes may be related to cultural
and social differences, which could reflect regional differences. For example, it may be found that social class is a determining factor on the attitudes and subsequent encouragement of significant others. Similarly, women who are single and have no dependants may receive a different degree of support than women who are married and have a family. There are also several other key socialising agents which the literature does not focus upon. These are the influences of coaches and other players.

Socialising Agencies

Schools

The school is one of the most influential socialising agencies throughout childhood and adolescence, and Physical Education (PE) has been researched extensively within the field of sports studies. In their work relating to this area, both Scraton (1986) and Hargreaves (1994) identify the historical context of girls PE. Scraton’s project, using interviews and observation within PE department case studies, describes how stereotypes remain in terms of attitudes towards what activities are considered female appropriate, and this is reflected in the delivery of PE in schools. In many cases girls are considered to be fully capable of playing football, but it is widely considered as an undesirable activity. Considering girls’ PE in historical context, Hargreaves (1994) suggests that some changes, but considerable continuities, have occurred in attitudes at schools.

In an ethnographic study of a middle-class primary school, Skelton (2000) illustrates the centrality of football to the schools’ gender regime, particularly the construction of a dominant mode of masculinity with boys and a number of male teachers who attempt to keep football as an all-male preserve. Various tactics were
identified as a means of deterring girls from venturing into the established male-preserve of football. Focusing predominantly on the game of football, Renold (1997) examines gendered playground relations experienced by boys and girls ‘to explore the place of sport in the social construction and negotiation of hegemonic masculinities that affect and position both girls and boys’ (Renold, 1997: 5). The study employed a qualitative approach, using techniques traditionally associated with ethnography, and the resulting analysis followed a post-structuralist line of enquiry. In a similar fashion to Skelton (2000), sport in general, but predominantly football is considered to be an activity that dominates playground space, with an active exclusion of female participation by both boys and male coaches, thereby displaying the construction of hegemonic masculinity. Finally, and most importantly, the interviews revealed that the clear ‘exclusion of girls from the game of football was almost strictly related to the social site of the school’ (Renold, 1997: 17). Some of the girls had discovered sites out-with the school, such as playing football with their brothers, friends, uncles in gardens and streets, where the hegemonic masculinising practices so apparent within the school gates were absent. This work offers one view that, although a major socialising agency, in a variety of ways the school can negatively influence the sporting experiences of girls, in particular those who attempt to pursue a traditionally male sport such as football.

The literature on women’s football demonstrates how women football players have been affected by prevailing attitudes. Lopez’s (1979) study substantiated that PE teachers have had negative attitudes to girls’ participation in football. These attitudes generally stemmed from the consideration of football as not being an appropriate game for females, unlike the traditional girls’ games of netball and hockey. It is also suggested
that PE teachers were not aware of the girls' desire to play football or, alternatively, they simply disapproved. Williams and Woodhouse (1991) refer to the school experiences of several top-level footballers with attention to the Sex Discrimination Act (1975) and how sports such as football have been exempt from the Act. Changes in FA ruling has since allowed girls to play alongside boys up to the age of eleven years, and the article revealed a reported growth in demand for football for girls in schools. There has also been active opposition to the FA rules by some secondary schools to accommodate this demand. Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel (1999) describe the varying attitudes to girls' football in school across the four European countries, concluding that the school system is a strong barrier to participation in football for girls in England. Similarly Davies (1996) identifies how several of the Doncaster Belles players played for junior school teams until the FA Rule 37 forbade them to participate.

Several issues relating to these findings need to be considered. Primarily, although some of the research has been published recently, a possible time distortion is associated with the findings. Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel's (1999) work represents more contemporary research, but the women in their sample may have experienced attitudes in school that may be somewhat different today. It is feasible that a sample of women footballers playing currently could be composed of women who attended school during the 1970s, 1980s, or 1990s. It is important, therefore, to identify the wider setting in order to interpret such findings appropriately. As one of the key socialising agencies the contribution of schools, in particular school PE departments, to provide opportunities for girls to play football is an area that needs further investigation as several gaps in the literature remain. There seems to be an overwhelming attempt to
uncover the negative attitudes expressed by schools and PE departments. Although it is reported that attitudes have generally been negative, it is quite possible that a more thorough investigation may reveal a positive influence of schools on the participation of girls in football. Furthermore, this thesis attempts to explore the potentially varying extent of influence schools across a wide sample of women from a diverse age range. It is expected that the players' family and social background, attitudes to schooling, school type and region, will be among the factors that relatively determine the part that schools play in encouraging or discouraging the socialisation of girls into football.

Acknowledging that many current players are actually schoolgirls will hopefully ensure an examination of present attitudes, in terms of providing opportunities for girls to play football, in a variety of schools. It will also enable us to assess how attitudes may have begun to change. The research will show whether football has become accepted as more of a mass participation sport for girls, in comparison to traditionally feminine sports such as netball and hockey, and if so, why this has occurred and whether the trend has been reflected in school sport provision.

**Media Coverage and the Influence of the Men's Game**

A distinct lack of reference exists on the influence that media coverage and interest in the men's game have allowed women footballers to identify with the sport. One reason for this may be because recent studies tend to be researched from varying feminist perspectives, and therefore a positive association with the men's game may have been either overlooked or not considered as an important influence on women footballers. Although various socialising agents are likely to be influential in terms of generating interest in the men's game, the media in their entirety have a significant, but
by no means exclusive, role to play. Of the literature reviewed so far it is mainly Davies (1996) who mainly addresses this theme, albeit superficially. Despite much of the research on women’s football identifying the influence of male contacts as major socialising agents, the connection between this influence and a probable associated interest with football overall has not been made. The desire of many women to play football is likely to have stemmed from a primary interest in the game possibly at the level of spectating. Although the women’s game has developed and is promising to expand even further in the future, it has provided no rival to the dominant presence of the men’s game, and the media have played a role in maintaining this dominance. It is feasible that it is through the men’s game that many women will have naturally identified with and become interested in the sport.

Several publications have emerged that consider women as football fans. Hayward (1995) offers a brief history of female football fans from the nineteenth century up to 1995, arguing that the existence and importance of female football fans is another area that has, until very recently, been largely ignored by researchers and the football industry itself. Coddington (1997) provides an account of the involvement and experiences of women at various levels in football. Rudd’s (1998) journalistic account documents her own experiences of playing football for both men’s and women’s teams. A number of interesting issues are raised concerning the authors relatively awkward transition from playing in men’s park teams to playing in women’s teams. Crolley and Long (2001) outline some ‘typical’ experiences of female football fans. References are made to women playing football, but the focus of the research is the experiences of women as fans, against the backdrop of working class culture in Liverpool. Using
ethnographic methods Elsdon (2001) presents an exploration of the ‘Ladette’ in relation to female football fans against a backdrop of post-modern cultural analysis. The research offers a discussion of the cultural phenomenon of the ‘Ladette’ and how this form of female identity relates to female football fans. Finally, it is worthy to acknowledge the novel by Dhami (2002), based on the film Bend it like Beckham, which tells the story of an Indian girl and her desire to play football like her hero, David Beckham. Albeit fictional, there is a strong emphasis on the identification with the men’s game, and the inspiration this provides to fight against social and cultural barriers in order to be able to play football. Issues that emerge from these publications will be discussed more extensively in association with the process of socialisation in Chapter Five.

Research presented so far on women as football fans and women’s identification with the men’s game generally fails to account for those fans that are also players. This may simply be outside the scope of the research, but in relation to this thesis it is useful to understand in what ways and to what extent an identification with the men’s game has inspired and motivated women to participate in the sport themselves. In support of this, Davies (1996) refers to the interest in the men’s game of many players who express their keen support of men’s professional clubs. Similarly, many players were introduced to football by watching their fathers play at local levels. A number of players are also involved in some role or another in the men’s game for example, as community football officers, or in administrative roles within men’s clubs (Davies, 1996). Such connections have lacked substantial exploration, and Lopez (1979) rightfully suggests that this is another area that could most profitably benefit from further research.
One aim of this thesis therefore is to examine in greater depth the significance of women’s interest in and identification with the men’s game. The influence of socialising agents and agencies will be considered at both the introductory stage and as they advance throughout the women’s lives. It could be argued that until very recently there have hardly been any obvious women role models for women players to emulate. Those that exist have had a significantly lower media profile than that of their male counterparts. The influence of the men’s game simply cannot be ignored, particularly at an organisational and financial level. A deeper exploration of the identification of women players with the men’s game, will allow a more grounded interpretation of the meaning in their lives of not just playing football, but being involved with the sport in a wider context.

Ultimately, it is important not simply to state what the influence of socialising agents and agencies is, but to interpret and understand the reasons behind the influence. This thesis recognises the need to explore primarily how women footballers have become involved in playing, and the attitudes and encouragement of socialising agents and agencies. There is also a need to explore the extent of influence of other agents, such as coaches, sports development officers, and agencies such as football clubs and sports clubs. For example, Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel (1999) conclude that the organisation of youth sport is a crucial factor in influencing girls and young women’s opportunities to play football. The thesis will examine the influences on involvement throughout the players’ football ‘career’, this approach may be particularly revealing when dealing with more experienced players. Another consideration is whether or not the external interest of significant others depends on the ability level of the player. It
may be expected that a particularly successful player will receive greater support from
their significant others to fulfil their potential. Cross-ability case studies could reveal any
such trends relating to this theme. Most importantly however is that this thesis treats
socialisation as an interactive process and the significance of this approach is considered
more thoroughly in Chapter Five.

**Perspectives on Women’s Football**

Perspectives on women’s football and socialisation into football are inter-linking
themes. Underlying perspectives determine the extent to which socialising agents and
agencies perform their role, and simultaneously these perspectives may be accepted or
rejected by the individuals involved in the socialisation process. Adopting or rejecting
perspectives will influence their role in the socialisation of other individuals. Football
has historically been viewed as a traditionally male sport, inappropriate for females to
participate in. To some extent this attitude remains in British society today as we have
seen in the previous section within schools in particular. This has resulted in a genre of
research on women’s football, particularly that adopting feminist approaches, exploring
such prevailing attitudes and focusing on the concepts of gender and sexuality. It is
necessary to understand these perspectives within the wider historical and social context
from which they have developed, been sustained, and ultimately challenged. The
literature on women in sport has addressed this area in depth and it allows us to situate
the perspectives on women’s football within a critical evaluation.

Since their formative years in the nineteenth century to the present day, ‘female
sports have been riddled with complexities and contradictions’ (Hargreaves, 1994: 3).
Whilst the Victorian period gave rise to modern sports in Britain, it was also obvious that sports had been constructed as the natural domain of men as they required essentially masculine characteristics. Throughout this period the ‘belief in innate biological and psychological differences between the sexes constituted a powerful and pervasive form of sexism – experienced as ‘unproblematic commonsense behaviour’ – which systematically subordinated women in sports for years to come’ (Hargreaves, 1994: 43). The participation of women in a traditionally male sport such as football has not only crossed the boundary of women’s participation in sport, but it has ventured further into a traditionally male-preserve. Perspectives on women’s football have been constructed by attitudes within patriarchal societies, and these perspectives have become established, to some extent, in British society throughout the twentieth and into the twenty-first centuries. To support this, the steady increase in the number of girls who play soccer throughout the 1960s took place ‘in an environment of either outright hostility or pleasant ridicule’ (Anthony, 1970: 13). The reluctance of the FA to revoke the 1921 ban on women’s football teams playing on FA-affiliated men’s grounds, a rule that was upheld until 1971 in England, and until 1974 in Scotland, is a typical example of this broader problem.

Although it has become increasingly accepted, as the profile of the sport has grown world-wide, the experiences of women footballers exposed to such underlying influences have been a significant focus in research on women’s football. A major obstacle to the development of the women’s game today is ‘the association of football with male sport that contains the conventional stereotypes of hegemonic masculinity in western culture. For women to enter the powerfully male-defined and controlled world
of football, they have had to challenge dominant notions of ‘appropriate’ female sport' (Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel, 1999: 101). In order to gain entry into the footballing world women evidently have needed to define themselves in opposition to femininity. This justifies the prominent focus on issues such as stereotyping, ‘butch’ lesbian identities, and the overriding concepts of gender and sexuality in research on women’s football, particularly that which engages in feminist thought. Women are thought to experience their bodies differently in different contexts and sport in particular, is a situation where this multiplicity is clearly apparent. Ultimately, it is argued that ‘because the body is central to the sporting experience, female players continually have to negotiate the overlapping and at times contradictory discourses of sport, gender and heterosexuality’ (Cox and Thompson, 2000: 17). In her conclusion Caudwell (1999: 400) asserts that notions surrounding women’s identity are clearly disturbed by the existence of the ‘butch’ and that ‘this disturbance caused by the actual or perceived presence of a masculine lesbian sexuality in women’s football appears to affect the representation of sexual identity by women who play’. Although they are not at the core of this thesis, such concepts are prevalent in feminist-grounded research on women’s football, and women in sport in general. These findings offer a valuable insight into wider perspectives on women’s football both within and outside the cultural arena itself and attention to this theme allows a more informed interpretation of the influence of socialising agents and agencies and women’s experiences of football.
The Subculture of Women’s Football

The theme of women’s football as a sporting subculture, which is central to this thesis and explored in Chapter Six, is not researched explicitly in the literature on the development of women’s football. There are social implications of being part of a club, which go further than simply playing the game. The more recent research concentrating on women’s experiences as football players acknowledges the existence of a subculture. But it is useful to begin with several references to extrinsic motivations in the historical texts. Throughout the early history of the women’s game, football gave many women the chance to travel and simultaneously raise money for charity. The women also gained recognition and received publicity and fame at local, regional, national, and international levels. Being part of a club also offered women the chance to make new friends and organise social events and occasions (Williamson, 1991; Newsham, 1997; Lopez, 1979). Lopez (1997) concentrates on the opportunities for women footballers from Britain, during the ‘new age’ of women’s football, to play and live abroad if they were of a high standard. The focus on this area is undoubtedly a product of the author’s own experiences of playing professionally in Italy, and provides an interesting account of the experiences of other players in similar situations. Forms of extrinsic motivation, such as international representation, rewards, publicity and fame are present both abroad and in Britain. Essentially, players who travelled and were skilful enough to take up a career abroad tended to gain publicity in Britain for their talent and ambition.

There is an obvious consistency within the literature acknowledging the existence of certain extrinsic motivations to playing football. However, the findings thus far relating to this theme could result in misinterpretation if not put into context. A bias
clearly exists towards the experiences of successful, top-level players in the above accounts, which do not represent all women who play football. The concentration on honours, rewards, international representation, travel, as sources of extrinsic motivation, is likely to be exclusive to a small proportion of players at different ability levels. Consequently, there has been a distinct neglect in uncovering the fundamental sources of extrinsic motivation which, although likely to be experienced also by top-level players, are of a potentially higher significance to the ‘average player’. Essentially the various meanings attached to football that are experienced through being an active member of the subculture need to be examined.

Despite using samples of top-level sportswomen, the work of Theberge (1995), Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel (1999), and Davies (1996) has gone some way to redress this neglect by introducing other sources of extrinsic motivation more applicable to all players, regardless of ability. The construction of a community grounded in shared identities and passion for the sport of ice hockey is the focus of Theberge’s fieldwork. The experience of team membership is identified as one of the most significant features of sports participation, and the existence of shared interests and concerns defines the team as a community. This shared community is experienced in a way that unites women from a range of diverse social locations and backgrounds. The concept of a shared community, however, is not exclusive to an elite women’s ice-hockey team in Canada, it is likely to be reproduced to some extent in any team sport and enveloping a diverse range of people. The existence of a female football culture that transcends national boundaries is illustrated by Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel (1999) who alert us to words such as ‘togetherness’, ‘social’ and ‘belonging’ which dominate
interview transcripts. Davies (1996) provides extensive references to the social life associated with being part of a football club, going so far as to suggest that the club acts as a ‘family’ to some players. This implies that players regard being part of a team as not only playing football, but encompassing an important wider attachment with other players and the existence of a community of which they are an active part, both on and off the pitch.

In reflection, the historical texts only skim over the surface of the experiences and motivations associated with playing football and being part of a club. Although the literature has mirrored similar motivations there still remains a distinct lack of primary focus that attempts to analyse the associated benefits of being part of a football club. Qualitative research has revealed some ‘social’ aspects, but it fails to attach any value of these experiences to the players. It is probably the work of Davies (1996) which offers most in terms of how being part of a football club is valued by the players as individuals and collectively. Extreme examples are described to suggest that playing football and being a club member can mean either ‘everything’ or can be of little significance to different players, depending on other aspects of their lives. No parallels of Theberge’s work focuses on the culture of women’s football and the construction of community, although Davies (1996) and Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel (1999) have built the foundations. Ultimately we need an analysis of women’s football as a sports subculture, with particular emphasis on the meanings and values attached to being part of that subculture is needed.

In retrospect, this thesis intends to examine the reasons why women participate in football in Scotland. It aims to draw on a combination of both quantitative and
qualitative data from a cross-ability sample of players in order to gain a representative
interpretation of the meaning of football in the lives of women. It is expected that the
reasons for and meanings attached to participation will vary, and ability level is likely to
be a determining factor. It is also an intention to discover how the importance attached
to playing football and being part of a club relate to the socio-demographic profile of
women. The experience of being part of a club and the social aspects associated with it
are probably of great significance for many players, whereas other players may consider
their football career as of the greatest importance. It should be possible to reveal where
the balance lies between the value attached to actually playing football and that
associated with being part of something wider than sport itself.

Conclusion

This chapter has reviewed the existing literature on women’s football. It has done
this methodically by discussing the literature under the following themes: (i) the
development of women’s football, and in particular (ii) the experiences of women
footballers. This chapter has been critical of the existing research into women’s football
and draws attention to several fundamental limitations. First, most research that claims
to provide historical accounts and explanations for the development of the game in
Britain tends to focus predominantly on England. Second, much of the more recent work
that explores the experiences of women footballers, including the work of Davies
(1996), Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel (1999), and Cox and Thompson (2000 and
2001), concentrate on top-level footballers, therefore struggling to offer a representative
voice of women footballers. Third, with the exception of Davies (1996) and Williams
(2003a), varying feminist approaches have generally influenced research into the experiences of women football players. Although this research offers a valuable insight into women’s experiences, there is a distinct prioritisation of the concepts of gender and sexuality, which arguably narrows the potential field of investigation. Davies’ work, however, whilst acknowledging these concepts, concentrates on the fundamental experiences of women who play football. What becomes self-evident from the critical review is that there is the need for a more thorough, cross-ability examination of the experiences of women footballers and the significance in their lives of being an active member of this sport subculture.

Similar research concentrating on the experiences of women football players in Scotland would go some way towards redressing the almost total neglect of Scottish women’s football in sports sociology literature and provide a thorough interpretation of an otherwise under-researched sport subculture. Consequently, a number of significant questions have arisen out of the comprehensive review of the existing literature on women, football and society. The following core questions inform this research on women’s football in Scotland and aim to take the literature on women’s football, the process of socialisation into sport, and sport subcultures, forward: How has women’s football developed in Scottish society? Who participates in women’s football in Scotland? How have women in Scotland experienced the process of socialisation into football? What meanings do players attach to being an active member of the subculture of women’s football? And ultimately, how can the subculture of women’s football in Scotland be interpreted?
CHAPTER TWO – AN INTERPRETIVE FRAMEWORK

An Introduction to Interpretive Sociology

Interpretive sociology is a term used to categorise a group of sociologies which, whilst varying in certain features, essentially have similar ontological and epistemological assumptions. Donnelly (2000) identifies that although interpretation is actually the basis of all sociology, and all science, the term interpretive is used more narrowly within the field of sociology. More specifically, ‘the term interpretive is used... to refer to a particular group of sociologies which have as their basis the interpretation and understanding of human meaning and action’ (Donnelly, 2000: 77).

Essentially interpretive sociology is used to search for meaning. In doing so it represents a social ‘action’ approach (rather than social system approach) in exploring the relationship between the individual and society.

It is useful to apply fundamental assumptions regarding ontology, epistemology, and methodology in order to locate interpretive sociology within the wider field of sociology. Sparkes (1992: 26) does so by making the following characterisation:

The interpretive paradigm is undergirded by a network of ontological and epistemological assumptions that...adopt an internalist-idealist ontology, a subjectivist epistemology and prefer an ideographic methodology.

It is important to distinguish that the interpretive paradigm refers to a whole family of approaches or range of research traditions. Within this ‘family’, traditions vary in the extent to which they adopt certain ontological, epistemological, and methodological assumptions. Donnelly (2000) identifies the various strands of interpretive sociology.
Included are Weberian sociology, the ‘sociologies of everyday life’ (which include symbolic interactionism, Goffman’s dramaturgical sociology, labelling theory, phenomenological sociology, ethnomethodology, and existential sociology), and hermeneutics. Despite differences between these traditions, there are similarities in approach justifying the use of ‘interpretive’ as an umbrella term. Of the ways in which the interpretive sociologies vary, we can reflect on several main areas. Marshall (1994: 255) identifies that there are two such main areas. They are, the extent to which interpretation is viewed as problematic and the degree to which they go beyond the actor’s own understanding of what he or she is doing. There are two further sociological debates identified by Donnelly (2000), to which interpretive sociology is related. The first is the debate between macro- and micro-sociology, which largely reflects the ‘structural’ versus ‘action’ debate, respectively; the second is between quantitative and qualitative methodologies, which will be considered in a later section of this chapter. To reiterate, Donnelly (2000: 78) recognises that the extent to which interpretive sociologies deal with the way that individuals produce culture and social structure, and the extent to which they also regard individual action as constrained by the structures it produces, differentiates the strands of interpretive sociology from each other.

Despite acknowledging these differences, it is useful to gain a further understanding of what interpretive sociology is generally concerned with. Cuff, Sharrock and Francis (1990: 143) express that Weber, considered to be one of the classic founders of sociology, thought that:

The development of interpretive sociology involved, beginning from a definition of the basic forms of action, working out what forms of
relationships could be created out of such basic modes of action and, moving 'upwards', specifying all the forms of group association, organisation and institution which could be compounded out of these relationships... even the most complex forms of social organisation – the massive world civilisations – should be looked on by the sociologist only as a complex made up of relationships among its members.

Although Weber's work has had a significant impact on the development of sociology in general, there is little work within the sociology of sport that is explicitly Weberian. It is in fact the sociologies of everyday life that have emerged as the most prominent within the sociology of sport. A full account of the different strands of interpretive sociology would be exhaustive and in places irrelevant in this framework. It is useful to use this summary quote from Donnelly (2000: 78) who suggests that ultimately ‘interpretive sociology is concerned with the way in which the social world is not just something to be confronted by individuals, but is continually constructed and reinvented by the participants’. A focus on the participants' perspectives of the phenomena under study or the culture within which the study is being conducted, is typical of research that adopts an interpretive approach, and is appropriate to the study of sporting subcultures. This thought leads us into a consideration of the place of interpretive sociology within the sociology of sport. The following section explores the features of interpretive approaches within the sociology of sport. Specific examples of interpretive studies are explored and adapted to construct an interpretive framework for this research.

Interpretive Sociology of Sport

The emergence of an interpretive tradition within the sociology of sport has been explored by Donnelly (2000). It is suggested that the development of an interpretive
sociology of sport began in the 1970s at the University of Massachusetts where subcultural studies were encouraged. Despite some studies not being strictly sociological, tending to possess elements of journalism, Donnelly (2000: 79) explains that several athletes’ biographies emerged providing rich ‘insider’ information revealing experiences and meanings of being an athlete. What Donnelly (2000) considers the final step in the development of an interpretive sociology of sport, was influenced by the work of the Centre for Contemporary Cultural Studies at Birmingham University in England in the 1980s. This final stage of development, and the additional impact of Geertz’s (1973) notion of ‘thick description’, introduced a more critical ethnographic approach to the interpretive sociology of sport. Ultimately Donnelly (2000: 80) suggests that interpretive sociology, along with cultural studies, has made important contributions to our understanding of sport in society, and has established itself as a central aspect of the field of the sociology of sport.

The most prominent of the interpretive sociologies within the sociology of sport are the sociologies of everyday life. In all of the sociologies of everyday life there are distinct overlaps identified, in both methodology and theoretical assumptions. Donnelly (2000: 83) recognises that, ‘with few exceptions, most of the studies in the sociology of sport employing an interpretive approach do not identify a specific sociological theory’.

This thesis does not strictly specify a sociological theory, but is located firmly within the field of interpretive sociology, adopting an interpretive framework that is adapted from existing interpretive work within the sociology of sport. It is important to discover more specifically how the approach adopted is located within the sociologies of everyday life. In his account of interpretive approaches to the sociology of sport Donnelly (2000: 83)
suggests that the sociologies of everyday life are employed in studies of two distinct, but overlapping themes: the process of socialisation and descriptions and analyses of sport subcultures (including the themes of careers and cultural production). These two themes are prioritised within this thesis.

_The Process of Socialisation_

This theme holds an important place within this thesis and informs the analysis in Chapter Five. Donnelly (2000: 84) recognises that 'it is only since those involved in the interpretive sociology of sport have turned their attention to socialisation that a number of rich insights have been made'. Since changes in subcultural studies in the 1980s, a number of studies have emerged concerned with the process of socialisation into and via sport from childhood and throughout the sporting career of individuals. Research on socialisation and sport generally reflects a recognition that there is a 'need to be able to explain how and why people become involved, or not, in sport' (Horne, Tomlinson, and Whannel, 1999: 130). Not only is it useful to understand how people become involved in sport, but how they remain involved over their sporting career, and how they might cease being involved in sport. In trying to explain the process of socialisation and how it relates to participation in sport researchers in the field of the sociology of sport have tended to concentrate of several common themes.

Generally research has acknowledged that primary socialisation is crucial to sports participation. Due to this, emphasis has been placed on examining the role of the family, particularly parents and siblings, and their influence on socialisation into sport during childhood. There has also been a tendency to explore the role of other major socialising agents and agencies such as teachers, coaches, friends, schools, and the
media, on sports participation. Another common theme is a focus on how certain social factors might influence a person’s socialisation into sport. Such social factors include gender, social class, race, disability, and religion. In relation to gender differences and the socialisation of women into sport it is useful to acknowledge the research conducted by Greendorfer, including Greendorfer (1977; 1987; 1992), Greendorfer and Lewko (1978), Greendorfer and Ewing (1981) and Greendorfer, Blinde, and Pellegrini (1986). This body of work generally attempts to explain differences in socialisation into sport with sensitivity to the influence of wider social factors. These early studies on women and the sports socialisation process naturally tended to adopt approaches that mirrored those being used in the general study of sports socialisation. In the early 1990s Greendorfer (1992) asserted that female sport socialisation has been a relatively neglected area of study in sports sociology, resulting in very little being known about the process by which women do or do not become involved in sport. Greendorfer’s study examining different ‘experiences’ (although quantitatively and using social learning theory) of athletes and non-athletes raised some interesting findings and acknowledged the need for more in-depth research. Previous research that considered women’s socialisation in sport had, in line with general sport socialisation research, used social learning theory to analyse the process and relied on quantitative research methods (Butcher, 1983; Butt and Schroeder, 1980; Greendorfer, 1977; Greendorfer, Blinde, and Pellegrini, 1986; Higginson, 1985; Lewko and Ewing, 1980; Weiss and Knoppers, 1982). In 1991 Greendorfer and Bruce had suggested a cultural studies approach to sports socialisation, but there is little evidence in their subsequent work (particularly Greendorfer, 1992) of adopting such an approach.
Several of the earlier studies on the socialisation of women into sport raise some important issues regarding the problem of researching the ‘general’ socialisation of women into sport. In particular Weiss and Knoppers (1982: 268) acknowledge that ‘although it is apparent that significant others are important in the socialisation of sport roles, athletes of different sports may have dissimilar socialisation patterns, which may be hidden when athletes representing several sports are studied collectively’. An individual’s experiences of participation in sport are shaped by various factors but these experiences will be shaped further by the specific sport in which an individual is involved. Although their work concentrates on how the role of significant others, rather than the more interactive experiences of individuals, is sport specific, Weiss and Knopper (1980: 269) identify that ‘different sport samples should be investigated to determine whether differential patterns of socialisation exist according to sport type’. This point is particularly relevant, especially in relation to women’s experiences of socialisation into traditionally male sports such as football.

Research on the socialisation of women and girls into football requires further attention. The theme is often present within existing research, but has not earned exclusive attention (see Chapter One). In relation to women’s football there have been several studies exploring the childhood experiences of girls and boys and their introduction to, and/or socialisation into football. Two studies have focused on girls and boys of primary school age, and their experiences of football within the school environment (Renold, 1997; Skelton, 2000). Renold’s study in particular acknowledges the different experiences of football that girls have outside of compared to inside the school environment. The process of socialisation has also been a theme within other
research on women footballers, encompassing both early experiences of the game and
experiences later in their sporting careers (see Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel, 1999
and Williams, 2003a). Exploring how women football players have been socialised into
football contributes to an understanding of the sporting career or biography of players.
Further, it gives us an indication of the role of major socialising agents in the process
whose influence tends to be determined by social factors and the values and beliefs of
wider society. As Donnelly (2000: 84) suggests, studies into the process of socialisation
have the potential to go 'well beyond the actual processes of involvement to show how
sport and physical activity are major sites for the production and reproduction of
traditional and stereotypical notions of gender'. Attention to the process of socialisation
would not only enable us to reveal experiences of women football players but would
provide another angle from which we can locate the place of, and attitudes to, women's
football in Scottish society. Although this research adopts a more interactionist model of
the socialisation process, in order to consider the extent to which players have a
decision-making role and possibly a reciprocal influence on others, players experiences
have to be put into the wider social and cultural context. Their ongoing socialisation
experiences are inevitably shaped by attitudes towards women participating in football
in Scottish society.

*Sport Subcultures*

A second distinct, but overlapping, theme of study for which the sociologies of
everyday life tend to be employed is descriptions and analyses of sport subcultures.
Traditionally subcultural studies focused on deviant subcultures (Cohen, 1955; Matza,
1969), the bridge eventually being made to the study of non-deviant careers, which
included sports careers (Donnelly, 2000: 83). The study of sport subcultures was
influenced during the 1980s by two main advances: a) the methodological refinement of
'thick description' by Geertz (1973) and; b) a radical theoretical / political turn of British
subculture theory towards critical sociology. Donnelly (2000: 84) offers that these
changes have produced an extremely rich crop of studies. Further, the sociology of
subcultures has shown how 'subcultures, with their various “establishment” and
“countercultural” emphases, have been constitutively inserted into the struggles, the
forms of compliance and opposition, social reproduction and transformation, associated
with changing patterns of social development' (Gruneau, 1981: 10 cited in Donnelly,
2000: 84). To appreciate the contribution of sport subcultural studies it is useful to
consider several examples and the relevance they have to the subculture under
investigation in this thesis.

In a discussion of ascribed and achieved subcultures Donnelly (1985) recognises
that there is a difficulty in considering groupings based primarily upon social categories
as subcultures due to their lack of specificity. He goes on to suggest that ‘it is more
useful to think of these groups as cultures than as subcultures (e.g. working class culture,
youth culture, black culture); cultures that exist within a dominant culture, and which are
themselves divided into various (overlapping) subcultures’ (Donnelly, 1985: 560).
Donnelly (1985: 561) then treats subcultures as being based on achieved characteristics,
and as ‘groups to which people tend consciously to attain membership’. By approaching
subcultures as based on achieved characteristics Donnelly (1985: 561) suggests that they
‘tend to be quite distinct with boundaries that are relatively easily determined and
cultural characteristics that are readily apparent’. Essentially, subcultures are
'characterised by the fact that members generally seek membership, and learn the meanings and ways of a particular subculture' (Donnelly, 1985: 561). The specificity of sport/leisure subcultures is usually relatively easily defined since they tend to have an established focal concern.

Research on sport subcultures has tended to focus on several common themes. Donnelly and Young (1988: 223) identify three principle themes in ethnographies of sport/leisure subcultures. First is a description of characteristics of the subculture and the behaviour of members. Second are descriptions of typical subcultural careers and career contingencies. And third are descriptions of appropriate subcultural identity or demeanour. It is acknowledged that there are few studies that implicitly or explicitly combine concepts of career and identity with the implication that the act of becoming a member of a particular subculture is also the act of taking on an appropriate subcultural identity. An analysis of such themes is offered in Chapter Six in the context of women's football in Scotland.

Drawing on and developing the work of Donnelly (1981), Wheaton (2000, 2002) offers interesting analyses of the subculture of windsurfing. In particular she focuses on issues of subcultural capital and the stratification of individual membership to the subculture and group cultures within it. In the context of women's sport, Theberge's (1995) study on the subculture of women's ice hockey in Canada has considerable relevance to this thesis. Essentially an examination of the construction of community on a women's ice hockey team, the analysis is based on fieldwork and interviews with an elite-level team. It is suggested that the construction of community on a woman's hockey team is grounded in members' shared identity as hockey players and their
commitment to the sport, and that this common focus and interest unite women from
diverse backgrounds and social locations (Theberge, 1995: 389). The study goes on to
consider how, within women’s sport, the problematic relationship of gender and sport
provides a very different context for the experience of community. Although essentially
grounded in feminist theory Theberge’s (1995) interpretive exploration of a women’s
sport subculture offers distinct parallels with this thesis.

In relation to women’s football in particular, there do exist two pieces of
literature that are extensive explorations of women’s football clubs in Britain. Whilst
interpreting the nature of the social and community aspects in women’s football clubs,
both Davies’ (1996) account of the Doncaster Belles, and Ashworth’s (2001) recent
story of the Kestrels Women’s Football Club are essentially journalistic and are not
theoretically framed pieces of research. The in-depth nature of Davies’ (1996) account,
in particular, is a result of the journalist immersing himself into the club scene. A ‘thick
description’ of the culture of women’s football, in a specific club context, is
subsequently offered. This draws us to an important discussion regarding the distinction
between journalism and social science. The potential of elements of journalism and the
retrieval of an investigative tradition for a critical sociology of sport are strongly
advocated by Sugden and Tomlinson (1999). This is discussed later in the chapter in
association with the investigative element of an interpretive critical framework.

In addition to these journalistic contributions to the literature on women’s
football, more theoretically grounded research has emerged. In an interpretive
ethnographic study of a women’s university football team in England, Harris (2001: 22)
examines ‘the experiences of the football players within the college, and explores their
relationship with other sports teams with particular focus upon the pitch and the bar as sites of resistance and incorporation. A focus on sites of resistance and incorporation is typical of research on sports subcultures. Focusing on women’s experiences of sexuality Caudwell (2002) provides an interesting analysis of different identities, and conflicts between them within the football context. The concept of subculture is considered throughout this research, for example, Chapter Three considers processes of resilience, transformation and incorporation throughout the development of women’s football. The subculture of women’s football in contemporary Scottish society receives exclusive attention in Chapter Six. Issues and debates regarding the concept are analysed and applied to the context of women’s football in Scotland, concentrating on the levels of individual identities and membership to interlocking group cultures within women’s football and the relations and possible tensions between group cultures.

Rejection of Feminist Theoretical Frameworks

The subject of research provides undoubted scope for a critical feminist approach. Potential areas of focus, as we have seen in existing research, include women’s experiences in a male-defined sporting world, ‘butch’ and lesbian images associated with women’s football, and women’s experiences of concepts of gender and sexuality. Several important issues regarding feminist-grounded research have influenced my decision not to adopt such an approach. First, as noted previously, existing research on women’s football that is grounded in feminist theory, although a useful addition to the literature, collectively provides a somewhat narrow focus. Consequently, there is much more to be explored about the subculture of women’s football. Davies (1996), whilst acknowledging issues raised within feminist-grounded
research, concentrates on the fundamental experiences of women who play football. In doing so he provides a rich undistorted account of the subculture of women’s football in the context of the Doncaster Belles.

Second, the rejection of a feminist theory as a theoretical approach does not mean that certain ideas presented in typically feminist work are to be ignored. Indeed, it is difficult to justify not adopting a feminist approach when researching women, but the main argument revolves around what the meaning of football is to the women who play it, in the context of this thesis, in Scotland. It is my assumption that women play football for very similar reasons that men do, particularly men who play at an amateur level. Furthermore I do not expect that the majority of women who play football relate primarily their playing of the game to feminist issues such as sexuality and the concept of gender, issues which are very often central to research on women and sport. These assumptions are based on my own experience of having being a member of various football clubs for nearly 10 years. A concern with adopting a feminist approach is that focusing primarily on such issues will distract the research away from its ultimate concern. This is not to say that if issues of sexuality and gender become apparent in the analysis they will be considered unimportant, on the contrary it ensures that in interpreting the subculture of women’s football, the experiences and identities of a range of members are represented.

Third, there is an important distinction to be made between research for women and research on women. Ramazanoglu (1989: 428) explains this distinction:

Sociological knowledge produced from a feminist standpoint...would mean taking gender seriously in what we look for, together with the
political implications of revealing gendered relationships. This political commitment to social transformation distinguishes research on women, which can be undertaken from any methodological position, from research for women, which is politically and methodologically feminist.

We can explore the difference between these types of research by considering feminist research within the critical paradigm. Critical theories tend to have a central intention of emancipation, in other words, research grounded in critical theory primarily aims towards ‘enabling people to gain the knowledge and power to be in control of their own lives’ (Gibson, 1986: 3). This is clearly research for women and holds true for the majority of feminist research within and out-with the critical paradigm. In setting out the initial major assumptions identifying a distinctly feminist epistemology, Hall (1996) suggests that there must be recognition of a transformative potential in a feminist theory of knowledge. In contrast this research is essentially research on women. Women are being placed at the centre of the research simply because they are at the centre of women’s football, and not in order to work towards a transformative understanding of women’s condition within this context. Despite this, it is acknowledged that by focusing this research on the subculture of women’s football, there is a potential for change in respect of wider awareness. It is also likely that the research will lead to a better understanding of certain issues within women’s football which in turn may have transformative potential for the sport. There is also the potential for participants in the study to be influenced by taking part. Any transformative understanding this may develop, on the part of the participant, is more a welcome by product of the research, rather than a priority.
Interpretive Framework

This thesis uses an interpretive approach combining several overlapping elements: historiographic, critical, comparative, investigative and multi-methodological. The adoption of this approach draws largely from the work of Sugden and Tomlinson (1999) who set out the elements of a critical interpretive framework. They identify six overlapping elements in historiographic, ethnographic, comparative, critical, investigative, and gonzo. The ethnographic element identified by Sugden and Tomlinson (1999) features, to some extent, within a wider multi-methodological element included in this framework. The investigative tradition is apparent within the other elements of the framework, but warrants discussion as a separate element. The other three elements adopted are the historiographic, comparative, and critical. The following sections of this chapter explore each element in greater depth to construct a solid and specific interpretive framework.

Historiographic

In order to understand the inclusion of historiography as one of the elements of this interpretive critical framework, it is primarily necessary to shed some light on what exactly is meant by the term. Historiography is the writing of history, or the study of this. In their account of the essential elements of a critical interpretive framework Sugden and Tomlinson (1999: 387) include an historiographic element for the following reason:

In order to fully make sense of what happens today we must come to understand why it happened, at least in part, in terms of yesterday’s events. Thus, it is vital to give research into contemporary phenomena a dynamic historical dimension – to identify and connect the key
institutional developments and critical moments of individual and collective action which underpin the area of social interaction under scrutiny and help to frame its contemporary form and suggest its legacy.

This quote has significant relevance to this thesis but the authors' views are by no means new. We can refer to the uses of history put forward in the work of Mills (1959) and his idea that 'every social science requires an historical scope of conception and a full use of historical materials' to prove this point. To paraphrase Mills (1959), at the most basic level social scientists must use the materials of history in order to fulfil their tasks, or even to state them well. Mills suggests an intimate relation of sociology and history and provides several reasons for it. First, in order to even ask sociological questions properly, let alone answer them, we need the variety provided by history. He suggests that we must study the available range of social structures, both the historical as well as the contemporary, in order to avoid flat description, and ensure empirical adequacy. Most importantly, historical types are indispensable to our explanations of what we are studying. Second, we are required to recognise and practice the social sciences as historical disciplines in order to understand how smaller milieux and larger structures interact. Dealing with historical materials should allow an awareness of structure. Third, Mills suggests that the historical and sociological problems of one social structure cannot be understood without making contrasts and comparisons with other societies. It is the historical viewpoint that leads to the comparative study of societies. Finally, and possibly most logically, there is a need to discern longer-run developments in order to understand the dynamic changes of a contemporary social structure. By this Mills (1959: 151) proposes the need to 'make a statement of at least "from what" and "to what"?' Essentially trends should be identified, and the mechanics of these trends examined.
In conjunction with the uses of history, Mills makes a similar argument for the need for biography. He stresses that possessing the quality of the sociological imagination "enables one to grasp history and biography and the relations between the two within society" (Mills, 1959: 6). On the whole Mills asserts that there are three sorts of questions that those who have been imaginatively aware have consistently asked. The first sort of question relates to the features of society, its structures, components, and within it the meaning of any particular feature for its continuance and for its change. The second sort of question is directly related to history, asking where a particular society stands in human history, the mechanics by which it is changing, and how it is affected by the historical period in which it moves. The final sort of question considers aspects of biography. In particular, what varieties of men and women prevail in society, what ways they are selected and formed, liberated and repressed, what kinds of human nature are revealed in observing society and the meaning for this human nature of features of the society (Mills, 1959).

A strong argument for the need of history in the context of understanding class is presented by Thompson (1963). He questions how individuals get to be in a particular social role, and how particular social organisations get to be there, essentially identifying these questions as historical. Thompson (1963: 11) goes on to state that:

If we stop history at a given point, then there are no classes but simply a multitude of individuals with a multitude of experiences. But if we watch these men over an adequate period of social change, we observe patterns in their relationships, their ideas, and their institutions.
Although written in the context of class, the ideas presented by Thompson (1963) can be applied out-with this context. If we were to “watch” the participation of women in football over a period of social change, say throughout and after the First World War, we would observe patterns in their relationships, their ideas, and their institutions. The use of history would allow us to answer how women football players today get to be in a particular social role, and how their social organisations such as Scottish Women’s Football, also get to be where they are. Clarke and Critcher (1985) set out a further case for the use of history in their work on leisure in Britain. They make the distinction between the use of sociology and the use of history and suggest that leisure cannot be situated within the structural and cultural processes that constitute society by using sociology alone. It is through an historical analysis of leisure in British society that Clarke and Critcher (1985) claim to clarify what we mean by structural and cultural processes, and leisure as a site of social conflict. Ultimately they state that in the context of their study ‘an historical perspective, however limited, is vital to our attempts to establish a critical approach’ (Clarke and Critcher, 1985: 51).

It is useful at this point to consider how a historiographic element has been used in existing interpretive sociological research on sport. In their comprehensive overview and summary of the growth of football world-wide, Sugden and Tomlinson (1998: 1) adopt what they refer to as an interpretive and conceptual framework. Further, it is suggested that the framework used is essentially social historical and sociological, and that the adoption of such an approach is a crucial feature in the interpretive framework. They ask several core questions in their research into who rules the ‘people’s game’, one of which has particular relevance to the inclusion of a historiographic element: how,
through understanding the development of FIFA, can we come to know more of the global change in the 20th century? By asking this question they give the contemporary phenomenon under investigation a dynamic historical dimension.

An excellent interpretation of the importance of a sport in a particular society, within a nation’s cultural life, is offered by Gruneau and Whitson (1993). The approach taken is considered to stand at the crossroads between history, sociology and contemporary cultural studies. More specifically, by taking this approach they appreciate that the centrality of hockey in Canadian cultural life has emerged out of a series of clashes of cultures and traditions that have occurred versus the backdrop of Canada’s development as an industrial and consumer society. It further offers an examination of the history of struggles surrounding hockey’s transformation from folk to commercial form, an exploration of the clash between different interpretations of hockey and Canadian culture. The pressures, limits, and struggles influencing Canadian hockey from the 1950s to the present are revealed, and a look inside hockey subculture, exploring current debates and examining how the game is changing, is also offered. Gruneau and Whitson (1993) identify that the primary task is to explore the complex relationships between culture and society, history and meaning, image and context. Further, they put forward questions that are typically asked in contemporary cultural studies, several of which have a historiographic element: What forces have influenced the development, availability, and popularity of different cultural forms and practices? What kind of relationship exists between cultural production, pleasure, meaning, and inequalities in power? How have the structures, meanings, and uses of different cultural forms and practices changed over time, and what significance can be attributed to these changes?
Ultimately Gruneau and Whitson’s research illustrates how a full understanding of the place of hockey in Canadian cultural life cannot be achieved without exploring the sport’s history, and considering how it has developed within the particular context of Canadian society.

The questions that Gruneau and Whitson’s (1993) research address have relevance to this thesis in a number of ways. Parallels can be made between hockey and Canadian cultural life and the place of football in Scottish society. There exists relevance by exploring the meaning of football in Scottish society and Scottish culture, and by ultimately locating the place of women’s football in this context. Some of the questions raised can be applied specifically to women’s football in Scotland, for example: What forces have influenced the development, availability, and popularity of women’s football in Scotland? What kind of relationship exists between cultural production, pleasure, meaning, and inequalities in power in the context of football in Scotland? How have the structures, meanings, and uses of football and women’s football changed over time, and what significance can be attributed to these changes? In some form or another these are questions that reside at the heart of this thesis. This identification deems Gruneau and Whitson’s (1993) work as a particularly relevant example of the use of interpretive sociology in sport that embraces a historiographic element.

In the context of this thesis the aforementioned arguments have considerable relevance. It is necessary to explain how we can apply to above discussion and justify the inclusion of a historiographic element in the framework of this thesis. In order to interpret critically the meaning of football in the lives of women in contemporary
Scottish society, it is necessary to understand the structures of society within which the sport exists. In order to situate women's football within the structural and cultural processes that constitute contemporary Scottish society, an historical dimension is required. It would be easy but not adequate to simply apply the theory of others to this thesis in this way. It is necessary to explore the need for an historiographic element in the context of this research. In doing so it is useful to identify core questions that this research poses, the answers to which are only likely to be reached through providing a dynamic historical dimension. There are three core questions that function in this way:

How has women's football developed in Scotland? How and to what extent have wider social, political, and economic processes in Scotland influenced the development of the sport? How does accounting for the development aid our understanding of the shape of the game today?

The first of these questions embraces an investigative and descriptive response. The development of women's football in Scotland is in desperate need of an historiography. In existing literature on the history of women's football in Britain there exist only references made to Scotland. A historiography of women's football in the context of Scotland would be an original piece of historical research. The second question lends itself to a more analytical approach. Providing a historiography alone may offer previously unaccounted detail but runs the risk of being simply descriptive. In order to use a historiography to eventually understand and situate women's football in contemporary Scottish society, it is necessary to ask the questions of 'why?' and 'how?' rather than simply 'what?' in an historical context. Finally, the third question challenges us to justify the inclusion of an historiographic element in the framework of this thesis.
This reverts us to the previous arguments in this section, and is a crucial area upon which to expand.

Reflecting on the first sentence in the quote from Sugden and Tomlinson (1999: 387) at the start of this section, ‘in order to fully make sense of what happens today we must come to understand why it happened, at least in part, in terms of yesterday’s events’. In the context of women’s football in Scotland, there is an array of questions we could ask about the shape of the game today. For example; How is the game organised within Scottish society?; Why is women’s football not as popular as men’s football in Scotland?; Why is the standard of women’s football in Scotland less advanced than that in societies such as the United States, China, Germany, Norway, and England? These are just a few of the questions that could be asked, but an attempt to answer them looking solely from a contemporary angle would prove particularly shallow and is unlikely to reveal a full answer. In order to be able to answer these sorts of questions as fully as possible there is the need to delve into the past. Only by providing a comprehensive historiography of women’s football in Scotland will we be able to produce an informed analysis of the shape of the game today. Further, providing a historiography of women’s football in Scotland would act as more than simply a historiography of the sport. It would also situate the experiences of women football players within the experiences of women in Scottish society, and wider still within the specific circumstances of Scottish society.

Critical

The inclusion of a critical element within the interpretive framework is based on the arguments put forward by Sugden and Tomlinson (1999). Essentially the authors
suggest that 'it is the main task of the sociologist to get under the skin of daily life and to understand what passes as “routine” in the context of broader issues of power, control and resistance to domination' (Sugden and Tomlinson, 1999: 388). In their study of FIFA, Sugden and Tomlinson (1998) declare that it is necessary to probe beyond the official and formal surface of social phenomenon under investigation in order to achieve an adequate understanding. At the most basic level Sugden and Tomlinson (1999) consider that to be critical is simply to be sceptical. Of what we should be sceptical needs some clarification. Scepticism can be put down to questioning authority and not taking things at face value. What exactly ‘face value’ is also requires some clarification in the context of this research. In terms of scepticism, this research may be considered sceptical in relation to what the true meaning of being part of a football club to women players in Scotland. By this it is assumed that it is not simply football per se that is of most importance to football club members, but there is a strong social aspect at work within the subculture of the women’s game. The research may also be considered sceptical in relation to the positions of power within Scottish society, within the organisational base of Scottish football, and within the governing bodies of the SFA and SWF Ltd. Sugden and Tomlinson’s (1998) study of FIFA is an excellent example of interpretive sociological research that presents a critical overview of the workings of the world football organisation. In relation to previous discussion, this research may come across as sceptical of the attachment that feminist theorists tend to make to the importance of sexuality and gender issues in researching women and sport, and ask whether these are generally issues of importance to the players themselves? In terms of what we consider to be represented as face value, this could be looked at in a similar
way. Are we to be sceptical of what appears as face value in terms of women’s football in Scotland, face value in terms of what research on women and sport puts forward or offers as central issues? Or are we to be sceptical, or critical, of both?

As with interpretive sociology, there exist a number of diverse strands of critical sociology, lending the umbrella term critical theories. Despite the diversity of critical theories it is recognised that there does exist a central intention of emancipation. Gibson (1986: 3) explains that the intention of emancipation is directed towards ‘enabling people to gain the knowledge and power to be in control of their own lives’ (cited in Sparkes, 1992: 37). It is important at this stage to uncover the extent to which this research is critical and justify the critical element within the interpretive framework. Regarding the emancipatory nature, as previously mentioned, this research does not directly intend to bring about social transformation. As a result the extent to which it may be considered critical may be questioned. This research acknowledges how issues of power, control and resistance to domination have influenced and continue to influence women’s football. These issues however do not essentially drive the research. It is driven by the desire to understand what being part of a sports subculture means in the lives of individuals, and women’s football in the subculture under examination.

Despite the emphasis in critical sociology on not only showing what is really going on at a societal level, but also actually doing something about it, there are several ways in which the research could be regarded as critical in nature. Critical sociologists also stress an attempt to ‘dig beneath the surface of historically specific, oppressive, social structures’ and recognise that ‘critical social research is concerned with the broad social and historical context in which phenomena are interrelated’ (Harvey, 1990 cited in
Sparkes, 1992: 38). This requirement is acknowledged and incorporated into the framework of this thesis within both the historiographic and critical elements. There do exist ontological and epistemological similarities across both the interpretive and critical paradigms. Running within the critical paradigm is one strand associated with radical humanism which adopts, as Sparkes (1992: 38) suggests, an internalist-idealistic ontology, a subjectivist epistemology, and a relatively voluntaristic view of people, thereby having much in common with the interpretive paradigm. Even with the subjectivist epistemology of the interpretive approach, critical researchers consider there to be major weaknesses. Carr and Kemmis (1986: 104) make an identification of limitations within the interpretive paradigm. They concede that:

Achieving a correct understanding of individuals’ meanings is only a necessary preliminary to social enquiries, and it is misguided to regard this as the whole substance of the theoretical enterprise. For the emphasis of the interpretive model on the subjective meanings of action tends to imply that social reality is nothing over and above the way people perceive themselves and their situation. But social reality is not simply structured by concepts and ideas. It is also structured and shaped by such things as historical forces and economic and material conditions. Moreover, these things also structure and affect the perceptions and ideas of individuals so that ‘reality’ may be misperceived as a consequence of the operation of various ideological processes. Uncovering these processes and explaining how they can condition and constrain interpretations of reality are vital requirements that are largely neglected by the ‘interpretive’ approach.

In general, the main argument against interpretive research is what Sparkes (1992: 39) terms ‘macro-blindness’. This is essentially a failure to set the phenomenon being studied within the context of wider society. In doing so, interpretive research has been criticised by those within the critical paradigm as failing to take into account how the structure and shape of society influences interpretations of social reality. Gruneau (1999)
has made a similar argument with respect to some radical critics located within a broad Foucauldian perspective. It is identified that within a broadly Foucauldian approach to social criticism lie several problems, including a failure to acknowledge what sort of change might actually be accomplished from various power struggles. More specifically, Gruneau (1999) further stresses the need for an evaluation of the wider context within a critical analysis. By drawing the ‘big diagnostic pictures’ (Fraser, 1989: 11) critical social analysts should ‘recognise and acknowledge the socially-situated nature of their work’ (Gruneau, 1999: 126). In her study on women’s ice hockey in Canada, Theberge (1995) appreciates the need to locate the phenomenon under study within the wider context. Theberge (1995: 390) identifies that women athletes in general often compete in obscurity and with little public support in a ‘contested ideological terrain’, and face the challenge of constructing a community within a broader social context marked by ambivalence toward their endeavours. In order to understand and interpret the experiences of women athletes it is therefore crucial to understand the broader social context, and the processes and relations that have led to the ambivalence encountered.

This research aims to avoid the potential limitation of setting women’s football in Scotland within a social and cultural vacuum. This is to be achieved on several levels. Providing a historiography of women’s football in Scotland will reveal how features of wider society have influenced the game throughout its development, and also how certain features continue to influence the shape of the women’s game today. The construction of a socio-demographic profile of women who play football in Scotland will allow players interpretations to be examined against the circumstances of their individual and collective lives and experiences of living in Scottish society. During the
interview process attention will be paid to socio-demographic characteristics of players, in order to locate their experiences within the context of their everyday lives. A critical examination of the organisational base of football in Scotland, as previously mentioned, is particularly important in identifying and understanding the structures within which the women’s game exists and develops. It is acknowledged that if this research were to suffer from placing women’s football in a social and cultural vacuum, it would be a wasted opportunity to use women’s football as a means to understanding the place of women’s sport in Scotland, the place of women in Scottish society, and to a certain extent certain features of Scottish society. Ultimately there are several questions that the research asks which warrant the inclusion of a critical element within the theoretical framework. At the individual level; what meanings do women attach to playing football, and to being an active member of the subculture of women’s football in Scotland? At the structural level; what relationships exist within the organisational base of football in Scotland, and what are the implications for women’s football? And at both the individual and structural levels; to what extent are the experiences of women football players influenced or constrained by the features and structure of Scottish society?

While critical sociologists have attempted to delve under the skin of daily life, they have generally failed to do so with respect to women and sport. Despite this, there have been a number of critical sports sociologists, namely Hargreaves (1994), who have focused on women in their research. In doing so, Hargreaves (1994: 3) reveals a ‘general inability of different sociological perspectives to deal with the problem of gender’. In her discussion of sociological perspectives Hargreaves (1994: 3) suggests that:
Although they represent different and sometimes conflicting theories of society, all the perspectives discussed, without exception, have marginalised gender in one way or another. In this respect they fail to provide a satisfactory analysis. Part of this failure is to treat gender as a variable, rather than as a relationship of power.

Hargreaves’ (1994) work is arguably the leading attempt to redress the neglect within not only critical sociology, but within the field of sociology as a whole. This research has some parallels with Hargreaves (1994: 3) in that it shares an analysis of ‘changes that have occurred, the conditions under which advances in women’s sports have been made, and how we can make sense of what has happened in the past and what is happening today’ within the context of women’s football in Scotland. The extent to which this research is critical differs from Hargreaves’ work. Whilst acknowledging the issues which are central to critical sociology, particularly feminist grounded work within this field, this thesis includes only a critical element and is not a strictly critical analysis. To enforce this it is useful to reflect on what Hargreaves (1994: 4) suggests:

It is a critical analysis of women’s sports which raises questions about the extent to which sports are radical activities for women, and how they might be viewed as a process of accommodation to existing structures of power and control, and to dominant ideologies.

To reiterate, this research is not critical to the extent that it is concerned with emancipation, or social transformation, although the findings may well provide the base for future research of a more critical nature. The critical element in this framework is adopted to ensure a sufficient understanding, and ultimately inform a thorough interpretation of the subculture of women’s football in Scottish society.
Comparative

This research encapsulates the element of comparative sociology in several ways. The use of comparative sociology has been considered as fundamental to any sociological or anthropological theory (Marsh, 1967: 6). As an advocate of comparative analysis, Durkheim (1982: 157) argues that:

One cannot explain a social fact of any complexity except by following its complete development through all social species. Comparative sociology is not a particular branch of sociology; it is sociology itself, in so far as it ceases to be purely descriptive and aspires to account for facts.

A more recent argument for comparative thinking is made by Sugden and Tomlinson (1999: 387) who suggest that ‘the fundamental purpose behind a comparative methodology is to learn more about ourselves by understanding “the other” – both horizontally across space and vertically through history’. The international analysis of boxing and society offered by Sugden (1996) has relevance to this thesis in terms of its use of comparative sociology. Sugden (1996: 2) qualifies that ‘the essence of good sociology is making sense of the mysterious’, and this is illustrated in his inter-societal interpretation of boxing. In his analysis of boxing and society Sugden (1996) focuses on four distinct inter-societal case studies and in doing so offers a fully informed interpretation of boxing and society. There are various ways in which research can be comparative, and this research lends itself to several possibilities. At the most basic level it is clear that the research offers both a horizontal and vertical dimension. The vertical dimension results from the inclusion of a historiographic element allowing women’s football in Scotland today to be compared with the shape of the game throughout its
development within Scottish society. The horizontal dimension is explored further in this section. Sugden and Tomlinson (1999) expand on how they have been able to constitute a broader comparative project using two main approaches. The first is through a single case study, informed by comparative thinking. The second is through a collection of cases ‘which offer readers a choice from a range of individual cases that stand alone, but also have an accumulative impact in terms of a more comprehensive understanding’ of the phenomenon being studied (Sugden and Tomlinson, 1999: 387).

There is another important point made by Sugden and Tomlinson (1999: 387) which leads us to an understanding of how this research is comparative. They assert that:

The study of single cases should always be informed, however implicitly, by a wider understanding of how a particular society stands in relation to others... Well-developed case studies providing detailed and deeply situated comparative data are essential if abstract theorisations are to be avoided.

The cases used in this research could be considered as either a single case study, represented by the subculture of women’s football, or a collection of cases, from within the subculture of women’s football and representing a cross-ability sample. The subculture of women’s football in Scotland could be seen as a single case study against which a variety of comparisons can be made. Most obviously we could ask what makes the subculture of women’s football a distinct social group in Scottish society? This approach categorises the subculture of women’s football as ‘the other’ comparative to wider Scottish society. In the context of this research, a single case study of the subculture of women’s football in Scotland, would be informed by an understanding of women within Scottish society, an understanding of how women football players stand
in Scottish society, both horizontally and vertically, and an understanding of how Scottish women football players stand in relation to women football players in other societies. The implications are that the research is potentially useful in providing a single case study of the subculture of women’s football in Scotland, which is informed by comparative thinking. Further, such comparative thinking ensures an understanding of the broad social context, and the place of women’s football within this.

This research could also use a collection of cases which stand alone individually, but also have a collective impact for our understanding of the subculture of women’s football. One shortcoming in the existing research on women’s football is its relatively non-comparative nature. Studies tend to concentrate on either a single case study, or a sample of women football players from ‘top-level’ teams. These cases are informative, but without comparative thinking are not sufficient to enable an informed interpretation of the subculture of women’s football. Concentrating on top-level players is likely to provide a bias in relation to the values and meanings that players attach to being involved in football. A cross-ability collection of cases will collectively represent the subculture of women’s football in Scotland. Individually, the cases will be representative of different ability levels within the organisation of women’s football in Scotland. The cross-ability comparison assumes that players within one club are of a similar ability level and therefore may attach similar values and meanings to being involved in football. Within this approach ‘the other’ may be considered collectively, as the subculture of women’s football in Scotland, or within the subculture as individual clubs, reinforcing the horizontal dimension.
Viewing the subculture of women’s football in Scotland as both single and collective cases will ensure that comparative thinking informs the crucial questions of this thesis. The ‘top-level’ bias, which has resulted from existing research, will be addressed to provide a more comprehensive understanding of the subculture of women’s football, set within the context of Scottish society. There are several questions this research asks which exemplify the inclusion of a comparative element is necessary: How does women’s football in Scotland today differ from the shape of the game in other historical periods? What makes the subculture of women’s football in Scotland a distinct social group within Scottish society? What makes Scottish women’s football different from women’s football in other societies? In what way are differences in the meanings attached to being involved in football related to factors such as individual characteristics, club affiliation, and ability level? The comparative element in this research does not direct us to specific questions, rather comparative thinking enables a more comprehensive understanding from which to interpret women’s football in Scotland.

**Investigative**

This research is not extensively investigative but the framework does contain an investigative element. In their critical interpretive framework, Sugden and Tomlinson (1999) develop the elements of the investigative and the Gonzo (gonzo journalism) in researching sports cultures. It is the investigative element that has most relevance and warrants inclusion in this theoretical framework. The extent to which this research is classed as investigative correlates somewhat to the extent that it is considered critical. As Sugden and Tomlinson (1999: 388) relate:
Recognising the unpredictable complexities of the researcher’s place and role in relation to the topics and human subjects of research, we believe that an investigative imperative is faithful to the spirit of a critical social science. Investigative sociological research is an important dimension of the critical gaze.

Sugden and Tomlinson (1999) refer extensively to the work of Douglas (1976) and Jennings (1994,1996) in putting forward their case for an investigative element in an interpretive critical framework. The following quote from Douglas (1976: 9) expresses a fundamental argument for the use of investigative social research, and hence the inclusion of an investigative element within this framework:

People are extremely adept at constructing complex and convoluted forms of falsehoods and deceptions to front out others, such as researchers, and sometimes even themselves, from the most important parts of their lives. Researchers have to use more in-depth and investigative methods to get at these private regions of life than they would to study the public realms which are open to almost anyone. It is precisely to get at these most important and pervasive parts of our lives that we have developed the methods of investigative social research.

It is recognised by Sugden and Tomlinson (1999: 389) that ‘Douglas’s view of the nature of social life is framed by his experience of researching relatively microscopic, albeit “deviant” subcultures’, despite this, it is also identified that the basic principles of Douglas’s view are applicable to ‘all walks of life’.

An investigative element has particular significance in understanding the organisational base of Scottish football. Sugden and Tomlinson (1998) frame their study of FIFA as an investigative enquiry and offer a comprehensive overview and summary of the growth of football world-wide. In a similar vein to Sugden and Tomlinson’s exploration of FIFA, the organisational base of women’s football in Scotland needs
similar, although not as exhaustive, exploration. In order to offer a fully informed interpretation an investigation of SWF Ltd in particular, and the relationships between the organisation and the SFA, is fundamental. Sugden and Tomlinson (1998) also take account of the dimensions of power employed by those who run the game. This is a potentially significant issue in terms of women's football in Scotland when considering the relationships within the organisational base of Scottish football, and within women's football itself. At the most basic level, the organisation of women's football in Scotland is a subject that has not been researched, an understanding of which is fundamental to this research. Naturally then, research into the SWF Ltd, the SFA and the relationships between the two, requires social enquiry of an investigative nature. As previously mentioned, the extent to which such research is considered investigative will correspond to the extent that it is deemed critical. To offer an idea as to how investigative this research actually is, it is useful to refer to the work of Sugden (1996) who drew upon a number of qualitative and investigative strategies, such as those recommended by Douglas (1976). In discussing the perils of ethnography, Sugden (1996: 201) suggests that:

While it is totally acceptable to undertake qualitative research in relatively non-threatening settings...ethnography has a long tradition of engaging the researcher in subterranean aspects of social life which, trading upon their invisibility from the public gaze, either border on or are at the very centre of that area of social life designated as deviant by the guardians of social order.

In his international analysis of boxing, Sugden's work is investigative to the extent that there is an element of risk and the experiences he encountered introduced both ethical
dilemmas and physical perils of ethnography. Sugden (1996: 211) exemplifies this in his ultimate statement suggesting that 'if we choose to work at the cutting edge of social construction, we should not be too surprised if, from time to time, we get a little dirty and a little bloody'. It is important to understand the social settings within which Sugden (1996) immersed himself. Although it is a distinct possibility on the football field, it is unlikely that such risk would be present in researching women's football in Scotland.

Largely because it is an under-researched area, enquiry into the subculture of women's football in Scotland in general, will call for the adoption of some level of investigation. The more specific areas that this research focuses on similarly require an investigative approach in order to reveal the truth. At this point it is appropriate to consider the potential of elements of journalism within the investigative paradigm. Both Sugden and Tomlinson (1999) and Douglas (1976) have referred to methods of journalism in their accounts of investigative social research. It has already been brought to our attention that within the reviewed literature on women's football, it is Davies' (1996) journalistic investigation into the Doncaster Belles that has arguably revealed most about the subculture of women's football. Similarly, Ashworth's (2001) story of the Kestrels Women's Football Club is journalistic in style, but somewhat less investigative. Throughout his account, Davies (1996) often critically refers to the organisation of women's football in England, albeit through a combination of his own investigation and the opinion of members of the Doncaster Belles. It is within the context of his case study however, that Davies' investigative approach proves most fruitful. Through his immersion in the field Davies investigates and gains access to the lives of players, offering the reader a familiarity with their personalities, private lives
and experiences, and ultimately an understanding of the meanings different players attach to being involved in football.

It is important to reflect on what Sugden and Tomlinson (1999: 390) term ‘a note of caution on the investigative journalistic mode’. They warn that an investigative and co-operative approach is all too often substituted for a totally investigative and negative approach, leading the investigative journalist to be over-dependent on sensationalist headlines. Sugden and Tomlinson (1999: 390) conclude by expressing that:

The following separate the investigative journalist from the investigative social scientist: the pursuit of objective understanding; the generation of theory; and the value of interpretation and explanation rather than mere exposé. Yes, by all means disclose – reveal the bad and the ugly – but also, when it can be justified balance this with accounts and interpretations of the good.

In some of the existing research on women’s football, there is an over-emphasis on ‘the bad’. Prominent themes have included negative attitudes to women’s football which infiltrate society and have influenced the development of the game, the generally unsupportive view of major socialising agents to girls and women being involved in playing football, and the continuing struggle for recognition from both the media and sporting world. Whilst these themes are indeed focal within research on women’s football there is little attempt to balance with accounts and interpretations of the good. It is quite possible that it would not be justifiable to attempt such a balance if themes relating to ‘the bad’ may be representative of ‘the truth’. This research aims to offer an interpretation of women’s football in Scotland that is based on a quest for truth. In order to do so the investigative is a fundamental element within the theoretical framework.
Multi-methodological

The importance of methodology in the research, as a whole and within the elements discussed so far, warrants its recognition as a crucial part of the interpretive framework. It could be argued that a methodological element is out of place within the theoretical framework. However, in a similar vein to Sugden and Tomlinson's (1999) elements of a critical interpretive framework, it is the packaging of the overlapping elements which constitutes the theoretical framework. The multi-methodological approach adopted in this research refers to a combination of quantitative and qualitative techniques used to ensure a fully informed interpretation of the subculture of women's football in Scotland.

A discussion of the techniques to be adopted in this research will follow but it is useful at this stage, to identify the typical methodologies of an interpretive approach. The interpretive paradigm is essentially recognised as inclusive. More importantly, it avoids the connotation of defining its range of approaches as 'essentially non-quantitative (a connotation that is carried by the term *qualitative*), since quantification of particular sorts can often be employed in this work' (Erickson, 1986: 119). In relation to methodologies, Donnelly (2000: 78) summarises that 'although “understanding” is the key to Weber’s methodology, the actual methods of the sociologies of everyday life often approximate those of anthropology – primarily ethnography and in-depth interviewing'. The methods that this research adopts are essentially qualitative, predominantly interviews, used in conjunction with selected quantitative techniques. Ethnography, in particular, is widely used in the previous examples of interpretive studies within the sociology of sport. Sugden and Tomlinson (1999: 387) define
ethnography as 'a comprehensive package of qualitative research techniques' which are applied in order to enable the researcher to 'first, gains empathetic access to a particular social milieu and second, is able to reproduce its more salient features for the edification of a wider readership'.

Regardless of the level of ethnography that is adopted (ranging from classic, long-term, depth immersion to 'ethnographic visiting') Sugden and Tomlinson (1999: 387) stress that:

...gaining a sense of space, place, character and culture – which can only be achieved through spending some time in the living research environment – sharpens the researcher’s critical gaze, helps the formulation of questions and enhances interpretation and theorisation.

Although the above views regarding ethnography are accepted and adopted in this research it is necessary to explain why the research is not exclusively ethnographic. It is important also to stress that, despite this, a sense of space, place, character and culture has been gained from experiences of playing football in Scotland for over six years. In this context, it can be argued that one particular asset this research has to offer is that it is grounded in lived experience. As Sugden and Tomlinson (1999: 387) qualify ‘theorisations and interpretations benefit greatly from research which is grounded in the lived experiences of those engaged in the area of cultural production under scrutiny’.

Out of the combination of qualitative research techniques that fall under the encompassing term of ethnography, the primary qualitative technique implemented in this research is in-depth interviewing. Due to the under-researched nature of women’s football in Scotland there is certain fundamental research data which need to be gathered
by other means. Included in these data are the essential socio-demographic characteristics, such as age, occupation, educational qualifications, family background, area of residence, and so on. The construction of a socio-demographic profile lends itself to a more quantitative research technique. In a similar fashion to Caudwell (1999), questionnaires sent to all 41 teams in the SWFL during 2002 provide a representative sample from the population of women football players, and enable the construction of an accurate profile. A socio-demographic profile makes a considerable contribution to this research on two levels. First, on an individual level, knowledge of such characteristics allows us to set the experiences of individuals within the wider context of their lives. Second, collectively the data provides us with a comprehensive answer to who the women football players in Scotland really are. Knowledge at both of these levels is an essential feature of making an accurate interpretation of women's football in Scotland.

A further quantitative technique used is time profiling. Administered within the setting of an interview, a typical weekly time-profile will add quantitative substance to issues raised. In particular, when determining the importance of football in the lives of women players, a time-profile will help to quantify and validate claims regarding how much time individuals devote to playing, training, and generally being a part of the football club. As Talbot (1997) suggests, in order to be interpreted accurately, time profiles are usually used within more extensive in depth interviews, as they need to be supplemented by other information such as circumstances of the people whose time use is being recorded.

The use of both questionnaires and time-profiles represent an implementation of quantitative research techniques in conjunction with the predominant use of qualitative
techniques. It is possible to apply Douglas’ (1976) view on a multiperspectival conception of methods to support the use of a combination of quantitative and qualitative research techniques. In connection with his research, Douglas (1976: 4) expresses that:

We eliminate the idea of absolute methods, substituting a multiperspectival conception of methods which argues that our choice of methods must always be made in the light of the degree of reliable truth we are seeking and the problems we face in the concrete settings we are studying. We shall see that this method makes the researcher, the live and socially situated individual, the ultimate “measure of all things”.

The adoption of a multi-methodology within this research reiterates an attempt to let the research and a basic quest for truth shape the methods used. It essentially avoids an adherence to a particular social theory. Instead it fits into the interpretive paradigm in the way in which it uses a combination of both quantitative and qualitative techniques to strive towards an as fully informed and educated interpretation as possible. To support this Douglas (1976: 14) has stressed that rather than choosing their methods in terms of preconceived biases about sociological methods, sociologists ‘should choose their own methods in terms of the value of the methods for producing the kinds of information they want in any given study’. In the same way that this framework consists of the packaging of several elements, the methodological approach relies on a combination of research techniques. The interpretive framework, and the synthesis of elements within it, is adopted in order to fulfil the aim of the research, as opposed to utilising techniques rigidly prescribed to a particular social theory.
Conclusion

In summary it is particularly useful to consider the assertions of Gruneau (1999) regarding the issues of complexity versus totality, and sensitivity to unevenness. Gruneau (1999: 127) believes that ‘writing better history and more inclusive theory involves the pursuit of complexity rather than totality’. By this he stresses that in order to address a broader range of silences, structuring practices, and centres of power, it is important to building on a singular entry point (e.g. class, gender, or race). In doing this, the bigger picture can be recognised and acknowledged, key issues appreciated and developed where necessary. At the same time it is impossible to acknowledge and analyse the broadest possible range of experiences, or focus on all issues which relate in some way to the social phenomenon under investigation. Further, Gruneau (1999) recognises the issue of unevenness as especially important. He appreciates how ‘history is experienced unevenly and is shot through with contradictions and the unintended consequences of human action’ (Gruneau, 1999: 127). This is particularly relevant in relation to issues of unevenness, which have had and continue to have an impact on women’s experiences of playing football in Scotland. To adapt Gruneau (1999: 127), the challenge is to write theoretically-informed histories, and sociologies, that are ‘sensitive to multiple and uneven paths of change’, histories and sociologies where ‘the structuring principles of the field of sporting practice at any given time are recognised to involve complex sets of dominant, residual, and emergent tendencies’.

This research can be seen as building on the specific entry point of women’s football in Scotland from which a plethora of issues, such as gender and sexuality, could be the focus of research. It would however be impossible and inappropriate to address all
of these issues at the risk of losing sight of the ‘complexity and unevenness of social
development’ (Gruneau, 1999: 127). Instead this research opts for complexity by
especially focusing on the meaning of women’s football in Scotland, whilst
acknowledging and addressing broader silences, structuring practices and centres of
power which enable us to gain as full an understanding as possible, in the context of
Scottish society.

To conclude it is necessary to explain why this framework makes sense in terms
of the questions the research asks. Core questions include; how has women’s football
developed in Scottish society? Who participates in women’s football in Scotland? How
have women experienced the process of socialisation into football? How can the
subculture of women’s football in Scotland be defined? And ultimately, what are the
meanings and values attached to football by women players in Scotland? In order to go
about answering these questions, and to gain a sufficient understanding to inform an
interpretation of women’s football in Scotland, all of these questions require the
packaging of the five overlapping elements that this framework adopts. The interpretive
framework adopted is inclusive and allows a synthesis of elements with no strict
adherence to any particular social theory, it is essentially a quest for truth which shapes
the research. Ultimately, at the most basic level, the research is about the meaning of
football in women’s lives in Scotland and interpretive sociology is essentially concerned
with the interpretation and understanding of such human meaning and action.

Research Design and Methodology

The research design has been developed in order to go about answering the core
questions of the thesis. The interpretive framework adopted advocates the use of a
methodology that allows the research to shape the methods used rather than prescribing an adherence to methods most commonly associated with a particular sociological theory. The multi-methodological nature of this research is crucial in order to answer the core research questions. The study involved four main research phases: review of literature; historical research; survey administration; and interviews. The review of literature concentrated primarily on research on women’s football, both within Britain and internationally. In addition to this, reviews of literature on the process of socialisation into sport, subcultural theory and sport subcultures informed the analysis in Chapter Five and Chapter Six. Historical research was conducted in order to provide a historical dimension to women’s football in Scotland. References to women’s football in Scotland in several secondary sources were used as the basis for the historical research. Archive searches of newspapers and sports press at the Mitchell Library (Glasgow), consultation of material held at the SFM (in particular, SFA meeting minutes) and examination of sources such as statistical accounts and domestic annals of Scotland, proved particularly fruitful in order to develop a historiography of women’s football in Scotland.

The two most important research methods adopted, in order to reveal the experiences of women footballers in contemporary Scottish society, was the combination of a survey and interviews. The survey was intended initially to obtain the socio-demographic characteristics of a sample of players. It was then decided that, since SWF Ltd had agreed to endorse the survey, advantage should be taken of this situation. Consequently, the survey was extended in order to explore the themes of socialisation and subculture in support of and to inform the interviews (see Appendix Two). With
SWF Ltd endorsement, and the distribution of surveys at an SWFL Secretaries meeting, it was hoped that a relatively high response rate would be achieved. A combination of both open-ended and closed questions was used in order to explore these themes and to produce both quantitative and qualitative data. The survey was piloted with a number of members of SULFC who were not registered with the SWFL and therefore would not be eligible to complete the final survey. The final survey was administered in February 2002 and analysed using Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS Version 10).

Survey analysis was conducted prior to conducting interviews in order for the findings to inform interview schedules. There remained a degree of consistency between survey and interview questions and this allowed the combination of data to be used effectively in the analysis. The clubs chosen as case studies for interviews were selected in accordance with several criteria. First, only clubs who had returned surveys would be selected as possible case studies. Second, the chosen clubs needed to represent a cross-ability sample of players, preferably one club from the Premier League and one from each of the three divisions in the SWFL. Third, an attempt was made to avoid any geographical bias regarding club location. Interviews were conducted with 13 senior players from the SWFL between November 2002 and June 2003. Five players represented a Premier League team, four players represented a team recently promoted from the Second to the First Division and the remaining four players represented a team struggling at the bottom of the Third Division. In terms of the selection of interviewees, club secretaries were contacted and asked to recruit willing participants from their club, and preferably players who had previously completed the survey and were therefore familiar with the focus of the research. Interviews were conducted at a date and location
convenient to the interviewees and generally lasted between 30 minutes and 1.5 hours with time-profiles being completed by the interviewee at the end of their interview. Interviews were transcribed as soon after the interview as possible and analysed manually based around the themes that formed the interview schedule (Appendix Eight).

The research was designed in order to complement effectively the focus of this study. Alternative methodologies were considered, particularly in relation to how to research the subculture of women’s football in Scotland. The fundamental reasoning for adopting a multi-methodological approach was in order to compensate for the under-researched nature of the subject area. Without an understanding of the wider context of the experiences of women footballers in Scotland, research on the subculture would inevitably exhibit macro-blindness and fail to account for the big diagnostic picture. The multi-methodological nature of this research represents an attempt to reveal the experiences of a cross-ability sample of women footballers in Scotland without losing sight of the historical, social and personal context in which their experiences can be located. As the conclusion to this thesis discusses, potential future research developed from this study might benefit from an adopting an alternative research design and methodology.
CHAPTER THREE – THE DEVELOPMENT OF WOMEN’S FOOTBALL IN SCOTLAND

Introduction

This chapter provides a historiography of women’s football in Scotland. It has been recognised in the previous chapter that it is only possible to fully make sense of and interpret women’s football in contemporary Scottish society if we have some understanding of how women’s football has developed throughout Scotland. The current knowledge that we have of the development of the women’s game in Scotland is generally confined within the context of historical research on the development of women’s football elsewhere in Britain, primarily England. The paucity of research on women’s football reflects a wider lack of understanding of the place of sport in the history and culture of women in Scotland. An initial exploration of the development of the game in the particular Scottish context is therefore original in its own right. The secondary sources that make reference to Scotland provide us with an initial collection of clues from which to progress. These clues typically refer to matches taking place at Scottish venues, matches involving Scottish women’s teams, and the identification of pioneering players. Research on more contemporary developments in the game provides us with evidence of a similar nature with greater emphasis on structural changes in the games’ organisation.

It is useful at this point to consider where this research is located in relation to studies of the history and development of women’s sport, and studies of the significance of sport in Scottish society. In relation to the former, this research is original in the sense
that it focuses on the development of women’s football in Scotland and begins to redress the neglect of the sports’ development in Scottish society. It is an important contribution to our knowledge of women’s history, women’s sport history, and in particular the history of women playing a traditionally male sport, in a Scottish context. This chapter offers a unique research base that has the potential to add to what we know about the development of women’s football in Britain. With respect to studies on the significance of sport in Scottish society, this research also stands out from existing studies that have generally been male dominated, in the sense that they have been largely conducted by men, and have concentrated on ‘male’ sports and/or men as fans (Burnett, 1995 and 2000; Jarvie and Walker, 1994; Jarvie, 1999; MacLennan, 1997; and Tranter, 1998).

The development of women’s football in Scotland has emerged and developed against the backdrop of social, political and economic factors in wider Scottish (and British) society. Factors such as social attitudes to women and sport, the influence of the media, the role of the football governing bodies, the onset of the First World War, and changes in women’s place in society, have combined to mould the development of women’s football in the context of Scottish society. In order to reveal the influence of these factors throughout the development of women’s football in Scotland this work is organised around several sections following a discussion of methodology: the origins of women’s football in Scotland; the growth of the game (late 19th and early 20th centuries); years of struggle 1921-1971, and; the new age of women’s football in Scotland since 1971. The choice of these sections is consistent with the stages of the game’s development identified in existing research on women’s football. This chapter will also consider the current organisation of women’s football in Scotland in relation to the game.
elsewhere. Issues for the future development of women's football in Scotland will also be discussed. Drawing from the work of Donnelly (1993) there is an underlying consideration of how the subculture of women's football emerged in Scotland and how it has been representative of dominant, emergent and residual aspects of culture. In particular, the extent to which women's football has transformed and been incorporated and suppressed by the dominant Scottish sports culture and societal institutions, such as the media, at different stages of its development will be considered throughout the chapter.

In terms of historical research a range of sources are used in order to provide an account of the development of women's football in Scotland. The material in this chapter is from a combination of both primary and secondary sources. The research methods adopted include archive and newspaper searches at the Mitchell Library, consultations of SFA meeting minutes, an examination of material at the Scottish Football Museum (SFM), and consultation of existing research on the history of women's football. Material held by the SFM was particularly fruitful and included sports journals and press cuttings from the late 1800s. This chapter provides essential historical context for the remainder of the thesis.

The Origins of Women's Football in Scotland

The origins of women's football are as of yet unclear. This is a situation only to be expected since knowledge of the subsequent development of the women’s football remains somewhat unsubstantiated. Several sources propose the origins of the women’s game to be located in Scotland itself (Williamson, 1991, McCuaig, 2000a, Williams,
2003a). In particular, both Williamson (1991) and McCuaig (2000a) refer to women playing football in the early eighteenth centuries. There is evidence however of women being involved in football to some extent even in the early seventeenth century. Church registers from Carstairs in Lanarkshire imply that as early as the 1620s women may have been involved in football. Participation in football and other activities are noted in the church register since at this time such behaviour conflicted with an external observance of the Sunday as a Sabbath (Chambers, 1858: 488).

In August 1628, the minister of Carstairs regretted to the presbytery of Lanark the breach of the Sabbath ‘by the insolent behaviour of men and women in foot-balling, dancing, and barley-breaks.’

Although it is not clear whether both men and women took part in all these activities, the evidence does not suggest that women did not take part in football. There is further evidence of the involvement of women in various ‘amusements’ during the mid-seventeenth century in Lamington, Lanarkshire. In fact curling was ‘the chief amusement in a frosty winter’ and the Rev, Charles Hope (1845: 823), Minister of the United Parishes of Wandell and Lamingtoune commented that:

... a striking peculiarity to this and many of the neighbouring parishes is, that females have their bonspiel or contest at curling as well as the males. The wives are matched against the unmarried women, and each party has a man in attendance to lend an arm to such as may be afraid of slipping on the ice at the time of delivering the curling-stone! It is very amusing sometimes to witness the scientific skill and prowess displayed by these female combatants.
This tradition of married and unmarried women competing against each other was later reproduced in football. In contrast to other amusements and games where 'the utmost decorum and good fellowship are strictly observed' (Hope, 1845: 823), participation in football in particular on Fasting's eve was regarded as less civilised, as the following minute of the kirk-session of 28th January 1656 suggests.

The sessione considering ane superstitious and abominable custone yt hes continued still in this paroche. That men and women uses promiscuously to play at the foot-ball upon Fasting's even; and also considering what evil and sadde consequences hes followed y're upon, viz. Uncleannesse, drunkennes, and fighting, they doe unanimously discharge and inhibite the s'd old superstitious and abominable practise. And hereby macks and ordaines, that whatsoever persone or persones shall contravein this present acte, they shall be censured with the censure of the kirk. And the minister be desyred to publish y're present acte out of pulpitt y' next Lord's day, that none pretende ignorance. (Hope, 1845: 823)

Aside from the issue of men and women taking part in what were deemed uncivilised activities on inappropriate days, the evidence suggests that the origins of women playing some form of football may be as early as the 1600s.

In accounts of the early history of women's football in Britain, the earliest reference to the game is the occurrence of an annual match near Inverness. Williamson (1991: 1) suggests that the hills above Inverness were the site for an annual match between the married and single women of Caledonia in the early eighteenth century. The scene set is allegedly typical of folk games with a freshly stuffed animal bladder used as a ball, trees as goal-posts, and men lining the field to either cheer on their wives or choose their future brides from the team of single girls (Williamson, 1991: 1). It is not known whether this is myth or reality or how long the tradition of this annual match in Inverness lasted but there are further suggestions that late 18th century Scotland
witnessed a similar tradition. In a comparable fashion there are reports of an annual match in Mid-Lothian in the 1790s. The fisherwomen of Musselburgh and Inveresk are also reported to have played football in the late 18th or early 19th centuries (Fittis, 1891: 155 and 164). As Dr Alexander Carlyle (1795: 19), the Minister for Inveresk noted:

As they do the work of men, their manners are masculine, and their strength and activity is equal to their work. Their amusements are of the masculine kind. On holidays they frequently play at golf; and on Shrove Tuesday there is a standing match at foot-ball, between the married and unmarried women, in which the former are always victors.

How long these traditions lasted is not known but collectively the evidence implies that women's football in Scotland did not simply develop in response to or in parallel with developments in England. Indeed, accounts of women playing football in Scotland seem to predate those in England or elsewhere in Britain. Williamson (1991) may have been correct in asserting that the origins of women's football can be found in Scotland but they appear to emerge much earlier than he had anticipated. What certainly does seem to be clear is that an early period of growth emerged during the late 19th and early 20th centuries.

Growth in the Women's Game: Late 19th and Early 20th Centuries

There is a general consensus in existing research that, in terms of growth in the game, the late 19th century was one of the most significant stages in the development of women's football. Both Williamson (1991) and McCuaig (2000a) convey that the 1890s were an important decade seeing women's football matches evolving in a more organised manner. There is actually evidence of an unofficial Scotland V's England
Female Football Players – An innovation in football playing has been commenced in Edinburgh, a game having been played there on Saturday by a set of girls calling themselves “international” teams, representing England and Scotland. We need not comment on the character of the performance they gave, but must, in the interests of public morals, protest against the institution of an exhibition which can hardly be called decent, and which is evidently got up to draw the shillings of the crowd. There can be no other possible reason for this outrageous exhibition than gain. Football is not a game for women; and the spectacle of a score of girls careering about a field in knickerbockers is not to be defended on any ground of public utility. There is some talk of these international players giving a performance in Glasgow; so that the authorities there should consider whether some means may not be devised for checking a scandalous enterprise.

The reaction to this match in the press was a sign of things to come in terms of how the association of women with football was to be received in Scottish society. The following report from the Scottish Athletic Journal in 1882 (cited in Cairney, 1998: 243) exhibits that not only women playing football but also their behaviour in a spectator capacity was considered highly indecent.

The game was at Annbank. Not more than five hundred people were on the field, and a slovenly-looking, petticoated, and extremely vulgar section of the crowd has answered to the courteous invitation, ‘Ladies Free!’ The language which came from the lips of these ladies was sickening to listen to. The men behaved moderately well, and in respect of them, it may be as well to forgive the fair sex in the hope that in future they will stay at home.

The distaste for and mocking of the association of women with the male domain of football was certainly not exclusive to Scotland as the following report from the ‘English Clippings’ section of the Scottish Athletic Journal on January 10th 1888 exemplifies.
Ladies' cricket is un fait accompli but we have hitherto regarded football as safe from the invasion of the fair sex. Judge, then, of our surprise when we heard that the new ground of Bishop Auckland FC was opened on Saturday, and that at the commencement of the 1st match the ball was kicked off by Lady Eden. Let us hope that Lady Eden's kick-off had been carefully rehearsed in private. (p.15)

The quote implies that even the simple act of a woman taking the kick-off to commemorate the opening of a football ground was deemed as a possible invasion of a treasured male preserve. The report emphasises that 'Lady Eden' would require practise in order to be able to perform a skill considered unnatural and alien to the 'fair sex'.

In 1892 the first match played within SFA guidelines took place at Shawfields Ground, Glasgow. The press continued to have the almost exclusive role of portraying women's football to wider society and reaction to this particular match was reminiscent of, and essentially reinforced, wider social attitudes to women participating in sport, particularly a traditionally male sport such as football. Such attitudes were exemplified by Scottish Sport (cited in McCuaig, 2000b: 6) who expressed strongly their opinion regarding such behaviour of women.

The ladies', we remember were permitted to start, and continued for some time their feeble imitation of our glorious winter game; but after witnessing how utterly unfitted the female anatomy is for the game, a rough section of the crowd invaded the pitch, surrounding the girls in a most insulting fashion...it was the most degrading spectacle we have ever witnessed in connection with football, and we never want to see it faintly repeated. Who that has a spark of respect for the ladies would wish to see them risk their womanhood by a public display that can neither be edifying nor graceful...we draw the line at public performances, which are nothing short of immodesty. We do not say that a little of modified football exercise, taken in private, would not have a beneficial effect to most girls, but we draw the line at public performances, which are nothing short of immodest.
The reference to the female anatomy being ‘utterly unfitted’ for the game of football is typical of the dominant medical opinion during the Victorian era. It could also be interpreted from this particular quote that in the term ‘our glorious winter game’ the ‘our’ refers to an ownership of football by men, since the participation of women represented an ‘invasion’. The press reports cited so far display a strong negative reaction to the emergence of women playing football. The possibility of an emergent female football culture was certainly considered anathema to the dominant (male) sports culture within the wider context of patriarchal Victorian society.

There is however evidence of women footballers exhibiting resilience to this negative reaction as women continued to organise matches. Despite adverse reaction several “Ladies” football teams were known to have travelled around Scotland during the 1890s. In 1894 the British Ladies Football Club formed under the pioneering President, Lady Florence Dixie (Williams, 2003a: 26). She became organiser and manager of the travelling British Ladies Football Team and took the initiative by arranging a tour of Scotland in 1895 ‘under the banner of women’s rights’ (McCuaig, 2000b: 6). Amongst other venues, the team played matches at Love Street and Cappielow, the grounds of St Mirren and Greenock Morton respectively (McCuaig, 1997: 2). The secretary and captain of the British Ladies Football Club, Nettie Honeyball, spoke on their behalf in an article in Sketch in 1895 (cited in McCuaig, 2000b: 6).

I founded the association last year, with the fixed resolve of proving to the world that women are not the ‘ornamental useless’ creatures men have pictured... I am in hopes that the British Ladies Football Club will be
able to furnish teams to travel about the country, and endeavour to popularise the sport by playing some matches in different localities.

Although the team had travelled and played throughout Scotland in 1895, attracting a great degree of publicity Williams (2003a: 26) suggests that the coverage was rarely confined to the actual football matches. The following quote from Scottish Sport in 1895 (cited in Cairney, 1998: 243) illustrates this with a focus on the clothing of the players, which is considered to contravene shamefully the expected fashionable attire of the time.

The members of the new Ladies Football Association, of which we have lately heard so much, do not play in fashion's dresses, but in knickers and blouses. They actually allow the calves of their legs to be seen and wear caps and football boots. The more shame to them, is our retort.

What is particularly amusing is the almost surprise that the women did not play in fashion's dresses which, considering the fashions of the Victorian era, would have been extremely difficult to do. The prominent voice of Scottish Sport was again instrumental in reproducing and reinforcing societal opinion regarding the association of women with football by damning the potential emergence of a 'new woman' based on the behaviour of the travelling teams (cited in McCuaig, 2000b: 7).

We are ungallant enough to express a contrary hope. Whatever may be the final outcome of this latest outbreak of the 'new woman', we sincerely trust it will not be in the indelicate direction of peregrinating players giving public exhibitions.

The reference to the 'latest outbreak' of the 'new woman' indicates that it is some form of a temporary disease that is certainly controllable and curable. Despite the vehement
disapproval of the women’s behaviour not all that was printed in the press was negative. In fact the following letter printed in Scottish Sport in 1895 shows strong support of the notion of ‘New Women’ and for football as a means by which to represent her, although somewhat unsurprisingly it was a ‘Lady Contributor’ who authored this letter of support (cited in McCuaig, 2000b: 15).

Hands down, all ye crusaders against knicker attired females; and I say ‘off-side’ to all those puny specimens who have nothing good to say in favour of football, either for man or woman...Let girls go in for everything...even if they do not at first gain the approval of the supposed superior sex, who, I feel quite sure, would be only too delighted to be the lookers-on at a properly played football match composed of New Women.

Further examples of resilience to the adverse reaction they received is evident as the exploits of Lady Florence Dixie’s travelling ladies football team were seemingly replicated elsewhere. Mrs Graham’s team of Original Lady Footballers had made tours of Scotland from around 1894. Their first visit to Stirling on Saturday 27th June 1896 involved a match played at King’s Park Football Club, rented for the occasion. The ladies team played against eleven gentlemen understood to have come from Bathgate and the gate receipts amounted to £12. The local newspaper (Stirling Observer, July 4th 1896) treated the game as something of a novelty and as the exploits of Lady Florence Dixie was replicated, so was the nature of the reaction:

As far as football was concerned the proceedings were farcical, the ladies making little attempt to play the game seriously, and the other side took matters very easily. At half time the ladies led by two goals to one, but in the second half the gentlemen soon placed the score in their favour. As time went on the players seemed affected with the heat, and (with) the
game becoming even more life-less the spectators began to leave the field, the proceedings being enlivened only by the custodian on the ladies’ side administering smart punishment to one of a number of young fellows who began to throw things at the players. The game ended in a draw. If they return to Stirling, which is not likely, the attendance will not be so large as it was on Saturday.

It became more apparent that many in the footballing establishment and throughout Scottish society regarded the participation of women in football with contempt, deeming it to be nothing more than a novelty. The media’s role in this was to portray women’s football in a way that not only mirrored but also was influential in constructing public opinion. So widespread were these feelings within society that they led in 1902 to the Council of the Football Association warning its member clubs not to play charitable matches against “ladies teams” (Williamson, 1991: 5). This had implications in Scotland with the Council of the Scottish Football Association carrying out the warning with immediate effect. Although Williamson (1991: 6) acknowledges that this constituted a minor mention in the FA’s minute book, he suggests that it was only a hint of where their opinions lay in relation to the very act of women playing football. Similarly McCuaig (2000a: 1) suggests that the cultural, historical and masculine values of the game were severely threatened by the presence of women in football.

Little is know about the effect of this warning on the women’s game but what certainly is clear is that it could not prevent the dramatic surge in growth of the women’s game that occurred a decade later. A significant landmark contributing to the development of women’s football in Britain was the onset of the Great War. The combination of women being grafted into the workplace, the disintegration of stringent Victorian principles, the suspension of the men’s football league in England, and the
realisation that women’s football matches were a lucrative source of funds for war charities, all contributed to the development of women’s football.

In terms of the number of spectators attracted and the quantity, not necessarily quality, of attention received in the press, the period just after the First World War saw women’s football evolve to what has arguably been its peak. This is exemplified in England by the success of the factory team Dick, Kerr Ladies of Preston, who formed in 1917. Further, Williams (2003a: 31) suggests that:

The expansion of women’s football organised by workers after 1914, sometimes on the initiative of welfare supervisors, was more pronounced in Britain than anywhere else: teams included Cardiff, Llanelli, Newport and Swansea in Wales, Aberdeen, Edinburgh, Glasgow, Renfrew, Rutherglen in Scotland and Belfast, plus English sides like Bennets of London and Dick, Kerr’s of Lancashire.

Evidence of teams becoming established within munitions factories in Scotland is clearly presented by McCuaig (2000b: 7) who provides a comprehensive account of the activities of what she considers to have been ‘one of the more significant teams…formed from the workforce of Beardmore’s Forge in the East End of Glasgow’. McCuaig (2000b) claims that the women who made up this team were those who represented Scotland in the first ever women’s international match against England, although evidence presented earlier in this chapter suggests that a match between representative sides of the two countries had occurred previously in 1881. McCuaig (2000b: 8) suggests that the management pursued an active outdoor recreation policy and a work’s football team was established in September 1917. There were strong links between the football activities of the workforce and Celtic Football Club who ‘organised special training sessions at the Park for the Parkhead Forge hopefuls and allowed the team to
utilise the existing bath and changing facilities at the Club’ (McCuaig, 2000b: 8). In the absence of the male workforce during the First World War the local women were assisted to form a football team at the Forge in order to raise funds for war charities.

The Scotland V’s England international match, with the women from Beardmore Forge representing Scotland, was played at Celtic Park on 2nd March 1918. The work newsletter published both squad details prior to the match and also published an extensive match report following the game. As McCuaig (2000b: 8) points out ‘the match report detailed a fiercely contested occasion that raised £410 for charity’.

Although, by way of introduction the report offers some reference to the women’s attire, the remainder of the report offers a very detailed account of play, often comparing players’ skill to certain players in the men’s game. Despite a victory for England of four goals to nil, McCuaig (2000b: 10) expresses that the style of the report and the attendance at the game signify that women’s football had made some significant advances.

The estimated attendance at the game was 15,000, and outstanding figure when we consider that attendance figures at Celtic (away) and Rangers (home) fixtures on the same day were reported at 20,000 a piece. And the match report, although a bit twee by today’s standards is not really any different in tone from a similar account from a male fixture. It is apparent therefore that in this period at least, women’s football in Glasgow was as popular as the male game.

Evidence regarding the state of women’s football in Scotland in the early 1920s is somewhat contradictory. It is asserted by McCuaig (2000b: 10) that the game was expanding throughout the regions in Scotland. These developments enabled Scotland to
turn out a representative side for the first post-war international fixture between Scotland and England (represented by Dick, Kerrs) in 1920 and again for the return fixture at Celtic Park in March 1921 in front of 9000 spectators. The English side won both matches quite convincingly by 22-0 and 9-0 respectively. McCuaig (2000b: 10) reiterates the advances in the Scottish game when she suggests that:

Despite these setbacks women’s football in Scotland was flourishing. Following this second international, Dick Kerrs conducted a tour of Scotland that attracted huge support. They played five matches — in Edinburgh, Kilmarnock, Aberdeen, Dundee and Dumfries — and attracted a total of 70,000 spectators. The ‘Ladies’ tour of 1921 illustrates the strength of women’s football across the major towns and cities in Scotland.

Williamson (1991: 22) and Newsham (1997: 48) report that the matches in Glasgow and then Edinburgh were played on consecutive days in the March of 1921. In contrast to McCuaig’s (2000b) attendance figure of 9,000, the match at Celtic Park is thought by Williamson (1991) and Newsham (1997) to have attracted a crowd of 6,000 spectators. The subsequent tour of Scotland by Dick, Kerr’s did attract significant crowds and Newsham (1997: 48) provides details of the attendance figures and gate receipts at each match. The match in Edinburgh on 2nd March attracted 23,000 spectators and generated £700 in gate receipts. Little over a month later on 16th April in Kilmarnock there was a crowd of 15,000 contributing to £700 in gate receipts. Dick, Kerr’s next visit to Scotland involved matches on consecutive days on 10th September in Aberdeen, in front of 18,000 (gate receipts unknown) and on 11th of September in Dundee, which £300 raised from an 8,000 strong crowd. The final match in Scotland in Dumfries on 23rd October generated a crowd of 6,000 (gate receipts unknown).
Where McCuaig (2000b) interprets the popularity of these matches as representing a flourishing game in Scotland Williamson (1991: 23), on the other hand, suggests that the women's game suffered from a lack of organisation and slow growth. The war brought thousands of women into employment in Scotland. Amongst the most visible of the new female workforce were the 'clippies' on Glasgow's trams with their distinctive Black Watch tartan uniforms. The majority of the female workforce was put to work in the munitions industry producing a new involvement of women in the national effort (Lynch, 1992: 423 and 424). Although, as Williamson comments, the women of Glasgow participated in football as a distraction from the hardship and monotony associated with war work, it is suspected that the demand on the ladies resulted in no time for the forward planning required to enable the game to grow in a structured fashion. The interest in the ladies game had grown sufficiently to warrant the organisation of matches further afield, and on Christmas week in 1920 a match was organised between the ladies of Aberdeen and Belfast sponsored by the Ladies Clubs of the two cities (Williamson, 1991: 24). Other than this event however Williamson (1991: 24) suggests that teams drifted apart with the end of the war and to such an extent that by early 1921 Glasgow struggled to put a team of girls together to play Dick, Kerr Ladies at Celtic Park. What might be a possible explanation for this difference in opinion is that women's football may have been flourishing in comparison to ever before in Scotland, but possibly in a less structured fashion to the game south of the border.

Regardless of whether the game in Scotland was flourishing, the opportunity for Scottish players to gain recognition for their skills outside of their club and country was apparent. As part of a carnival arranged in aid of unemployed ex-servicemen, Liverpool
hospitals and the Variety Artistes’ Benevolent Fund on 14th February 1921, the directors of Liverpool Football Club gave permission for a ladies’ football match to be staged at Anfield. Dick, Kerr Ladies took on and defeated a team made up of the best players from the rest of Britain which included a Scottish centre-forward by the name of Riddell who scored the only goal for her team (Newsham, 1997: 45). While it is feasible to say that, although women’s football in Scotland experienced a period of growth during the late 19th and early 20th centuries, the nature of the development is not entirely clear. Evidence suggests that the development of women’s football in Scotland during this period did not strictly mirror the development in England. What is certain is that the onset of the First World War triggered an expansion of organised football for women, the foundations of which were laid during the late 19th century.

It might be in a tentative way possible to suggest that this period of growth in the women’s game is characterised by two distinct stages in respect of the participants, the nature of the game, and possibly the motivation attached to participation. The foundations laid in the late 19th century were very much the result of pioneering middle-class ladies. During this stage of growth the nature of the game was more typical of ‘healthy recreation’, being treated as a novelty and referred to as ‘ladies football’. The term ‘ladies football’ is significant for two reasons. First, the attachment of ‘ladies’ reflects that the term ‘football’ alone represents the game played by men. Men’s football is generally referred to simply as ‘football’, confirming the acceptance of men’s football practice as the standard. Second, the use of the term ‘ladies’ as opposed to ‘women’s’ relates to the nature of the game and its participants during this period. The term ‘ladies’ suggests that the participants essentially conformed to playing the game in a ladylike
manner, upholding existing expectations of how the female population (particularly the middle and upper classes) should behave in Victorian society. Hargreaves (1985: 50) suggests that ‘women’s participation in the traditionally all-male competitive sports was symbolic of her competition with men, and she faced harsh ridicule about their de-sexing characteristics. It was imperative, therefore, for women games players to be in every way “ladylike” in their behaviour both on and off the pitch’.

The second stage of growth triggered by the on-set of the First World War and a combination of associated factors resulted in an expansion of organised football, particularly for working-class women. Factory teams came to dominate the game and it essentially became more competitive motivated by the drive to raise funds for war charities. In his analysis of subcultural genesis Clark (1974: 439), after a review of the work of Cohen (1955) and Merton (1957), concludes that structural conditions are the ‘basic generating force with cultural traditions and historically specific circumstances acting as more precise determinants’. This theory can certainly be applied to consider the genesis of a subculture of women's football. If there is little evidence that the activities and interaction of women footballers prior to the Great War were sufficient to suggest that a subculture had emerged, the context in which the game developed among the working-class factory women suggests otherwise. The emergence of women’s football functioning to essentially raise money for war charities, but also to boost camaraderie and maintain fitness amongst the new female workforce, acted as a partial solution to historically specific structural conditions.

Despite a difference in opinions on whether women’s football in Scotland was flourishing or struggling in terms of organisation and structure, by 1921, with the
organisation of international and domestic matches attracting significant numbers of spectators, women's football had reached a height of popularity in both England and Scotland. Over the next 50 years women's football in both England and Scotland struggled to maintain this high profile and the respective governing bodies were instrumental in denying the women's game the chance to thrive.

The Years of Struggle 1921-1971

Relatively little is known about the women's game in Scotland between 1921 and the 1960's, and this might be explained by the events of 1921 that proved to have considerable consequences for the development of women's football throughout Britain. Despite the game's apparent popularity, there existed certain concerns that compelled the FA to take severe action, and the SFA followed suit. In a similar fashion to their ruling in 1902, the FA issued further warnings against its member clubs. The FA initially expressed concern regarding the misappropriation of funds raised at charity matches in October 1921. Later that same month the Council of the FA decided that affiliated clubs were required to obtain permission from the FA themselves before allowing matches between ladies' teams to be played on their grounds. The ease at which ladies teams and men's clubs organised fixtures had been reduced as 'what had grown into a good understanding between the organisers of ladies' charity games and member clubs of the Football Association was now under threat from those very same clubs' governing body' (Williamson, 1991: 65). These restrictive practices escalated to further jeopardise the organisation of women's football throughout Britain. The FA demonstrated their hostile attitude to women's football with the issuing of these
warnings finally culminating in the following resolution passed by the Association’s Consultative Committee on 5th December 1921 (Williamson, 1991: 69):

Complaints having been made as to football being played by women, Council feel impelled to express their strong opinion that the game of football is quite unsuitable for females and should not be encouraged. Complaints have also been made as to the conditions under which some of the matches have been arranged and played, and the appropriation of receipts to other than charitable objects. The Council are further of the opinion that an excessive proportion of the receipts are absorbed in expenses and an inadequate percentage devoted to charitable objects. For these reasons the Council requests the Clubs belonging to the Association refuse the use of their grounds for such matches.

Despite expressing concern regarding the misappropriation of receipts, the resolution does not state this matter immediately. It begins by asserting that the game of football is simply not suitable for women to participate in, an attitude which seems only to suggest that FA aimed to do its utmost to preserve the game of football as an exclusively male domain. We can deduce therefore that although the disintegration of Victorian principles contributed to the growth in the women’s game, these principles had not been fully eradicated from society, and were never so rife as within the structures of the governing body of football. The withdrawal of official backing, which was formalised by the FAs across Britain, effectively denied women’s teams access to the grounds, cut exposure of the game, and retarded its growth throughout Britain (McCuaig, 1997: 2).

There was immediate reference to, and general support of, this action in the Scottish press the following day. In a piece entitled “Measures to prevent women footballers” the Herald (6th December 1921) printed sections of the resolution. The following report in Scottish Sport (6th December 1921) focused on the support for the resolution based primarily on medical grounds.
“The football playing women: ‘A most unsuitable game’”

The action of the Football Association in passing a resolution regarding football clubs to refuse the use of their grounds for women footballers, as they considered the game unsuitable for females, would appear to have a good deal of support. Asked by a press representative to give her views on the subject, Dr Mary Scharlieb, the Harley Street physician, briefly replied:— “I consider it a most unsuitable game: too much for a woman’s physical frame.” Even among women generally, the playing of football by the sex is far from being popular. A proposal to form a football club for the women on the staff of Messrs Selfridges went before the Athletic Committee, but was rejected on the ground that not sufficient support could be found for it.

Mr Eustance Miles, discussing the subject with a representative of the press said:— “I consider football quite an inappropriate game for most women — especially if they have not been medically tested first... The trouble is that the type of woman who wants to play football won’t be medically examined yet. The kicking is too jerky a movement for women just as throwing is in contrast to bowling at cricket and the strain is likely to be rather severe as well though not perhaps more severe than in hockey. But just as the frame of a woman is more rounded than a man’s, her movements should be more rounded and less angular. I have had a lot of experience of cricket for women and girls, and I think the game is very good indeed so long as they don’t throw. I suppose in the same way wrestling would be more suitable than boxing”.

The use of these medical ‘facts’ to oppose the participation of women in football had featured persistently in the press since at least the 1890s. Little is known about the continuation of women’s football in Scotland after the resolution, suggesting that the SFA in line with the FA had, to some extent, succeeded in oppressing the women’s game. Williamson (1991: 77) reports on how the women footballers in England responded to the FA resolution. The teams of the Midlands and the North of England were seen as the driving force behind the formation of the English Ladies Football Association which held its first meeting in Blackburn on 10th December 1921 and attempted to take a hold of the running of the game (Williamson, 1991: 82). No such parallel response is reported for the women footballers of Scotland. McCuaig (1997: 2)
suggests that the women's game flourished in an independent capacity but there is little evidence available to support this claim. In fact Williamson (1991: 98) suggests that in England by 1922 'the ladies' game had slipped so far away from its original glory that it was scarcely recognisable...It had gone into a state of suspended animation from which it would make sporadic 'recoveries'.

This is supported by coverage in the press regarding women and football. The following excerpt on women's sport from the Herald (London Correspondence, 10th August 1922) suggests that it was due to the strenuous nature of the game that football became a less desirable activity for women.

A certain section of the medical opinion, as well as those who regard the problem from the point of view of morals, have had their belief confirmed by a committee set up by the College of Preceptors, that football as a game for women and girls is unsuitable. It does not however, require the efforts of doctors or moralists to enforce this, for the female footballers themselves are realising that the strenuousness of the game and the liability of the players to hard knocks and perhaps permanent injury makes it a less desirable pastime than it once appeared. Female football teams really originated in the days of the War and munitions girls and though it spread to other classes of womanhood there are signs its popularity is not only waning, but is threatened with extinction. This, at all events, is the position in London. Last year saw the decline beginning and it spread rapidly. A firm of caterers here whose employees ran quite a number of teams at one time, have now only one or two.

There are signs too, according to one who is alive to the fancies of the athletic girl that the interest lost to football is being transferred to hockey, which does not come under the ban of the expert committee.

Despite the fact that women had been keen footballers since the First World War, this excerpt seems to relate the fall in the participation of women in football exclusively to a sudden realisation by players that it is a strenuous sport. Although the recent restrictions placed on women's football coincide remarkably, the report fails to acknowledge the
effect of the resolution passed by the governing bodies as a likely explanation for the women's football being threatened with extinction. The second paragraph resigns women’s football to a thing of the past, suggesting that it emerged in a particular context that is no longer relevant. Although based on research on the subculture of delinquent boys, Cohen (1955, cited in Clarke, 1974: 436) suggests that subcultures that have emerged as a solution to the distinctive characteristics of structural location are likely to continue for as long as the structural problem persists. Women’s football was accommodated for as long as was necessary, with the emphasis being on the fund-raising functions it served. As Melling (1999: 59) identifies in her account of the role of ladies’ football during the 1921 miner’s lock-out in Wigan and Leigh, ‘from the First World War until 1921 women’s infiltration into male traditional spheres was endorsed as part of the war effort’. Further, Melling (1999: 59-60) suggests that from 1921 came ‘the development of a state agenda for a return to pre-war forms’ and ‘attacks from the media, educationalists, sections of the medical profession and the FA suggest that ladies’ football was high on this agenda’. With the charitable reasons for which the game was promoted becoming less relevant in the context of an improving structural location, the governing bodies were considered justified in imposing the ban by large sections of society.

It is useful to refer to Clarke (1974) to consider what the implications were for the subculture of women’s football. Clarke (1974) suggests that reactions to subcultures have consequences for their development. In particular he asserts that although strong negative reaction or strong positive reaction can lead to amplification and assimilation,
respectively, there are various stabilising positions. Clarke (1974: 437) states that these stabilised positions are:

...usually achieved by the sub-culture removing itself sufficiently far from contact with non-members to avoid providing an obvious target for public complaint or exploitation.

The subculture of women's football since the 1921 resolution could be considered as being in a stabilising position such as this, although the women who were involved in playing football had little control of their removal from contact with non-members. It might have been considered at the time that the game was threatened with extinction but the subculture of women's football was maintained to some extent, even if in a particularly residual state.

As previously mentioned little is known about women's football in Scotland after the 1921 resolution and during the remainder of the 1920s. What is evident, as the following meeting minutes suggest, is that the SFA demonstrated a persistent adherence to the ban.

Ladies' Football
Recommended – Aberdeen F.C. be informed: - this Association does not approve of clubs arranging or sponsoring or letting grounds for Ladies' football matches. (SFA Meeting minutes 23/1/24)

Ladies' Football (Item 49. Office-Bearers Met)
Intimated – Raith Rovers F.C. was informed: - this Association does not approve of clubs arranging, or sponsoring, or letting grounds for ladies' football matches. (SFA Meeting minutes 25/6/24)

Ladies' Football (Item 163. The Council Met)
Intimated - Queen of the South F. C. was informed: - this Association does not approve of clubs arranging of sponsoring or letting their grounds for ladies' football matches. (SFA Meeting minutes 11/3/25)
These minutes do suggest however that the attitude of individual clubs may well have been more sympathetic towards women's football. The fact that the SFA found it necessary to remind certain clubs of the position of the governing bodies and its affiliates on this matter suggests that the clubs might have been making some attempt to provide facilities for women's matches. The lack of evidence relating to women's matches during this decade and the obstinate position of the SFA suggest that attempts to organise women's matches, at least by affiliated men's clubs, were unsuccessful. There is some evidence of women's football teams in existence throughout the 1920s however. One such example is Caley Ladies FC of Inverness of which photographs, but no reference in the text, appear in a history of Inverness Caledonian FC (c. 1926, Ruth Shuttleworth Collection, SFM).

There is evidence of several events during the 1930s suggesting that the game maintained a degree of public interest. In 1936 a match between Dick, Kerr Ladies and the Rest of Britain was played as part of a carnival on 13th June at Squires Gate in Blackpool. Two Scottish footballers, Miss McNeil and Miss McMonin, achieved special acclamation for their skills and were invited to play in this prestigious match (McCuaig, 2000a: 2). In relation to prominent teams however, it seems to have been Edinburgh Ladies who were in ascendancy in Scotland. As McCuaig (2000b: 13) suggests, since their establishment in May 1937 the Edinburgh team became a dominant force.

Indeed, after only four months their match record was unprecedented — played 20, won 18, lost 1, drawn 1, one game including a recent victory over the team who had beaten them. Significantly, the team averaged a consistent gate of 5000 at a time when supporter levels were declining in general under the strain of the economic depression of the 1930s.
It is not specified where these matches were played in order to accommodate such a healthy attendance, but since the SFA were so persistent in adhering to the 1921 ban it is unlikely that they played at the ground of a club affiliated to the SFA.

The exploits of Edinburgh Ladies that generated the most attention resulted from their dispute of the Dick, Kerr Ladies' assumed right to call themselves the champions of the world. Mrs Proctor, secretary of the Scottish team, had seen official headed paper of Dick, Kerr Ladies claiming that they were the "Champions of the World" (Newsham, 1997: 84). In a challenging fashion the Edinburgh team pointed out that Dick, Kerrs could not claim such a title when they had not yet played the most successful team in Scotland. It is asserted that the health of the women's game was demonstrated, when Dick, Kerr Ladies took on Edinburgh Ladies in a match billed as "The Championship of Great Britain and The World" in 1937 (McCuaig, 2000a: 2). The profile of the game was expected to attract a significant crowd but, despite both teams being used to average gates of 5,000, the match at Squires Gate in Blackpool only attracted 1,000 spectators. The English side were winners by five goals to one, with the Edinburgh goal scored by Frances MacDonald (Newsham, 1997: 86). The following year saw the Edinburgh side defeat Dick, Kerr Ladies on Scottish soil. The Scottish centre-forward Nancy "Cannonball" Thomson scored a hat-trick in the match and was subsequently "poached" by the Lancashire side in 1939 for whom she was to continue playing for 12 years (McCuaig, 1997: 2). There is again some inconsistency in the research regarding the name of the Edinburgh team. Although most reports refer to Edinburgh Ladies, Williams (2003a: 50) suggests that the team that Nancy Thomson had played for throughout the 1930s were in fact named Edinburgh City Girls.
The game seems to have continued in a relatively underground fashion throughout the 1940s and 1950s. One event of note was in the form of a match sponsored by the Lady Provost’s Fund for the Queen’s Nurses between Bolton Ladies and Edinburgh Ladies, which attracted a crowd of 25,000 spectators (Williamson, 1991: 99). Where this match took place is not known but it remained in line with the traditional purpose of women’s football matches in that it served a charitable function. It is suggested by McCuaig (2000b: 14) that:

Women remained committed to playing the game in Scotland and their determination is magnified both in the support and success the game generated, which continued throughout the 1940s, 1950s and 1960s, and is evident in the expansion of international games in this period.

However, the women struggled to reach anything like the heights of popularity they received during the years after the First World War. It is also worth noting the continuing adherence to the 1921 resolution displayed by the SFA, as the following meeting minutes illustrate:

Ladies’ Football (Item 40. Executive and General Purposes Committee)
On attention being drawn to the fact that in certain areas ladies’ football is being permitted on grounds of clubs within the jurisdiction of this Association, the Secretary was instructed to re-iterate the previous decision of the Association that such matches cannot be permitted or in any way encouraged. (SFA Meeting minutes 14/9/49)

It is developments from the 1960s that tend to feature more prominently within research on women’s football. The 1960s saw several developments that set the foundations for the new age of women’s football throughout Britain. The most notable was the formation of the Women’s Football Association (WFA) in England in 1962. There is
also reference to a number of Scottish work teams who were playing, many of which might well have been formed, during the 1960s. Williams (2003a: 37) identifies that the names of Scottish teams were fairly creative and tended to relate to the name of the workplace.

The names combined representative and works titles, including the Cambuslang Hooverettes, Johnstone Red Rockets, Johnie Walker and Fife Dynamites, Holyrood Bumbees, Tayside Toppers, Aberdeen Prima Donnas and the Glasgow Gay Eleven (based at the Gay’s biscuit factory).

Another team to emerge as a successful outfit was Stewarton and Thistle from Kilmarnock who formed in 1961 and achieved success throughout the 1970s. The team was formed at the request of the Provost in order to raise funds for the Freedom from Hunger Campaign (Lopez, 1997: 76). Two players who were to have particular success and involvement in women’s football emerged from the Kilmarnock team. The future secretary of the SWFA, Elsie Cook, was the captain of Stewarton and Thistle and one of their most able players, Rose Reilly, was to have a very colourful football career. Both players took the opportunity to play professionally in Italy during the early 1970s (Lopez, 1997: 76).

The staging and success of England in the men’s 1966 World Cup is thought to have provided a stimulus for the participation of more women in the sport, and it is likely that this spread north of the border. In 1968 Scotland’s first organised league started in Glasgow. This league accommodated the Scottish champions Cambuslang Hooverettes who made a name for themselves south of the border through their participation in the Deal International Tournament. The tournament was organised in
1967 by a carpenter by the name of Arthur Hobbs, who worked at the Deal Council offices in Kent, with the aim of helping to develop the women’s game to a higher level (Lopez, 1997: 40). In 1970 Cambuslang Hooverettes progressed to the final to face Southampton Saints, but eventually lost on penalties. The shape of the game in Scotland looked to have improved throughout the late 1960s with the Scottish champions establishing themselves as competition for the best teams in England.

Concern was expressed in 1967 as to the promotion of an alternative tournament for women’s football. The tournament for English and Scottish women’s football teams emerged in what must be one of the most unexpected fashions. As Williams (2003a: 39) reports, a contestant on ‘Opportunity Knocks’ in 1967 challenged Hughie Green (presenter of the TV show) to see the Scottish women footballers in action and he duly responded. The games received support from national newspapers (the Daily Mirror in England and the Daily Record in Scotland) and attracted respectable crowds. The tournament, which became known as the ‘Butlins’ Games’, offered £300 in prize money and attracted crowds of 5000 spectators (Williams, 2003a: 39). The following quote from Green, in response to a number of critics, emphasises that the games were taken seriously:

These women are terrific. We’ve had some tremendous games since it all started. If they don’t want the kind of publicity and the big attendances and great games we’ve been giving all over the country I couldn’t care less. Our girls have played hard; they deserve all the encouragement we can give them. (c. June 1969, Margaret Rae Collection, SFA Museum, cited in Williams, 2003a: 39)

Williams (2003a: 39) points out that the critics of the Butlins’ Games were generally members of the WFA in England who even considered imposing a ban on affiliated
teams who took part. The response of the SFA is not known, neither is the extent to which the games were continued in consecutive years.

The New Age of Women’s Football in Scotland from 1971

Research on the development of women’s football, especially that focusing on England, considers 1971, the year when the FA eventually rescinded the 1921 resolution under pressure from UEFA, to represent an important trigger for the new age of women’s football. What is often not detailed is that the attitude of the SFA towards women’s football continued to have a restrictive impact during the early years of the 1970s. In fact, despite pressure from UEFA as early as 1970, official recognition to women’s football was not granted by the SFA until 1974. It is identified by Lopez (1997: 59) that:

It was UEFA’s reaction to the growth of women’s football in Italy, and their concern at the success of the unofficial world cups organised by FIEFF, in Italy in 1970 and Mexico in 1971, that led to women’s football coming under the respective national governing bodies’ umbrellas.

The following minutes show how the SFA responded to UEFA’s initial correspondence regarding national governing bodies giving official recognition to women’s football:

Women’s Football
There was submitted correspondence with UEFA, who enquired as to Association’s attitude towards women’s football, and with the Women’s Football Association, who sought recognition, in Scotland. The committee were unanimous in their refusal. (SFA Meeting minutes 7/9/70)
Women's Football (Item 76, E. & G. P. Committee).
There was submitted a letter from the Women's Football Association, requesting reconsideration of the Association's attitude towards women's football.
The committee adhered to their original decision. (SFA Meeting minutes 11/11/70)

Women's Football (Item 153. Executive and General Purposes Committee)
The contents of a letter received from UEFA were noted. (SFA Meeting minutes 15/12/70)

Although these minutes refer to the Women's Football Association (Scottish) evidence suggests that it was not until the following year that the SWFA officially formed. It is clear from the minutes that the SFA was completely opposed to giving any official recognition to women's football. In particular, the final minute of 15th December 1970 suggests that although the contents of a letter from UEFA were noted they were not discussed.

In 1971, UEFA passed a motion which ended in a vote of 39-1, in favour of member countries taking control of women's football (Scotland was the odd one out) and this became an official UEFA recommendation by November of that year.

The fact that the SFA were the only country to vote against member countries taking control of women's football only emphasised their opposition to the association of women with football. In contrast to governing bodies in other European countries the SFA took UEFA's motion as only a recommendation and remained committed to their long-standing attitude towards women's football for several more years.

The beginning of the 1970s did however see some positive developments indicative of a new age of women's football in Scotland regardless of the SFA's
In 1971 Scotland saw the formation of the SWFA, of which Elsie Cook was the first secretary. As Elsie Cook recollects:

...in the early seventies came the inauguration of our very own SWFA with, as far as I can remember, six teams, Aberdeen, Edinburgh Dynamos, Westthorn Utd, Motherwell AEI, Dundee Strikers and Stewarton Thistle. I was Honorary Secretary from 1971-1973 until I took over as manager of the Scottish International side (Elsie Cook, 2000 courtesy of Jean Williams).

In 1972 the first official Scotland versus England international match was played at Ravenscraig Stadium at Greenock. Although the Scotland side lost, the result of 2 goals to 3 suggests that the standard of football in Scotland was similar to that played in England. In order to comply with the now 50-year old resolution the Ravenscraig Stadium at Greenock was used since it was a non-SFA venue. Elsie Cook also points out that 'the officials at the match were provided by the Scottish Football Referees Association as opposed to the SFA' (Elsie Cook, 2000 courtesy of Jean Williams). In 1972 Lees Ladies (formerly Stewarton & Thistle) reached the final of the WFA Cup in England. The following year another Scottish team, Westthorn United, made it to the final of the WFA Cup. Westthorn had fielded two of Scotland’s most renowned players in Elsie Cook and Rose Reilly who had both featured in previous WFA Cup matches. Despite these successes the general lack of progress in the game in Scotland became apparent when the two players left in 1973 to achieve success as professional footballers in Italy. Rose Reilly eventually took up Italian nationality and played 20 times for the national side (Lopez, 1997: 48).
Although it is not clear what it contained, the SFA received further correspondence from UEFA regarding women’s football in 1973. Again, the meeting minutes do not offer much by way of evidence that the contents of the letter were discussed in any detail.

Women’s Football (Item 319. Executive and General Purposes Committee)  
A letter from UEFA was noted. (SFA Meeting minutes 9/5/73)

It is feasible to suggest that the letter contained further recommendations by UEFA that the SFA offer official recognition to women’s football. Even if this was the case it took over a year from this correspondence before the SFA reluctantly met the recommendations. The following minutes of August 1974 illustrate that after almost 53 years of overt opposition the SFA eventually decided to give recognition to the women’s game.

Women’s Football (Item 70. Executive and General Purposes Committee)  
It was agreed to give recognition to women’s football. (SFA Meeting minutes 29/8/74)

This decision was followed by official correspondence from the Secretary of the SFA to the Secretary of the SWFA, Mr. Robert Hall on 2nd September requesting that ‘in the circumstances, I would appreciate your sending me a copy of your Constitution and Rules for inspection’ (c. September 1974, SFM Collection). Shortly after the official recognition of the women’s game the first women’s match to be played at the ground of an SFA affiliated club was played between the Scottish Ladies’ International side and a Scottish Select side at Celtic Park in September 1974. The match was played, as McCuaig (2000b: 14) describes, ‘in recognition of the decision to endorse women’s
football' and was intended as a 'curtain-raiser' to the European Cup First Round first leg tie against T. P. S. Turka'.

Despite the official recognition given in 1974 seeming to represent a positive development for the women's game there were numerous teething problems. The most explicit example occurred in 1975 when two of Scotland's most successful players received a lifetime ban. Both Rose Reilly and Edna Neillis had been playing professionally in Europe and as Williams (2003a: 40) explains this experience 'led them to suggest that the Women's Scottish FA choice of manager in 1975, a poorly qualified amateur male, was not the ideal solution'. In response the players spoke to the press about the decision and were instantly disciplined by the SWFA, along with former official Elsie Cook who also spoke out and subsequently had her honorary membership of the association withdrawn. The suspended players led a protest march in Glasgow against the managerial appointment and the suspension. A meeting of all secretaries of teams throughout the country was arranged by the SWFA in order to discuss the problems that existed within the association. Although there is little detail there is evidence of another international player receiving a lifetime ban for different reasons that may well shed some light on the stringent punishment delivered to Edna Neillis and Rose Reilly. Former Edinburgh Dynamo and Scotland International player Maggie Wilson was sine die in 1976 because she turned professional and went to play in Italy. The SWFA apparently confirmed that she should only play as an amateur. Reflecting on the ban Maggie Wilson suggests that the association was in its infancy and it took a year for the ban to be lifted (June 2000, Ruth Shuttleworth Collection, SFM). It is not clear how long the bans on Edna Neillis and Rose Reilly were in place but their names did not

There is evidence that the game was expanding in terms of the organisation of international fixtures and the number of teams producing players of an international standard. For example, the Scotland squad for the Pony Home International Championship of May 1976 represented seven different teams across Scotland including Edinburgh Dynamo, Motherwell AEI, Westthorn United, East Fife Ladies, West End Ladies, Dundee Strikers and Lochend Thistle. The following SFA minutes also suggest that international fixtures were a fairly regular occurrence.

Women’s Football (Item 55. Executive and General Purposes Committee)
It was intimated that, subject to the approval of The F.A. of Ireland, the Scottish Women’s Football Association had been given permission to play the Ladies’ Football Association of Ireland, at Grangemouth on 4th July, 1976. (SFA Meeting minutes 24/6/76)

Women’s Football (Item 145. Executive and General Purposes Committee)
It was intimated that, subject to the approval of The F.A. of Wales, the Scottish Women’s Football Association had been given permission to play the Ladies Football Association of Wales, in Wales, on 26th September, 1976. (SFA Meeting minutes 30/9/76)

Using the achievements of the national team as an indicator would suggest that throughout the 1980s and 1990s, the women’s game in Scotland seems to have been at a lower standard to that south of the border. Since the inaugural international between England and Scotland in 1972, the teams met in friendly matches and European Championship Qualifying games, but by the 1992-93 European Championships Scotland had lost all of their 11 encounters with England. The Scottish national side had relatively
disappointing experiences in the European Championships throughout the 1990s never progressing further than the qualifying group stage.

Since their formation in 1971 the organisation of women's football in Scotland has been the responsibility of the SWFA. Lopez (1997) concedes that as the only women's association not officially affiliated to their men's FA, development under the SWFA has been slow. Several appointments have been made over the last 12 years in an attempt to strengthen the organisation. The Scottish Sports Council as part of the wider Team Sport Scotland initiative of 1991 appointed Sheila Begbie as Women's Football Co-ordinator, her role was to develop girls' and women's football in conjunction with the SFA. Team Sport Scotland introduced several Team Sport Co-ordinators' posts at this time. In 1992 one of the first joint initiatives between 'Team Sport Scotland', the SFA and the SWFA was to hold the 'Heading for the Future' conference. The conference considered the future of women's football in Scotland, with the aim of learning how the game was being developed in the USA, Norway and England (Lopez, 1997: 155-156). Shortly after the appointment the SFA invited Sheila Begbie and the SWFA to be housed within their office headquarters (Lopez, 1997: 156). The SWFA became a National Affiliated Association of the SFA in 1998, has recently been renamed Scottish Women's Football Ltd and is currently housed at Hampden Park. SWF executive administrator Maureen McGonigle occupies a seat on the SFA Council. SWF and their committee work closely with the SFA, which provides support and financial backing.

The SWFL was formed in November 1999 and today accommodates 3 divisions. The beginning of the 2002/2003 season saw the previous Premier Division of the SWFL
break away to become the Scottish Women’s Premier League. Maureen McGonigle explains that this change was administered in the hope that ‘by highlighting the country’s top-12 women’s teams, those who can help the game progress may, at last, sit up and notice’ (Mawhinney, 2002: 13). The remaining 30 teams continue to play in the three divisions of the SWFL. Several women’s teams are currently run through existing men’s clubs including Ayr United, Falkirk, Kilmarnock, Hibernian, and Hearts. It is Ross County however who have displayed the most forward thinking in recent years in relation to women’s football. In 2001 they became the first team to employ female apprentice professional footballers through an apprentice scheme launched and funded by the SFA (Mawhinney, 2002). There are also development centres open to under 18s and youth leagues are run throughout the country (Pearson, 2003).

In terms of media coverage the SWFL have an Information Officer responsible for press and media coverage. The SWF Ltd launched an official magazine named “Miss-Kick”, devoted to women’s football in Scotland, in May 2001. Miss-Kick is circulated by subscription, and is also sold at the club shops of some men’s football clubs, such as Ayr United, which have affiliated women’s teams. The women’s game has received positive press and media coverage recently particularly in relation to their success in breaking into the top 20 countries in Europe in 2002. Technical Director for the national squad, Vera Pauw has been commended for her work in recent years. In October 2003 Scotland’s women’s team were placed 30th in the FIFA World Rankings and the squad is now competing for a place in the Euro 2005 Championship in England.

One particular concern in Scotland is how much further Scottish women’s football can be taken without more investment. The possibility for talented players to
pursue a professional career overseas is illustrative of Scotland remaining a few steps behind other nations. In relation to players pursuing opportunities overseas Maureen McGonigle stresses:

That is because Scotland is not offering them anything and it's about time they did. They want to keep their talent here, be proud of their talent. But they need the support and they need people to put their money where their mouth is. (Maureen McGonigle, cited in Pearson, 2003: 12)

In a similar fashion to the early 1970s there is a handful of Scottish players developing their potential in more professional structures around the world. Despite the recent collapse of the fully professional WUSA league in the United States making her future uncertain, Scotland striker Julie Fleeting has been playing professionally with San Diego Spirit and may return there next year (Pearson, 2003). Other Scottish players have pursued careers overseas including Iceland (where a number of players play professionally during the Scottish closed season), Germany and England. Transformations towards the professionalisation of the women's game in other countries will undoubtedly have an impact on the scene in Scotland, the extent of which remains to be seen.

Conclusion

A number of questions have been at the heart of this initial analysis of the development of women's football. How has women's football developed in Scotland? How and to what extent have wider social, political, and economic processes in Scotland influenced the development of the sport? What have been the underlying social attitudes
towards women and sport in Scottish society? And what role have institutions such as the SFA and the media played in contributing to the development of women's football in Scotland? The association of women playing football in Scotland may well have a longer history than originally thought. This chapter has provided evidence to suggest that the origins of women's football can be found in seventeenth century Scotland. The most significant stage in the growth of the women's game however occurred during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. In particular, the spread of a network of women's teams during and after the First World War adds weight to the suggestion that a subculture of women's football had emerged. To some extent the genesis of the subculture can be related to a solution to wider structural problems.

In considering the extent to which wider social, economic, and political processes in Scotland influenced the development of women's football it is particularly useful to draw on Donnelly's (1993) discussion of resilience and transformation of sports subcultures. An underlying theme throughout this chapter has been the extent to which, throughout its development, women's football has been transformed and incorporated into the dominant sports culture in Scotland. The dominant sport culture in Scotland is overwhelmingly male and arguably football dominated. Although women are thought to have been involved in forms of folk football, the culture of football that developed in Scotland throughout the nineteenth century did not incorporate women. Donnelly (1993: 123) considers that there are continual challenges to the dominant culture that must be answered or accommodated. These challenges often come in the form of residual and emergent sport subcultures and Donnelly (1993: 123) discusses them in terms of the resilience and transformation of sport subcultures.
During and after the First World War women’s football developed in conformity to the dominant sport / football culture in Scotland. It was accommodated and incorporated to some extent but since it served a charitable function the game did not represent a serious threat to the dominant sports culture. Donnelly (1993: 124) explains that resilience refers to:

...instances of sport subcultures where the form and the meanings and ways of the sport have survived to become anachronistic and possibly oppositional to the dominant sport culture. In other words, the sports began in conformity but did not change as the dominant sport culture changed, and they became aspects of residual culture.

When the context for which women’s football was incorporated became no longer relevant it was considered to pose a potential threat to the dominant football culture. Pre-war arguments regarding the association of women with football, generally based on medical opinion, re-emerged in opposition to women’s football and were disseminated through the press. It is suggested by Clarke (1974: 437) that ‘images in terms of which the subculture is transmitted to a wider public either by word of mouth or through the mass media play an important part in the reaction process’ (Clarke, 1974). It has been illustrated throughout this chapter how reaction processes have been particularly relevant throughout the genesis and maintenance of subculture of women’s football in Scotland. The SFA had, and used effectively, the control and power to suppress women’s football and force it to become a residual in nature. The ban of 1921 through to 1974 represented the SFA’s answer to this challenge. However the sport survived despite ‘an extended period of criticism and marginalisation’ (Donnelly, 1993: 128). The period from 1974 to 1998 involved a gradual transformation of women’s football. As
Donnelly (1993: 129) found for both rugby and boxing, there was a gradual transformation of women's football toward the dominant sport culture. Although it had been residual in nature it gradually became incorporated. The affiliation of the SWFA to the SFA in 1998 and recent attempts to develop forms of professionalism in the sport are representative of this incorporation.

While this chapter has not claimed to be exhaustive it has nonetheless provided one of the first accounts of the development of women's football in Scotland and in that sense it is original. Even at this incipient stage the historical research has been capable of raising, and providing answers to, a number of fundamental questions. It is illustrative of the fact that women's football in Scotland and the way in which it has developed has in part been shaped by the particular Scottish context. Donnelly (1993: 134) explains that when examining the transformations of various sport subcultures 'both the form (text) of the activity and its cultural meaning (context) have to be taken into account' and 'it is this question of context, together with the dynamic nature of culture, that is crucial to the better understanding or resilience and transformation in sport subcultures'. By examining the development of women's football within the wider context this chapter has not only led to an understanding of resilience and transformation in the subculture of women's football, but has also provided an essential historical context in which to interpret the subculture of women's football in contemporary Scottish society.
CHAPTER FOUR – A SOCIO-DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE OF WOMEN FOOTBALLERS IN SCOTLAND

Introduction

The question at the heart of this chapter is; who participates in women’s football in Scotland? A socio-demographic profile of women footballers is presented and provides a background in order to contextualise and understand fully issues raised in the remainder of the thesis. The interpretive paradigm is inclusive in the sense that, if necessary, both qualitative and quantitative research methods can be adopted. The multi-methodological element packaged into the theoretical framework is illustrative of this inclusiveness in relation to research methods. Douglas (1976: 14) advocated the use of a number of research methods that sociologists deem necessary in order to enhance their work and not be limited by any particular rigid theoretical framework. Since little is known about women footballers in Scotland, the construction of a socio-demographic profile using quantitative research methods is a crucial step towards an interpretation of the subculture. The profile will stand alone as a useful piece of research, and will further be used to substantiate and qualify later findings from in-depth interviews.

In relation to the multi-methodological element of the theoretical framework, this chapter also draws on the other overlapping elements in various ways. There is an underlying investigative element in that details of player’s private lives are used to construct the socio-demographic profile. In a quest to distinguish what characteristics make women footballers in Scotland a distinct social group, comparisons are made to a
range of statistics. Where possible data from the sample of women footballers are analysed in comparison to; statistics on women in Scotland, the Scottish adult population, sport in Scotland, women and sport in Scotland, and findings from other research on women’s football.

In terms of a critical element this chapter aims to explore some preconceptions about women’s football. For example, previous research has suggested that women’s football is played predominantly by young, single, working class women. The extent to which women footballers in Scotland are representative of findings from previous research needs to be explored. Further, the analysis has to be critical by being sensitive to the methods by which socio-demographic profiles are constructed. For example, there are various ways of attempting to distinguish a player’s social class. This profile is sceptical of certain indicators of social class and offers an analysis based on a consideration of a number of indicators.

With regard to the historiographic element adopted in this framework, the construction of a socio-demographic profile is useful and has the potential to inform the overall analysis. Using the sample of football players enables us to account for any change in the socio-demographic characteristics of women footballers. Since the ages of players in the survey sample range from 18 to 45 years it is possible to account for changes in such characteristics over almost 30 years, albeit with some limitations, namely the lower number of players representative of older age groups.

Survey of Women Footballers

This chapter of the thesis introduces the use of quantitative research techniques (survey) to construct the socio-demographic profile of women footballers in Scotland.
Women’s football in Scotland is currently organised into 4 senior divisions, the SWPL, First Division, Second Division, and Third Division. The SWFL was re-organised for the 2002/2003 season to incorporate the SWPL, previously known as the Premier Division. At present there are 12 teams in the SWPL, 12 in the First Division, 10 in the Second Division, and 8 in the Third Division. The information presented here is taken from a survey of women footballers that was administered during February 2002. The survey was administered during the 2001/2002 season and the organisation of the SWFL has since undergone some changes in terms of changes in teams, promotions, relegations, changed names, disbanded teams. Surveys were distributed to secretaries of all clubs at an SWFL Council meeting on February 9th 2002. At this time there were 41 clubs throughout the four senior divisions, consisting of 12 clubs in the Premier Division, 12 in the First Division, 9 in the Second Division, and 8 in the Third Division (see Appendix One for details of clubs). The survey was extensive and was designed to gain both quantitative and qualitative data in order to inform sufficiently the wider research project. The survey was based around several themes which made up different sections: Section 1 - Personal and Family Details; Section 2 - Education and Occupation Details; Section 3 - Sporting Biography; Section 4 - Introduction to and Experience of Football; Section 5 – Perspectives on Women’s Football; Section 6A – Being a Member of a Football Club; Section 6B – Optional; and Section 7 – Football Aspirations and Involvement (see Appendix Two). For the chapter at hand, the focus is on several sections of the survey that relate to socio-demographic characteristics.
**Response Rate**

Details of the completion rates of the survey for each division appear in Figure 4.1.

![Figure 4.1 - Response rates to survey by each division](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Division</th>
<th>No. of clubs respondents</th>
<th>No. of clubs who responded</th>
<th>Response rate (%)</th>
<th>Total no. of surveys administered</th>
<th>Total no. of surveys returned</th>
<th>Response rate (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Premier</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>615</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N.B. All figures throughout this chapter are adjusted to 0 decimal places.

It can be seen from Figure 4.1 that a total of 144 surveys were returned, a response rate of 23%. The surveys returned were generally completed in their entirety. Many were thoroughly completed providing valuable qualitative data. There was also a convenient and consistent response spread across 4 divisions ensuring a representative cross-ability sample for analysis.

Although 54% of clubs responded in total, suggesting a relatively high response rate, the actual number of surveys returned reflects a lower response rate of 23%.

Several possible reasons for this have been identified. The first reason is that all administration was done through club secretaries for practical reasons, however this resulted in an additional link in the chain and a more direct way of addressing players may have lead to a higher response rate. The second reason relates to the nature of the survey itself. The survey was extensive in order to cover as many issues as possible. One of the main objectives of the survey was to provide a combination of both quantitative and qualitative data for analysis, with an emphasis on obtaining a high quality over a
high quantity of data. The extensive nature of the survey may have been a factor in deterring some players from participating. Despite this players were encouraged to take the survey away to complete in their own time and the surveys that were returned suggest they were completed attentively. Although the actual response rate was relatively low a sufficient quantity and more importantly a valuable combination of quantitative and qualitative data was obtained.

Age

It was decided that the survey would only be distributed to players aged 18 years and above. This decision was for ethical reasons due to the inclusion of two optional questions relating to the issue of sexuality in women’s football. It was also decided to make these questions optional, firstly in order to acknowledge their potentially sensitive nature and secondly, to prevent players feeling pressured into answering these questions and deterring them from completing the survey. Since these questions were included more out of interest than as a primary focus it was deemed that making them optional was the best approach. Given that the survey was only distributed to players aged 18 years and above a proportion of current senior women footballers below the age of 18 years were excluded from the potential sample. Consultation of the SWF Ltd database of registered players for 2001/2002 (see Appendix Three) enables us to account for the proportion of players who are actually excluded. Out of 786 registered players, 652 were eligible to complete the survey i.e. they were 18 years or above on 9th February 2002 when the survey was distributed, therefore 134 players (17%) were excluded from the potential sample. In terms of future research, girl’s football in Scotland is an area worthy of exclusive attention. The development of the sport at youth level is a significant
contributory factor to the rate of growth in participation. Although concentration on
girl’s football is out-with the scope of this thesis, it is acknowledged as an important
future research area.

Comparative Figures

For the purpose of this chapter comparative figures in relation to age, marital
status, education and social class indicators, have been obtained from several sources
(Hope, Braunholtz, Playfair, Dudleston, Ingram, Martin and Sawyer, 2000; Central
Statistics Unit, 2001; sportscotland, 2001; Walker, Maher, Coulthard, Goddard and
Thomas, 2001; Hope, Martin and Dudleston, 2003). There are some limitations
associated with the use of these figures. The first limitation concerns the availability of
data by sex. Although using data for the female population may be more appropriate it is
not necessarily available. For comparative purposes therefore figures for the adult
population overall are used in some cases. Similarly there exists a limitation related to
the availability of data for Scotland. Where possible comparisons are made to Scottish
national figures, but in some cases only figures for Great Britain have been obtained.

In terms of social class indicators, the technique of using occupations to
distinguish social class is relatively crude but is considered to be the most suitable
indicator based on the data obtained from the survey. In several cases comparative
figures have used slightly different categorisations of social class and these have been
adjusted as precisely and logically as possible for comparative purposes. Finally,
comparative figures on most socio-demographic characteristics account for an adult or
female adult population, which also includes those over the age of 45 years. The survey
sample however does not include anyone over this age, and attempts have been made in
the analysis to account for this difference in age composition. With these limitations in mind comparative figures can be utilised to offer a more informed analysis and allow us to locate the survey data in a wider context.

Geographical Representation of the Sample

In terms of geographical representation it is useful to consider firstly whether the clubs who returned surveys are geographically representative of the distribution of clubs in Scotland. Secondly it is also necessary to acknowledge that clubs returned varying numbers of surveys. It is therefore useful to consider not only the geographical location of clubs who returned surveys, but also the percentage of surveys returned from clubs within each region. By displaying both of these sets of figures Figure 4.2 offers an indication of whether the sample is geographically representative.

![Figure 4.2 - Geographical distribution of clubs and representation of sample](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FRC*</th>
<th>Grampian</th>
<th>Tayside</th>
<th>Strathclyde</th>
<th>Central</th>
<th>Lothian</th>
<th>Fife</th>
<th>Borders</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Actual % **</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Club %***</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Player %****</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Former Regional Council area. ** Percentage of clubs located in these regions. *** Percentage of clubs in the sample (i.e. who returned surveys) in these regions. **** Percentage of players in the sample from clubs in these regions.

In terms of the clubs who returned surveys, when compared with the actual geographical distribution of clubs, the sample includes an over-representation of clubs from some regions and an under-representation of clubs from others. Compared with the actual distribution of clubs, Grampian, Tayside, Central and Fife regions were over-represented by the percentage of clubs who returned surveys. In contrast, Strathclyde, Lothian, and Borders regions were under-represented by the percentage of clubs who returned surveys. Despite this, some clubs returned a relatively high number of surveys.
and others relatively few. The most important comparison to make therefore is between the actual distribution of clubs and the percentage of returned surveys from each region. In terms of returned surveys Figure 4.2 shows that Grampian, Central and Fife regions are particularly over-represented in the sample (for example, 29% of the sample were from clubs in the Grampian region which accommodates only 18% of clubs). Tayside, Strathclyde, Lothian and Borders regions are under-represented in the sample. In summary it can be suggested that the sample is not fully representative of the geographical distribution of clubs, and it is important to acknowledge this factor in analysis.

Ethnic Group

A further limitation is the omission of a question regarding ethnic group in the survey. The survey obtained data regarding players' country of birth, but no further details in terms of players' race or ethnic group was acquired. This was simply an error made during the survey design that went unnoticed and was therefore not resolved by the time the surveys were administered. A player's ethnic group is a socio-demographic characteristic that may influence their experience of participating in football, and the omission in the survey is a potential limitation for this interpretive analysis. Further, recognising the ethnic groups that players belong to, and comparing the findings to national statistics would have revealed any under- or overrepresentation of certain ethnic groups participating in women's football. Such findings could have policy implications for women's football in Scotland. For these reasons, the neglect of attention to ethnic group in the survey is recognised as a limitation of this study. Issues regarding women,
ethnicity, football, and women’s football in Scotland have the potential to form the basis of a future research project.

Area of Residence

As with ethnic group, the survey unintentionally omitted a question regarding area of residence. It is possible to compensate for this omission by using two possible indicators of area of residence. The survey obtained data for both area of football club and area of secondary school attended by players that can be used to offer some indication of area of residence. Although the region of the club or secondary school is not an exact indication of area of residence, the Former Regional Council (FRC) area definitions used encompass relatively large areas and should allow for any slight differences between actual area of residence and region of club or secondary school. It does need to be acknowledged though that some player’s area of residence may fall in a different region to their football club. Also, this method does not account for change in area of residence between attendance at secondary school and the present, it assumes that players have remained in the same area of residence. It is however possible to analyse the data to determine to what extent this is the case. The socio-demographic profile of women footballers in Scotland is organised around the following sections: (1) personal characteristics, (2) education, (3) social class, (4) occupational status, and (5) sporting biography.

Personal Characteristics

Age Group

By consulting the SWF Ltd database (Appendix Three) it is possible to consider the overall age composition of women footballers in Scotland, although data relating to
all other socio-demographic characteristics is taken from the survey sample and therefore excludes players under the age of 18 years. Figure 4.3 shows the age composition of registered women footballers in Scotland for the season 2001/2002, when 770 players were registered in the SWFL, and offers a comparison to national figures.

It can be seen that, in comparison to the Scottish female adult population, the age composition of women footballers tends to be concentrated within the younger age groups. The vast majority (91%) of registered senior players in Scotland is aged between 16 and 34 years. Overall the most represented age group is 16 to 24 years accounting for 66% of players. Such an age composition is probably to be expected since participation in sport is clearly age-related, with a steady decline in participation among older age groups (sportscotland, 2001: 8). There is also likely to be a variation in the age of
participants across sports with younger age groups more likely to participate in more energetic team sports, such as football.

Figure 4.4 illustrates that comparing the age composition of the adult population to that of participants in football shows a clear overrepresentation of younger participants in football. People between the ages of 16 and 34 years make up only 33% of the adult population, while this age group accounts for 76% of football participants. Since the figures for football participation in Figure 4.4 are largely representative of male participants, it could further be suggested that the overrepresentation of the younger age groups in football participation occurs to an even greater extent for women’s football.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>16 – 24 yrs</th>
<th>25 – 34 yrs</th>
<th>35 – 54 yrs</th>
<th>55 yrs +</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% of adult population*</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of football participants**</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* National figures relate to the adult population taken from Hope, Braunholtz, Playfair, Dudleston, Ingram, Martin and Sawyer (2000: 17). ** Figures taken from sportscotland (2001: 23). Of those who participate in football 93% are male and 7% are female.

Comparing Figures 4.3 and 4.4 supports this claim with 91% of women footballers (see Figure 4.3), and 76% of football participants (see Figure 4.4) between the ages of 16 and 34 years. One possible explanation for this greater overrepresentation of younger participants in women’s football in Scotland is that as women’s football in developing, it is becoming more popular, acceptable, and accessible particularly for the younger age groups. This may be the case both within schools and at the club level which would reflect the developing nature of the sport at youth level.
Table 4.5 - Age group of survey sample

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age group*</th>
<th>18-20</th>
<th>21-25</th>
<th>26-30</th>
<th>31-35</th>
<th>36-40</th>
<th>41-45</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* These figures are taken from the survey and therefore represent a sample of women footballers from the age of 18 years and above. Age group categories do not replicate exactly the age groups used for national figures, however the difference in categories is minimal with variations of only 1 year.

Figure 4.5 shows a breakdown of the age composition of the survey sample. The vast majority of players in the sample are between the ages of 18 and 35 years (93%), with players between 35 and 45 years accounting for the remaining 7% of the sample. These figures suggest that in terms of age, the survey sample is particularly representative of the registered senior women footballers in Scotland.

**Marital Status**

It can be seen from Figure 4.6 that a significant proportion of women footballers in Scotland is single.

Table 4.6 - Marital status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Single</th>
<th>Partner*</th>
<th>Married</th>
<th>Divorced</th>
<th>Other**</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Female Percentage***</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Living / cohabiting with partner. ** In the case of the survey, 'other' was specified as 'having a boyfriend' (2%), in relation to National Figures 'other' included 'separated' (3%) and 'widowed' (13%). *** National figures relate to female adult population taken from Hope, Martin and Dudleston (2003: 10)

Compared with the female adult population very few women footballers are married (only 6% compared to 52% nationally). It is important however to identify the impact that age composition may have on these figures. The figures for the national female percentage represent women from the ages of 16 years to 75 years and above whereas, as we have already noted, the age composition of women footballers in Scotland is more...
limited. It is useful therefore to compare roughly age group by marital status for the adult population (includes both men and women) to that of the survey sample. Figure 4.7 displays these figures.

Figure 4.7 - Age group by marital status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age status</th>
<th>National %</th>
<th>Sample %</th>
<th>National %</th>
<th>Sample %</th>
<th>National %</th>
<th>Sample %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>* 16 - 24 yrs</td>
<td>18 - 24 yrs</td>
<td>25 - 34 yrs</td>
<td>35 - 44 yrs</td>
<td>35 - 45 yrs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cohabiting</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* age group categories are not exactly consistent across national figures and the survey data, but since the difference is minimal they are used as a rough comparison. ** National figures relate to the adult population taken from Hope, Martin and Dudleston (2003: 11)

Figure 4.7 shows that the marital status of the youngest age group for the adult population and women footballers are very similar, with the majority in both being single (84% and 86% respectively). We begin to notice a difference in the middle age group where, compared to the adult population (32%), there is a significant proportion of women footballers (58%) who are single. In this middle age group few women footballers are married (6%) and a relatively large proportion are cohabiting (34%).

Figures for the oldest age group represent only 10 women footballers. It can be seen that a larger percentage in this older age group are married, but this is a relatively small percentage when compared to the adult population (40% compared to 66% nationally).

In view of this, compared to the adult population a relatively large percentage (30% compared to 13%) of women footballers are single. Overall then and accounting for variations across age groups, compared to the Scottish adult population a relatively significant proportion of women footballers tend to be single.
Country of Birth

Detail of a player’s country of birth is the most appropriate indicator for nationality obtained by the survey. Figure 4.8 shows that, as expected, most players (89.6%) were born in Scotland. What the figures do not illustrate is what nationality players consider themselves to be. For example, the data do not allow for players who may have been born outside of Scotland, but would consider themselves as Scottish. Similarly, it is not possible to distinguish the extent to which players have been brought up and remained resident in the country they were born. The data presented later in this chapter on the region of secondary schools allows us to account for these factors to some degree.

Figure 4.8 - Country of birth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Scotland</th>
<th>England</th>
<th>Wales</th>
<th>Other*</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid %</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Included Sweden, Finland, Norway, United States, Dominican Republic, Singapore, and Canada.

The figures presented in Figure 4.8 therefore, are of limited use in the context of our analysis. However, they do provide otherwise unknown data on a particular socio-demographic characteristic of women footballers in Scotland.

Area of Residence

As with ethnic group, the survey unintentionally omitted a question regarding a player’s area of residence. As a result this profile will rely on two indicators of area of residence in order to compensate. The indicators used are the region of a player’s secondary school, and the region of the club for which they play. As previously discussed, there are limitations in using these indicators. Considered separately the limitations of the two indicators are enhanced somewhat. Examining a crosstabulation of
the two indicators does seem to suggest that there is a relative consistency between the area of a player’s club and the area of the secondary school they attended. The percentage figures in Figure 4.9 show that a particularly high percentage of players who attend secondary school in a particular region tend to play football for a club within the same region (see figures in bold). Of the players who attended secondary school in the Tayside and Fife regions, 100% play football for a club in Tayside and Fife, respectively. There are also high percentages for Grampian and Central, where 92% and 88% respectively, continue to play football for a club within the region they attended secondary school. There are slightly lower percentages for Strathclyde (76%) and Lothian (60%) suggesting that players may reside in the region where they attended secondary school and travel to play for a club in a different region, or that players no longer reside in the region where they attended secondary school. The figures also show that several players (6 in total) who attended secondary school in the Western Isles, Highlands, or England play football with clubs from the Grampian, Strathclyde, Lothian or Fife regions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FRC area of school</th>
<th>Grampian</th>
<th>Tayside</th>
<th>Strathclyde</th>
<th>Central</th>
<th>Lothian</th>
<th>Fife</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grampian</td>
<td>92 (33)</td>
<td>6 (2)</td>
<td>3 (1)</td>
<td>101</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tayside</td>
<td>100 (18)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strathclyde</td>
<td>5 (2)</td>
<td>3 (1)</td>
<td>76 (28)</td>
<td>101</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central</td>
<td>6 (1)</td>
<td></td>
<td>88 (15)</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lothian</td>
<td>10 (1)</td>
<td>10 (1)</td>
<td>60 (6)</td>
<td>20 (2)</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fife</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100 (13)</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W. Isles</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highlands</td>
<td>100 (1)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England</td>
<td>50 (2)</td>
<td>25 (1)</td>
<td></td>
<td>25 (1)</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figures are in valid percentages (omits missing figures), figures in brackets represent the actual counts.
It can be assumed that the area of the club that player’s are members of is a relatively accurate indicator of area of residence. This assumption is possibly more accurate for regions which cover larger geographical areas and/or have lower population density, such as Grampian, Tayside, and Fife. The important point to reiterate is that these are only indicators of area of residence and as a result, only assumptions can be made. Assuming players actually resided in the area they attended secondary school, it is generally within the more densely populated regions of Strathclyde and Lothian that players have either moved from since attending secondary school, or remained resident in but travel outside the region to play football.

**siblings and children**

In order to gain a sense of family background, one characteristic the survey addressed was the number of siblings that players have. This was broken down to reveal the number of elder brothers, elder sisters, younger brothers, and younger sisters. In addition, the survey asked players for the number of children they had, if any. Figure 4.10 displays the total number of siblings of players in the sample.

**Figure 4.10 - Total number of siblings**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total no. of siblings</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid %</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It can be seen that there are only 4% who are only children, with the majority of players (89%) having between 1 and 3 siblings. There are several implications of these figures, particularly in relation to the potential influence of family and siblings on primary socialisation into sports participation. This will be considered in more depth in Chapter Five. The figures in Figure 4.10 are broken down in Figure 4.11 to show the number of
siblings by their age and sex. Figure 4.11 shows that there is relatively little variation when siblings are divided into the above categories. It does seem however that a slightly higher percentage of players tend to have elder brothers (42%) and sisters (41%), rather than younger brothers (34%) and sisters (29%).

Again, the analysis of such data has the potential to inform us as to whether the age and sex of a player in relation to their siblings has an impact on their participation in football. For example, it may be considered that elder brothers are important socialising agents for girls into football. It has been acknowledged that second-born siblings tend to be over-represented in sport, suggesting that birth order makes a difference in sports participation (De Garay, Levine, and Carter, 1974). This survey data may help us to explore what influence, if any, the position of women footballers within sibling order has on participation in and experiences of football. The following chapter considers the extent to which siblings are influential in the process of socialisation into football.

In terms of family background, the other characteristic the survey addressed was the number of children players have. Figure 4.12 clearly shows that the majority of
women footballers have no children, with only 3.5% and 2.8% having one or two children, respectively.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of children</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid %</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Of the players who have children (9 players in total), 3 are single, 4 are living with a partner, and 2 are married. In terms of age, 5 of the players are in their 20s, 2 are in their 30s, and 2 are in their 40s.

Education

In relation to the education of women footballers in Scotland, the survey addressed two main areas. First, data was obtained for the town of secondary school, which was later re-categorised into FRC areas. Second, details of the qualifications held by players were obtained.

Region

Obtaining data for the town of the secondary school that players attended was primarily done in order to inform the analysis in the next chapter. In particular, in order to explain any variation across Scotland in the attitudes of schools to girl's football. It is also a potential indicator of a player's area of residence. As with ethnic group, the survey unintentionally omitted any question regarding area of residence, although an indication has been offered by consulting the data for region of secondary school and region of club (see Figure 4.9). It can be seen from Figure 4.13 that the majority of the
sample of women footballers attended secondary school in Strathclyde and Grampian regions (27% and 26% respectively).

Tayside and Central regions accounted for just over 25%, and Lothian and Fife regions approximately 17% of the sample. The remainder of the sample (approximately 5%) attended secondary school in either the Western Isles, the Highlands, or England.

Qualifications Held

This section considers the qualifications held by women footballers, in comparison to those held by the national adult population. Qualifications held by age are also considered, to allow for any distortions in the figures due to the age composition of the sample of women footballers. Finally, a breakdown of further and higher education qualifications of the sample are shown. Figure 4.14 indicates that a relatively large percentage of women footballers hold qualifications, with only 2% with no qualifications, compared to 20% and 19% for the national male and female population, respectively. In terms of Standard Grades a very high percentage of women footballers (98%) hold Standard Grades, compared to 67% of the national male, and 72% of the national female population. A relatively high percentage of women footballers also hold Higher Grades. Although at 64%, this is approximately 5% higher than the national adult male population figures (54%), the difference is more significant when compared to the national adult female population (52%).
In terms of a first or higher degree, there are again a relatively high percentage of women footballers (32%) that hold this level of qualification in comparison to the national adult population (16% of males and 15% of females).

It is important to acknowledge that some of the sample is not yet old enough to have gained an undergraduate or postgraduate qualification. Also, the sample of women footballers is limited to women aged 45 years and under. It is again possible that the age composition of women footballers may affect the interpretation of the figures, and therefore useful to compare qualifications held by age to national figures. Figure 4.15 shows a breakdown of the qualifications held by age, for both the sample of women footballers, and the national adult population.

* age group categories are not exactly consistent across national figures and the survey data, but since the difference is minimal they are used as a rough comparison. ** National figures include both male and female population, taken from Hope, Martin and Dudleston (2003: 97).
At each age group a lower percentage of women footballers have no qualifications than the national adult population. The largest difference is in the middle age group where 11% of the adult population have no qualifications, whereas all women footballers in this age group have obtained some kind of qualifications. In terms of the sample of women footballers, the older age group of 35 to 45 years has the largest percentage of players (14%) without any qualifications. At the level of standard grades, across all age groups, a larger percentage of women footballers than the national adult population have obtained this level of qualification. Again, the 25 to 34 years age group of women footballers are particularly well represented with 100% obtaining standard grades compared to 80% of the national adult population. A similar pattern emerges in relation to Highers obtained. It is in the older age group where the percentage of women footballers with Highers (75%) is largest, and 17% above that of the national adult population (58%). Finally, at the level of first or higher degrees the percentage of women footballers that hold this level of qualification is larger across all age groups than the national adult population. It can also be seen that for both the national adult population and women footballers, the percentages for the youngest age group are relatively low. This can possibly be explained by the fact that not all of the people within this age group will be old enough to have obtained this level of qualification. At the 25 to 34 years age group a relatively large percentage of women footballers (44%) hold a first or higher degree, compared to 21% of the national adult population.

A further breakdown of the levels of further and higher education qualifications held by the sample of women footballers is offered in Figure 4.16. The analysis above
takes account of several levels of qualifications but omits certain Further Education qualifications.

**Figure 4.16 - Further and higher education qualifications held**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Further Education</th>
<th>Undergraduate</th>
<th>Postgraduate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid %</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In terms of women footballers Figure 4.16 shows that a relatively high percentage (44%) hold further education qualifications. Of the percentage of women footballers who hold a first or higher degree (a total of 32% shown in Figure 4.14), 27% hold an undergraduate, and 6% hold a postgraduate degree. In summary then, it can be suggested that there tends to be a larger percentage of women footballers than the national adult population who holds qualifications at all levels.

**Social Class**

Previous research on women's football in England has often considered the issue of social class, and has generally concluded that the sport is played predominantly by working class women (see Chapter One). This has generally been determined using the occupation of player's fathers as an indicator of socio-economic status. This section aims to illustrate how the choice of social class indicator can influence the interpretation of social class. An analysis of social class is formed by considering guardian occupations, player occupations, and perceived social class, as indicators of player's
social class. It also considers players’ views of the social class of typical women footballers in Scotland and how this relates to the view of their own social class.

Guardian Occupation

A commonly used indicator of social class is the occupation of player’s guardians. An examination of this will give an idea of the social class background players have come from and may inform our understanding of the socialisation of players into the sport. It is widely acknowledged that childhood is a crucial stage in the socialisation process, with parents acting as the primary socialising agents (Greendorfer, 1992: 112). In the next chapter we will see that women tend to have been introduced to football at relatively early ages. An examination of social class, indicated by the occupation of players’ guardians, is important to enable an understanding of the social backgrounds women footballers have come from. Further, identifying social class in this way will help us determine whether it tends to be women from a particular background who are socialised into playing football.

Figure 4.17 - Guardian occupation as indicator of social class

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation Type</th>
<th>AB</th>
<th>C1</th>
<th>C2</th>
<th>DE</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male Guardian Valid %</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female Guardian Valid %</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valid Combined Percentage**</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Percentage ***</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GB Percentage****</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AB – Higher and intermediate managerial, administrative and professional; C1 – Supervisory, clerical and junior managerial, administrative and professional; C2 – Skilled manual workers; DE – Semi-skilled or unskilled manual workers: apprentices in skilled trades; casual or lowest grade workers; state pensioners or widowers; those entirely dependent on the state long term through sickness, unemployment, old age or other reasons. * 29 respondents who were students were coded according to the occupation of their male guardian. ** Valid combined percentage omits ‘Missing’ figures. 2 respondents whose female guardians were students were coded according to the occupation of their male guardian. *** National figures taken from sportscotland (2001: 5). **** GB figures taken from Walker, Maher, Coulthard, Goddard, and Thomas (2001: 22) Categories adjusted to correspond with AB, C1, C2, DE classifications.
By using the admittedly crude technique of distinguishing between working and middle class by occupation type, with AB and C1 roughly representing middle class and C2 and DE representing working class, it can be seen in Figure 4.17 that a relatively large percentage of players are considered as working class based on the occupations of their guardians. The valid combined percentage illustrates that players who come from a working class background account for 59% (C2 and DE) of the sample, and players from a middle class background account for 41% (AB and C1). We can therefore suggest that using guardian occupations as an indicator of social class, the sample of women footballers tend to be more working class and less middle class than the Scottish, and even more so than the GB adult population.

**Player Occupation**

Another useful indicator of social class is player occupations. Figure 4.18 suggests that in terms of player occupations the majority of players in Scotland are middle class (60%, AB and C1), with only 39% (C2 and DE) categorised as working class.

---

**Figure 4.18 - Player occupation as indicator of social class**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation Type</th>
<th>AB</th>
<th>C1</th>
<th>C2</th>
<th>DE</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid Percentage*</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Percentage**</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GB Female Percentage***</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The figures for women footballers are particularly consistent with those for the GB adult female population for categories C2 and DE. In terms of categories C1 and AB women footballers tend to be more prominent in the AB category and less prominent in the C1
category than the GB female population. Figures for Scotland represent both the male and female population and show a more even distribution across the four categories. Across all categories the figures for women footballers generally tend to fall between the Scottish figures for the adult population, and the GB figures for the female population.

There is therefore some inconsistency when we use player occupations compared to guardian occupations as an indicator of social class. Again there exist limitations regarding the availability of national data and not being able to compare player occupations with those of the same age composition of the Scottish female population, for example. Generally it seems to be the case that some players whose guardian occupations suggest they are from a working class background may themselves be employed in an occupation that would suggest otherwise. This has obvious implications for previous research on women's football that has used the occupation of male guardian as an indicator for social class.

*Perceived Social Class*

Reflecting on these differences it is interesting to explore what social class the players perceive themselves to be. Figure 4.19 shows that a large percentage of players consider themselves to be working or working to middle class (74%). Only 25% consider themselves to be middle or middle to upper class, and only 1% consider themselves to be upper class.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social class</th>
<th>Working</th>
<th>Working - middle</th>
<th>Middle</th>
<th>Middle - Upper</th>
<th>Upper</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid %*</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Valid percentage omits ‘Missing’ figures.
These figures tend to correspond more closely with guardian rather than player occupations as an indicator of social class. It is possible to tentatively suggest therefore, that the players’ family background rather than their own occupation is a stronger determinant of perceived social class.

It is also interesting to take into account what social class category players consider women footballers in Scotland generally to be. These results differ slightly from the players’ views of their own social class, in that player’s themselves consider women’s football slightly more working and working to middle class.

![Table 4.20 - Players’ views of the social class of women footballers](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social class</th>
<th>Working</th>
<th>Working - Middle</th>
<th>Middle</th>
<th>Middle - Upper</th>
<th>Upper</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid %*</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This can be more clearly presented by examining the following crosstabulation of players’ views of their own social class by their views of the social class of women footballers in Scotland.

![Table 4.21 - View of social class by view of social class of women footballers](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>View of own social class</th>
<th>View of social class of women footballers</th>
<th>Working</th>
<th>Working - Middle</th>
<th>Middle</th>
<th>Middle - Upper</th>
<th>Upper</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Working</td>
<td>81 (43)</td>
<td>15 (8)</td>
<td>4 (2)</td>
<td>100 (53)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working - Middle</td>
<td>28 (14)</td>
<td>69 (35)</td>
<td>4 (2)</td>
<td>101 (51)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle</td>
<td>3 (1)</td>
<td>55 (16)</td>
<td>41 (12)</td>
<td>99 (29)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle - Upper</td>
<td>50 (2)</td>
<td>50 (2)</td>
<td>50 (2)</td>
<td>100 (4)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper</td>
<td>50 (1)</td>
<td>50 (1)</td>
<td>50 (1)</td>
<td>100 (2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figures are in valid percentages (omits missing figures), figures in brackets represent the actual counts.

It can be seen that players generally perceive women footballers in Scotland to be of the same or a lower social class category than they consider themselves to be. A relatively small percentage consider other women footballers to come from a higher social class.
category than themselves, however the extent to which this happens varies across social class categories, with this trend being more prominent amongst those who consider themselves as working class. Within this class category, the majority (81%) considers women footballers in Scotland also to be working class. A smaller proportion (15%) considers women footballers to be working to middle class and only 4% consider them to be middle class.

Of the players who consider themselves to be working to middle class the majority (69%) suggest that women footballers are similarly working to middle class. A small proportion (4%) considers women footballers to be middle class, and the remaining 28% considers women footballers to be working class. The majority (59%) of those players who consider themselves to be middle class consider women footballers to generally be of a lower social class category than themselves, with 41% considering them to similarly be middle class. Very few players (only 6 players) consider themselves to be upper to middle, or upper class, making their views less significant, however all except one consider women footballers to generally be from a lower social class category than themselves.

**Occupational Status**

This section considers details regarding the occupational status of women footballers. The occupations of players have been categorised into types of occupation in Figure 4.22. For those who work the nature of their work (whether part time or full time) and salary is considered. For those who are students, their student status is also revealed.
It can be seen in Figure 4.22 that almost three-quarters of women footballers are made up of women who work in professional / technical occupations (26%), managerial / administrative occupations (19%), or are students (24%). Those working in clerical occupations make up 9%, and those working in sales make up 6% of the sample. Out of the remainder of the sample, 10% work in unskilled / semi-skilled occupations, 4% work in skilled occupations, 1% are unemployed, and 1% are home-makers. The prominence of professional / technical and managerial / administrative occupations reinforces the figures in Figure 4.18. An important observation to make is that Figure 4.18 tends to show a higher proportion of players categorised as semi-skilled or unskilled workers. This difference is largely due to the re-classification, in Figure 4.18, of students according to the occupation of their male guardian. Figure 4.22 therefore offers a more accurate breakdown of the occupational status of women footballers.

In terms of those who are in employment Figure 4.23 shows that the majority are employed in full-time occupations (86%) with only 14% in part-time occupations.
In contrast to the national female population, a large proportion of women footballers are in full-time rather than part-time employment. Research on the economic activity of people of working age reported that 57% of women who are employed are so in full-time work, with the remaining 43% in part-time employment (Central Statistics Unit, 2001: 31).

In terms of salary, Figure 4.24 shows the annual salary for those women footballers who are in employment. The majority of players (57%) earn between £10000 and £20000 per annum, with 23% earning below this and 21% earning higher. Although national data is not exactly comparable, it does give an indication of how annual salaries of the sample differ from the national male and female population.

Converting the figures in Figure 4.24 into weekly earnings of full-time employed players allows a comparison with the average weekly earnings of full-time male and female
employees in Scotland. The average weekly earnings of full-time male employees in Scotland in 1999 was £406.0, while that of full-time female employees was £297.7 per week (Central Statistics Unit, 2001: 43). Figure 4.25 converts the figures for annual salary of all employed players into weekly earnings for all full-time employed players in the sample.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Weekly earnings</th>
<th>Up to</th>
<th>£96.15-£192.31</th>
<th>£192.31-£288.46</th>
<th>£288.46-£384.62</th>
<th>£384.62-£480.77</th>
<th>More than £480.77</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% FT workers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Since we only have figures in predetermined categories it is not possible to calculate the average earnings of full-time employed players in the sample. However, Figure 4.25 does offer a rough indication of those employed full-time who earn above or below the average female weekly wage. Although the categories used are not completely comparative we can account for those who earn above and below £288.46 per week, which is only £10 less than the average female weekly wage. With this slight limitation in mind we can conclude that 51% earn over £288.46 (approximately the average female weekly earnings), with the remaining 49% earning below. Since the average female weekly wage is almost £10 higher then there is likely to be slightly more of the sample earning below, and slightly less earning above the average wage. It is possible to tentatively suggest therefore that the average weekly wage for full-time employed players is likely to be comparable with that of the female national population.
Student Status

Since almost a quarter of the sample of women footballers are students it is useful to offer a breakdown of their student status. Figure 4.26 shows that only 6% of students are at High School.

This is probably related to the age composition of the sample, with the survey being completed only by players who are 18 years of age and above. A large percentage (39%) of students are in Further Education, and the majority (49%) are studying at undergraduate level, with the remaining 6% studying at postgraduate level. At all levels, the dominant nature of study is full-time (94%), with only 6% studying on part-time courses.

Sporting Biography

This section considers the sporting biography of players in order to gain some understanding of their participation and involvement in a variety of sports in different contexts. Firstly, the provision and participation of sports in school PE and as extra-
curricula activities is considered. Secondly, the section considers players' continuity in
sports participation from school, exploring which sports players have continued to be
involved in, and which they have discontinued. Thirdly, the section goes on to consider
players current sports participation and which they consider to be their main sport.
Finally, features of players' football participation including the number of clubs they
have played for, the level at which they play and international representation are
detailed.

School Sports

There is generally a shortfall between provision and participation in sports in PE,
although most sports have a relatively high level of participation amongst players in the
sample. Figure 4.27 shows that the most commonly provided sports in PE were athletics,
hockey, badminton, and basketball. Football was offered in PE at school to just over half
of the players in the sample. There seems to be a relatively high level of participation for
all sports offered, which may suggest that the majority of players were likely to be
generally sporty and participate in the range of sports provided at school.
In terms of sports provided as extra-curricula activities, Figure 4.28 shows that the most common include football, badminton and hockey, with football being the sport most commonly provided and participated in. Despite this, football was provided as extra-curricula activity for under a half of players (approximately 39%). Of those who were provided with football as extra-curricula activity 91% participated in the sport. The provision of football at schools will be examined more fully in the following chapter, exploring variations in provision depending on factors such as age of players.
Figure 4.29 combines the findings in Figures 4.27 and 4.28 to show the total provision of and participation in sports at school. Overall, we can conclude that the most commonly provided sports are athletics, hockey, badminton, and basketball. While football is the 7th most commonly provided sport at schools overall, it is the most commonly provided sport in extra-curricula activity.

*Continuity in Sports Participation from School*

This section considers the sports, other than football, that players have continued to participate in since leaving school. Due to the nature of the survey and data analysis it is impossible to account for combinations of sports in which participation has continued since school.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>H</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>S</th>
<th>V</th>
<th>Bas</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>G</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>Sq</th>
<th>MA</th>
<th>T</th>
<th>+1</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

H = Hockey  B = Badminton  S = Swimming  V = Volleyball  Bas = Basketball  N = Netball  G = Golf  A = Athletics  Sq = Squash  MA = Martial Arts  T = Tennis  +1 = continued participation in more than 1 sport

*Sports, other than football, that have continued to be played since leaving school.*

It is possible however to show that, of those who continued participation in sports other than football (74 players in total), 26% continued participation in more than one sport offered at school. Of those who continued participation in only one sport, badminton was the most commonly continued.

*Current Sports Participation*

Figure 4.31 shows players' current participation in sports at both recreational and competitive levels of participation. The survey requested players to specify which sports or physical activities they participate in regularly (once or more often per week) at the
relevant level of participation. As expected, at both the recreational and competitive levels there is a dominance of participation in football.

![Figure 4.31 - Current sport participation](image)

The slight shortfall in participation in competitive football is due to missing data as a result of several players not answering the question, all players in the sample participate in football at a competitive level. Just under half of the sample also participate in football at a recreational level. There is some consistency with continuity of sports and current sports participation. A relatively high number of players participate in badminton at the recreational level which can be explained to some extent by the relatively high continuation of participation in badminton after leaving school. The third most popular sport activity is running, and of the remaining sports and activities there tends to be greater popularity among individual activities (such as squash, tennis, swimming, fitness/gym), with the exception of basketball which is the most popular team sport after football. Another important observation to make is that participation in all other activities tends to be common at the recreational rather than competitive level. Although
participation in some sports or activities is at the competitive level, in the majority participation at the recreational level is greater.

It is apparent that in the sample of women footballers, participation in football at both the recreational and competitive levels is higher than for any other sport. There also tends to be relatively little participation in other team sports. The figures in Figure 4.32 go some way to support these findings.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Football</th>
<th>Squash</th>
<th>Golf</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>99</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The large majority (99%) of the sample considers football to be their main competitive sport. The remainder of the sample consisted of two players, one who considered golf, and another who considered squash, to be their main competitive sport.

**Participation in Football**

Having examined players’ sporting biographies, this section explores exclusively the nature of their participation in football. As previously mentioned, all players participate in football at a competitive level. Figure 4.33 shows the distribution of players across divisions in the SWFL, illustrating relatively equal representation across the four divisions. A further breakdown of the number of clubs representative of each division in the sample is offered in Figure 4.1 at the beginning of this chapter (full details of the individual clubs representing each division are offered in Appendix One). The relatively equal distribution of players from across the four divisions presents a representative cross-ability sample of senior women footballers in Scotland.
The survey also obtained data relating to the extent to which players are involved in playing matches for their club, offering an indication of players’ ability levels within their existing clubs. Figure 4.34 illustrates that most players (83%) usually play in the first eleven at their club. As the extent of involvement decreases, the proportion of the sample also decreases, with very few players (only 1%) not featuring in the squad for matches. From this we can conclude that the majority of the sample are regularly involved in playing matches for their existing club.

In terms of the number of clubs of which players have been members, Figure 4.35 shows that the majority (40%) have only been a member of one club. Of the remaining 60% of
the sample, 56% have been members of between two to four different clubs. Very few players (5 in total) have been members of five or more clubs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure 4.35 - Number of clubs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No. of clubs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valid %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Possibly the most plausible explanation for differences in the number of clubs of which players have been members, is that age (or number of years a player has been participating in football) may be a determining factor. Figure 4.36 represents the crosstabulation of number of clubs by age group.

The findings however seem to be inconclusive since there does not appear to be an obvious relationship between the two variables. In fact, it is in the youngest age group where the most common number of clubs of which to have been a member is actually two, but only one with the other age groups. Apart from the youngest, the trend for each age group tends to reflect the trend in Figure 4.35.
In terms of international representation, Figure 4.37 shows that a large percentage (91%) of the sample have not represented Scotland at any level. Those who have represented Scotland have generally done so at a variety of levels from Under 16 to senior squads. Focusing on those who have represented Scotland, there are several other variables we can explore.

**Figure 4.37 - International representation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>International Representation</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid %</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is generally expected that those who have represented, or still continue to represent, Scotland are likely to be playing at a higher standard than other players. Figure 4.38 shows a steady decline of players who have international representation as we move down through each division. It is also interesting to point out that those who currently play in the second and third divisions have represented Scotland in the past, but are currently not involved.

**Figure 4.38 - International representation and current division**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Division</th>
<th>Premier</th>
<th>First</th>
<th>Second</th>
<th>Third</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Frequency</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 4.39 - International representation and age group**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>20 and below</th>
<th>21-25</th>
<th>26-30</th>
<th>31-35</th>
<th>36-40</th>
<th>41-45</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Frequency</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4.39 shows those players who have represented, or continue to represent, Scotland, by age group. There tends to be less international representation as the age group increases. It is important to remember however that there is a similar trend for the number of players represented in the sample by these age groups. Generally, in relation
to international representation, of the few players who have represented Scotland the
majority tend to play their football in the higher divisions, and tend to fall into the
youngest age groups.

Conclusion

This chapter set out to present a socio-demographic profile of women footballers
in Scotland based on quantitative data obtained from a survey of 144 players across the 4
divisions within the SWFL. The question at the heart of the analysis was who
participates in women’s football in Scotland? In terms of personal characteristics it can
be suggested that women footballers in Scotland are generally under the age of 45 years,
with the majority between the age of 16 and 34 years. Compared to the national female
population a significant proportion of the sample is single which, in part, can be
attributed to the age composition of players. This is only apparent however amongst the
youngest age group. As age increases then compared to the national female population
there is a relatively higher proportion of women footballers in Scotland that are single.
Such findings may not however be exclusive to women who play football. It would be
useful therefore to compare these figures regarding marital status to women who
participate in other sports. Such research could examine whether a high prominence of
single women is consistent among other sports or more typical among some sports more
than other sports and what reasons exist for any similarities and differences.

In relation to education and qualifications it is possible and extremely useful to
compare qualifications held by women footballers to those held by the national adult
population. The percentage of women footballers that have obtained educational
qualifications is higher across all levels of qualifications (from Standard Grades through to Higher Degrees) than both the national male and the national female percentages. Indeed at all levels of qualifications the difference is fairly significant suggesting that women footballers are generally better educationally qualified than the national population. The sample of women footballers remain better qualified than the national adult population when the data are broken down by age group.

Based on player occupations it seems that slightly more could be categorised as middle class than as working class. An exploration of guardian occupations and players’ views about their social class however tends to suggest that more players come from working class rather than middle class backgrounds. These findings suggest that it is extremely important to take account of the indicator of social class used when interpreting figures regarding social class. In terms of the impact that social class might have on players’ socialisation into football there are a number of important considerations. It is important to differentiate between the social class background of a player (based on their parents’ occupational status) and their current social class (based on their own occupational status).

Research tends to suggest that women who participate in football are predominantly working class. The survey findings suggest however that women who participate in football in Scotland tend to have come from a working class background but, based on their current occupational status, might be considered more typically middle class. The next chapter considers the process of socialisation of women into football and it is during primary socialisation (during childhood and adolescence) that social class background might have a significance influence since indicators of social
class based on players’ own occupations is irrelevant for this stage in the socialisation process. The findings in this chapter therefore suggest that it is girls and women who come from a working class background who are more likely to become involved in football. It is interesting to note that in the wider context the two groups who are generally under-represented in sports participation are women and people from lower social classes. If women footballers are typically of a lower social class then they belong to both of these under-represented groups, it is therefore interesting to explore how women are socialised into football and this is the focus of the following chapter.

In terms of occupational status three-quarters of the sample of women footballers are employed, almost one quarter are students and only 1% of the sample is unemployed. The types of occupations vary but almost half are employed in ‘professional/technical’ and ‘managerial/administrator’ occupations. Of those who work most (86%) do so on a full-time basis and average weekly wages seem to be comparable with the national female population. The majority of students are enrolled in full-time undergraduate degree programmes or in full-time further education.

The sporting biographies reveal that most players generally participated in the sports offered to them at school suggesting that the women in the sample tend to have been relatively ‘sporty’. In terms of provision of football at school this was mainly confined to extra-curricula time rather than PE lessons with almost all of those who were offered the chance to participate being involved. Other than football the sport in which participation has most commonly been continued since school is badminton. In terms of current sports participation football is clearly the dominant choice of sport, being the main competitive sport of nearly all (98.6%) of the sample. Compared to participation in
football there is relatively little participation in other sports/activities with badminton and running being the most popular. This can be related to the relatively high level of commitment that is required to participate in football, an issue that is explored in more detail in Chapter 6. Also, the vast majority of the sample is either employed on a full-time basis or are students in full-time education, possibly limiting the spare time they have available to be committed to other sports/activities. The reasons why football is chosen as players' main sport and the meanings they attach to being involved is explored more comprehensively in the remaining chapters. Finally, in terms of participation in football there is a relatively equal distribution of players representing each division in the SWFL. Most players have been a member of either one or two different clubs and the majority of the sample (90.8%) has not gained any international representation.

The question at the heart of this chapter was who participates in women's football in Scotland? This has been answered by presentation of a socio-demographic profile of women footballers that sets the subsequent analysis of the socialisation process and the subculture of women's football in Scotland into context. In addition, this chapter has explored the sporting biographies of players, a theme that is also explored through interviews, in order to set women's experiences of football within a wider sporting context. This chapter provides empirical data that, in the first instance, represents important original research. Also, and most importantly, the data can be used to substantiate, and provide another context to inform, the interpretation of the subculture of women's football in Scotland.
CHAPTER FIVE - SOCIALISATION OF WOMEN INTO FOOTBALL IN SCOTLAND

Introduction

This chapter explores the process of socialisation of women into football in Scotland. Analysing this process enables an understanding of the experiences women football players have encountered at various stages of their football career. Exploration of the players' experiences and the influences of major socialising agents and agencies also allow an important insight into perspectives on and attitudes towards women's football in Scottish society. The underlying questions addressed in this chapter are: How and why do women become involved in playing football in Scotland? How and why do they develop a commitment to the sport, and how does this compare to their participation in other sports? How have wider societal attitudes towards women's football influenced women's socialisation experiences? How and why do women's experiences of becoming and being involved in football differ? To what extent does women's socialisation into football in Scotland consist of interactive processes of reciprocal influence? This chapter adopts a critical interactionist model of the ongoing sports socialisation process in order to offer an interpretation of women's experiences of becoming involved, developing a commitment, changing sports participation, and potential retirement from playing football in Scotland.

The analysis in this chapter relies primarily on qualitative interview data, obtained through semi-structured interviews, supported by a combination of both quantitative and qualitative survey data. The adoption of a critical interactionist model of socialisation is usually combined with the choice of qualitative over
quantitative research methods (Coakley, 2001: 84). This research also utilises data obtained from the survey that used open-ended questions. This offers a degree of qualitative data which, although not as detailed as interview data, does give an important indication of the experiences of a greater number of players. This qualitative data obtained from the survey can, if necessary, be quantified to support the more detailed descriptions of the experiences of women footballers. This synthesis allows the detailed descriptions of women’s experiences to be contextualised on two levels. First, within the experiences of a larger sample of women footballers in Scotland and second, within the wider context of their personal lives.

There are a number of reviews of research into the sports socialisation process that consider how approaches adopted have developed since the 1970s (Coakley, 1993 and 2001; Greendorfer and Bruce, 1991; Horne, Tomlinson, and Whannel, 1999; and Stroot, 2002). More recent research into sport socialisation has begun to adopt a combination of critical and interactionist theories, in contrast to early work on the sport socialisation process that tended to employ an internalisation model. Research using an interactionist model would be likely to agree with Coakley (2001:82) defining socialisation as:

...an active process of learning and social development, which occurs as we interact with one another and become acquainted with the social world in which we live. It involves the formation of ideas about who we are and what is important in our lives. We are not simply passive learners in the socialisation process. We actively participate in our own socialisation as we influence those who influence us...Socialisation is not a one-way process of social influence through which we are moulded and shaped. Instead, it is an interactive process through which we actively connect with others, synthesise information, and make decisions that shape our own lives and the social world around us.
The adoption of an interactionist model is consistent with the overall theoretical framework of this research. Although constrained to a certain extent by structure and power relations, women footballers ultimately have an interactive, decision-making role in their own lives and the place of football within it. The reciprocal influence of players during the socialisation process will also be explored throughout this chapter. Drawing from Stevenson’s (1999) work on the process of becoming an athlete, this analysis treats players’ participation in sport as a journey, considering their experiences in football as descriptions of careers with identifiable beginnings, a process of developing a commitment, and an inevitable end.

Chapter One offers a thorough review of research on women’s socialisation into football and Chapter Two considers, more generally, research on women’s socialisation into sport. There are a number of relevant issues that emerge from the reviews. First, early research on the socialisation of women into sport generally adopted an internalisation model based on Bandura’s (1977) social learning theory. Second, such research also tended to use quantitative research methods. Third, although there is relatively limited recent research focusing exclusively on women’s socialisation into sport, studies on women’s experiences of being involved in various sports have provided some detailed accounts of the process of socialisation. This more recent work usually adopts qualitative research methods and treats socialisation as a more interactive and reciprocal process (Klein, 1993, Crosset, 1995, and Shire, Brackenridge and Fuller, 2000). Finally, as with the research on women’s experiences of being involved in sport, the most recent research on women’s football (with the exception of Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel, 1999) has not focused exclusively on the process of socialisation, but refers to it as a relatively marginal theme within the wider research. As a result, although research in general has tended
to adopt qualitative methods, detailed descriptions of how women become involved, experience being involved, and change their involvement in football, are somewhat lacking. Explorations of the interactive and reciprocal nature of these processes are also relatively limited.

This chapter explores women footballer's experiences of the socialisation process. Socialisation into football is considered as an ongoing and interactive process. The analysis begins with a short section on general early childhood experiences of play, toys and games. The main part of the analysis is organised around the following general phases of players football careers: initial involvement in and identification with football; developing a commitment and becoming involved in playing football regularly; changing participation and retirement from football. The final section offers an overall discussion of the influence of others at each of these stages, and attitudes towards women's football in Scottish society. Throughout the chapter there is ongoing consideration of the interactive and reciprocal nature of the socialisation process.

Early Experiences of Childhood Play

Research within the field of sport socialisation has offered insights into childhood play experiences. One such study that is particularly relevant to this research is the work of Giuliano, Popp and Knight (2000) who examined the extent to which childhood play activities predict future sport participation by women. A survey was used to measure adult experiences with sports as well as childhood play activities of varsity athletes and nonathletes from a college population. In relation to the athletes in the sample, the relevant findings to this research were that 'women who played nontraditional varsity sports (e.g. soccer, basketball, track) were more
likely than women who played traditional sports (e.g. swimming, golf, tennis, volleyball) to have been tomboys as children, to have played with primarily masculine games, and to have played in team activities' (Giuliano, Popp and Knight, 2000: 176).

Although not extensively, the interviews briefly explored the early childhood play experiences of some of the players. There was a degree of consistency in relation to the games played, toys played with, clothes worn, and players’ descriptions of themselves as young children. In particular players commonly describe themselves as tomboys. The following examples illustrate these general similarities.

I was constantly in a football kit, trackie bottoms, trainers, never really wore dresses ... once I started being able to walk and things I was always...in a football kit. I would have cars, the odd doll, turtle figures, I was kind of a bit of a tomboy when I was wee, but that's just the way I am. But I've always been like that, I'd get cars for my birthdays, footballs, just things like that. (Cahli, 17)

I totally was a tomboy when I was younger. I just never wore a skirt, you wouldn't get me out of the house with a skirt on. I always wanted to play football. I asked for cars and tractors for Christmas rather than dolls and prams. (Dawn, 23)

I'm sure we had dolls and stuff, but I was always a bit of a tomboy...Because we were hanging about with the boys all the time I was a bit of a tomboy...When we were younger we had dolls, I'm sure mum dressed us in pink occasionally...We weren't like 'brownie girls', we weren't kind of them. It was never forced upon us that, you know, this is your stereotypical role of a female, you've got to keep to that. It was just, you know, just let us kind of develop as we kind of wanted to. (Jo, 23)

These examples offer relatively detailed descriptions of childhood play and behaviours and indicate that there exists an element of consistency amongst interviewed players. The survey did not cover this area, although a number of survey
respondents identified themselves as tomboys when describing their socialisation into and identification with football. The sample here is limited and provides a foundation for possible future in-depth investigation. Nonetheless, the accounts provide descriptions of childhood play experiences of a number of women who participate in what Giuliano, Popp and Knight (2000) would term a 'nontraditional' female sport. Although comparisons with nonathletes, or athletes participating in 'traditional' female sports are outside the scope of this research, there is a degree of consistency with the Giuliano et al (2000) study, with players describing themselves as tomboys as children, and as having played with traditionally masculine games.

**Initial Involvement in and Identification with Football**

In order to gain an indication of their initial involvement and identification with football interviewees were asked what were their earliest memories of experiencing football at any level (e.g. watching, informal play). Players either became initially involved through informal play, through watching, or through a combination of the two. Players who were initially involved mainly through informal play did so at various sites such as in the garden, parks, streets, and school playgrounds. Generally fathers, brothers, and male friends were involved in football at these sites.

I remember playing football just out the back there with my dad and my brothers...Probably about six or seven. And I used to play at school on the playground, I always remember because I was the only girl. (Shirley, 21)

Growing up playing with my brother and my dad. I didn’t really go to any games other than just watching a local game with my dad...It was just informal, playing with my brother and his pals at the Primary School. (Alison, 32)
There was like four people in our class, it was myself, my twin sister and two boys, and we were at school with about thirty or forty kids. So all there was to do at break-time was to go out and play football...So that’s kind of my earliest memories of football, to get out just at Primary School, just going out kicking about. (Jo, 23)

The players who stated their initial involvement as mainly through watching football generally went along to professional men’s matches at quite an early age and, with one exception, were taken by their father.

Dad had a season ticket for Pittodrie...and one of my sisters won a competition for a season ticket...I would have been about eight or nine...The idea was that it was rotated between the three daughters. (Heather, 27)

I used to go to like nearly every Arbroath game when I was little. Supposedly I went to a game when I was like, well a baby, I was taken to a game, obviously I don’t remember, but I was taken to it. (Cahli, 17)

Earliest memories, oh my goodness, I think going to Pittodrie for the first time to watch Aberdeen. I don’t even know how old I was. I was probably older than your average kid going because my dad didn’t like going. Just coming in and seeing the stadium for the first time when I was about eight...I went with my neighbour. (Jennifer, 31)

Although players whose earliest memories were stated as watching matches they have also generally been involved in informal play from a relatively young age. Several players who didn’t become involved in playing football regularly until adulthood had however been involved in watching football prior to playing.

I did watch my fiancée and that playing football on a Sunday...but I wouldn’t say that ever really influenced me to play myself...It was just I went along to watch because he was playing...(Lisa, 28)

My earliest is really my dad watching football, or watching football with my dad, or going to football with my dad and my uncle...I would
say (I was) about seven or eight, I can’t really remember anything before that really. (Sarah, 27)

Overall most players experienced an involvement with football, whether through informal play, watching, or a combination of the two, at relatively early ages. The most prominent figures that shared the players’ initial experiences generally tended to be players’ fathers and brothers. It is also useful to draw on data obtained in the survey regarding how players initially became involved with football. The survey explored players’ initial involvement in football by asking respondents to describe how they were first introduced to football with reference to: the nature of involvement (e.g. spectating, informal play in garden/streets); who got them involved; and at approximately what age they became involved. In accordance with previous research and the interviewed players, the majority of survey respondents became involved in football through informal play, with fathers and brothers in particular seeming to be involved.

Playing in garden, my father took me to training and matches at his football club that he coached. I was 9 years old. (Premier 23)

Kick abouts in the garden with my father from as young as I can remember – as soon as I learned to walk probably! (Second 34)

Very young, playing in the garden with my brother. (Third 11)

The survey data also suggests that primary schools may have provided a relatively positive environment for some girls to become involved in playing football. Although school attitudes (secondary school in particular) are explored elsewhere in the survey and are considered later in this chapter, a number of players specify primary school, and some secondary school, as sites where they became involved in football, albeit usually in an informal nature.
I’ve always liked football from a young age and got involved through my primary school. (Premier 9)

I was 8 and participated in football festival at school. Continued to play in streets till I played in school team etc. (Premier 18)

Started playing football at the age of 8 with classmates at break-times. (First 28)

First introduced at primary school, age 11. Started playing football with the boys due to lack of girls in school. (Third 4)

Introduced at primary school at the age of 8 then continued through high school. (Third 39)

The survey data also shows that in relation to informal play players tended to also participate with friends and classmates, particularly in the school environment. One interviewed player describes how she was allowed to play and was accepted by the boys in this particular environment due to her ability level. The following account describes the contrasting experiences of other girls who were considered, by herself and the boys, not good enough to be involved.

I mean I used to be like, at school, at playgroup, whatever, play just on the pitch with the boys in my team. And no other girl got to play except for me who’d get picked. And I always remember, here’s a story for you, one day all the girls at my class in primary school they decided ‘how does she get to play and we don’t get to play?’ so they basically sat in the middle of the park and didn’t let us play. They all had their little dresses and that on and were actually sat in the middle of the park and says ‘we’re not moving until we get to play’... I think they just wanted to play because I was playing... I mean they couldn’t play, do you know what I did, I actually set up a wee park and was like ‘go and play there’, that kind of thing and the girls, they actually started playing at primary school. (Fiona, 21)

What is particularly significant about this account is how the interviewed player detaches herself from the other girls on the basis of her ability to play football. Her ability entitles her to play with the boys and she actively ensures that the participation
of the other girls at an inferior ability level, with ‘their little dresses...on’, is separated from her own privileged position of playing with the boys.

A number of the interviewed players stressed that football has played an important part in their family life. While this was the case for some players, others have not necessarily experienced this to such an extent, instead being brought up in a family who have less of an interest in football. Consequently, it can be suggested that this factor is not a prerequisite for women becoming involved in football. Furthermore it supports the decision to approach socialisation into sport as an interactive process, where individuals are not simply passive learners. In some cases there is evidence of reciprocal socialisation with parents and siblings becoming more interested in football through their daughter’s or sister’s involvement. When asked several questions concerning their families’ interest in football and whether football has played an important part in players’ family life the following responses suggest a reciprocal influence.

Like my dad, he’s not really a football person... it wasn’t until I actually switched to playing myself that I started moaning at my dad to take me, so he never actually went until I was playing...It’s been important since I’ve been playing it...my dad, he comes to all my games and it’s a big part of his life. (Fiona, 21)

Mum and dad were never into football, dad’s into it now, but that’s more through me and Jen (twin sister) both play(ing)... Mum’s got an interest, but again that’s more through us I think. But yeah, dad watches an awful lot of football now, and he didn’t used to. When we first started playing I think it was more because we had an interest, he kind of took us along, he developed an interest for it...The whole family is interested in it, but it’s through us I think more than anything. (Jo, 23)

My dad wasn’t really, you know thinks girls can’t play football, why would he push me into football, he had no interest in it. It was only when I picked it up and started to show an interest in football that he started to get interested as well...It really has been self-driven rather
than, you know, getting a lot of help and advice from people who have pulled me along. (Heather, 27)

Many of the descriptions offered in the survey data also hint at a more interactive nature of the process of socialisation with players having a more independent decision-making role in their initial involvement in football.

Started playing in the street with friends. I started myself but my dad then encouraged me. (Premier 6)

Informal play, just something I was interested in. 5 years old. (Premier 8)

Saw an advertisement in paper, went along to trials and always enjoyed (at the age of 12ish). (First 7)

The survey data is also useful to offer a general summary of at what age players became involved in football at various levels of organisation. The regular and competitive levels relate more to the next sections in this chapter but the following summarises the age and nature of players’ introduction to football based on the survey data. It is clearly depicted in Figure 5.1 that the majority of players (89%) were initially introduced to football in some form or another by the age of 10 years, with all players having been introduced to football by the age of 18 years.

![Figure 5.1 - Age of introduction to football at various levels](image-url)
It then follows that as the level of football increases (from regular participation to the competitive level) the age of introduction to football at these levels also tends to increase. The various levels of football were defined in the following ways: introduction, for example watching, informal play in garden / streets; regular, for example training or coaching sessions and friendly matches; competitive, for example for a SWF affiliated club. A relatively significant proportion of players (59%) were involved in playing football regularly by the age of 14 years, and the majority of players (60%) began playing football competitively between the ages of 11 and 18 years. Overall, the introduction to football at various levels of competition seems to follow a logically progressive trend.

In terms of the nature of players' introduction to football, Figure 5.2 shows that the vast majority (70%) took part in informal play in the garden, streets, or parks. The remaining proportion of players were introduced at primary school (14%), in a spectator capacity (13%), or by some other way (3%). There is clearly some consistency between the survey data and the more detailed descriptions of players' initial involvement in football obtained during interviews.

In summary then the majority of players have become involved with football through informal play at relatively young ages. This informal play has generally
occurred at a number of sites. These sites include the garden, streets, parks, and school playgrounds. Certain figures tend to have played a prominent role in being involved in players' initial experiences of football, primarily fathers, brothers and friends. Although some players consider football to have an important place in their family life, interview and survey data also suggests that this is not necessarily an important factor influencing players' involvement in football. Further, there is evidence to suggest that even at early ages players' have been involved in making individual decisions regarding their participation in football. The process of becoming involved in football has been an interactive one for a number of players. In some cases this has been to the extent that they have had a reciprocal influence on others, particularly parents.

Developing a Commitment to Football

Interviews reveal that players have had relatively varied experiences since initially becoming involved in football. Some followed a gradual increase in participation resulting in them developing a regular commitment to playing football at a fairly young age. Others continued to play in an informal nature for a number of years before they became more formally involved. Other players ceased playing football before becoming involved again at an older age. There are a number of reasons for players' varying experiences, however the provision of and attitudes towards football in the school environment does seem to be an influential factor. Players' experiences of participating in football at school will be discussed before exploring how players developed a commitment to football outside of the school environment.
Experiences of Participating in Football at School

The extent to which players were involved in football at primary and secondary school varies from playing in school teams, being able to participate during Physical Education lessons, simply continuing informal play during break-times and lunch-times, to actually being banned from playing football. Several players specify their school (especially primary school) as a site for fostering an initial commitment to football.

Primary school set up a team, so that would be my first formal team...They had a great attitude, there was never any bother at school. I mean I think the attitude was, just let kids play. I think it's when you're older there's maybe a slightly different attitude kicks in. (Jennifer, 31)

Some of the boys that I was friends with used to play with...the school team which girls weren't allowed in at that point. And it was quite a big school so one of the dads had formed a second team to play friendlies against other schools that had sort of second teams, so I got to play in that team. (Angie, 26)

In many cases this form of participation was disrupted to some extent during secondary school. Some players acknowledged that as girls get older it becomes less acceptable for them to be involved in playing football and their experiences reflect this in varying ways. This resulted in some players ceasing playing football and taking up other sports that were available to them within the school environment. Whereas some players took it upon themselves to find an alternative site in which to continue their participation in football.

Went to secondary school and...joined the school team, did quite well with the school team, and then got actually banned after a year, there was an ultimatum provided to the school saying the team is either withdrawn or this lassie stops playing, they'd got a letter through. So that just kind of cut it off there and then and I moved on to hockey,
which was a poor second... I was quite upset... it was one of the saddest days at school is when I got banned from playing football. (Jennifer, 31)

And then it went up to secondary school, still played in the playground with boys, I was probably the only one that chose football at secondary school and played with the boys there. And then...in the later years you stop doing that, and then my influence was more into athletics, I did athletics for about 10 years, I didn’t do football. (Heather, 27)

I didn’t play at secondary school, didn’t have any competitive sport at my secondary school...And I wanted to play football so I found a team to join...I was keen to play, I wanted to play and sort of hassled my mum and dad to find a team for me to go to. (Angie, 26)

Well I stopped for a year, and then I thought, I hated not playing, so I got into the girl’s team. (Kim, 17)

Some players, although they participated throughout school, they sometimes encountered barriers they had to overcome if they were determined to continue playing. Other players experienced particularly positive support throughout both primary and secondary school.

There was a couple of us at that school that played and we were kind of nagging at the PE staff to have a team. But sometimes we didn’t have like training or anything but a teacher would take us to games and that. And I’m pretty sure there’s a few years or a year that we didn’t, because we couldn’t get anyone to take us, but the majority of the time I remember having a team. (Shirley, 21)

I used to play for my school team, primary school team...At the beginning at primary school we weren’t really, girls weren’t allowed to play football, but we kind of proved them wrong and we built the team up...I’m still playing at secondary school. (Cahli, 17)

The headmaster...was fantastic because he was under a lot of pressure because Jen and I were getting a game in the primary school team and sometimes it would cause other boys not getting a game. Of course the parents weren’t impressed that their sons weren’t getting a game...So that caused a bit of friction. But no he stuck up for us and always encouraged us, he was great. Then we moved up to secondary school, there was a couple of members of staff there that were really, really supportive as well. (Jo, 23)
The experiences of players during school seem to depend on a number of factors such as the school's overall provision of and attitude towards competitive sport, attitudes towards girls being involved in football, and the attitudes of individual teachers. One such variable that the interview data alone struggles to account for is the effect of age on school attitudes. The school is considered to be one of the major socialising agencies, and research has tended to suggest that the first real barriers to participation in football for girls have occurred within the schooling system (Scraton, Fasting, Pfister and Bunuel, 1999). Based on the survey data Figure 5.3 goes some way to suggest that this has also been the case for women football players in Scotland. Players were asked to describe the general attitude of their high school and PE department towards girls football. Having re-categorised the responses as positive, neutral or negative attitudes it seems that the majority of players seem to have experienced distinctly negative attitudes. There exists little difference between the attitudes of the school as a whole and the PE department in particular, although the data does suggest that PE departments may have a slightly more positive attitude towards girls football than schools as a whole.

![Figure 5.3 - Attitude of High School and PE Department](image)

The exploration of high school and PE department attitudes can be examined further by exploring how these attitudes might differ depending on the age of players. This gives some indication of how school attitudes, and in sense possibly
societal attitudes, towards women’s football have changed in recent years. It is important to account for the possible limitations of the data, namely that the older age groups represent the experiences of fewer players. However since the majority of the sample are between the ages of 18 and 30 years, the data offers a good indicator for differences over a 12 year span.

Figure 5.4 shows the attitudes that players of different ages experienced towards girl’s football at high school. There is a clear difference in the attitudes of high schools depending on the age of players. Players aged 20 years and below have experienced slightly more positive attitudes than negative. As age increases we see a shift in the attitudes of high schools. More players aged 21 to 25 years have experienced negative attitudes than positive. This shift changes even more significantly when we consider players aged 26 to 30 years where a significant proportion (23 out of 35 players) experienced negative attitudes towards girls football at high school. Although figures for those over the age of 30 years represent relatively fewer players, the majority seems to have also experienced negative attitudes. Based on the survey data then, school attitudes towards girls football seem to have gradually become more positive. If we concentrate on the 12-year span
represented by the figures for players between the ages of 18 and 30 years, there is a
definite shift from particularly negative attitudes towards more positive attitudes. To
what extent this shift is concurrent with wider societal attitudes towards women's
football requires further investigation.

Overall, the combination of interview and survey data seems to suggest that,
although some players experienced positive support throughout school, secondary
school in particular has been a site where it has been difficult for girls to develop
their commitment to football. This has resulted in many players experiencing a
disruption to their involvement in football, with some transferring their sports
participation to other sports and others finding alternative sites to participate in
football. The following section discusses the alternative environments outside of
school where players developed their commitment to football.

*Developing a Commitment to Football outside of the School Environment*

The majority of interviewed players developed a commitment to football
during their childhood or adolescence. Those who did participate in football at school
tended not to play exclusively at school. In fact school football seems to have been
treated more recreationally with opportunities outside of the school environment
generally being of a more structured and competitive nature. It is useful to examine
how players have developed a commitment to football by considering those who
have had similar experiences. Players can generally be divided into two groups
depending on their experiences. First, those who experienced a relatively smooth
transition from informal play to developing a commitment to football during
childhood and adolescence (primary socialisation). Second, those who developed a
commitment to playing football during adulthood (secondary socialisation). Within
this second group players tended to either experience a disruption to their initial
involvement during childhood and adolescence before returning to play football in their adulthood, or they had little or no involvement in actually playing football (although some involvement in watching football) during childhood or adolescence and became initially involved in playing football during adulthood. The experiences of players in each of these two groups will be explored in turn.

Players who experienced a relatively smooth transition from being initially involved to developing a commitment to football tended to do so at clubs where youth structures were in place, or through coaching provision specifically for girls. Some players became involved in playing organised football at about eight or nine years of age through coaching courses and playing regularly for girl’s teams.

When I was about nine or something like that there was a course through the council … That was like Easter time then after the summer holidays there was a course put on, it was the first course in the area, and it was put on for like girls only. There was before sort of mixed football where the girls could go but in football that’s seen as a threatening atmosphere for obviously girls who don’t want to play with the boys. So it was set up as a girls only class, and I went a long to that for about three or four months. Then at that time Falkirk Ladies was formed, that was 1993, I was eleven…Then from then obviously I joined the club then it’s basically went from there. (Fiona, 21)

I got asked to join BYC Carnoustie when I was about 8 years old, that’s the first team I started to play with…It was through school, yeah they were saying ‘oh there’s this Carnoustie team, you should maybe try and go along there’, so I got my dad to take me through. And then I just started training with them then playing the league games. (Cahli, 17)

Other players who experienced a relatively smooth transition from initial involvement developed a commitment to football in their early teens. All three of these players were involved in playing for their primary school teams, and joined teams outside of school when they were unable to play football in a team at secondary school.
Some players experienced a degree of disruption to their involvement in football, which seems to have prevented them from developing a commitment during childhood or adolescence. This disruption usually occurred at school and as a result these players didn’t resume their participation in football until during adulthood, some players having developed a commitment to other sports in the meantime. Those players who had little or no involvement in actually playing football formally (although some involvement in watching football) during childhood or adolescence before developing a commitment during adulthood had fairly varied experiences. These include, for example, choosing football due to injury obtained in other sports and becoming involved in playing football through obtaining coaching awards or working in a related occupation.

It must have been about three years ago I got quite a bad back injury in athletics which kind of led me to have to give it up. So for about six months I wasn’t really doing much sport. And then somebody just suggested football because it’s played on grass and would be a bit more gentle than a track. I just thought that it might be quite nice to get involved in a team sport because I’m really quite, I like to stay fit and like to do activities. (Sarah, 27)

It was through work really because I went to uni then got a job in Sports Development. And then it was really through (name) she said they’d got a club and to come along so I went to training a few times and that was pretty much it. (Claire, 22)

A year after I came out of college... the Team Sport Scotland National Co-ordinator was looking to promote girls football. And because I had been through the C certificate, and then I actually went through the first ever B License as well... They were looking for coaches in different areas, and I helped set up just coaching one Easter, and we had a huge response. And just from knowing some friends that were playing football we just formed Falkirk from that. (Alison, 32)

In the survey players were asked to describe how they became involved in playing football regularly (e.g. training or coaching sessions and friendly matches) and
competitively (e.g. for a SWF Ltd affiliated club). The responses provide further, albeit less detailed, descriptions of how players have developed a commitment to football. Again there seems to be two distinct types of experience, those who experienced a relatively smooth transition to developing a commitment to football during childhood and adolescence, and those who developed a commitment to football during adulthood, some having been previously involved but had their participation disrupted. The following are a number of examples of players who seemed to experience a relatively smooth transition from their initial involvement to developing a commitment to football.

I was interested through my team East End girls and I was about 9 or 10 when I went to my first coaching session. I had moved up through the age groups, then played 1st division football and now playing premier league. (Premier 9)

High school football team at 12. Then I started to play for Hamilton Accies at 14 years old. When I was too old for my U16 team we formed a senior team – Hamilton Athletic. (Premier 24)

I was approached while playing on the street by a member of a Ladies Senior Club...I started training and playing with Cumbernauld Ladies FC when I was 13 years old. (First 20)

The team was Hamilton Accies U18s...I then went on to sign for the club, a few seasons later I was too old to play for the club so I moved up to the Ladies, I’ve been there since. (First 21)

What is interesting to note is that most of the players who experienced a smooth transition tended to be currently playing in the higher divisions, or were introduced to teams where a youth structure seemed to be in place. In contrast, a relatively large number of the players who experienced a disrupted transition to developing a commitment to football, or developed a commitment to football during adulthood, tend to play in the lower divisions, especially the Third Division.
First introduced at primary school, age 11. Started playing football with the boys due to lack of girls in school. Played for high school team for a short time, aged 16. First played for Arbroath Ladies age 24. (Third 4)

Began playing regular 5-a-side with workmates (twice a week) and then with group of women I met through a workmate age 27. Began playing for FMC Harriers age 28 through someone who works where I used to work. (Third 8)

I played for my primary school in two matches. I didn’t play again until recently. I was first introduced to a SWF club last summer. It was Dundee City WFC. (Third 22)

I started playing regularly at 10 years old for Deanburn Primary School. I only started playing competitively at the age of 21, the team is Bo’ness LFC. I was involved in starting up the team. (Third 38)

The logical implication is that players who develop a commitment during childhood have the potential to play at a higher ability level than those who develop a commitment during adulthood do. Further, the provision of opportunities for girls to become involved in football during childhood and to experience a smooth transition from initial involvement to developing a commitment is therefore an important factor in fostering players’ potential to reach a higher ability level. Another issue that is more prominent in the survey data is the number of players who played in boys teams or as one of the only girls playing in school teams when they were younger. This seems to have provided an important environment for some girls to foster a commitment to football, and possibly compensate for a lack of opportunities for girls to play in all-girls teams.

Overall, interview and survey data allows us to consider players’ experiences of developing a commitment to football to fall two main groups. The first includes those players who have experienced a generally uninterrupted transition from their initial involvement in football to developing a commitment during childhood and
adolescence. Within this group players have tended to become involved in either coaching programmes or have joined girl's teams at relatively young ages and continued to play through to senior level. The second group consists of players who have developed a commitment to football during adulthood. Within this group there are some players who were involved in playing football at some organised level (e.g. primary school or boys teams) during childhood and adolescence, ceased their participation (for varying reasons), and later resumed their participation developing a commitment to football in adulthood. Other players within this group, although maybe having experiences of football in an informal and/or spectator capacity during childhood and adolescence, were initially introduced to formally playing football during adulthood.

Changing Participation and Retirement from Football

Since all players in both the survey and interview sample are currently involved in playing football (except one player who has very recently retired), the extent to which this section explores retirement from football is slightly limited. Interviews did however explore hypothetical questions regarding players' inevitable retirement from football. Interviews also offered some detailed descriptions of players' experiences of changing their participation in football. This has been mentioned briefly in the previous section, in particular in relation to those players who changed or ended their participation in other sports and became involved in football. The previous chapter drew on survey data in order to offer an account of other sports that players have been and are still involved in. In considering descriptions of players' participation in other sports it is possible to further examine changes in participation in football within the context wider sports socialisation.
Although, as previously mentioned, there are some players who have taken up sports other than football (particularly during school years), having returned to playing football, they now consider football to be their main sport. In three cases players changed their overall sports participation to football due to injury preventing them continuing in their previous sports. However, there is little evidence of players changing their participation in football once they have developed a commitment. Again, these findings are influenced by the fact that players interviewed and surveyed are currently involved in playing. Despite variations in how different players became involved and developed a commitment to football all interviewed players and the vast majority of survey respondents (99%) consider football to be their main sport.

I've been involved in quite a lot of activities... but always football has always been kind of the main one, and it kind of dominates, it takes up your entire time... So other activities kind of fell by the way side a little bit. (Jo, 23)

Well I used to do Highland dancing as well when I was really little, I got sort of pushed into that because my mum and my sister were like really good at that... But I turned around and said 'one day I'll want to play football', that was when I was about Primary 2 I think...It's the natural thing to do like I've always, since I was about 2 or 3, I've always had a ball at my feet. I've never really been interested in playing anything else but football. (Kim, 17)

I went through a stage where I was like trying every kind of sport and then when football came along my mum went 'no, you're not playing that, here's another sport' and all the rest of it. But I kind of stuck at it more because I wanted to prove my mum wrong...So I don't know why I actually chose it over, I think obviously I enjoyed it more, and I was getting fed up with the other ones. (Fiona, 21)

One player who has only recently begun playing football described how she became involved in football as an alternative to her previous sport of athletics. She has since resumed her athletics and is pursuing both sports, considering them to be equally
important in her life. Another player who became involved in football after injury prevented her participation in athletics suggests that if she hadn’t suffered an injury she would choose to participate in athletics rather than football.

In order to gain an indication of whether this general dominance of football in players’ sporting lives has ever been threatened, interviewed players were asked if they had ever nearly given up playing, if so why, and why they had continued to be involved. Some players also volunteered information throughout their interviews relating to their experiences of nearly giving up playing football. The majority of players had, at some point and for different reasons, contemplated giving up playing football. The most common reason for nearly given up related to the frustration of being involved in a struggling team. The following are examples of how different players experienced this frustration.

Well the team that I was playing for last year was scraping around for players you know, it was always an effort, I always had to drive the mini bus, end of story, I’m not playing anymore. Then because John (manager of current team) asked me, that’s why I kept playing. (Jennifer, 31)

When we first started we used to get hammered all the time... And I thought to start off with, I’m not wasting a whole Sunday to get hammered, you know, to get hammered every week. But the more and more you get involved in a team, you just want to keep going, you just want to get better. (Dawn, 23)

Because at one point our team was just almost gone...I was going to just give up playing completely, but there was another lassie in the team and she was like ‘you cannot just give up, you’re a good player, just keep your head up and you’ll just find somewhere else’. But then the team finally picked up and we got back to having a team and stuff, so I kind of got back into it, but I was totally ‘I’m giving it up, can’t really be bothered with this rubbish anymore’...They just kept me going, just because they were just positive attitudes I was getting from people. (Cahli, 17)
In all of these cases players have been encouraged by others to continue playing. In one case the manager from another team provided the opportunity for the player. The other two examples show how the encouragement from other players was an important factor in motivating players to continue. Other reasons given for nearly giving up are in some cases quite personal, including health issues, relations with other people involved in the team, diminished enjoyment due to decisions ‘on the field’. The following example offers a detailed description of the dominant place of football in the wider context of a player’s life, and how this led to a resentment of being involved when other priorities emerged. The dominant place of football in the player’s life, and the player’s view that it had become part of their identity, which will be further explored in the following chapter, was similarly the reason they continued to play.

Yes I nearly gave up, because it came to the point I think, I’d always, always played football, it was always the most important thing. Like I didn’t drink until I was 18... I didn’t have time for it. There was no point me getting wrecked on a Friday or Saturday night with a game the next day, it just wasn’t appealing to me. And I think it came to the point where I was about 21...and I thought ‘god, I’ve not got a life’, you know? Football was dominating it and I thought ‘I’m going to pack this in’. And it happened to... another girl on the team at the same time, roughly the same age as me. I think we were both seeing people at the time, you get different priorities I think. And I wasn’t enjoying the football...because it was taking up my whole weekend. And I was just kind of resentful of it...But the reason I didn’t pack it in was because I thought this will pass, this is going to pass...But I think you just hit a phase where...football is not the most important thing in your life, and it gets a little difficult to kind of keep at it. But I’m glad I did. (Jo, 23)

It is also useful at this point to draw on comments made by a couple of interviewed players regarding the termination of participation in football by other players. Both players who drew attention to this work in sport related jobs, one a
Physical Education teacher and the other currently an Active Primary School Co-
ordinator, and therefore have extensive experience of sports participation,
particularly by children and adolescents. They both comment on possible reasons for
the 'drop-out' of girls from football. The emergence of other priorities during
adolescence and how the stereotypical image of a female footballer can conflict with
the expected image of adolescent girls are both identified as possible reasons for girls
dropping out of football.

There's a lot of girls who do drop out...as you move up to senior you
loose a lot of them. And I don't know if that's through...them
developing a social life or whatever... it could be they maybe don't
see it as feminine...You've always got this image of a female
footballer, you know, and they'll be trying to get away from that...The
young girls at 15 or 16... that kind of age... probably think, you know
that's a bit masculine...I'm not wanting to be a tomboy anymore, I'm
wanting to be a girl, to go out, or whatever, I want to be more
feminine. And they sometimes don't equate the two, they think if they
play football they can't be feminine, so they get shot of the football.
(Jo, 23)

The stereotypical image of women footballers is also identified as a concern of
player's parents, particularly when their daughters make the transition from playing at
junior level to playing at senior level.

Every now and again when you get these stupid programmes on TV
about women's football that paint negative images, girls drop out of
football, parents stop them from coming along. You get one or two
that stop, or you get parents coming in and asking 'is that what it's like
in the ladies team when they get there?'...So stereotypes yeah, they
read things, see things, but luckily our parents come and talk to us
about it but whether that stops any new girls coming in I don't know
because you're not in contact with these people. (Alison, 32)

Stereotypical images regarding women footballers, whether accurate or not, can still
be very powerful factors in decisions made by both players, and parents, regarding
participation in certain sports. This chapter will later discuss attitudes towards women’s football that players have experienced, and give some indication of the extent to which such stereotypes prevail in Scottish society.

All players were asked what is likely to influence their eventual decision to retire from playing football. There was a degree of consistency in responses, namely that injury (or age resulting in them being physically unable to compete) and diminishing enjoyment would be the only factors likely to force them to retire from playing.

Injury, if an injury happens, and injury happens... As I get older if I really am struggling... I think the most likely thing is if I don’t get to play actually, I might attempt to go back and play for a lower league team or something, I don’t know. I’m quite tempted just to call it a day if I’m not in the first team regularly. (Jennifer, 31)

I think mainly if I wasn’t enjoying it, because that's why I nearly packed it in, because I wasn’t enjoying it. I think if you dread it every week there's no point doing it, there's no point in doing something if you're not enjoying it. (Jo, 23)

If I’m too old I’ll have to stop eventually. That’s all that would really make me stop playing football, when I get too old... if I can’t do it anymore. (Kim, 17)

A number of players mentioned family commitments or having children as possible reasons for stopping, some however expressed that this would probably only result in a temporary break in playing and that they would probably continue to play afterwards. One player who has very recently retired explained how she still intends to be heavily involved in other roles related to football. These roles include those related to her work and also continuing involvement at club level.

Probably family commitments, like maybe my daughter starts doing something which means I can’t afford to commit the time, things like
that. Other than that, injury, or if I got to the point where I wasn’t able to compete at the level that I would want to. (Angie, 26)

Injuries probably, I'll try...not to let my work get in the way or home life. It depends what happens, whether I have another baby or whatever. But I’m going to try not to let that stop me from playing. But probably injury, that’s probably the only thing that I’d worry about that would stop, getting older. (Sarah, 27)

I’m still going to coach...And I still work for the SFA as an employed coach with them at the high level kids. So I mean I work at that level, I work at club level, I’m still going to stay on as administrator within the club, you know, so I’m still going to be there. (Alison, 32)

Overall, although some players have changed their sports participation from other sports to football, and also participate in a number of sports, all interviewed players consider football to be their main sport. Despite this all players, at various stages in their careers, have contemplated giving up playing football. The reasons for this are relatively varied and some relate to specific situations in players’ personal lives. The most common reason offered is the frustration of being involved in a struggling team. A number of players consider the drop-out of other players, particularly during adolescence. The emergence of other priorities, and the conflict between stereotypical images of the female footballer and the expected image of adolescent girls are considered to be possible reasons deterring some adolescent girls from continuing their participation in the sport. There is a degree of consistency with regard to what is most likely to make players retire from football, namely injury, diminished enjoyment, or other priorities. What seems to be apparent throughout, and will be explored in greater depth in the following chapter, is that once players have developed a commitment to football it has played and continues to play an important part in their lives.
The Influence of Socialising Agents

The previous sections describe players' socialisation experience throughout their football careers and have provided some discussion on the influence of others. This section will expand on this further in order to gain a fuller understanding of the extent of other people's influences, offer some insight into attitudes towards women's football in Scottish society, and again consider the extent to which socialisation into football is an interactive and reciprocal process. One important point to make is that the sample consists of women who are currently participating in football in Scotland, as this is consistent with the overall focus of the research. As a result the experiences of women and girls who may have desired to participate in football but were discouraged from doing so, those who experienced particularly negative socialising experiences resulting in them not pursuing the sport, or those who simply chose not to pursue participation in football, are absent from the analysis. Further research is required to address the experiences of these women and girls, and to give a more representative insight into individual and societal attitudes towards women's football in Scotland.

Both the survey and interviews explored the general influence of others on players' football careers, which combined provide detailed qualitative descriptions that can be supported by quantitative data. Survey respondents were asked to specify certain people who encouraged them to get involved in football at various levels of competition. They were also asked to categorise the overall influence of various people as being positive, neutral, or negative, state if they had ever been discouraged to play football by anyone, and if so give reasons as to why they thought this was the case. Interviewed players tended to volunteer information regarding the influence of other people when asked about how they became involved in football. In addition to
this they were asked to describe what had been the influence of various people throughout their football career, who had the most positive and most negative influences.

Survey data is used to provide an overview of the general influences of certain people. In line with treating socialisation as an ongoing process it offers a useful indication of how the influence of various people is prominent at different stages of the socialisation process. Interview data is used to offer more detailed descriptions of the influence of certain socialising agents. A discussion of the influences of all people mentioned by players would be exhaustive. This section will therefore concentrate primarily on which people player’s view as having had the most positive and most negative influences on their football careers.

*The Role of Socialising Agents at Various Stages of Career*

Survey respondents were asked who they consider to have encouraged them to participate in football at various levels of competition. An exploration of this enables us to consider who has had a significant influence on players’ socialisation at different stages in their career. Used alone this data would offer a relatively limited picture of players experiences and would neglect to acknowledge the interactive nature of the socialisation process, but it does allow us to gain an overall picture of the ongoing role of certain socialising agents. At the level of introduction to football Figure 5.5 clearly shows that fathers and brothers have a particularly influential role of introducing players to football. Brothers tend to be the most influential socialising agents for 27% of players, followed closely by fathers (23%). These findings are consistent with the interview and survey data discussed earlier in this chapter. Both friends and classmates are also relatively influential in introducing players to football (18% and 12% respectively).
Figure 5.5 - Who encouraged introduction to football at various levels

At the higher levels of football participation, when players develop a commitment to the sport, a shift in the influence of socialising agents emerges. At the level of regular football it is clear that other socialising agents become more influential. In particular the role of the coach, school teachers, and other women football players become prominent. As these socialising agents become more influential, the opposite occurs with the previously influential fathers, brothers, and classmates. This shift continues as players are introduced to the competitive level of football, with the exception of school teachers whose influence is not acknowledged by any players at this stage. One group of socialising agents that remains consistently influential throughout all stages is friends. Whether this is simply because players tend to have friends who are similarly interested in football or sport in general is unclear, but may offer a logical explanation. We can conclude therefore that at the level of introduction to football fathers and brothers tend to be the most influential in encouraging players. Their influence tends to be replaced by that of socialising agents from within the game, such as coaches and other players, as the level of competition increases.
The previous discussion regarding the interactive nature of players' involvement in football is again evident in Figure 5.5. Although the survey asked players to state who had encouraged them to be involved in football a number of players stressed that their involvement was related to other factors, many of the players considering their involvement to be self-driven. Such responses were categorised under “other” for the purposes of quantification. Other responses in this category included, for example, players responding to adverts in newspapers. The examples from interviews referred to previously support the notion that players themselves have an interactive role in the socialisation process.

An important implication of these findings is that research that simply explores who was influential in getting players initially involved in sports participation could be misleading since it doesn’t account for the ongoing nature of the socialisation process. For example, a player might have been involved playing informally with their father or brother but their influence throughout the player’s career may not always have been positive. The research has shown that initial involvement is more than likely to occur at an early age, during which time parents have an influential role. Developing a commitment to football however can occur at various ages and other socialising agents are more likely to become influential. In terms of considering changes in participation, or players nearly giving up at certain stages, these decisions tend to be made throughout players’ careers. Focusing on initial involvement would result in a narrow understanding of players’ ongoing experiences since it represents only the first stage in their career journey.
The General Influence of Various Socialising Agents

An exploration of the influence of certain socialising agents at different levels of competition produces some interesting findings. However it struggles to offer any information on the nature of influence of socialising agents who have not perhaps been the most influential. For example, Figure 5.5 tells us little about the influence of player’s mothers since they were not identified as being as influential as other agents. Figure 5.6 displays the overall influence of a number of socialising agents.

![Figure 5.6 - Influence of Socialising Agents](image)

The influence of all socialising agents is generally considered to be positive, although some socialising agents more than others have tended to have a less positive influence on players’ participation in football. Those agents who generally have a more positive influence are, as would be expected, consistent with those discussed in the previous section who have encouraged players at various stages of their careers. Although relatively infrequent, a number of players consider some socialising agents to have had a negative influence. Those displaying the highest frequencies of negative influence were PE teachers, followed by mothers, and then fathers. In terms
of the influence of siblings, although very few players consider them to have been a negative influence, sisters tend to be less positively influential than brothers. It is important to acknowledge a limitation of the survey data. Quantifying other people’s influences tends to give only a limited view of the extent to which others are influential and also fails to account for the more interactive nature of the socialisation process. For example there can be extremes to which players have classified socialising agents’ influence within each category. A player may consider the influence of someone to be particularly positive if they have played an extremely proactive role in the players’ socialisation into football. Similarly someone whose influence may simply be in response to the player’s personal motivation may also have been classified as positive. It is therefore extremely useful to consider more descriptive accounts of other people’s influences to account for such limitations of the quantitative data.

Interviewed players discussed the influence of various socialising agents throughout the interviews. They were encouraged to indicate the nature of the influence of various people and why they thought their influence was of that particular nature. They were also asked who has had the most positive and the most negative influences on their involvement in football. Finally they were asked if they had ever been discouraged from being involved in football, if so by whom, and what possible reasons they could give for the discouragement.

The most positive influences tended to come from parents, in particular fathers. This was the case for nine out of the 13 interviewed players. The extent to which parents have had a positive influence is generally more related to offering encouragement and support in response to their daughter’s choice of being involved in football, rather than parents playing a significantly pro-active role. In particular
players relate their parents’ positive influence to being instrumental in their initial involvement (usually the father), providing transport and equipment, and offering support by attending matches. The following examples are from players who consider their parents to have had the most positive influence on their involvement in football.

Mum and dad...it wasn’t as if they planted the seed, we just happened to be playing at school, but they were always very, very encouraging, and whatever we wanted to do they would be behind 110%...I remember, because we lived out the road, it’s like a 45 minute journey to get in for training or whatever, twice a week. So my mum...she never complained, she was probably never out of the car... And dad used to come along to the games, still does, comes along to all the games. (Jo, 23)

They’ve just kept me going playing football... My mum used to take me everywhere, up to Inverness, just everywhere for football. Didn’t matter where it was, she would take me there. Dad, he would be there as well. Training, they just put off everything just to take me to football. (Kim, 17)

My dad, he’s been a big influence, just like supporting me kind of thing, like my transport getting me to places... My mum, she’s like supported me as well, she was like, in the first couple of years she was a bit apprehensive about it all, since then she’s like supported me fully. I think because she obviously saw that I was enjoying it and because I was being quite successful she supported me even more. (Fiona, 21)

Well, my parents, from even when I was younger, I think it was my dad that got me into it. And I’ve always liked sport, you hear a lot of maybe your mum doesn’t want you to play or whatever, but my mum’s always been fine, I always got my right equipment and stuff so that was fine. (Shirley, 21)

It is interesting to note that in relation to being instrumental in getting players initially involved in football mothers haven’t been considered as major socialising agents in comparison to fathers. However, in relation to offering support at certain levels, such as transport etc. the accounts reveal mothers as playing an important supportive role. Other common responses include positive influences from friends,
siblings, and partners. Although most players have experienced a positive influence from their parents this was not uniformly the case, with one player’s parents and another player’s mother in particular being considered as having the most negative influence on their involvement in football for different reasons. One player’s parents’ discouragement was generally in reaction to their daughters’ experiences and enjoyment, whereas the other player has received discouragement from her mother due to her attitude towards women being involved in football.

My mum hates me playing football. Every time I come home and complain that something hurts she tells me I should take up tiddlywinks or something, so she’s fed up of me moaning...I think she thinks, why do I bother playing football if I come home on a Sunday and I moan about how long a day has been, or moan about being kicked...She’s not particularly encouraging, but she’s interested enough, she’ll come down to a couple of home games...And dad sometimes as well, if I haven’t been picked or something...He knows that I can be better than a lot of the people there...and if I come home and moan he’ll say ‘well why don’t you just pack it in? Give it until Christmas and pack it in, do something else’. (Heather, 27)

My mum, even when I got the job as a Football Development Officer and that was my living, she was like ‘when are you getting another job?’...And mum and dad came to watch me play last Sunday, and the first thing my mum said after the game was ‘right, I take it that’s you finished now?’...She has this whole problem with females playing football and also the fact that injuries and everything that come of it. (Alison, 32)

In relation to negative influences, despite these two references to parents, the most commonly stated negative influence for interviewed players was that of the school. Almost half of the players considered the school to have had the most negative influence. Generally responses related to attitudes towards girls playing football at school and therefore limited support or opportunities.
With school we just didn’t get the opportunity, I know that’s changed now...but when I was at school, no it wasn’t, we couldn’t even consider it as a sport for females at that point. (Sarah, 27)

School, I’d say that was pretty much a negative thing because at school there wasn’t anything at all. There was a few of us to try and set up a team and but we’d have to just arrange it ourselves, no support whatsoever...In first and second year we asked the guy that took the guys football team but he was not keen at all, there was guys football but not girls football, I think that was the general feeling. (Claire, 22)

Most negative would be when I was at school, some people there...Because everyone is expected to be, they all expect you to be girlie, and just go out and not play football, but it’s supposed to be boys that did that. (Kim, 17)

The remaining players struggled to identify particular people as having a negative influence and tended to suggest that the most negative influence they had experienced was simply general attitudes towards women’s football. A number of players expressed that they had experienced no negative influences in relation to their participation in football. Again it is important to point out that the experiences of players who are currently playing football do not represent possible negative influences that may have resulted in girls and women choosing not to pursue, or terminating their participation in football.

Finally the survey explored whether players had experienced any particular discouragement from anyone, and if so why they thought this had been the case.

Figure 5.7 shows a summary of responses. The most common socialising agent to show discouragement is players’ mothers. Reasons given for discouragement from mothers are consistently related to concerns regarding injury and, to a lesser extent, the view that girls should not play football. Responses categorised as ‘others’ included ‘men’, ‘female friends’, and ‘society’ in general.
The findings in Figure 5.7 relate to previous results that the most common socialising agents to have a negative influence or to discourage players are mothers and schools. This section has discussed the influence of other people on players' football careers. What has also emerged is the identification of 'general' attitudes, rather than specific people, as having a negative influence on player's experiences. The final section in this chapter explores such attitudes that have been experienced by players.

**Experiences of General Attitudes towards Women’s Football in Scottish Society**

The identification of general attitudes towards women's football as a common negative influence experienced by players requires further investigation. Both survey respondents and interviewed players were asked what attitudes towards women's football that they have experienced in Scotland. The survey explored specifically what players considered the view of the press and the general public would be in relation to a number of statements about women's football. Interviews explored the topic in a number of ways, including discussions of what attitudes players have encountered from the media and the general public, what stereotypes exist in relation to women's football and to what extent, based on their experiences, such stereotypes prevail in Scottish society.
Survey respondents view the attitude of the general Scottish public towards women’s football fairly negatively. Respondents were asked to state to what extent they thought the general Scottish public would agree (on a scale of ‘strongly agree’ to ‘strongly disagree’) to a number of statements about women’s football. Figure 5.8 summarises the responses based on players’ experiences.

Most responses were concentrated between ‘disagree’ and ‘agree’. A relatively high proportion of players considers the general Scottish public to ‘disagree’ with the two most favourable statements about women’s football. Over one third (35%) of players consider the public to disagree with the statement that ‘women’s football should become professional’ and 28% consider the public to disagree with the statement that ‘women’s football should be taken more seriously’. To the other extreme, a high proportion of players, 55% and 50% respectively, consider the general Scottish public to ‘agree’ with the two more negative statements (‘women’s football is never taken seriously’ and ‘football is a man’s game’). Although players considered the general Scottish public to ‘strongly disagree’ with few of the statements, a significantly higher proportion of players (14%) consider the public to ‘strongly disagree’
disagree’ with the positive statement that ‘women’s football should become professional’. In summary, based on their experiences, players consider the general Scottish public to have relatively negative attitudes towards women’s football.

Survey respondents were similarly asked about what they consider the attitudes of the media to be towards a number of statements regarding women’s football. Figure 5.9 summarises the extent to which players thought the media would agree with various statements. Responses are again generally concentrated between ‘agree’ and ‘disagree’. In relation to the most positive statement about women’s football (‘should be taken more seriously and higher coverage’) the most common response by players (38%) is that the media would ‘disagree’. In relation to the most negative statement that ‘no one is interested’ in women’s football, the most common response by players (44%) is that the media would ‘agree’.

![Figure 5.9 - Scottish media views on women’s football](chart)

Although a relatively high proportion of players (39%) consider the media to ‘agree’ with the statement that women’s football ‘deserves a limited amount of media coverage’, a significant proportion of players consider the media to ‘agree’ that women’s football is ‘not good enough to receive coverage’ (49%) and ‘not popular enough to receive coverage’ (52%). In summary, the survey data suggest that players
consider the media to have relatively negative views about the coverage of women’s football.

In relation to both the general Scottish public and the media, interviewed players similarly consider there to be a generally negative attitude towards women’s football. When asked what they thought the general attitudes were towards women’s football from the general public most players recognised that there has been and continues to be a distinct lack of awareness about the organisation and standard of women’s football in Scotland. It was also acknowledged that limited media coverage has contributed to this lack of awareness in the general public, and men in particular, forming ignorant views often based on stereotypes. What does emerge from descriptions is that players consider attitudes towards women’s football to be becoming more positive due to a gradual increase in general awareness of the sport. This has resulted from an increase in participation, particularly amongst young girls, and more positive media coverage.

First I think it’s changing... when I was obviously younger there was no coverage or anything like that, so people were saying it was just ‘oh a bunch of girls, they can’t play football, get in the home’... Because more girls are playing they’re passing on their values or whatever, saying it’s all right. I think because the skill level has increased... people are actually looking at it now... Some of the coverage on the TV as well and then like the FA Cup on Sky Sports, a lot of people will look and say ‘oh they aren’t just running about pulling their hair back and doing cartwheels in the middle of the park, they can play football’. (Fiona, 21)

I think it’s changed dramatically over the last few years, even at a local level to national level. When we first started playing it was hugely negative, we couldn’t get anything in local papers, you know. We tried to get sponsorship, non-existent because people just didn’t think that females should be playing football. So it was really negative and just your stereotypes, the guys that just stereotype women that play football, and just weren’t interested in going and looking at a game to see if they could actually play. (Alison, 32)
I don’t think they realise... that there is like a league structure and there is a premier, first, second and third (division). Because when you say to them ‘I play for Arbroath and we’re in the third division’, they’re ‘third division? What do you mean? I didn’t even know there was...’...But I think that could change over the next wee while because more girls are playing at school. But in general I think not a lot of people really realise how structured, the fact that there are a lot of teams formed. (Sarah, 27)

Players also refer to more positive media coverage increasing awareness, especially at a local level. Although a number of players acknowledge that press coverage in local papers is generally a result of the teams’ own initiative, sending in their own match reports rather than the papers having a proactive role.

Interviewed players were also asked to describe the types of stereotypical images that exist in relation to women football players. There was a significant degree of consistency across responses with the majority of players referring to images regarding sexuality and femininity that are prevalent in the attitudes of the general public and the media. Players’ opinions and experiences regarding such stereotypes will be further discussed in the following chapter. It is however useful to offer an example of press coverage to illustrate some of the most extreme attitudes towards women’s football that are apparent in Scotland. In January 2003 many Scottish newspapers reported on news that the manager of Gretna Ladies FC had resigned claiming that relationships between a number of lesbians within the team was having a negative affect on team spirit and the general atmosphere at the club. Although Gretna Ladies actually compete in an English league, the news generated a relatively large amount of press coverage in Scottish newspapers, particularly in the tabloid papers. One particular report for the Daily Record from journalist and TV presenter Tam Cowan is riddled with sexual stereotypes regarding women’s football.
AH, what a shame. Just as Channel Five was undoubtedly preparing a bumper deal to screen all of next season's matches, I'm afraid Gretna women's football team is about to fold. Yes, it's curtains for the lesbian players. Numerous affairs between team-mates set tongues wagging and, with team spirit destroyed, boss Barney Davidson has quit. The manager reckons eight of his 17-strong outfit (which plays, presumably, in the Beaver Homes League) are "Eric Sykes" and I found this pretty surprising. You see, having carefully studied the team photo in Wednesday's papers - and don't say you didn't play exactly the same game at home - I could spot only four. There may have been a fifth but it's hard to tell as her face is partially clouded by the smoke from a colleague's pipe. Trouble has apparently been brewing at the club for some time. A few weeks back, for example, one of the players decided to shave her legs just before a match - and totally knackered the furious groundsman's Flymo. Even the pre-match huddle was causing bother. A recent kick-off had to be delayed by 15 minutes after two of the players' sideburns became entangled. Never mind, the manager may have quit and the club might be about to bite the dust but it hasn't been such a bad old week for the Gretna ladies. (Cowan, 2003: 61)

This article offers an extreme example of how stereotypical images are prevalent in Scottish society and how they are used to ridicule women's football. In summary, both survey and interview data suggest that the attitudes of the general public and media in Scotland are relatively negative towards women's football. Interviewed players relate this to a lack of awareness and a degree of ignorance that results in people reproducing stereotypical images of women football players. Most interviewed players recognise that although they have not personally been discouraged from playing football, certain attitudes and assumptions regarding women's football, particularly those relating to sexual stereotypes, have the potential to discourage others from participation. A more comprehensive analysis of sexual stereotypes associated with women's football is offered in the next chapter.
Conclusion

This chapter has treated socialisation as an interactive and ongoing process. Women's socialisation into football in Scotland has been explored in relation to several stages of players' careers. It is clear that even at the stage of initial involvement in football, which tends to occur during early childhood, players are not simply passive learners. Stroot (2002) reviews socialisation research to suggest that the adoption of an internalisation model is most appropriate when considering primary socialisation as infants and during childhood. It is suggested that socialisation changes from such a uni-dimensional process to a two-way interaction process after initial entry into sport (Stroot, 2002). The findings in this chapter suggest that women football players are not so passive in their initial involvement during childhood and adolescence, and that primary socialisation is not simply a one-way process, but rather an interactive process where players have a decision-making role. There is further evidence of a reciprocal influence, particularly from daughters to parents, when players become initially involved and throughout their commitment to football.

In accordance with previous research, opportunities for and attitudes towards girls' football at school, particularly high school, have a significant influence on players' transition from their initial involvement to developing a commitment to football. For those whose initial involvement occurred during childhood few were able to foster a commitment to football exclusively through their school. A lack of provision for girls' football at school led to a disruption in the career of a number of players. Players who were able to continue participation in football through school tended to develop their commitment to competitive participation outside of the school environment.
What is clear from interviews in particular is that, although players followed various paths in making the transition from initial involvement to developing a commitment to football, once a commitment had been developed all players consider football to be their main sport. An exploration of issues of retirement and changing participation further reveals that football is an important part of the lives of most players. Most players express that they have experienced fairly negative attitudes towards women's football in Scotland from both the general public and the media. It is also acknowledged that such attitudes, usually based on stereotypes, are potentially discouraging. In their review of research on the sports socialisation process Horne, Tomlinson and Whannel (1999: 154) conclude that 'it is necessary to continue to develop a model of the human individual that recognises both the freedom and constraint involved in social action'. What becomes apparent within this sample of current players is that human agency has generally prevailed in the face of various degrees of constraint, particularly those imposed within the school environment, and more subtly at societal level. The meaning of football in players' lives has an important bearing on their desire to become and remain involved and such meanings are the focus of the following chapter.
CHAPTER SIX – THE SUBCULTURE OF WOMEN'S FOOTBALL IN SCOTLAND

Introduction

This chapter provides an interpretation of the subculture of women's football in Scotland based on players' experiences and the meanings they attach to football in their lives. Earlier chapters have already contributed to our understanding of women's football in the context of Scottish society and particularly how women's football as a subculture has been 'constitutively inserted into the struggles, the forms of compliance and opposition, social reproduction and transformation, associated with changing patterns of social development' (Gruneau, 1981: 10). Following a brief discussion of the general characteristics that define the subculture of women's football in Scotland, this chapter is divided into three main sections that combine to offer a more comprehensive interpretation of the subculture. It is recognised by Nayak (2003: 14) that as research on subcultures has evolved they have become seen as 'micro-communities, groups within groups, who came to share similar felt and understood interests', including sport, 'and a whole spectrum of embodied social practices'. This is a useful way to view the subculture of women's football in Scotland. The first section interprets women's football in Scotland as comprising of three interlocking group cultures (Fine and Kleinman, 1979). The second section considers individual membership to these group cultures, based on the meaning of football in players' lives, and the constitution of subcultural and group-cultural capital. The final section of this chapter identifies the dominant, residual and emergent nature of the three group cultures and explores the power struggles and tensions between them.
Towards a Definition

Donnelly’s (1981) notion that subcultures are based on achieved rather than ascribed characteristics is developed to form a preliminary analysis of the subculture of women’s football in this chapter. Donnelly (1981) identifies eight characteristics that define achieved subcultures: identifiable groups; composition; cultural characteristics; distinctive nature; lifestyle and resources; scope and potential; fulfilment of individual needs; and interaction and communication. Although Donnelly’s (1981) exploration of sport subcultures is dated the themes he addresses remain particularly relevant to this study. Recent analyses of sports subcultures have tended to be informed by Donnelly’s earlier work (Wheaton, 2000 and 2002). Several of the characteristics of achieved subcultures identified by Donnelly (1981), in particular identifiable groups, composition, distinctive nature and scope and potential, can be applied to offer a very basic definition of the subculture of women’s football in Scotland. The remaining characteristics (cultural characteristics, lifestyle and resources, fulfilment of individual needs, and interaction and communication) receive more thorough scrutiny in the subsequent sections since they alert us to differences in the meaning of football in players’ lives.

Identifiable Groups and Composition

The subculture of women’s football in Scotland is an identifiable group based on members’ participation in football. In the case of sport subcultures recognising an identifiable group is at least relatively straightforward since there usually exists an established focal concern, in this case various degrees of involvement in football. In terms of composition this subculture is a collective of small groups of individuals who are registered with a specific club competing in one of the divisions within the SWFL, or in the SWPL. The small groups, or individual
clubs, possess various common cultural characteristics. They also have the potential and the ability to interact with each other either directly, via matches, meetings, award ceremonies, or symbolically through league newsletters, Internet web-sites such as www.scottishwomensfootball.com or www.swfl.org.uk, the official SWF Ltd magazine ‘Miss-Kick’, and so on (Donnelly, 1981: 570). There are also few barriers to the exchange of members within women’s football as players move relatively freely from one club to another for a variety of reasons.

**Distinctive Nature**

In terms of being distinctive in nature, women’s football is arguably not as distinct as other examples of sports subcultures because many of the cultural characteristics of football are diffuse throughout Scottish society. Whereas with other sports subcultures it is the sport itself that is distinctive in nature (e.g. high-risk sports), with football it is the act of women participating that is more distinctive in nature than the sport itself. There are several ways in which women’s football and/or women footballers can be viewed as distinct. Women’s football is distinctive in nature to men’s football in Scotland, particularly in relation to cultural differences and the way that, despite a gradual incorporation into the dominant sports culture at a structural level, women’s football is treated as distinct (or marginal) by the general Scottish public and the Scottish media. Women footballers are distinctive in nature to other sportswomen and other women. Although there may be numerous ascribed and achieved similarities amongst women in Scotland, women footballers are likely to have shared experiences that are unique to their participation in football. The cultural elements that characterise the subculture of women’s football will be distinct from those that characterise the subculture of women’s gymnastics, or those that characterise other identifiable groups of women in Scottish society. At the most
basic level, membership to the subculture of women's football is determined by sex. There is also a degree of skill and ability required in order to participate at even the lowest ability level. To a varying extent, women who are members of a football club are required to be committed to attend training sessions and matches on a regular basis. There are numerous other factors, for example economic or attitudinal factors, which may make it difficult or unappealing for other women to attain membership to the subculture.

Scope and Potential

It is asserted by Donnelly (1981) that in order for an activity to result in the emergence of a subculture it has to have scope and potential. He further states that 'a subculture is a relatively stable and enduring group and cannot be based on a fad or craze' (Donnelly, 1981: 575). Chapter Three considers how it is difficult to suggest that the participation of middle and upper class women in football in the late 19th century constituted the emergence of a subculture. It is debatable as to whether, if indeed a subculture of women's football did emerge during this stage, the cultural characteristics of the members were significant enough to sustain a subculture. Women's football therefore at this stage was possibly more representative of a fad or a craze. Women's football in Scotland has since developed into a competitive, structured and institutionalised sport, despite being subjected to a degree of hostility and subordination. Throughout its development it has acquired and is continually acquiring additional characteristics. The final section of this chapter explores the fluid nature of cultural characteristics, and how dominant, emergent and residual elements of culture are constantly changing within the subculture.

Several of the characteristics that define an achieved subculture have been applied to give a very basic definition of the subculture of women's football in
Scotland. An examination of the remaining characteristics reveals a more complex subculture and the existence of collective and individual identities and multiple meanings of football in players’ lives. Although football essentially brings players who share various ascribed and achieved characteristics together into this social space, the meanings attached to the place of football in their lives differ. Women footballers in Scotland are not simply a homogeneous group, indeed there is evidence of multiple and sometimes conflicting identities.

An analysis of three interlocking group cultures that exist within the subculture of women’s football in Scotland is presented based on the core question; to what extent do identities and meanings that players attach to football vary across group cultures? The meaning of football in players’ lives not only determines which interlocking group culture(s) they belong to but also the extent to which they are regarded as ‘core members’ or ‘outsiders’ to the various interlocking group cultures and the subculture of women’s football as a whole. The analysis is then developed to consider individual membership and subcultural capital based on the core question: what elements of subcultural capital determine the extent to which players are ‘core’ members or ‘outsiders’, and do these elements differ across group cultures? Finally, the analysis is extended to examine the dominant, emergent, or residual aspects of culture within the subculture of women’s football. Since culture is dynamic in nature, so are dominant, emergent, or residual elements of culture. Similarly, identities are fluid and are amenable to change as cultural and subcultural settings surrounding individuals also change. The question at the heart of the final section is; what power struggles and tensions exist between dominant, emergent and residual elements of culture within the subculture of women’s football in Scotland?
The ‘Pals’, the ‘Professionals’ and the ‘Conformers’

Through a collective exploration of several of Donnelly’s (1981) characteristics of achieved subcultures (cultural characteristics, lifestyle and resources, fulfilment of individual needs and interaction and communication) it is possible to appreciate that football has different meanings in the lives of different players. These meanings are influenced by a various contextual factors such as experience, ability level, age, aspirations, the context of an individual’s wider life, the extent to which they socialise with other players, their identity and inclusiveness within subculture, the extent to which they form part of the network of women footballers, and various personality traits. The causality is not simply unidirectional and the meaning of football in players’ lives, in turn, affects some of the above factors.

It is possible to identify three distinct but interlocking group cultures within the subculture of women’s football. The extent to which a player belongs to one or more group culture(s) reflects the meaning they attach to football in their life. This section discusses the similarities within and differences between the characteristics of these interlocking group cultures. Specifically, at the heart of this section is the following question: to what extent do identities and meanings that players attach to football vary across group cultures? This is answered through an interpretation of the three group cultures: the ‘Pals, the ‘Professionals’ and the ‘Conformers’. Figure 6.1 offers a diagrammatic representation of the interlocking nature of these group cultures within the subculture of women’s football in Scotland. Within and across each group culture is what is referred to by Donnelly (1981) as the horizontal stratification of subcultural membership from ‘core members’ to ‘outsiders’ (Donnelly, 1981 cited in Wheaton 2002: 253). In Figure 6.1 membership levels 1, 2
and 3 relate to the stratified nature of subcultural membership representing 'core members', 'associate members', and 'outsiders', respectively.

Figure 6.1 – Interlocking group cultures and horizontal stratification of subculture membership within women's football in Scotland

A limitation of such a model, as Wheaton (2002: 253) discusses, is that 'lived experience is infinitely more complex and fluid than any rigid application of a model of identity positions would suggest'. However, the adaptation of Donnelly's (1981) model represented in Figure 6.1 accounts for the possibility of multiple identities and individual membership, to varying extents, of one or more of the interlocking group cultures. The analysis in the second section asserts that it is possible to identify elements of subcultural capital, the acquisition of which differentiates the extent to which some individuals are core members of one or more group culture(s) and outsiders to others.

The 'Pals'

This group culture generally consists of players who consider the social aspects of being part of a football club as particularly important. Despite the majority of players taking their football relatively seriously they accept that they are
not likely to make a living out of football and the social rewards attached to club membership are valued highly. Within this group culture are players who are relatively experienced and have been playing football since a young age, and some less experienced players. The ‘core pals’ tend to have a social life that revolves around friends who are in their team, or involved in football out-with their team (e.g. previous teams) in some form or another. The extent to which football is taken seriously by such players may vary depending on factors such as ability level. Generally players are committed to training sessions and matches and dedicate a significant amount of time to football and football related activities due to their enjoyment of the sport and the social rewards they experience.

An important preliminary observation is that there tends to be a relationship between the extent to which the social aspects of being a club member are valued and ability level (or division). The survey explored how players value the social aspects of club membership. Figure 6.2 displays a cross-tabulation of players’ views about being a member of a club by the division in which their club competes. The majority of players across all divisions either consider that ‘football is important but sometimes enjoy social (aspects)’ or ‘value playing (football) and social equally’. Across divisions the selection between these two statements varies. It is clear that the view of players in the Premier League is skewed towards football being more important than the social side and the view of players in the First, Second and Third divisions is skewed more towards the social aspect being as important as playing football.
If the two extreme ability levels, the Premier League and the Third Division, are compared to each other the skewness is more apparent. Despite this preliminary observation interview data reveals that several Premier League players share cultural characteristics (such as beliefs, knowledge, customs, behaviours, understandings) more typical of being considered a ‘pal’, rather than a ‘professional’ for example. There are also players from lower divisions who share fewer cultural characteristics that are typical of being a ‘pal’. Evidently the cultural characteristics of this particular group culture transcend ability levels and it is useful therefore to consider the various cultural characteristics of the ‘pals’.

The meaning that football has in players’ lives became particularly revealing through discussions of why they play football, what and how important they consider the social aspects to be, and what they would miss the most if they were unable to play football again. Although all interviewed players expressed that they primarily play football because they enjoy it, there are various aspects of being involved that players enjoy more than others. In terms of the fulfilment of individual needs Donnelly (1981) discusses the importance of various types of rewards that result from being a member of a subculture. The purely social rewards identified by
Donnelly (1981: 576) include ‘involvement in a group, feeling of community, and the establishing of long-term friendships or even partnerships with individuals with similar interests’. The ‘pals’ tend to emphasise a number of social rewards associated with being a member of a club as particularly important including friendship, enjoyment, and ‘having a laugh’. The following responses to what the main reasons are that players play football typify such attitudes towards their involvement.

I play football now because all my friends do, because if I didn’t play football I’d have a Tuesday, a Thursday, and all day Sunday I would have nothing to fill it...I know a couple of the lasses in the team that get fed up with it and want to pack it in, but then you think well all my friends, you know it’s such a large bit of your life that you would miss out, you know, you wouldn’t see a lot of people. (Heather, 27)

I think that for all teams, having a laugh and you know, getting on with the people they’re playing with, things like that, makes all the crowd go back every week. (Lisa, 27)

The ‘pals’ can also be characterised as having a friend base that is generally football-related. The establishment of such friendships is another social reward that results from membership in the subculture, and is particularly evident amongst the ‘pals’. Not only is the social element of football the most important to them but their social life is often dependent on their involvement in football.

I would say, I wouldn’t have thought it but when I think about the things I do and who I do them with then it’s all through football really that I do them, nearly always. (Jennifer, 31)

Most of my, well a lot of my friends are through football. (Shirley, 21)

I would say about 70 – 75% (of friends) are related to football. (Claire, 23)
For one of the core ‘pals’ the friendships developed through football performed a particularly important function in helping her deal with personal problems in the context of her private life. As a result the friendships formed have continued to be an extremely important part of her life, to such an extent that this has also extended to provide a social focal point for her friends outside of football.

At the time we started our senior team I split up with my partner and was kind of at a lose end so that kind of came at just the right time, it gave me another focus and some new friends to go with. So within football the friends that I’ve made there, I mean they’ll be there for life, it’s just fantastic. And also for my friends out of football it’s also given us a focus, something that we can also do together, you know that they can come and be part of the social nights and things as well. (Alison, 32)

A further common characteristic amongst the ‘pals’ is their attitude towards club loyalty. Several players discuss hypothetically, or based on experience, the possibility of transferring to another club to play football. Some players stress that they would find it very difficult to leave their club due to the various social rewards accrued, such as their involvement in this particular group, the friendships they have formed, and the feeling of community with the other club members. The following account illustrates that for the ‘pals’ the social rewards accrued through subcultural membership are more important than ambitions to play at higher level and as a result they would remain loyal to the club to which they are an established member.

You know, it’s a football team yeah, but it’s also a big circle of friends. So therefore I’d find it hard to leave the team... I mean I was asked in the summer to leave the team and go and play football for another team.... But I thought yeah, I might get on better playing football with that team but I couldn’t leave my pals, leave my mates...so it wasn’t an option really... It’s not as if you leave football and that’s it, it would be too easy to leave then. If the football wasn’t
happening at the time you could walk away but there's the huge social thing there that would make it hard to leave. (Heather, 27)

When asked what might make them stop playing football one of the 'pals' describes how she would probably not join a different club if she moved away from the area of her current club.

If I ended up going back through to Glasgow...and I can't always get back through that might make me stop playing football, and I wouldn't really look for another team...Just because I'm happy where I am just now, so I wouldn't want to move...To have the football without the social or whatever, I don't think that's something I would do. (Claire, 23)

This player would prefer to retire from playing football rather than forsake her already established social status within her current club and begin the process of socialisation into a new club setting where she may not accrue the same social rewards.

In order to examine further the extent to which various aspects of playing football are important to players the interviews explored what they would miss the most if they were not able to play again. A particularly common response amongst the 'pals' related to social aspects, thus confirming the extent to which the social aspects of being a member of a club are important within this group culture.

Probably the social side, just missing the banter, the jokes, and the giggles, and all that. (Cahli, 17)

...probably just the social aspect of it. Just having a laugh at training, things like that you know, the company that you're in and that, I'd miss that a lot. (Lisa, 27)
Similarly players were asked how they would feel if they were not able to make it out socially with other members of their club. As expected the ‘pals’ expressed that they would be particularly disappointed to miss out on any social events.

...I wouldn’t like to never be able to go out with them you know, that would be hard...Just missing out on the gossip and, a typical female I want to know what’s going on, and as I say they’re all friends as well so that’s like missing out on seeing them in that kind of, away from the football. (Alison, 32)

Absolutely gutted because if you’re part of that team, you obviously want to be there, you want to experience what they’re experiencing. Because I would feel, I wouldn’t feel jealous, envious towards any of them but I’d feel that I’d missed the experience that I would have wanted. But I would feel really, really gutted if I didn’t get the chance to go. (Cahli, 17)

A number of players suggest that if they weren’t able to play football again this would not necessarily have a negative effect on the social rewards they currently experience through football since the friendships they have made are so established to be affected.

If I wasn’t able to play football again, as I say, I would still have the friends that I’ve made because they’re good friends, they’re not just going to disappear because I’m not playing football...I’m still friends with some people that don’t even play football just now, but we’re all still a good social group. (Heather, 27)

In summary, in terms of the meaning of football in their lives, the ‘pals’ consider the social aspects associated with being a member of a football club as particularly important. Consequently a number of players have formed many and important friendships with players in their club, and some outside of their own club. Many of the ‘pals’ suggest that a large proportion of their friend base are related to football and these established social links form an integral part of their social life.
The ‘Professionals’

There are a number of players by whom football is taken particularly seriously. The pseudo name allocated to such players, the ‘professionals’, refers predominantly to their attitude towards football and is not a reflection of professional status since the vast majority of women footballers competing in Scotland do so on an amateur basis (see Chapter Three regarding the current state of women’s football in Scotland). Within senior women’s football in Scotland the ‘professionals’ currently represent a relatively small proportion of players. Those outside of the sample of senior players surveyed and interviewed for this research who are currently going through organised youth structures are likely to constitute this group culture of women footballers in the future. The emerging nature of this group culture will be further discussed in the final section of the chapter. Although this group culture does not seem as prominent as the ‘pals’, those who belong to it consider football to play a significant part in their lives. The ‘professionals’ tend to acknowledge that there is a social element associated with being a member of a club, but emphasise that this is not an exceptionally important element to them. The meaning of football in the ‘professionals’ lives relates almost exclusively to the individual rewards that they accrue from playing football.

Players within this group culture tend to be either young players who believe in the possibility that they might make a living out of playing football in the future, or more experienced players that have played and still play at a high level and approach their football with a very professional attitude. The following responses to what the main reasons are that they play football illustrate this range of members within the ‘professionals’ group culture.
Because I enjoy it a lot, I’ve always enjoyed it and I want to be a professional one day (Kim, 17)

I like the game... I’m maybe not one of those players who particularly plays for the social side, that doesn’t mean that I don’t get on with the team mates or anything like that, I do, but the reason I play is, I play for the game. (Angie, 26)

I see myself as having a different attitude towards my football, I’m a competitive person, it’s basically there for my football’s sake. I’m not there for, like when I was younger I probably was, but I’m not there for social reasons. (Fiona, 21)

There is also a sense that the ‘professionals’ make some attempt to detach themselves from other players who do not take football as seriously and are there primarily for the social aspects.

Everybody’s got different reasons for playing football. Obviously there’s two distinct, people that take it seriously and people that don’t take it as seriously. (Fiona, 21)

...I think that within teams you can maybe, you know, get... people who are maybe doing it to maybe better themselves, for fitness, and want to be at their best, and then you still get people who are just there for a laugh, because their pals are, you know, a good way to spend a Sunday afternoon or whatever. (Angie, 26)

The ‘professionals’ differentiate themselves from the ‘pals’ based primarily on their view that the ‘pals’ do not take their football as seriously as they do. It is also interesting to note that the ‘professional’ who currently plays in the Premier League (Angie) acknowledges that both ‘professionals’ and ‘pals’ exist within teams and this differentiation is not simply a more extreme reflection of ability level, supporting the findings in the previous section. The potential tension between the two group cultures will be explored in the next section.

Since the ‘professionals’ tend not to consider their participation in football as primarily social they emphasise that their friend base generally consists of people
outside of football. This is not because they do not regard their fellow club members as friends, but because the importance they attach to be involved in football is almost exclusively related to playing the game. As a result their club members are treated primarily as footballers over a potentially prominent group of friends. The following examples confirm how the 'professionals' regard their social life to exist outside of the club environment. In the first example the player is discussing who she usually goes out with socially.

I mainly do it with people out of football, it just clears your head, don't want to be with them all the time. You see them when you're training, every Sunday, can get a bit stressful if they're the people in your social life with as well. (Kim, 17)

In the following example the player is responding to being asked whether she considers the social side of being a member of a football club as important.

I don't see it as being important because at the end of the day all my friends that I've grown up with and, although I get on with a lot of the girls I play football with, have a laugh with them and that, but obviously my pals at home that I've grown up with are my friends. (Fiona, 21)

Further confirmation of what aspect of playing football is most important to the 'professionals' is indicated by various responses. One player's response to what they would miss the most if they couldn't play football again focuses exclusively on 'the game'.

The game, definitely the game, that's what I would miss, because I was able to train when I was pregnant... and it was just the game, I missed the game on the Sunday afternoons. (Angie, 26)
The 'professionals’ generally aim to continue to be involved in playing football for as long as possible and expect it to play an important part in the rest of their lives. Indeed most of the 'professionals' are already, and consider that they will continue to be, committed to football in some form or another after they have terminated their own participation with some also aiming to focus their career around being involved in football.

After football I suppose I'll continue my coaching. Obviously there's the coaching thing, but obviously I want to get a job and give more opportunities to girls... but kind of a similar job to... girls and women's football development officer. (Fiona, 21)

I'll just continue to play for as long as possible, for as long as I'm still enjoying it. After that I'll probably get more involved in the coaching side, I already did some coaching for regional squads, I put my name down for more courses to go through that and I'll probably end up doing coaching. (Jo, 23)

A strong characteristic of the 'professionals’ is their commitment to football. Whereas many of the 'pals' are committed members of their group culture, their commitment is often based on the subsequent social rewards they accrue. The 'professionals’ however tend to show particularly intense commitments to football based on more individual rewards and potential future material rewards. Due to the significant time commitment the 'professionals’ dedicate to football the prospect of being injured or not being able to play again would have severe implications.

I'd go off my head! I wouldn't know what to do because that's all I really do, train, and every Sunday like, oh I'd be lost! I don't know what I'd do. (Kim, 17)

See if I gave up football today I think I'd be like sitting in the house... not knowing what to do because basically my life is football. (Fiona, 21)
The weekly time profile shown in Figure 6.3 corroborates the extent to which the 'professionals' dedicate their spare time to football. In particular this player is committed to additional fitness training resulting in a significant proportion of their spare time (on 6 days of the week) being spent on football related activities (highlighted) aimed at improving their performance and emphasising a particularly professional attitude.

Although the 'professionals' currently represent a relatively small proportion of the interviewed sample of women footballers it is possible to identify several clear defining characteristics of players within this group culture. In summary the most defining characteristic of the 'professionals' is that they exhibit a very professional attitude towards their participation in football. There is also tendency to differentiate themselves from other players who they consider to take their football less seriously, being motivated primarily by the social rewards they accrue from being involved. Finally, the 'professionals' commit a significant amount of time to football and other activities related to improving their performance. What is important to point out is that players are not simply categorised into only one of

![Figure 6.3 - Weekly Time Profile: Kim (17 yrs) Premier League](image-url)
these interlocking group cultures. Although comparisons have been made in relation to differences between the ‘pals’ and the ‘professionals’, some players’ identities as women footballers combine sometimes paradoxical, sometimes complementary, elements of both group cultures. Similarly, as we will see in the next section, there are nebulous boundaries between the ‘pals’, the ‘professionals’ and the ‘conformers’, emphasising the interlocking nature of these group cultures.

The ‘Conformers’

Identifying the ‘conformers’ as one of the interlocking group cultures within women’s football in Scotland is somewhat problematic but, as this section goes on to explain, it is one cultural element of women’s football that simply cannot be ignored. Previous research on women’s football and the survey and interview data obtained by this research ‘provides evidence that demonstrates sexual stereotyping of women who play football’ (Caudwell, 2002: 29). Issues and experiences of gender and sexuality are not the central focus of this research and as a result the analysis that follows is based on a fairly cursory, but nonetheless revealing discussion of the existence of, and conformity to, stereotypes relating to sexuality associated with women who play football. This section argues that ‘conformers’ to stereotypes regarding the presence of lesbians represent members of a cultural element within the subculture of women’s football in Scotland. It is important to note that the use of the term ‘conformers’ does not come attached with negative connotations but simply acknowledges that the association of lesbians with women’s football is to some extent a legitimate one. Through her research with women footballers in England and Wales Caudwell (2002: 30) goes as far to suggest that not only is there an indication that ‘the lesbian stereotype has real currency’ but it may in fact ‘work to displace notions of dominant heterosexuality’. It is necessary
to distinguish between simply a lesbian presence in women’s football and the extent to which there actually exists a gay cultural element within the subculture of women’s football. Making this distinction is important in order to justify the inclusion of the ‘conformers’ as one of the interlocking group cultures within the subculture of women’s football in Scotland.

The analysis of the ‘conformers’ is somewhat problematic in the sense that interviewees did not willingly represent the voice of lesbians. Both Donnelly (1985) and Wheaton (2002) express the difficulties that a researcher faces in terms of gaining access to various groups of individuals when researching sports subcultures. In particular Wheaton (2002: 256) stresses how her ‘role as an active participant ...caused unexpected problems’ in relation to gaining access to the ‘windsurfing widows’, a particular group culture within the windsurfing subculture. As an outsider to this particular cultural element of women’s football in Scotland and since the central research focus was not specifically on experiences of sexuality it was not a priority to discover a willing informant to explore these issues exclusively. In his experience of researching sport and leisure subcultures, albeit specifically ‘deviant’ ones, Donnelly (1985: 556) asserts that ‘in most cases, unless the researcher possesses the requisite skills or is fortunate enough to discover a willing informant, the studies are based on straightforward observation’. Similarly, when the research is not overtly focused on sensitive and personal issues such as sexuality, the probability of being able to discover a willing informant is somewhat diminished.

This section of the analysis is based therefore on the views and opinions of players in relation to the existence of this cultural element within women’s football. A more ethnographic study exploring women’s experiences of sexuality within football, themes central to Caudwell’s (1999, 2000, and 2002) work, would enable a
comprehensive exploration of this cultural element within the context of the subculture of women's football in Scotland. Nevertheless, interviewees’ responses to a number of questions and the anonymous survey data enables a fundamental analysis and illustrates that not only does this cultural element exists within the subculture of women’s football, but the meaning of football in the lives of lesbian/bisexual players ought to be considered as culturally significant.

A combination of both survey and interview data reveals the existence of a lesbian / bisexual presence within women footballers in Scotland. In particular, the survey included an optional question regarding players’ views on whether they considered there to be a high proportion of lesbian / bisexual women who play football in Scotland. Despite the question being optional 76% of players chose to answer and 92% of respondents (see Figure 6.4) consider there to be a ‘high’ proportion of lesbian / bisexual women playing football in Scotland. In the second part of the question players were asked to offer reasons for their response of ‘yes’ or ‘no’, with the majority who answered the first part choosing to offer reasons, some of which were fairly extensive.

![Figure 6.4 - High proportion of lesbian / bisexual women who play football in Scotland?](image)

Various reasons and motivations are offered by those respondents who consider there to be a high proportion of lesbians / bisexual women. In particular reasons
include the possibility that being involved in women’s football offers an acceptable environment in which women are comfortable to express their sexuality.

I’d say about 80 percent of the women’s game are bisexual. And young players coming into the game are going the same way because it seems right with everyone else doing it. (Premier, 6)

Because you spend a lot more time socialising with girls more. And it seems no pressure is added to your decisions in life. (First, 7)

It’s a good way to socialise and meet people. You can relax and be yourself. (First, 8)

Although the evidence suggests a lesbian / bisexual presence in women’s football in Scotland it is necessary to examine the extent to which it represents a cultural element, justifying the inclusion of the ‘conformers’ as a group culture. One indication that the ‘conformers’ can be considered as a group culture within women’s football in Scotland is the assertion that aside from actually participating in football, the lesbian / bisexual presence is in fact a significant reason for some players to become club members. The following responses indicate that the meaning that football has in the lives of some players is related specifically to the lesbian / bisexual cultural element.

I think some women only play football because they are homosexual and think that it is acceptable. (Premier, 27)

1. Because it is accepted more. 2. People join for that purpose. 3. Friendships become / turn into relationships. 4. Women offer more in every aspect than males. (Second, 24)

I think sport as a whole attracts a large number of lesbian / bisexual women – not just football i.e. hockey and rugby have similar levels. Possibly the opportunity to mix / socialise in an all-female environment is part of the reason many get involved. (Second, 34)
The survey data also tends to suggest that there may be a higher prominence of lesbian / bisexual women in certain clubs. The existence of this cultural element of women’s football may therefore be more prominent within some teams more than other teams. Such suggestions come from both players who identify a high proportion of lesbian / bisexual women within their own team and also players who consider that there is not in their own club but there is in certain clubs.

About 40/50% of our club members are. (Second, 26)

(Because half my team are and other teams are the same. (Second, 27)

At certain clubs there are but in general I would think the majority are not. (Premier, 13)

The following account from an interviewed player supports the notion that a ‘butch’ image, which in this case is equated with a lesbian presence, is prominent in some teams more than others and in particular in ‘other teams’ rather than their own.

I think there has been teams that we’ve played against where you’ve just, it’s awful saying it, but there’s seemed to be a sort of higher majority of more butcher looking women...I’m speaking from like our team ... I would say there’s not really, there’s no sort of stereotype within our team... But you know, other behaviour when you then go for a drink after the match... you see women together and things like that, some teams have more of that going on than other teams...Of the people in our team, you know, there’s maybe one girl that we know that’s a lesbian, but apart from that the rest of us are all with partners or whatever. (Sarah, 27)

Finally, as a further indication that the ‘conformers’ represent a cultural element within women’s football in Scotland the following account considers the existence of a lesbian identity and a social network amongst this group culture. Through her experiences within a club where a lesbian / bisexual element seems to be
particularly prominent one interviewed player suggests that she is in fact an ‘outsider’, particularly socially, due to her heterosexuality.

I think there is an identity, quite a lot of them especially, I don’t know how to say this but a lot of them I feel at my club especially. I’ve never said this to anybody but I’m kind of like an outsider. Like the way they all go out to Glasgow to their gay clubs and all that kind of thing. At my club it used to be, well nobody was like that, but now that’s like the majority going to Glasgow... Honestly, a lot of people are like that and a lot of them have actually decided that they want to be involved in that now, so they all go to that, so they’re kind of like a wee group. I think there’s a lot of them in football teams, either all, or the majority of them are like that, and they all kind of stay together... But I don’t have that actual identity with my team, whereas a lot of the other people do, the majority do have that thing in common. (Fiona, 21)

This players’ account identifies that not only is there a lesbian / bisexual cultural element within women’s football in Scotland but there is also a hint that in some contexts it ‘can work to displace heterosexual dominance’ (Caudwell, 2002: 41). The evidence suggests that within women’s football in Scotland, as Caudwell (2002: 41) discovers in her research in England and Wales, there is a possibility that ‘at specific times and within particular teams an inverting of the sexual ‘norm’ exists’.

In summary it is necessary to make several points. The survey and interview data offers evidence of a lesbian / bisexual presence within women’s football in Scotland. In order to justify the inclusion of the ‘conformers’ as a group culture there are indications that there is not simply a presence of players who happen to be lesbian / bisexual but there are cultural elements associated with this presence. These cultural elements include the possibility that some players actually become involved in football because, possibly in the context of some clubs more than other clubs, it offers an environment in which they feel comfortable with their sexual identity. Although this analysis has identified the ‘conformers’ as a group culture
within the subculture of women’s football in Scotland, more ethnographic research focusing exclusively on this aspect of women’s football is required in order to gain a more thorough understanding of this cultural element and the various meanings that football has in the lives of these players. As with the ‘pals’ and the ‘professionals’ the extent of individual membership to this particular group culture will vary. For example some ‘conformers’ may openly disclose their sexuality and become involved in football specifically for this cultural element, to the other extreme some ‘conformers’ may not feel comfortable, or see it as important, to disclose their sexuality in the football context. The following section discusses how a player’s development of various elements of subcultural capital reflects the extent of individual membership to group cultures.

**Individual Membership and Subcultural Capital**

The model of interlocking group cultures and individual membership shown in Figure 6.1 illustrates how players can be members of one or more group cultures and to varying extents. The extent of their individual membership is based on the meaning a player attaches to football in their life. As previously mentioned, within each of the various overlapping group cultures there are levels of membership from ‘core’ members to ‘outsiders’. Donnelly (1981: 571) considers the level of individual membership to be based on the relationship between subculture and lifestyle and that the degree of individual membership of a subculture depends on a number of variables. First, the extent to which subcultural membership is a dominant aspect of an individuals’ lifestyle. Second, the extent to which individuals are committed to the subculture and subcultural activities in terms of the allocation of resources. Third, the extent to which individuals possess a sufficient amount and
type of information in order to 'create and modify the characteristics of a subculture' (Donnelly, 1981: 572).

The model of subcultural membership offered by Donnelly (1981) is developed through an analysis of subcultural capital here in order to explore two main overlapping themes. First, the extent to which individual membership to group cultures within the subculture of women's football varies. Second, how elements of subcultural capital might differ across group cultures, indicating that more specific elements of group-cultural capital exist within the subculture of women's football in Scotland. The use of the term *subcultural capital* is adopted from Thornton's (1995) analysis of (dance) club cultures. Wheaton (2000: 258) acknowledges how Thornton's (1995) appropriation of Bourdieu's (1984) work on distinction is particularly useful in research on sport subcultures, using it to inform her own research on the windsurfing subculture.

A recognised limitation of Donnelly's (1981) horizontal stratification of subcultural membership is that it seems a relatively rigid model of 'identity positions' (Wheaton, 2002: 253). The model of individual membership to interlocking group cultures presented in Figure 6.1 develops Donnelly's (1981) model in line with what Thornton (1997: 202) considers to be a particular strength of 'Bourdieu's schema' by locating 'social groups in a highly complex multi-dimensional space rather than on a linear scale or ladder'. In a similar fashion to Wheaton (2000) the remaining analysis of the subculture of women's football is informed by Thornton's (1995) examination of 'the ways subcultural groups distinguish themselves against others, as well as differentiate among themselves, creating internal hierarchies of participation, knowledge, and taste' (Wheaton, 2000: 258). The questions central to this section are; what characteristics determine the
extent to which players are ‘core’ members or ‘outsiders’ to group cultures and the subculture as a whole? How do elements of subcultural capital vary across group cultures?

There are several clear elements of subcultural capital that transcend group cultures. A player’s commitment to subcultural activities, which by and large determines the extent to which football is a dominant aspect of their life, is one important element. As is the experience or status a player has within the subculture, which is often developed over time. Also a player’s possession of knowledge and information regarding the subculture is a prominent element of subcultural capital. Generally there are two, potentially related, factors that determine the extent to which players have the potential to acquire subcultural capital. First, the level at which players compete, with those in higher divisions generally exhibiting characteristics that are related to having subcultural capital. Second, and this may overlap with ability level in some cases, the duration of time that a player has been a member of the subculture seems crucial in determining the extent to which they have the potential to acquire subcultural capital.

A player’s commitment to subcultural activities emerges as a particularly important element of subcultural capital. It is important however to distinguish between three main forms of commitment that can be recognised. First there is a commitment to primary subcultural activities directly related to the act of playing football, such as attending club training and matches, that is a basic feature of subcultural membership. Figure 6.5 displays the hours of training that survey respondents attend each week.
The majority of Second and Third Division players attend two to three hours of training per week, in the First Division most players tend to attend either two or four hours per week, and most of the Premier League players attend four hours per week. Of the players who attend more than four hours of training per week the most compete in the Premier League. Taken as a suitable indicator of primary commitment the findings suggest that there is a positive relationship between ability level and commitment to primary subcultural activities. Further, the more time that a player commits to training with their club leads to the potential for direct interaction necessary to develop other elements of subcultural capital which will be subsequently discussed.

A secondary level of commitment to subcultural activities is visible, variations of which relate to specific group cultures within the subculture. Such activities are related to football and involve other subculture members. Commitment to secondary subcultural activities might include being involved in coaching women's teams, taking on administrative duties, or writing match reports for newspapers. On a social level, secondary subcultural activities include organising and attending social events and more informal forms of interaction and communication based on social rewards.
Finally, it is possible to recognise a tertiary level of commitment that is more indirectly related to subcultural activities. One such example is that previously offered in the discussion of the ‘professionals’, with players possibly being committed to additional personal fitness training outside of the club environment. Another example would be players being involved in coaching outside of women’s football, such as coaching youth teams. The following time profile (Figure 6.6) of a typical ‘professional’ who is currently at university shows the extent to which they are committed to such tertiary subcultural activities, in particular as a coach employed through the Scottish Football Association (coaching is highlighted).

![Figure 6.6 - Weekly Time Profile: Fiona (21 yrs) First Division](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time/Day</th>
<th>Mon</th>
<th>Tues</th>
<th>Wed</th>
<th>Thurs</th>
<th>Fri</th>
<th>Sat</th>
<th>Sun</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8-9</td>
<td>Uni team training</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>Uni team training</td>
<td>Coaching</td>
<td>Football match with club team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-11</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>University</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12-13</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>Football match</td>
<td>Coaching</td>
<td>Watch Falkirk F.C.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14-15</td>
<td>Football club training</td>
<td>Coaching</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>Study</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-17</td>
<td>Coaching</td>
<td>Football club training</td>
<td>Coaching</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>Study</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-19</td>
<td>Home</td>
<td>Maybe night out with Uni team</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>University work or night out</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22-23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24-25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Certain elements of commitment to subcultural activities are likely to be considered as more important depending on group-cultural context. For example, organising and attending social events is likely to be regarded as a more important element of subcultural capital amongst the ‘pals’ and the ‘conformers’ than amongst the ‘professionals’. Similarly, commitment to activities such as coaching a youth team or additional personal training is more likely to be considered as an important element of subcultural capital amongst the ‘professionals’. Consequently it is logical
to assert that the importance of elements subcultural capital, and therefore what constitutes group-cultural capital, is related to the meaning of football to individuals within each group culture.

Evidence from both the survey and interviews suggests that the acquaintances and direct interaction players have outside of their own club has the potential to contribute to two elements of subcultural capital, mainly status and possession of information and knowledge. Discussion of these elements is particularly prominent amongst, but not exclusive to, those players who are primarily 'pals'. Some of the core 'pals', generally those who are relatively experienced players and have made friends and acquaintances through football over the years they have been involved, refer to a social network of players. Two core 'pals', from the Premier League and the First Division respectively, describe the existence of a social network. In the first example the player is discussing what part they expect football to play in the rest of their life.

I'd like, I mean I'm 27 now, I'd like to be playing for a few more years. But I would like to keep with the circle of friends that I've got, because obviously they've been with me know for a few years... I don't think I would loose contact with them too much because it's such a wide circle... it's not as if it's all central, just around the team... it's such a wide thing... It's quite a big network now, a strong network. (Heather, 27)

As the player considers the role that football will have in her life there is distinct focus on the social aspects, particularly friendships, rather than aspects of the actual game. During her experiences of being involved in football the player has become an established member of a network of players and friendships are an integral part of her experiences of football. This communication network has emerged through direct and indirect interaction and extends wider than the club environment. The
second example suggests that if being an established member of such a communication network contributes to subcultural capital, then it is one element that develops through experience, particularly the length of time that a player has been involved in football.

I think people know everybody. A lot of folk know folk from other teams, you know, particularly the players that have been involved, maybe not so much the younger players coming in now, but like people of my age everybody knows everybody...You recognise folk from other teams on nights out, you know who folk are, who they play for, you know. (Alison, 32)

It seems somewhat paradoxical that although less Premier League and First Division players value the social side as highly as say Third Division players (see Figure 6.2), of the players interviewed it is the Premier League and First Division ‘pals’ who tend to be core ‘pals’. A players’ experience, the extent to which they have previously been involved in women’s football, is of particular importance in establishing such core status. One player from a relatively ‘new’ team in the Third Division supports this explanation in her discussion of whether she has experienced a sense of being part of a network of players within the subculture.

I think there probably would be if you were involved for a long period of time, I’m not sure if you spent a season with a team, or whatever then you would. But yeah I think that over a number of seasons and a number of years, yeah there probably would be...I haven’t experienced that because I haven’t really been involved that, I’ve only really been a sort of season and a half that I’ve been playing. (Sarah, 27)

Although the players interviewed from this team share cultural characteristics typical of the ‘pals’ they are generally outsiders in relation to wider social networks outside of their own club. It is difficult to distinguish whether this is more typical of
lower ability level or simply because they are a relatively new club that had only been established for two years at the time of interviewing. However, the survey data displayed in Figures 6.7 and 6.8 add currency to the notion that there is a relationship between ability level and extent to which players are part of a general communication network of women footballers, whether that network is based on direct interaction in relation to football or direct interaction in a social sense.

In Figure 6.7 there is a general trend towards players agreeing more strongly with the statement that ‘I only really know players in my own club’ as ability level decreases.
The findings in Figure 6.8 show a general trend towards players agreeing more strongly with the statement ‘I am friends with women who play for other clubs’ as ability level increases. Using the interviewed Third Division club as example some players may be considered ‘outsiders’ to the subculture as a whole but core members within the context of their own club. Essentially such players may attach similar meanings to football as other players but since they are a new team and some players are beginners, they have not yet built up a high level of group-cultural or subcultural capital.

At the most basic level then, it can be asserted that ‘core’ members within the subculture of women’s football tend to be those players who are established and active members of one or more of the group cultures. To the other extreme, ‘outsiders’ generally include new players or more experienced players who have not built up elements of subcultural capital. There also exists a relationship between ability level and the extent to which players have the potential to build up elements of subcultural and group-cultural capital. The extent to which elements of subcultural capital are considered as important is different for each interlocking group culture offering the notion that more specific elements of group-cultural capital exist. For the ‘pals’, commitment to organising and taking part in social activities, a player’s reputation as ‘one of the pals’, having a sense of humour, and so on, may constitute group-cultural capital. For the ‘professionals’ a commitment to training, a player’s football ability, international caps, possibly even an avoidance of social aspects such as drinking, and so on, may constitute subcultural capital. For the ‘conformers’ then a commitment to organising and taking part in social activities specific to this group culture, a player’s knowledge of the gay scene and other members of this group culture, may constitute group-cultural capital.
Finally it is also important to discuss briefly the precarious nature of a player’s identity as a member of the subculture. At times, depending on various contextual factors a player’s identity as a member of the subculture, group culture, or club culture may be emphasised or diminished. In particular there are various examples where situational changes have resulted in players identifying themselves, often temporarily but sometimes more permanently, as outsiders to various aspects of the subculture. The most common example is when injury leads players to feel more of an outsider. The way in which players negotiate this diminished identity varies. Some players tend to make a concerted effort to maintain their status as a member of the subculture. Other players resign themselves to having a temporarily diminished identity within the subculture. The following account is from one player who, at the time of being interviewed, was eight months pregnant. The player discusses the implications of being pregnant, and therefore unable to participate in primary subcultural activities, on her identity as a member of the subculture.

...when I found out I was pregnant I was really happy but it was just the thought of ‘oh my god, I’m not going to be able to play football for like the whole season!’...I was quite gutted, and I’d been along watching all season at the matches which has really been... awful because you feel like you want to get on the pitch and help them out... I’ve even been down to training... Just to kind of still maintain a feeling that I’m in the group, you know, and it’s nice to find out how everybody or the team is getting on as well. Because I think if I’d stayed away for six or seven months I’d feel completely out of it. (Sarah, 27)

In particular the player made an effort to continue to attend, despite not being able to participate in, primary subcultural activities in order to maintain a feeling of being part of the club and to reduce the potentiality of becoming an ‘outsider’.

257
The analysis in this section gives some indication of the nature of individual membership to interlocking group cultures within the subculture of women’s football in Scotland. The existence of multiple identities reflects the heterogeneity amongst players and the various and changing meanings they attach to being a footballer. The nature of individual membership is complex and dynamic and is liable to change as the cultural, subcultural, and individual context changes. The final section of this chapter treats elements of culture as dynamic and considers the extent to which group cultures within women’s football in Scotland represent dominant, residual and emergent aspects of the subculture. Further, tensions and power struggles exist between group cultures as subcultural characteristics are continually created and modified.

**Tensions between Dominant, Emergent, and Residual aspects of Culture**

This analysis of the subculture of women’s football in Scotland has developed Donnelly’s (1981) previous work in order to account for a more complex and multi-dimensional model of sports subcultures. Having examined the cultural characteristics of and individual membership to the ‘pals’, the ‘professionals’ and the ‘conformers’ it is necessary to consider the relations between the three interlocking group cultures. This section develops Donnelly’s (1993) discussion of sports subcultures and their relationship with dominant, residual and emergent aspects of culture to suggest that as subcultures can be representative of residual and emergent elements of culture, within a subculture there are aspects of group cultures that can function in the same way. Indeed within the subculture of women’s football in Scotland interlocking group cultures range from, to borrow from Donnelly (1993:
121), 'resilient and conservative maintainers of tradition (i.e. residual culture) to the most active sites of cultural production (i.e. emergent culture').

Based on the accounts of interviewed players in particular it would seem that the 'pals' represent a dominant element, the 'professionals' an emergent element, and the 'conformers' a relatively hidden and more residual element of culture within women's football in Scotland. However, as the dynamic nature of culture has been appreciated it is also important to consider the dynamic nature of dominant, emergent and residual aspects of culture. It is therefore not sufficient to simply assign a label of 'dominant', 'residual', or 'emergent' to the interlocking group cultures within women's football since power relations are continually changing. Instead it is important to appreciate the complex nature of power struggles between group cultures, and between group cultures and the organisational structures of women's football in Scotland.

In her discussion of subcultural capital Thornton (1997: 208) states that 'interestingly, the social logic of subcultural capital reveals itself most clearly by what it dislikes and by what it emphatically isn't'. Similarly, a common tendency is for members of group cultures within women's football to confirm or emphasise their own identity, and in some cases the collective identity of their club, by distinguishing what they are not. It is usually through discussions of players' own identity, based on the meanings they attach to football and the elements of subcultural and group-cultural capital they consider as important, that possible tensions between members of group cultures are revealed. Further, Thornton (1997: 208) advocates a perspective that 'rather than characterising cultural differences as resistances' to hierarchy or to the remote cultural dominations of some ruling body, it investigates the micro-structures of power entailed in the cultural competition that
goes on between more closely associated social groups’. This analysis offers an
examination of the interplay and possible tensions between the more closely
associated social groups. The existence of differentiation between individuals and
group cultures has already been exemplified throughout the analysis in this chapter.
Based on the survey and interview data it is possible to focus on the two most
explicit sites of differentiation and possible tensions, between the ‘professionals’
and the ‘pals’, and between non-conformers and the ‘conformers’.

The ‘Pals’ and the ‘Professionals’

It has already been recognised that when discussing their attitude towards
football the ‘professionals’ tend to emphasise the fact that they take football
seriously by detaching themselves from the ‘pals’. The following two quotes offer
eamples of this differentiation and how the ‘professionals’ adherence to taking
their football seriously tends to result in them being outsiders with regard to the
social activities of their club, particularly going out drinking together.

...socially they’re (club members) out every Friday drinking whereas
me, I’m not like that. (Kim, 17)

...like after games, Sunday night I think is the big night to be out in
Glasgow or whatever, and a lot of them go out on a Sunday night.
They all meet up and go on mini buses and all that kind of thing. I’m a
good girl, go and do my uni work. (Fiona, 21)

There is further evidence of potential tensions between the ‘professionals’ and the
‘pals’ based on this differentiation. In particular, the following quote suggests that
some ‘professionals’ disapprove of the extent to which the ‘pals’ prioritise the social
aspects of being a club member, and the ‘pals’ might struggle to understand why
some ‘professionals’ take football so seriously.
People say the same things about me, ‘why do you take that so seriously?’, they all go out on a Saturday night, the majority of them, and get gassed, and then they say to me ‘what did you do last night?’, ‘I was doing my uni work, watched a bit of TV’, and they’re like ‘why?’, ‘because I take my football seriously’, whereas a lot of them don’t take it as seriously. (Fiona, 21)

Even within group cultures there is evidence that extreme displays of the social aspects associated with being a club member are a possible source of conflict. In the following quote, although a core ‘pal’ herself, the player considers that activities and behaviours related to the social aspects of being a club member should remain off the field and not encroach on the actual game.

…the other week… the opposition were standing in the dugout boozing. I didn’t know that at the time, obviously the referee didn’t spot it but they were standing with cans of beer. So there’s your stereotypical image being acted out… So anybody watching that game might say well that quite fits with the stereotype, but then you look at our team and it probably wouldn’t. (Alison, 32)

This type of behaviour from teams is understandably considered to be potentially negative for the image of women’s football, but stereotypes relating to various behaviours of women footballers remain conformed to and acted out in some situations. So within the group culture of the ‘pals’ there is evidence of players detaching themselves and their team from more extreme displays of social behaviour which they consider to be potentially detrimental to the image of women’s football.

Returning to the relationship between the ‘pals’ and the ‘professionals’ it is useful to consider the ‘pals’ views of players who tend not to get involved in the more social aspects of being a member of a club. The ‘pals’ were asked how it would be viewed if a club member was interested only in football and not in being
involved in the social aspects. The responses suggest that such players might struggle to ‘fit in’ since the social aspects are considered an important part of being a club member.

...I mean there’s still a couple of girls who don’t really socialise that much and you’re always a wee bit aware of it with them being slightly on the fringe of things... And they miss out on a lot... So I think it’s really important that you try and get as many people involved in it as possible and at the moment with the team that we’ve got we’re quite lucky and it’s like 99% are involved in almost everything we do in the social, that side of it. (Alison, 32)

...we find as well that somebody that maybe isn’t as socially connected into the group, if they come along and play, you know team-wise, that does affect the team spirit... there’s a little bit of stuff that goes about, you know, if somebody’s not really connected in the social script... off the field everybody needs to fit in, those that really don’t fit in quite so much, it does affect the overall team thing because we don’t feel we know them as much as the rest of them. (Heather, 27)

Although they had not experienced this situation first hand, one player in the Third Division suggests that not being involved in the social aspects of being a club member may actually lead to someone leaving the club since it is considered as an important part of club membership.

...we tend to, especially like the managers and the coaches you know, tend to encourage everyone to have a drink at the end. If somebody was to take themselves out of that all the time then I think you’d probably wonder why and, I don’t know whether it would end up snowballing...you know, that person would end up leaving. (Sarah, 27)

A number of ‘pals’ suggest that for the majority of players, although they might take their football seriously, the social aspects are particularly important. This has already been shown as a characteristic typical of the ‘pals’ and some ‘pals’ also
consider it to be a dominant characteristic amongst the majority of women who play football.

I think everybody I know, well most girls play football for the enjoyment really, they’re not looking to get to the top, they’re looking to have a laugh and have a good time. (Claire, 23)

In relation to the ‘professionals’ then, a common view amongst the ‘pals’ is that a more professional attitude towards football is an emergent but not currently a dominant aspect of culture. Most of the ‘pals’ appreciate that there is an emergent culture of, generally younger, players who exhibit a more professional attitude. It is acknowledged that the emergence of such a culture relates to positive developments in the structure and organisation of women’s football and better opportunities for younger players who have more realistic professional ambitions.

The girls that are growing up now have got more chances... So by the time they get to fifteen or sixteen there’s the chance that they’ll be really good. And they’ve now got the pathway to get into Scotland squads. So you’re maybe going to be more ambitious of what you can do. (Claire, 23)

... it’s a different type of player that’s now coming through because of all the structures that are now in place. But there’s still a lot of us that went into the game for the social side of it who wouldn’t be seen as footballers, you know, we went in for the social side of it. But a lot of girls now, they love their football, they want to progress, they want the skills, they want the university scholarships, they want to play professional football, they’ve got a different attitude for different reasons now. (Alison, 32)

Although characteristic of a ‘pal’ herself, this interviewed player, who has been heavily involved in establishing and developing the club for which she is a member, confirms how clubs now need to exhibit a ‘professional’ organisational structure and attitude in order to be taken seriously by potential sponsors or men’s club to which
they are, or aim to be, affiliated. This attitude is not however consistently adhered to throughout women’s football.

... they (men’s club) did look at us and there were a lot of talks and it was because we put across a professional case. I’m sure that the fact that we’d been running for ten years and we’d done x, y and z, and we bring in this much money and take out this much money, we get sponsorship and ... we get grants, they see well actually it’s a well-run organisation. It’s not just something that’s going to fall apart at the first hurdle which a lot of women’s teams go and do. A lot of women’s teams are teams, they’re not clubs. You know there’s no feeder system, there’s no ongoing progression for the girls. (Alison, 32)

Similarly, a player who is typically one of the ‘professionals’ stresses that since her club have recently been promoted there is a need for her fellow club members, likely to be typical of the ‘pals’, to adopt a more professional attitude if they are to compete successfully at the higher level.

Basically because we’re up a division a lot of the girls are obviously going to have to screw their nut in and take it more seriously if they’re wanting to get any further or if they’re going to be getting their games. They’re going to be bringing in a lot of young players next year. (Fiona, 21)

There is evidence then that subcultural characteristics are being continually created and modified and from the players point of view a more professional culture is emerging to threaten the dominance of a culture based on social aspects. A professional attitude is generally considered as crucial to the development of women’s football in Scotland. There is also evidence to suggest that the emergence of a professional culture needs to be combined with a suppression of certain stereotypes associated women’s football in order for the game to be taken seriously enough to gain widespread recognition throughout Scottish society.
If you can come across as a professional attitude and not just a bunch of lassies out there drawing out the stereotypes that go with women's football, you know, and you have to work on that. I think people will embrace women's football if you're getting rid of, I'm not saying the stereotypes are right or wrong, but you have to come across a professional attitude. (Alison, 32)

These comments regarding the suppression of the stereotypes that are associated with women's football lead us into a discussion of the most explicit site of tensions between group cultures.

_**Non-conformers and the 'Conformers'**_

The prevalence of stereotypes regarding sexuality suggest that a lesbian / bisexual culture is as a dominant aspect of women's football. The analysis in this chapter has provided evidence that a lesbian / bisexual presence certainly exists within women's football in Scotland, but the actual extent of its prevalence is difficult to determine. There is however evidence suggesting that, on two levels, attempts are made to diminish attention towards the stereotype, possibly forcing this cultural element to become more residual in nature. On one level the ruling bodies are reluctant to draw attention to a lesbian / bisexual presence and the associated cultural element within women's football. When endorsing the survey for this research, members of SWIF Ltd and the Women's Department of the SFA stressed that data specifying the actual percentage of respondents who are lesbian / bisexual should not be obtained. Their concern being that any possible media coverage focusing on such data would be potentially detrimental to the development of the women's game. On another level, among non-conformers in particular there is the insinuation that the 'lesbian stereotype' is inaccurate, unfair and gives women's football a bad name and this forms one of the most apparent tensions within women's football in Scotland.
It is recognised by Melling (2002: 328) that ‘from the 1960s onwards, gay
women have indeed become increasingly involved in women’s football’ and ‘it has
not been uncommon for confrontations to arise between the heterosexual majority
and the gay minority’. But the extent to which there is a heterosexual majority and a
gay minority is difficult to assess in this context since interviewed players in
particular did not willingly represent the voice of lesbians / bisexual women. As an
outsider to this particular cultural element of women’s football it would seem at first
glance to be residual (hidden) to a dominant ‘heterosexual’ culture. An ethnographic
analysis would reveal more comprehensively the extent to which this cultural aspect
of women’s football is in fact residual in nature or works to ‘displace heterosexual
dominance’ (Caudwell, 2002: 41).

What is particularly pertinent here is Thornton’s (1997: 208) notion of
subcultural capital revealing itself most clearly by ‘what it dislikes and by what it
emphatically isn’t’. In relation to the tension between non-conformers and the
‘conformers’, there is evidence in both interview and survey data of non-conformers
displaying an overt detachment of themselves from stereotypes regarding sexuality.
The following quote illustrates how the association of ‘butch’ and ‘lesbian’
stereotypes with the game can offend non-conformers.

I’ve been on school placement at a school recently and I mentioned
that I played football. Suddenly they came up with this stereotype ‘oh
we had somebody here that played, oh she was big and she was butch,
and she had a deep voice, and she was very masculine’. And I thought,
you know, that’s not what all women footballers are like... We’re not
all women chasers, for instance, that’s the side that really bugs me
about women’s football. (Heather, 27)

What is also interesting in this quote is that the player equates ‘butchness’ and
masculinity with lesbians, whom she refers to as ‘women chasers’. The insinuated
predatory nature of lesbians in this quote is considered later in this section. The survey data in particular reveals a more subtle form of detachment from stereotypes regarding sexuality. In response to reasons why players consider there to be, or not to be, a high proportion of lesbian/bisexual women who play football in Scotland there is a consistent identification of ‘them’ or the ‘others’ as distinct from ‘us’ by players whom it must be assumed are heterosexual.

I’ve came across them. (First, 19)

I know a few and my mate knows a lot of them. (Second, 6)

Because I have seen and heard a lot about these types of relationships within my club and others. (Second, 3)

From common knowledge of other players. (Third, 24)

Interviewed players were asked if negative attitudes towards women’s football, particularly those based on stereotypes, had ever discouraged them from taking part. Most players expressed that they have never been discouraged themselves, although a number of players explain how they have to contend with the potentially discouraging stereotypical assumptions regarding sexuality.

The stereotype does bug me, it does bug me a lot. Sometimes you think, well I’ll not mention women’s football because I’ll automatically be classed as, you know, a stereotype. So sometimes I’m not sure whether I’m going really, you know, say I play football or whatever in case they give me a label...But I’m wary of it, very wary of the stereotype. (Heather 27)

I think you’ve got to be quite a strong person to play women’s football, to keep at it, because there is this attitude that all women football players are butch lesbians who, you know, would knock lumps out of any guy, you know what I mean? You know, you’ve got the image. And I think you’ve got to be quite a strong person to not get drawn into how you’re perceived to be, kind of thing, and just be yourself. (Jo, 23)
The second quote in particular hints at the view that some players may become easily influenced and get ‘drawn into’ the lesbian / bisexual culture. Further, survey data reveals more controversial tensions regarding non-conformers attitudes towards the lesbian / bisexual cultural element within the game. In particular, some players consider there to be a predatory element associated with the lesbian / bisexual culture within women’s football.

Too many older players are introducing young kids with their influence. They use these kids admiration to their advantage. (Premier, 15)

A lot of young players are influenced by older players. (First, 13)

People can be easily influenced. (First, 6)

These findings are consistent with Caudwell (2002: 38) who considers this ‘notion of the predatory lesbian’ and the ‘positioning of lesbianism as licentious and lascivious’ as a regulatory practice which protects heterosexuality. Further, in support of the interview and survey data presented in relation to these tensions, Caudwell’s (2002) research also reveals that ‘there is evidence of conscious marking of self and space as heterosexual’, the implications being that ‘such a strategy alludes to the fragility of [hetero] sexual identity, and therefore exposes heterosexuality as delicate and vulnerable’ (Butler, 1990 cited in Caudwell, 2002: 41). It is interesting that, although interview data did not represent the voice of lesbians, survey data failed to reveal tensions in the opposite direction, from ‘conformers’ towards non-conformers. The most prominent conflict regarding the treatment of lesbian / bisexual players refers to attitudes of people outside of football suggesting that concerns of non-conformers regarding lesbian / bisexual
culture within women’s football are not overtly expressed within the football environment.

Many of the interviewed players suggest that stereotypes regarding sexuality are relatively old-fashioned and are likely to diminish with the emergence of more young girls taking up football. References are made to a decrease in the proportion of players who are lesbian / bisexual. In fact some players, presumably non-conformers, see this as a positive development that can only be good for the image of the sport.

It’s probably justified years ago, you know, but now it’s just become such a popular sport that it’s open. So many people are taking it up now that the stereotypes are not justified...there’s such a big amount of even youngsters coming through, and people from all over that the stereotypes I think are old fashioned now. (Heather, 27)

Well the main ones (stereotypes) are speculating about sexuality in women’s sport in general. But I think with more kids coming in to play football I think that it’s changing. And I think we’ll get rid of that stereotype as more girls come through and play. (Claire, 23)

Similar attitudes are evident as survey respondents also consider that the presence of lesbian / bisexual culture within women’s football is residual in nature.

I think that there are less homosexual and bisexual women playing than say 10 years ago. Perhaps more heterosexual women are playing now and as the game grows in terms of numbers playing more and more girls are given the opportunity to play, and the balance of numbers from each of these groups changes. (Premier, 12)

Yes but not as many as when I first started playing, it came as a bit of a shock to me and my team mates. I didn’t notice it until training with national side where half of the squad were bisexual it was a bit off putting to myself but it is not so bad now, I think it is fading out. There are so many girls playing for under 10, 11, 12 teams and everyone is moving on, the sport is getting really popular and hopefully that side of women’s football will disappear and we will get the media coverage and the publicity and the respect that Scottish Women’s Football
should have, and that can only be great to promote the women’s game. (First, 16)

An important point to make, however, is that such views are based on the relatively
naive assumption that the young players are heterosexual and therefore would not
conform to the stereotype. As previously mentioned, the extent to which a lesbian /
bisexual culture is residual in nature is difficult to determine. Although many players
consider the presence of lesbian / bisexual women to be decreasing, the evidence
presented in this chapter suggests that a lesbian / bisexual culture exists within
women’s football in Scotland. It seems that particularly among non-conformers, the
association of lesbian / bisexual identities with women’s football is considered as
detrimental to the image of the game. Further, it is thought that in order for women’s
football to develop and receive widespread recognition a domination of heterosexual
identity and a suppression of lesbian / bisexual identity is essential. This relationship
between non-conformers and ‘conformers’ represents the most explicit tension
within women’s football. The concerns expressed by the non-conformers are
replicated in the ruling bodies’ approach to the promotion of the game. Essentially
the desired dominant cultural image promoted by the Women’s Department of the
SFA and SWF Ltd emphasise professionalism, at least in attitude, and preferably
non-conformity. Consequently, the lesbian / bisexual culture within women’s
football becomes at least hidden if not residual in nature.

Conclusion

This chapter set out to answer a number of questions regarding the subculture
of women’s football in Scotland. After a brief discussion of the general
characteristics that define the subculture a more comprehensive analysis is offered. It
is identified in the first section that the subculture of women’s football in Scotland consists of three interlocking group cultures, the ‘pals’, the ‘professionals’ and the ‘conformers’. Despite some overlapping, the cultural characteristics of these group cultures are relatively distinct. The second section of the chapter asserts that individual membership to one or more of the group cultures is determined by the meaning that players attach to football in the context of their everyday life. It is also recognised that there are various elements of subcultural capital, the acquisition of which determines the extent to which an individual is considered a ‘core’ member or an ‘outsider’ to the subculture, as a whole, and individual group cultures. A closer analysis reveals that as cultural characteristics vary across group cultures, so does the significance of elements of subcultural capital. It is therefore possible to identify some elements of subcultural capital as being more apparent, or considered more important, in some group cultures than in others. This finding supports the notion that not only is it possible to identify elements of subcultural capital, but within the subculture it is possible to recognise more specific elements of group-cultural capital. The final section of the chapter analyses the extent to which differences in the meaning of football in players’ lives can lead to power struggles and tensions between group cultures. The analysis revolves around the two most explicit examples of tensions, between the ‘pals’ and the ‘professionals’, and between non-conformers and the ‘conformers’. The tensions reveal how, as the subculture continues to develop, subcultural characteristics are continually negotiated and power struggles emerge between dominant, emergent and residual elements of culture that are similarly dynamic in nature.

In a critique of the concept of subculture Nayak (2003: 18) recognises that the lens of a subculture is in itself a restrictive way by which to view people since ‘these
portraits may actually serve to reinforce social stereotypes'. This analysis has attempted to avoid such restrictive viewing by interpreting the subculture of women's football not simply as a whole but as consisting of various interlocking group cultures. Further, despite a focus on researching youth, Nayak's (2003: 19) assertion that 'more subtle approaches that illustrate complexity and inconsistency within youth formations may enable stereotypes to be more readily imploded' is particularly appropriate. The interpretation of the subculture of women's football in Scotland offered here is one that recognises the complex and fluid nature of the boundaries of the interlocking group cultures. Similarly it identifies that members of the subculture have the potential to acquire multiple identities to varying extents across group cultures.

As the game continues to develop in Scotland the characteristics of the subculture are being negotiated continually by individual members within the interlocking group cultures. There is evidence of an emergent professional culture that is compatible with the desired dominant image promoted by the ruling bodies. The extent to which the organisation and structure of women's football in Scotland can accommodate, eventually recompense and then sustain a professional culture remains to be seen. The most explicit tension within women's football however is between non-conformers and the 'conformers'. There is strong evidence to suggest that although a lesbian / bisexual culture exists within women's football its existence is considered, particularly by non-conformers, as a potential hindrance to the positive development of the sport.
CONCLUSIONS – AN INTERPRETATION OF WOMEN’S FOOTBALL IN SCOTLAND

This thesis offers an interpretation of the subculture of women’s football in Scotland. The main focus of the research is on women’s experiences of being socialised into the game and the meanings they attach to being an active member of the subculture. The literature review in Chapter One explored the existing research on women’s football to ask what do we know about women’s football in British society? And more specifically, what do we know about women’s football in Scottish society? Existing research on women’s football generally falls into two main themes: the development of women’s football in Britain, albeit almost exclusively focusing on developments in England, and women’s experiences of being involved in playing football. What emerges from the critical review is that attention to both of these themes in the Scottish context has been particularly absent.

More general gaps in the literature on women’s football are also revealed. Little empirical work has been conducted on socio-demographic characteristics of women footballers. The process of socialisation has received relatively superficial attention with a limited appreciation of the interactive and reciprocal nature of the process. Consideration of the experiences of a cross-ability sample of women footballers is also lacking, with most research focusing on either top-level players, or single case studies. Little attempt has been made to explore the multiple meanings and identities that exist within the subculture of women’s football and to understand power relations between group cultures. Research that has focused on the experiences of women footballers has by and large done so from a feminist perspective and has tended to prioritise issues of gender and sexuality offering
collectively a somewhat narrow focus on experiences and meanings. The critical review of existing research resulted in the emergence of several core research questions: How has women’s football developed in Scottish society? Who are women footballers in Scotland? How do women experience the process of socialisation into football? How can the subculture of women’s football in Scotland be defined? These core questions have formed the focus of the research-based chapters (Chapters Three to Six) with further specific sub-questions also explored in each chapter.

The synthesis of elements in the interpretive theoretical framework adopted is crucial in ensuring that the interpretation is as fully informed as possible. Chapter Two sets out the interpretive approach that is considered most appropriate in order to frame the research. The question at the heart of this chapter is how can we make sense of women’s football in Scotland? Drawing from the work of Donnelly (2000) interpretive sociology is recognised as useful in researching two overlapping themes prominent in the sociology of sport and central to this research: the process of socialisation and sport subcultures. The under-researched nature of the topic had significant implications for how it needed to be approached. In particular it has been imperative to adopt a framework that enables an exploration of the history of the game and socio-demographic characteristics of women footballers. In doing so not only has original historical and empirical research been carried out, but this research has been crucial in order to inform and contextualise the central focus of the study, women’s experiences of the process of socialisation and the meanings they attach to being an active member of the subculture of women’s football in Scotland. Consequently an interpretive approach was adopted combining the following overlapping elements: historiographic, critical, comparative, investigative and multi-
methodological. This interpretive framework is adapted from Sugden and Tomlinson's (1999) discussion of the elements of an interpretive critical framework in the sociology of sport. It is the synthesis of elements that ensures that the pursuit of complexity is achieved and that macro-blindness is avoided.

The historiographic element of the interpretive framework was almost exclusively prominent in Chapter Three, which offered a socio-historical context for the research on women's football in contemporary Scottish society. The core underlying question of this chapter was how has women's football developed in the particular Scottish context? A number of important findings emerge from the analysis of primary and secondary sources. Evidence suggests that the origins of women's football might in fact be found in seventeenth century Scotland. Continuations of seventeenth century traditions are apparent throughout the eighteenth century but it was not until the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries that women's football experienced a considerable stage of growth. In particular the genesis of a subculture of women's football can be related to the spread of a network of teams during and after the First World War. The principal theme throughout the history of women's football in Scotland is the influence of the SFA and the media, and the implications of their opinions regarding the association of women with football. The historiography offered in Chapter Three illustrates how the subculture of women's football has developed against hostility, exhibited resilience and gone through various stages of transformation in order to become more gradually incorporated into the dominant sport / football culture. What is apparent throughout the chapter is that the way in which women's football has developed in Scotland has not been uniformly experienced throughout Britain but has been shaped by the particular Scottish context.
Socio-demographic characteristics of women footballers in Scotland are the focus of Chapter Four. This empirical chapter presents a socio-demographic profile based on relevant quantitative survey data. The chapter set out to answer the core question: who participates in women's football in Scotland? The main findings suggest that some characteristics of women footballers are not necessarily typical of the national population. In particular, a significant proportion of the sample is single compared to the national female population and women footballers are generally better educationally qualified than the national population. A number of interesting findings emerge in relation to social class. An important point to make is that the use of different social class indicators (e.g. occupation of guardian versus player occupation) is likely to result in different findings. The data suggest that, based on the occupation of guardians, women footballers tend to come from a working class background. Based on players' current occupation however, women footballers in Scotland might be considered more typically middle class. The chapter also considered the sporting biography of players to reveal that players have generally tended to be 'sporty' throughout their lives. Significantly, football is considered as their main competitive sport for nearly the entire sample.

The question at the heart of Chapter Five was how do women experience the process of socialisation into football in Scotland? What is particularly clear throughout is the interactive and reciprocal nature of the socialisation process. The majority of players become initially involved in football through informal play, which usually takes place with fathers or brothers. In relation to making the transition from initial involvement to developing a commitment to football, the most evident hindrance is the provision of girls' football at schools. For some players a lack of provision led to a temporary disruption in their football career. Although not
represented in this research, the experiences of women and girls who have ceased
playing, having at least started to develop a football career, would provide an
important addition to our understanding of how women’s and girls’ experiences of
the socialisation process are influenced by the wider social context. Within the
sample, players express that they have experienced potentially discouraging
attitudes, some from the certain socialising agents and agencies and some more
generally from the Scottish public and the media. The meaning of football in the
players’ lives has, however, been too significant to allow discouragement to
effectively terminate their football career.

Finally, Chapter Six offered an interpretation of the subculture of women’s
football in Scotland based on the following central question: how might the
subculture of women’s football in Scotland be defined? Following a discussion of
various ascribed characteristics that could be used to offer a brief definition of the
subculture, the interpretation focused on an analysis of three interlocking group
cultures, the ‘pals’, the ‘professionals’, and the ‘conformers’. The extent of a
player’s membership to one or more of these group cultures depends on the meaning
of football in their life. In fact various elements of subcultural capital specific to
particular group cultures (‘group cultural capital’) are identified. The extent to
which the meaning of football in players’ lives, and therefore the extent to which
different elements of subcultural capital are considered as important, is a potential
source of tensions and power struggles between group cultures. The most explicit
sites of tension are between the ‘pals’ and the ‘professionals’, and between the non-
conformers and the ‘conformers’. These tensions illustrate the dynamic nature of
dominant, residual and emergent elements of culture and how the characteristics of
the subculture are being continually negotiated between interlocking group cultures.
This thesis has suggested how the two themes of socialisation and subculture overlap. It is important to demonstrate more explicitly how processes of socialisation and the subculture are inextricably linked. The relationship between processes of socialisation and the subculture can be seen as cyclical in nature. An individual's experiences of the socialisation process have an influence on the meaning of football in their life. As we have seen, the meanings that players attach to football form the basis of their individual and collective identity within the subculture. Not only do players experience the process of socialisation into football, but they also experience a process of socialisation into the subculture. Socialisation experiences continually contribute to the meanings, values and identities attached to football and the cultural characteristics of the subculture and group cultures within it. Attitudes of individuals and socialising agents towards women's football remain crucial to an individual's experiences of the process. So despite the interactive and reciprocal nature of the socialisation process, an individual's ongoing experiences of socialisation into football are inevitably shaped by the various dynamic contexts in which the experiences are located, such as, family, school, society, and specific club contexts.

Since an individual's socialisation experiences influence the meanings and values they attach to the place of football in their lives and their identity as a footballer, these experiences, meanings, values and identities work to reproduce, modify and develop the cultural characteristics of the subculture of women's football. As these cultural characteristics are modified and developed, in ways that are often influenced by power dynamics, they in turn influence player's socialisation experiences. Inevitable transformations in the cultural characteristics are likely to lead to a corresponding change in the image of the subculture. Such transformations
will further influence socialisation experiences, and this research has shown various evidence of this, particularly in relation to the development of more positive attitudes towards women's football in schools. This research also suggests that being socialised into the subculture of women's football might lead to an individual experiencing socialisation via football. Their membership of the subculture may help to development of other aspects of their life and foster relationships and experiences that an individual may not have encountered in alternative cultural contexts, for example, developing a social life, taking on administrative duties, or being introduced to the gay scene. It can be seen therefore that the processes of socialisation and the subculture are inextricably linked in various ways.

Having offered an interpretation of the subculture of women's football in Scotland there are a number of issues that emerge as particularly pertinent in the current climate of the game. This research has revealed two main paradoxes within women's football that, although they overlap and exist simultaneously, warrant exclusive attention since they foster an important discussion of power dynamics. The first paradox relates to the relationship and power dynamics between the 'pals', the 'professionals' and the ruling bodies of women's football (the women's section of the SFA and SWF Ltd). The dominant ruling bodies of women's football aim to promote, and are largely justified in doing so, an image that is professional in nature. Naturally, the popular image and culture associated with women's football, usually disseminated to society through the media, influences societal attitudes towards women's football and will, in turn, influence experiences of socialisation. The image of the 'professionals' is becoming one that ruling bodies strive to portray as a dominant cultural element to the media and the public in order to ensure that women's football is respected and taken seriously in Scotland. There is an attempt,
therefore, to create a particular subcultural image that will raise awareness and recognition, enhance the profile of the sport, foster positive attitudes towards women’s football at all levels of society and inevitably encourage the socialisation of girls and women into the sport.

Clubs themselves similarly recognise the need to present a ‘professional’ organisational structure and attitude in order to be taken seriously by the media, possible sponsors, or men’s club to which they are, or aim to be, affiliated. Although a professional attitude towards the game is evident (particularly from the ruling bodies, certain clubs and ambitious younger players) the possibility for financial reward of this professional attitude is extremely limited within the structures of women’s football in Scotland. The organisational structures and some individual clubs are fully aware that in order to make any ground on material professionalism they have to precede this with evidence of attitudinal professionalism, particularly within the SWPL and Scottish National Squad.

This research suggests, however, that although players might take their football seriously, since financial gain from football is currently extremely limited then full commitment to a professional attitude towards football is not considered worthwhile by many of the ‘pals’. Out of the SWPL players interviewed the majority would be considered ‘pals’, and it is the younger players who are more likely to display a more professional attitude, particularly since the potential for them to be rewarded in material terms at some stage in their career is more realistic. So although the ‘professionals’ seem to represent the desired dominant culture the ruling bodies of women’s football in Scotland attempt to portray, it is possible to tentatively suggest that in reality it is a more emergent element of culture. A continuing concern is that the most successful Scottish players, those with the
potential to obtain financial rewards, may attempt to pursue this where structures accommodate it, although even in countries where women’s football is more advanced (i.e. the WUSA League in the United States) the transition to professionalism remains a struggle.

If women’s football in Scotland is in transition towards professionalism at a more widespread level, it is only at a very incipient stage. What continues to develop is a pressure on individual players and clubs to display a level of professionalism for which they are not yet, and for many players, will never be, sufficiently recompensed. If developments towards material professionalism continue to progress slowly the ruling bodies may struggle to be justified in expecting players to uphold a level of professionalism. However, since an attitudinal professionalism is considered by the ruling bodies and some clubs and players as an essential precursor to material professionalism then such expectations on players is likely to continue without professional reward. It is difficult to suggest what the implications might be for women’s football, but an increase in tensions between the ‘professionals’ and the ‘pals’, and a strengthening of values between the ‘professionals’ and the ruling bodies, seems inevitable.

The second paradox demonstrates unequivocally the nature of power dynamics within the subculture and how the dominant image of the subculture that ruling bodies attempt to portray is in fact quite different from the reality. The source of this paradox is routed in the relations between the ruling bodies of women’s football, the non-conformers and the ‘conformers’, and is again related to the desired dominant image that the ruling bodies, and a significant proportion of players, attempt to portray. In parallel to promoting a professional image there is an attempt to suppress the association of a lesbian image within women’s football and
it is here where power dynamics within the subculture become most explicitly revealed. The existence of a lesbian / bisexual presence within women’s football in Scotland should not be considered as a negative aspect of the game. However there is evidence to suggest that the ruling bodies are conscious that not drawing attention to the presence of lesbian / bisexual culture is an important factor in the positive development of the sport. In other words, although the ‘professional’ image that the ruling bodies promote is not overtly a non-conforming one, effort is made to prevent the ‘stereotypical’ images regarding sexuality becoming more prevalent and to some extent justified.

The fear that evidence of a prominent lesbian / bisexual culture within women’s football has the potential to discourage players themselves and, as this research has shown, parents of younger players encouraging their daughters to developing a commitment to the sport, is somewhat warranted. Until wider societal attitudes regarding sexuality change however, these concerns will continue infiltrate women’s football. It could be suggested therefore that unless the ruling bodies readdress their approach they will find themselves continually attempting to hide the existence of this culture within the game. This is not to say that the existence of a lesbian / bisexual cultural element should be celebrated or should even be prioritised as an issue, but it should at least be recognised as a reality. Within women’s football, especially by heterosexual players, the lesbian / bisexual culture is seen as a stereotype, an unfair and undue impression of women footballers, and one that will eventually disappear. Although the stereotype is not an accurate impression of all women footballers, it is conformed to by what appears to be a significant proportion. So instead of being feared as a factor that could threaten the positive development of the sport and, on behalf of all women footballers, the ruling bodies
should be at the forefront of recognising it as a cultural element within women’s football rather than attempting to hide or even deny its existence. However, it is the ruling bodies of women’s football in Scotland who have the power to disseminate an image of the subculture of women’s football to wider society. The evidence suggests that they are likely to continue to portray an image which is paramount to securing the positive future development of the sport, and the suppression of the existence of a lesbian/bisexual culture within the game seems to be an underlying attempt to achieve this. A reluctance to accept the reality of a lesbian/bisexual culture within women’s football in favour of an attempt to hide its presence has the potential to further intensify tensions and power struggles between non-conformers and the ‘conformers’.

The paradoxes between the desired dominant image of governing bodies and reality can now be considered together. The dominant image that the governing bodies are keen to promote is a combination of a culture of professionalism and preferably ‘non-conformity’. Interview and survey data, however, would suggest that the desired dominance of this image does not reflect reality. Although the ‘pals’ seem to be the most prominent group culture, and despite the existence of a fairly significant lesbian/bisexual culture, consideration of power dynamics within the subculture reveal that it is the ruling bodies who dictate the subcultural image that is presented to wider society, regardless of whether this image is an accurate depiction of reality. Returning to previous discussion of how processes of socialisation connect to the subculture it can now be better understood how power dynamics within women’s football can influence socialisation experiences and the meaning of football in players’ lives. Therefore, it would be somewhat naïve to look at the actions of women footballers as completely free from restriction since power
dynamics within wider society and within the structures of women's football influence the experiences of players, and in various ways present elements of constraint.

Revealing the sources of the paradoxes and power dynamics that exist within women's football in Scotland has only been possible through an analysis that takes account of the multiple meanings players attach to football, rather than approaching subcultural members as being a relatively homogenous group. Although Caudwell's (1999, 2000, and 2002) work on women's experiences of sexuality within the football context has achieved this, it has done so with a specific focus that neglects the meanings players attach to football outside of experiences of sexuality and gender, for example group cultural characteristics similar to those associated with the 'professionals' and the 'pals' are not revealed.

It is again extremely useful to refer to Thornton's (1997) discussion of approaches to subcultural analysis. When locating her own research on club culture as being distinctly post-Birmingham, Thornton (1997: 200) recognises a general major shortcoming of the Birmingham tradition in that it has 'both over-politicized youthful leisure and at the same time ignored the subtle relations of power at play within it'. In line with Thornton's (1997) concerns it is useful to revisit Donnelly's thesis of sport subcultures. At the most basic level, and as discussed in Chapter Six of this thesis, Donnelly (1981: 573) identifies how:

Subcultures are clearly stratified in terms of the amount and type of information in possession of various members, the level of commitment to the subculture in terms of the allocation of resources, and the degree to which the subculture is a dominant aspect of the lifestyle of its members.
What Donnelly has failed to account for here is the different meanings that players attach to their subcultural membership and how the different group cultures that these meanings represent are similarly stratified. Donnelly (1981: 577) further suggests that interaction generally occurs in ‘small face-to-face groups, but these groups do not develop markedly different cultural characteristics because of the various means of communication that serve to link them into a subcultural whole’. Although it is essentially football that brings together the members of this subculture, the research shows the existence of different and sometimes conflicting group cultural characteristics that could be considered as markedly different.

It is, however, a further notion stressed by Donnelly (1993) that this research, in line with Thornton (1997), has the potential to develop. It is important to reflect on how Donnelly (1993) uses the view of the dynamic nature of culture as a basis for his discussion of sport subcultures. Donnelly (1993: 121) suggests that subcultures provide ‘an ideal model with which to explore dominant, residual and emergent aspects of culture’, but much of his analysis is framed within the relationship between subcultures and the dominant sport culture. This analysis of subcultures is undeniably useful, and this research has drawn heavily on Donnelly’s (1993) work in order to explore the relationship between the subculture of women’s football and the dominant sport culture in Scotland.

In support of, and to paraphrase Thornton (1997), it can be argued that, while focusing on power relations between the subculture and the dominant sport culture, work on sport subcultures has often ignored the subtle relations of power at play within them. It is these power dynamics that inevitably shape the future transformation of subcultures and their future relationship with the dominant sport culture. It is therefore necessary to not only explore the dominant, residual and
emergent nature of a subculture with respect to its relationship with the dominant culture, but it is similarly crucial to explore the dominant, residual and emergent nature of group cultures within the subculture. It could be argued that Donnelly's (1993) model is limited in that it struggles to appreciate a degree of heterogeneity amongst subcultural members sufficient to result in the development of multiple meanings, identities, represented by interlocking group cultures. The degree of heterogeneity within women's football in Scotland has been seen to be sufficient to foster tensions between various group cultures and to intensify power dynamics within the subculture. To summarise, this thesis has adapted Donnelly's subcultural analysis in two main areas. First, in relation to the horizontal stratification of subcultural membership, it has re-interpreted subcultural membership, meanings and identities as multiple and complex. Second, it has advanced the analysis of dominant, residual and emergent aspects of culture to stress that such a dynamic nature of culture is not only apparent between a subculture and the dominant sport culture, but within a subculture itself.

In essence this thesis has risen to Gruneau's (1999: 127) challenge by offering theoretically informed historical and sociological research that is 'sensitive to multiple and uneven paths of change'. In particular, it recognises that within the subculture of women's football in Scotland, for various reasons individual members have had some shared and some more exclusive experiences during their involvement in the sport. Consequently players attach different meanings to football in the context of their lives. It is the existence of multiple meanings and identities that result in power struggles and foster tensions between interlocking group cultures within the subculture, and between these groups and the ruling bodies. The dynamic nature of, and the power struggles between, dominant, emergent and
residual elements of culture ensure that the characteristics of the subculture of women's football are being created and modified continually as the wider cultural context changes.

There are several important factors that contribute to the strength of this thesis. The research represents originality on a number of levels. It is the first thesis focusing exclusively on women's football in the Scottish context. It offers the most comprehensive historiography of women's football in Scotland to-date. Similarly it is the first piece of research to reveal the socio-demographic characteristics of a sample of women footballers, or even sportswomen, competing in Scotland. Outside of the Scottish context, this research is unique in that it focuses on the socialisation and subcultural experiences of a cross-ability sample of women footballers in relation to the wider social context. In doing so the multiple identities and meanings that a representative sample of women relate to their experiences of football are revealed and a valid interpretation of the subculture is achieved. The most significant strength of this thesis does not lie in any particular chapter. It is the synthesis of the chapters and the elements of the interpretive framework adopted that enables an informed and contextualised interpretation of the subculture of women's football in Scotland.

A Note on Critical Reflection to the Research Process and Recommendations for Future Research

An ongoing consideration throughout this research was determining the extent to which it is, and should be, critical and investigative in nature. Chapter Two developed this discussion, but it is an important issue on which to reflect, particularly in relation to the implications for future research. The critical and investigative potential of this research was sacrificed to some extent in favour of
ensuring that a comprehensive and crucial context for the research was provided. When considering how to approach an interpretation of the subculture of women's football in Scotland an in-depth ethnographic analysis of a particular club/case study was considered but was rejected for a number of reasons. The under-researched nature of the subject area raised a concern that such an approach might struggle to offer sufficient context or a representative voice of women footballers. As a result an ethnographic analysis of a single case study was rejected in favour of a multi-methodological approach to researching a representative sample of players.

In hindsight it appears that this decision was justified, for two important reasons. First, evidence suggests that certain cultural characteristics are more prominent in some clubs than in others and an in-depth analysis of one particular club might lead to bias and a failure to reveal this. Second, it was actually through the survey of a representative sample of women footballers, rather than more in-depth qualitative research, that the existence of a lesbian / bisexual presence and tensions between non-conformers and the 'conformers' were most explicitly revealed. What has also been in mind throughout the duration of this project is that future research of a more critical ethnographic nature would be better conducted on the back of a project which had already offered comprehensive context and made a significant contribution to our understanding of the subculture of women's football.

What has become apparent throughout this study is that it is the research subject, rather than a strict sociological theory, that should determine the methodology adopted and the research methods used. This study has succeeded in offering a variety of data that has been used collectively in order to offer an interpretation of the subculture of women's football in Scotland. Had there already existed a wider knowledge of the development of women’s football in Scotland and

288
the socio-demographic characteristics of women footballers, this research may have taken a relatively different form. The adoption of an interpretive framework involving the synthesis of various elements that are deemed most appropriate for answering core research questions, has proved particularly fruitful in the scope of this research.

A further strength of this study is that, although it is grounded in lived experience, my partial rather than complete immersion in the field allowed me to retain a degree of objectivity throughout the research process. My previous experiences of women’s football in Scotland meant that I had gained important ‘insider’ knowledge but I was not an ‘insider’ of any particular club or group cultural context to such an extent that my experiences had the potential to bias my interpretation of the subculture. Although I was not completely immersed in the field I could however use my identity as a fellow footballer to my benefit when gaining trust from interviewees. From initial contact with interviewees I ensured that they were aware of my own involvement in football in Scotland, having competed at both university and SWFL level. In doing so I gained a degree of trust from interviewees who considered me to also be a member of the subculture of women’s football and someone who could empathise with their experiences. So although I was primarily a researcher, I felt that the interviewees considered me to be ‘one of them’ rather than an ‘outsider’ to women’s football.

In terms of advancing this research subject, there is the need for a more critical ethnographic analysis of power dynamics within the subculture of women’s football in Scotland. This research has provided a sound analysis from which such research should progress and has already made a significant contribution to our understanding of the multiple meanings, identities, and the power dynamics that
exist within a continually transforming subculture. Within the research on women's football, it is Davies' (1996) work which reveals the most in terms of tensions between women footballers and the ruling bodies, based in an English context. His investigative journalistic account has many similarities with the critical interpretive approach advocated by Sugden and Tomlinson (1999). Having made a contribution to our knowledge of the history of women's football in Scotland, the socio-demographic characteristics of players, their experiences of the socialisation process and having offered an interpretation of the subculture, the next logical and important step would be a more critical investigation of the power dynamics within women's football in Scotland. Referring again to Thornton (1997), research on women's football is still in need of both being politicized to a greater extent while simultaneously exploring relations of power at play within it.

Research of a critical ethnographic nature focusing on revealing the power relations at play between group cultures within women's football and between these group cultures and the ruling bodies would not only develop a more critical analysis of the subculture of women's football but would also inform future analyses of sport subcultures. Such research would benefit from adopting a similar interpretive framework to this study, whilst possibly adding more currency to the critical, investigative and ethnographic elements advocated by Sugden and Tomlinson (1999). Since little is currently known about the subcultures of women's football within particular cultural contexts there is certainly scope for such research that is comparative at an international level.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Cowan, T. (2003) “Gretna lesbians should witch their games to Beaver Homes Leagues; too many matches force boss to call it a gay”, *Daily Record*, Scottish Daily Record & Sunday Mail Ltd, January 11th, p.61.


Greendorfer, S. L. (1992) “Differences in Childhood Socialisation Influences of Women Involved in Sport and Women Not Involved in Sport”, in Yiannakis,


Scottish Football Association (1924) Meeting Minutes, Scottish Football Museum Archive.

Scottish Football Association (1925) Meeting Minutes, Scottish Football Museum Archive.


299


300


The Herald (1922) “Changing Fashion in Women’s Sport”, *The Herald (London Correspondence)*, August 10th.


301


