IRENE A. REID, (B.Ed; M.A.)

Department of Sports Studies

University of Stirling

'Shinty, Nationalism and Cultural Identity,

1835 - 1939: A Critical Analysis'

DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis has been composed by myself, and that it embodies the results of my own research. Where appropriate, I have acknowledged the nature and extent of work carried out in collaboration with and/by others included in the thesis.

Signed: ....

Date: ....

ABSTRACT

The significance of sport is now emerging as an important dimension of the broader scholarship that examines the social, cultural and political aspects of Scottish society. A prominent facet of this emerging body of literature has examined the multiple ways in which sport contributes to and is constitutive of Scottish nationalism and culture. This thesis builds upon previous studies of sport to examine the connections between shinty, nationalism and cultural identity. The rationale that underpins the thesis asserts that in order to understand more fully expressions of nationalism, it is necessary to examine the social and cultural forces that have contributed to different ideas about the nation in specific historical circumstances. At the heart of the thesis it is argued that the sport-nationalism-identity axis in Scotland has sought to assert different forms of autonomy. The concept of autonomy, articulated through civil society, provides an original conceptual framework for the critical analysis of shinty, nationalism and cultural identity between 1835 and 1939. The development of shinty during this period coincided with the emergence of a number of cultural and political movements that were part of a relatively autonomous Highland civil society, and which became the repository of a particular strand of Celtic radicalism. A number of the leading proponents of Celtic radicalism were advocates of various aspects of Scottish nationalism that oscillated on the political landscape of Britain after 1886. Using a multi-methodological research approach, the thesis examines the extent to which the development of shinty intersected with key elements of Celtic radicalism and nationalism. It is concluded that shinty provided the terrain upon which particular cultural identities could be articulated, and was also a vehicle for particular expressions of nationalism that reinforced different aspects of the autonomy of the Highlands within Scotland. This original and unique synthesis provided in this thesis makes a small contribution to our understanding of sport in Scottish culture.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

DEDICATION

ii

This thesis is dedicated to the memory of my late father

William A. Reid (1930-1975).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

Over the last two decades or more a body of literature has emerged which has examined the cultural, political and social affairs of Scottish society (Beveridge and Turnbull, 1989; Harvie, 1994a; Lynch, 1992; McCrone, 1992; Morton, 1999; Nairn, 1981; Paterson, 1994). An important contribution to understanding social life in Scotland has been made by sociologists and historians who have focused on some of the many ways in which sport contributes to and is constitutive of Scottish culture and politics (Bradley, 1998a; Giulianotti, 1991; Jarvie, 1991; Jarvie and Reid, 1999; Jarvie and Walker, 1994; Moorhouse, 1986a; 1986b; 1987; Murray, 1984). This thesis contributes to, and is critical of, this body of knowledge. More specifically this thesis focuses on the connections between one sport, nationalism and cultural identity through a particular analysis of the game of shinty. It examines the extent to which the development of shinty was influenced by broader cultural, social and political movements during the period 1835 to 1939.

There are at least four key factors which distinguish this thesis from previous studies of shinty. First the analysis is grounded in theoretical assumptions which underpin a critical but eclectic theoretical approach to the study of sport in society. In the Scottish context this thesis takes its lead from the proposition that if we are to fully understand Scottish society, then the place of sport in Scottish culture has to be incorporated or at least not ignored (Jarvie and Walker, 1994: 8). Second the thesis examines shinty in relation to theories of nationalism and cultural identity as they have been specifically applied to the Scottish context. This strand of analysis considers the question posed by Telfer (1994: 123) who asked which image of the nation is represented through shinty. In this respect this analysis of shinty is a Celtic critique of nationalism and cultural identity in the Highlands of Scotland that has been largely

ignored in previous studies of the place of sport in Scottish social life. Third the analysis of shinty is contextualised within the specific social and political milieux of the Scottish Highlands between 1835 and 1939. Fourth a strand of this thesis involves a comparative socio-political analysis of sport, nationalism and cultural identity in two different contexts namely the Highlands of Scotland and Ireland. This builds upon examining the role of two sporting organisations, the Camanachd Association and the Gaelic Athletic Association (GAA), in the period from their formation in the late nineteenth century through to the middle of the twentieth century. In an era of radical Celtic politics, particularly the period between 1870 and 1922, the comparative analysis of these two sporting organisations offers an insight into the respective relationship between sport, politics and nationalism in two different, but related Celtic cultural contexts. Together these four strands provide a unique theoretical framework and socio-political background upon which to consider shinty, the traditional 'sport of the Gael'.

The culture and politics of Celtic communities has become a matter of much academic and popular interest during the 1990s (Jarvie, 1999: 3). In spite of this widespread interest, it is necessary to first clarify how the term Celtic is used in this thesis. As Jarvie (1999: 3-4) points out there are for example linguistic, archaeological and political uses for the term. The conception of Celtic utilised in this thesis follows the open and inclusive approach adopted by Jarvie (1999: 4), acknowledging that Celtic culture can be defined in terms of language, the material culture of a particular people, as well as the activities and aspirations associated with certain political objectives. It is accepted that there a number of communities that assert their identity in connection with their image of Celtic community. This noted the thesis focuses predominantly upon the distinctive Celtic cultural community that was projected by the people of the Highlands of Scotland. This image of a Celtic cultural community can be defined by a combination

of cultural factors, that includes the Gaelic language, as well as the material culture such as poetry, literature and popular recreations of a particular people, the Gaels. As the thesis illustrates ideas about Celtic Scotland may have changed yet for Scottish Gaels these linguistic and cultural elements remain core elements in their sense of themselves as part of a distinct cultural community within Scotland and Britain. At the cusp of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries some Scottish Gaels, as well as more radical Scottish nationalist supporters, placed this linguistic and cultural vision at the core of their radical cultural and political aspirations. This Celtic vision underpins the critique of sport, nationalism and cultural identity in Scotland by analysing critically the relationship between shinty, nationalism and cultural identity between 1835 and 1939.

It is important to clarify the reasons for the timescale examined in the thesis. There may be legitimate arguments for suggesting a narrower or wider time frame, but the period has not been selected at random or for the apparent convenience of approximately one hundred years. The historical period 1835 to 1939 has been selected for three important reasons which relate to the aims and underlying questions embedded within this study. These arose from specific issues suggested in previous histories of shinty and in a wider body of literature concerning Highland social development. The period 1835 to 1939 covers a substantive one in the development of the modern game of shinty. The development of shinty during the Victorian period was one aspect of a wider Celtic cultural movement that sought to preserve and promote a traditional distinctive cultural identity of the Highlands. During this period the development of shinty coincided with that of hurling in Ireland, where the development of Gaelic sport was connected to the ideas that underpinned land reform politics, home rule and nationalism. In the Highlands there were similar, but separate, expressions of Celtic radicalism in culture and politics. These did not translate into an identical project of political

nationalism but certain aspects of this Celtic radicalism did affect the development of shinty. It is argued that the imperial and unionist politics of certain key leading administrators within the Camanachd Association, shinty's governing body, was commensurate with the political nationalism of Scotland during this period. A distinctive Celtic identity was depicted through cultural activities such as sport, which along with other spheres of civil society provided an outlet for a cultural autonomy that was part of a larger imperial political state. By concluding this particular study of shinty in 1939 this thesis seeks to provide a more critical examination of the relationship between shinty, nationalism and cultural identity than has been evident in previous histories of shinty.

Since at least the 1980s a significant number of 'histories of shinty' have been produced. This literature records valuable evidence about the game in relation to its origins, its development, its structure and its organisation, and the histories of specific clubs such as Kingussie, Fort William, Kyles Athletic and Skye Camanachd (Hutchinson, 1989; Macdonald, 1992; MacLennan, 1993; 1994; 1998a; 1998b; Robertson, 1994; Thorburn, 1996; Whitson, 1983). Evidence suggests that shinty was once played in many parts of Scotland (MacLennan, 1993: 21; 1998b: 119), but the game began to disappear from certain areas by at least the latter part of the eighteenth century. By the middle of the nineteenth century shinty was largely confined to the Scottish Highlands, and to specific parts of urban Britain, although as MacLennan (1998b) has demonstrated, shinty was also played in the many emigrant contexts in which a Scottish diaspora settled.

The body of literature concerning shinty that has emerged since the 1980s builds on two classical historical accounts (Macdonald, 1919; MacDonald, 1932). These accounts claim that shinty's roots lie in the ancient Celtic culture of the Scots who

migrated to Scotland from Ireland in the fifth and sixth centuries AD. In Gaelic, the language of Celtic Scotland, the game is known as *camanachd*, with its antecedent folk origins being acknowledged as coming from the same Irish roots as the language (Hutchinson, 1989: 11). The antecedent folk origins of shinty are supported by Ó Maolfabhail (1973) in his history of hurling in Ireland. He contends that the Irish sport represents one of the two traditions of that activity and that the other "survives to the present day in Scotland under the name of ... Camanachd" (Ó Maolfabhail, 1973: viii). The various histories of shinty available provide a useful historical record about the sport but there are limitations to such work. For instance previous studies of shinty do not accommodate a theoretical analysis of how shinty contributes to the cultural fabric of the Highlands, or to the ways in which this sport might represent a Highland image of Scottishness. More precisely, it is unclear which image of the nation shinty might represent - "Scottish, British, Highland or Celtic?" (Telfer, 1994: 123). In specific historical periods, particular social and political circumstances may have contributed to each of these images of the nation. In the context of this study it is argued that the game represented both Highland and Celtic representations. On the one hand a Highland image of the nation is used to refer to the idea of a distinctive cultural community within the British state. On the other hand Celtic is used to refer to the idea of a community linking the Highlands and Ireland which was promoted by certain individuals within the radical Celtic movement during the last quarter of the nineteenth century. Shinty is recognised as a signifier of, and vehicle for, both images. It is argued that the Highland image predominated within the context of civil society, and importantly amongst the leaders of the Camanachd Association, the official administrative body for shinty.

Shinty did decline in some communities during the nineteenth century, but between 1835 and 1939 it was transformed from a popular folk pastime into an institutionalised sport. This metamorphosis was not revolutionary, nor was it a uniform and linear process since the patterns of transformation were different throughout Highland society. The transformation of shinty during this period, like other popular folk games (Holt, 1989: 3; Tranter, 1998: 3-12), depicts the complexities of decline and survival of traditional recreations, and the adoption of new practices, that are associated with what Williams (1977) termed dominant, residual and emergent cultures. Whitson (1983) has utilised this conceptual framework in an analysis of shinty in the Highlands since 1945, but these dimensions of cultural change are also helpful in examining the development of shinty between 1835 and 1939. This includes for instance: the disappearance of the sport in some communities; the decline of some traditional patterns of participation such as Sunday shinty; the continued significance of patronage to shinty but within new structures; the place of shinty as a core element of a distinctive Celtic culture; and the establishment of the formal structures and practices of institutionalised sport. Three questions are addressed in this thesis which arise from these developments: (i) How did the game of shinty develop between 1835 and 1939? (ii) What cultural, social and political circumstances contributed to the divergent patterns of change? and (iii) How was shinty affected by the historical epoch in which it moved? In answering these questions this thesis does not detract from existing knowledge about the history of shinty. It is the contention of this thesis that the research outlined in this study provides an original analysis and perhaps more importantly adds to our knowledge about one aspect of Scottish popular culture.

Previous studies of shinty have suggested that the sport contributes to definitions of the Highlands as a cultural community. By the middle of the nineteenth century

shinty was an integral element in the social and cultural activities of a growing Highland diaspora in urban Britain. During the 1870s certain elements within this loosely connected network of organisations and individuals in Highland society began to promote a more radical edge towards Highland issues. This Celtic radicalism manifested itself in a number of ways some of which were overtly political, while others fostered a distinctive Celtic cultural identity and autonomy through activities such as music, literature and sport. One of the more radical activists of this Celtic movement was John Murdoch (1818-1903) who recorded his recollections of shinty in the 1830s in his autobiographical notes (*The Autobiography of John Murdoch, Vol. I*). This unpublished record is one of a number of primary sources that demonstrate how shinty intersected with the radical Celtic movement of Highland society particularly during the last quarter of the nineteenth century. The confluence of shinty and Celtic cultural and political movements such as the urban Highland societies, and the Highland Land Law Reform Association (HLLRA) has not been thoroughly examined in previous histories of the sport. This radical dimension of Highland social history therefore provides the impetus for a fourth question which the thesis examines namely: to what extent was the development of shinty and the Camanachd Association connected to the Celtic radical movement that shaped Highland society after the 1870s?

Between 1887 and 1934 a number of intermittent contests involving shinty and hurling teams took place on both sides of the Irish Sea (Hutchinson, 1989; MacLennan, 1998b; Bradley, 1998a). These links reinforced the antecedent folk origins of both codes which were part of the common cultural heritage of Celtic Scotland and Ireland. Like shinty the development of hurling within the GAA after 1884 was associated with cultivating a distinctive identity which drew on this Celtic past. The GAA's connections to the wider radical movements in Ireland brought a more overt political dimension to

the identity promoted by hurling. The anti-British flavour of the organisation appears to have influenced the Camanachd Association's decision to sever links with the Irish organisation between 1934 and 1972 (Hutchinson, 1989: 156-7). There is no evidence that the Camanachd Association had a collective view on the political issues which were the focus of Celtic radicalism in Scotland and Ireland, but this is an important difference between the national agencies responsible for the Celtic sports of Scotland and Ireland. This dimension of the social history of these Celtic sports raises two further issues: (i) Why did no similar organisation to the Gaelic Athletic Association in Ireland emerge in Scotland? and (ii) In what ways did the social and political background of the leading administrators and patrons of the Camanachd Association influence the national aspirations of shinty from 1893 until 1939?

The thesis builds upon a unique synthesis of material which draws from at least four bodies of knowledge. The study is partly rooted within: a sociological body of knowledge which discusses the concepts of nationalism and cultural identity; recent literature by Scottish writers who have sought to explain Scottish culture and society; a body of literature by sociologists and historians who have undertaken research into certain aspects of Scottish sport; and a body of Celtic literature which provides a basis for a critique of mainstream work on Scottish culture and Scottish sport. It is in fact this Celtic critique which is one of the original aspects of this thesis.

There are three key points which inform this study of sport, nationalism and cultural identity in Scotland. The first is developed from the body of literature on nationalism, which demonstrates that this complex ideology cannot be reduced to a single explanation (Anderson, 1991: 3; Hutchison and Smith, 1994: 3; Smith, 1991: 72). Second, the observation of both Kellas (1980: 129; 136) and Harvie (1994a: 19) that in pre-devolution Scotland, nationalism was a popular ideology expressed in relation to

sport rather than to politics. Finally there is McCrone's assertion that cultural identities such as region, religion, gender and ethnic origin contour the ways in which people define and experience the nation, and therefore inform alternative expressions of what it is to be Scottish (1992: 193).

The connection between identity and sport is not a new departure in the study of sport. This has been highlighted in studies of sport in other social, national and cultural contexts that have utilised theories from the perspective of critical sociology (Ball and Loy, 1975; Cantelon and Gruneau, 1982; Dunning, 1971; Gruneau, 1983; Hargreaves, 1982; Hargreaves, 1986). A feature of this work has been to examine the ways in which sport is used to express collective identities such as those based on class, gender or ethnicity. In the 1990s the ways in which nationalism is expressed through sporting contexts has emerged as a prominent issue in the sociological analysis of sport (Booth, 1998; Cronin, 1999; Duke and Crolley, 1996; Hargreaves, 2000; Jarvie, 1993; MacClancy, 1996; Nauright, 1997; Sugden and Bairner, 1993). This literature reveals at least three important points. First although a single word is used to describe expressions of allegiance towards the sporting representatives of nations, nationalism is not a single phenomenon (Cronin, 1999: 55). Second the nationalisms associated with sport may relate to different kinds of nations which can be divided into two broad categories: those which are states, and those nations which exist within states. These points have a particular resonance in Scotland, a nation within a state, where it has been suggested nationalism has been expressed in relation to cultural practices such as sport, rather than through politics in a quest for statehood (Kellas, 1980: 129). In the case of this thesis a third point is evident from previous studies of sport, nationalism and identity. Distinct cultural communities within both kinds of nations may express their collective identity, as well as their image of the nation, through sport.

One feature of some of the research into sport and nationalism has been that such studies have often focused on contemporary expressions of nationalism and cultural identity. There are limitations to this approach. Focusing on contemporary situations has tended to overlook the confluence of sport and ideas about nationhood and identity in specific historical contexts. It has been assumed that the nationalism expressed through sport has depicted the same meaning and image of the nation throughout the modern era. If we are to fully understand the myriad ways in which sport may be used to project nations and cultural communities, it is necessary to examine these relationships in historical, as well as in contemporary contexts, and in greater depth than has hitherto been the case. This thesis examines shinty from a social and historical perspective, in order to more fully understand the relationship between shinty, nationalism and cultural identity in a specific period. Using an eclectic theoretical framework of nationalism, cultural identity and autonomy, the thesis contributes a wider understanding of the place that shinty has occupied in Highland civil society and culture.

ORGANISATION OF THE THESIS

In order to examine the questions raised concerning the relationship between shinty, nationalism and cultural identity between 1835 and 1939 the thesis has been organised into six substantive chapters. The case study does not attempt to provide a comprehensive historical account of the sport during this period since this has been covered in previous histories of shinty (Macdonald, 1919; MacDonald, 1932; Hutchinson, 1989; MacLennan, 1998b). Instead the thesis examines the confluence of shinty with selected social, cultural and political developments which contoured the social history of the Highlands. The chapters are therefore organised around the key themes which provide the building blocks to facilitate the examination of shinty,

nationalism and cultural identity in the Highlands between 1835 and 1939. The social, cultural and political factors which contributed to the cultural identity embodied by shinty and to ideas of nationhood cannot be organised into neat time periods of specific decades. Each substantive chapter of the case study is framed by a broad time period, but the issues addressed therein were not confined to these decades. The social, cultural and political circumstances which contributed to definitions of cultural identity and Celtic radicalism between 1835 and 1939 were more fluid, their presence ebbing and flowing within the wider context of Highland, Scottish and British imperial social history.

Serious examinations of nationalism and cultural identity have emerged as prominent themes in the analysis of Scottish culture and society (Brown, McCrone and Paterson, 1996; Gallagher, 1991; Harvie, 1994; McCrone, 1992; McCrone, Kendrick and Straw, 1989; Nairn, 1981; Paterson, 1994; 1998). As recently as the 1980s such an approach would have been considered parochial, sentimental and irrelevant in the serious academic analysis of these themes. This poses a fundamental problem in developing an appropriate conceptual framework for this thesis. The problem, in part, was that Scotland was not the archetypal nation-state which certain scholars have argued is the necessary component of nationalism in the modern era (Gellner, 1983; Hobsbawm, 1992a). Gellner (1983: 44) stated that "Scottish nationalism indisputably exists", but acknowledged it contradicts his own theory of nationalism. The problem is compounded by the fact that during the period examined in this thesis shinty has been a constituent, and is constitutive of, Celtic cultural identity in the Gàidhealtachd, but not of the Scottish nation. This cultural identity did not translate into a widespread popular expression of nationalism that was associated with, or aspired to, a separate Scottish state. There was an element of Celtic radicalism that did have such aspirations, yet the

body of literature that examines Scottish society and politics has tended to marginalise this in accounts of both the Scottish nation and nationalism.

To address the problem concerning Scotland the eclectic theoretical framework that underpins this thesis is developed in chapters one and two. This theoretical framework has been developed from three ideas evident in current social and political theories on nationalism and cultural identity: (i) nations are not fixed entities; (ii) that nations are cultural formations to which political objectives and definitions of statehood may be attached; and (iii) nationalism is shaped by a number of cultural factors such as class, ethnic origin, religion, region and gender. In chapter one the focus is on selected theoretical explanations of sport, nationalism and cultural identity. The eclectic theoretical framework that is developed is built upon the core concepts that inform the thesis, namely nationalism, cultural identity, civil society and autonomy. The strength of this eclectic framework is that it draws on different theories to illuminate specific concepts that are relevant to the time period being examined. The chapter is divided into five sections that examine these concepts and their relationship to sport. The chapter probes six key questions: (i) what are some of the ways in which sport is connected to nationalism? (ii) what are nations and nationalisms? (iii) what are the processes that contribute to the making of nationalisms? (iv) how does sport contribute to the formation of cultural identity? (v) in what way are the structures of sport related to the institutional framework of nations? (vi) how are sporting nationalisms and cultural identities to be understood in relation to self-determination?

The discussion identifies the ways in which cultural, political and social processes shape social systems in particular historical contexts. This illustrates the ways in which the structure, meaning and image of the nation is subject to gradual transformation over time within the changing cultural, political and social framework of

society. Nationalism is shaped by these processes which redefine the nation, and the ideology changes to express an image of the nation which is consistent with the circumstances in a specific historical context. The processes that shape the nation cannot be divorced from the collective historical experience of the particular social system. One consequence of this is that expressions of nationalism incorporate symbols and events which are rooted in the history of the nation which may be real or mythical. This is a selective process which constructs the definition of the nation, and gives rise to what Anderson (1991) has referred to as the *imagined community*. It is argued that all nationalisms express aspirations or experiences of self-determination that represent some form of *autonomy*, that can be expressed through either political or cultural structures. The relationship between sport, nationalism and cultural identity is an example of the way in which civil society may provide a vehicle for such aspirations.

Chapter two develops this theoretical framework further through a critical analysis of autonomy, nationalism and cultural identity in Scotland. The analysis examines the different ways in which scholars have explained nationalism and cultural identity in Scotland, and the role they ascribe to sport in defining the nation. Most analyses of Scottish society have either been ambivalent towards, or ignored, the contribution of sport to definitions of the nation (Jarvie and Reid, 1999b: 25; 1999c: 100). Where more detailed consideration has been given to the sport-nationalism-identity axis the analyses have tended to focus on football, ignoring Scotland's diverse sports culture. The limitations of these studies may overlook the multifarious social, cultural and political dimensions of Scottish society which mediate expressions of nationalism and cultural identity

One reason for examining nationalism and cultural identity in Scotland lies in the wider literature on nationalism. One theory argues that some cultural nationalisms

such as those associated with Catalonia and Scotland, seek cultural and social autonomy in a multinational state while they remain part of the political framework of the state (Smith, 1991: 138). Paterson (1994) argues that the circumstances of Scotland's place within the British imperial state until at least 1945 fulfilled the nation's objectives of autonomy. This is a plausible explanation as to why Scotland did not seek independence during the age of nationalism. It is also a flexible theoretical framework that can accommodate alternative expressions of nationhood through different cultural contexts. It is argued that organised sport is part of the network of institutions and cultural practices which comprise civil society in Scotland, which has had a central role in mediating ideas about nationalism, cultural identity and autonomy. Four questions underpin the analysis in chapter two. How have scholars explained Scotland's sense of nationhood in the community of nations? What explanations are offered for the connections between nationalism, cultural identity and Scottish sport? What are the limitations of these explanations for the investigation of shinty undertaken in this thesis? In what way does the autonomy of civil society, and the notion of unionist nationalism provide a theoretical framework for the study of shinty, nationalism and cultural identity?

A number of studies of Scottish society have suggested that during the nineteenth century and the early decades of the twentieth century Scots displayed a dual national identity (Devine, 1999: 289-90; Mackintosh, 1974: 409; Morton, 1999: 6-7; Paterson, 1994: 50-1). This dual identity has been explained as one where Scots thought of themselves as British in relation to formal public matters like citizenship and politics, and Scottish in relation to culture and community. There is some evidence to support the dual identity theory, but there are at least two weaknesses in this explanation. First while the dual identity theory acknowledges the importance of Protestant religious

adherence in definitions of Scottish and Britishness, less attention is paid to the ways in which other personal and collective identities like gender, region or class, feed into these national discourses. Consequently people are considered to act and think as either Scottish or British depending on the social and political context or issue. This contrasts with current theory that highlights the importance of other social identities in understanding nationalism (Hall, 1993: 350; McCrone, 1992: 193). Explanations of dual identity may not claim this theory an exhaustive account of nationalism in Scotland, but more attention ought to be paid to the multifaceted identities that contribute to ideas about the nation.

A second weakness with the dual identity argument is that it can project the idea that a homogeneous Scottish culture has informed nationalism. Scotland was not a nation formed around a people of one ethnic origin with one culture but has always been a plural one (Lynch, 1992: 53-4). This cultural plurality is rooted in part in the period between the third and ninth centuries which is described as "an age of migrations" (Lynch, 1992: 12) which ensured there was "hybrid kingdom" of Scots by the twelfth century (Lynch, 1992: 53). By the nineteenth century the descendants of these cultural communities may have defined themselves in ways which support the dual identity thesis, but evidence suggests other collective identities were being articulated in Scotland at this time. In the context of this study of shinty the most pertinent of these was rooted in the Celtic culture, and the social circumstances of the Highlands. In short it is being argued here that Scotland's Highland cultural community is not adequately acknowledged in the dual identity theory.

Recent critical analyses have recognised that examinations of Scotland should consider the contemporary cultural diversity of the nation. This is also a valid assertion when considering Scottish society and sport in defined historical periods. Scholarship